

## Measuring the Mind

Is it possible to measure psychological attributes like intelligence, personality, and attitudes and if so, how does that work? What does the term 'measurement' mean in a psychological context? This fascinating and timely book discusses these questions and investigates the possible answers that can be given in response. Denny Borsboom provides an in-depth treatment of the philosophical foundations of widely used measurement models in psychology. The theoretical status of classical test theory, latent variable theory, and representational measurement theory are critically evaluated, and positioned in terms of the underlying philosophy of science. Special attention is devoted to the central concept of test validity, and future directions to improve the theory and practice of psychological measurement are outlined.

DENNY BORSBOOM is Assistant Professor of Psychological Methods at the University of Amsterdam. He has published in *Synthese*, *Applied Psychological Measurement*, *Psychological Review*, and *Intelligence*.



# Measuring the Mind

Conceptual Issues in Contemporary Psychometrics

Denny Borsboom

University of Amsterdam





#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521844630

© Denny Borsboom 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-84463-5 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-84463-0 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### Contents

Preface		page vii
1	Introduction	1
	1.1 The measured mind	1
	1.2 Measurement models	3
	1.3 Philosophy of science	5
	1.4 Scope and outline of this book	9
2	True scores	11
	2.1 Introduction	11
	2.2 Three perspectives on true scores	13
	2.2.1 The formal stance	14
	2.2.2 The empirical stance	21
	2.2.3 The ontological stance	30
	2.3 Discussion	44
3	Latent variables	49
	3.1 Introduction	49
	3.2 Three perspectives on latent variables	51
	3.2.1 The formal stance	52
	3.2.2 The empirical stance	56
	3.2.3 The ontological stance	57
	3.3 Implications for psychology	77
	3.4 Discussion	81
4		85
	4.1 Introduction	85
	4.2 Three perspectives on measurement scales	88
	4.2.1 The formal stance	89
	4.2.2 The empirical stance	95
	4.2.3 The ontological stance	100
	4.3 Discussion	118
5	Relations between the models	121
	5.1 Introduction	121
	5.2 Levels of connection	122
	5.2.1 Syntax	123
	5.2.2 Semantics and ontology	128

v



vi	Contents	
	5.3 Discussion	133
	5.3.1 Theoretical status	133
	5.3.2 The interpretation of probability	138
	5.3.3 Validity and the relation of measurement	140
	5.3.4 Theoretical consequences	145
6	The concept of validity	149
	6.1 Introduction	149
	6.2 Ontology versus epistemology	151
	6.3 Reference versus meaning	154
	6.4 Causality versus correlation	159
	6.5 Where to look for validity	162
	6.6 Discussion	167
References		173
Index		183



### Preface

About five decades ago, the visionary Dutch psychologist A. D. De Groot started building an extraordinary academic group at the University of Amsterdam. It consisted of psychometricians, statisticians, philosophers of science, and psychologists with a general methodological orientation. The idea was to approach methodological problems in psychology from the various angles these different specialists brought to the subject matter. By triangulating their viewpoints, methodological problems were to be clarified, pinpointed, and solved. This idea is in several respects the basis for this book. At an intellectual level, the research reported here is carried out exactly along the lines De Groot envisaged, because it applies insights from psychology, philosophy of science, and psychometrics to the problem of psychological measurement. At a more practical level, I think that, if De Groot had not founded this group, the book now before you would not have existed. For the people in the psychological methods department both sparked my interests in psychometrics and philosophy of science, and provided me with the opportunity to start out on the research that is the basis for this book. Hence, I thank De Groot for his vision, and the people in the psychological methods group for creating such a great intellectual atmosphere.

I unfortunately never had the chance to collaborate directly with De Groot; but he did, in the years he spent at the University of Amsterdam, appoint two people who had a direct and substantial influence on all of the work reported here: Don Mellenbergh and Jaap van Heerden, the supervisors of my PhD research. This book is single-authored because I conceived of it and wrote it. But in terms of the genealogy of the ideas that led to this work, and the general spirit in which the research is carried out, I am greatly indebted to these two remarkable men, both for their contributions to my research and for the atmosphere of intellectual freedom they created. Several chapters in this book are partly based on, or use material from, papers we have published jointly. Specifically, the paragraphs on the platonic true score interpretation in chapter 2 are taken from Borsboom and Mellenbergh (2002), chapter 3 is a slightly adapted version

vii



#### viii Preface

of Borsboom, Mellenbergh, and Van Heerden (2003), and chapter 6 is adapted from Borsboom, Mellenbergh, and Van Heerden (2004). Another person who deserves special mention is Peter Molenaar, who was never directly involved with my research but played a highly stimulating role in the background. With his uncanny ability to connect theoretical insights from distinct areas of mathematics, philosophy, and science, he repeatedly probed me to broaden my intellectual horizon; and his insights on the relation between inter-individual and intra-individual variability were among the primary factors that stimulated the theoretical developments in this book. Also, I would like to thank several people who have, in one way or another, significantly influenced the development of my research: Conor Dolan, Harrie Vorst, Ellen Hamaker, Sanneke Schouwstra, Gitta Lubke, Han van der Maas, Maarten Speekenbrink, Joel Michell, Keith Markus, Dan Cervone, Günter Trendler, Ton Smolenaars, Brian Haig, and Ingmar Visser.

My deepest gratitude extends to those closest to me. I thank my parents for their faith in me; Maaike for being such a wonderful sister; and, above all, Helma for her support and love. This book is dedicated to my son, Kick. I hope that, whatever you will do in this beautiful life, you will do it with passion.