

## Ingres and His Critics

This book examines the critical writing and journalistic reportage on Jean-Auguste-Dominique Ingres, from the time of his renunciation of the Salon in 1834 until his large retrospective at the 1855 Universal Exposition. This massive body of writing demonstrates how the artist negotiated the contradictory forces dominating the rapidly evolving art world of mid-nineteenth-century Paris. While continuing to enjoy the benefits of his affiliation with the Academy, Ingres employed certain modes of presentation – most notably the single-artist exhibition and illustrated monograph – that effectively distanced his work and public persona from the increasingly embattled world of artistic officialdom, implicating them instead in the burgeoning modernist ideal of self-generating creative genius. The resulting fluctuation in Ingres's critical profile – between imperious *chef d'école* and persecuted *artiste maudit* – provides a new context in which to consider the formal qualities of his work, which likewise vacillate between academic banality and modernist *bizarrierie*.

Andrew Carrington Shelton is associate professor of art history at The Ohio State University. A scholar of French art, he contributed to the catalogue for the exhibition *Portraits by Ingres* and has published articles and reviews in *The Art Bulletin*, *Art History*, *The Burlington Magazine*, and the *Bulletin du Musée Ingres*.

# Ingres and His Critics

**Andrew Carrington Shelton**  
*The Ohio State University*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India  
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521842433](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521842433)

© Andrew Carrington Shelton

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*  
Shelton, Andrew Carrington.

Ingres and his critics / Andrew Carrington Shelton.  
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-84243-3 (hardback)

ISBN-10: 0-521-84243-3 (hardback)

1. Ingres, Jean-Auguste-Dominique, 1780–1867 – Criticism and interpretation.

2. Art criticism – France – Paris – History – 19th century. I. Title.

ND553-1553 2005

759.4 – dc22 2005012224

ISBN 978-0-521-84243-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

List of Illustrations	page vii
Abbreviations	ix
Acknowledgments	xi
<b>Introduction: The Critics and Their Ingres (1834–1855)</b>	1
1. <i>Le Martyre de Saint Symphorien</i> at the 1834 Salon	15
2. <i>La Stratonice</i>	54
3. <i>La Gloire à Domicile: The Studio Exhibitions of 1841–42</i>	87
4. <b>The Painter Behind the Canvas</b>	135
5. <i>L'Oeuvre de Monsieur Ingres</i>	193
Notes	239
Bibliography	289
Index	315

## List of Illustrations

### FIGURES

1	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Jesus Among the Doctors</i> , 1862	page 12
2	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>The Turkish Bath</i> , 1862	13
3	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>The Martyrdom of Saint Symphorien</i> , 1834 Salon	16
4	Paul Delaroche, <i>Lady Jane Grey</i> , 1834 Salon	17
5	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>The Vow of Louis XIII</i> , 1824 Salon	19
6	Honoré Daumer, “ <i>Ne vous y frottez pas!!</i> ” (“ <i>Don’t mess with it!!</i> ”), 1834	34
7	Nicolas-Toussaint Charlet, <i>Middle Class, Strong Class</i> , 1840	35
8	Honoré Daumier, <i>Rue Transnonain</i> , 1834	37
9	Raphael and studio, <i>The Road to Calvary</i> , circa 1516	42
10	Guido Reni, <i>Massacre of the Innocents</i> , 1611	43
11	Jacques-Louis David, <i>Oath of the Horatii</i> , 1785 Salon	44
12	Jacques-Louis David, <i>Brutus</i> , 1789 Salon	44
13	Jacques-Louis David, <i>Intervention of the Sabine Women</i> , 1799	45
14	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Madame Duvaucy</i> , 1807 (1833 Salon)	50
15	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Madame Leblanc</i> , 1823 (1834 Salon)	51
16	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>La Stratonice</i> , 1840	57
17	Paul Delaroche, <i>Death of the Duc de Guise</i> , 1835 Salon	74
18	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Antiochus and Stratonice</i> , circa 1806	75
19	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>La Stratonice</i> , undated	75
20	D. Cunego after Gavin Hamilton, <i>Andromache Mourning Hector</i> , 1764	81
21	Jacques-Louis David, <i>Antiochus and Stratonice</i> , 1774	83
22	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Amédée-David, Comte de Pastoret</i> , 1827–28 Salon	89
23	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>La Vierge à l’Hostie</i> , 1841	95
24	J.-A.-D. Ingres, Copy after a Byzantine Icon, circa 1840	104
25	Anonymous, <i>Mother of God of the Sign</i> , 17th Century	105
26	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Cherubini and the Muse of Lyric Poetry</i> , 1842	113
27	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Ferdinand-Philippe-Louis-Charles-Henri, le Duc d’Orléans</i> , 1842	119

28	Benjamin Roubaud, Ingres as <i>Raphael II</i> , from <i>Le Panthéon charivarique, Le Charivari</i> , May 27, 1842	124
29	Anonymous, <i>La Gloire à Domicile, La Caricature</i> , May 22, 1842	125
30	Portrait of Ingres from Louis de Loménie, <i>Galerie des contemporains illustres par un homme de rien</i> , 1840	137
31	Anonymous, View of the Bazar Bonne-Nouvelle, 1852–53	148
32	A. Provost, View of the Galerie des Beaux-Arts, Bazar Bonne-Nouvelle, 1843	149
33	Anonymous, View into Ingres's Alcove in the Galerie Bonne-Nouvelle, <i>L'Illustration</i> February 11, 1846	151
34	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Oedipus and the Sphinx</i> , 1808 (reworked circa 1825; 1827–28 Salon)	153
35	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>La Grande Odalisque</i> , 1814 (1819 Salon)	154
36	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>The Sistine Chapel</i> , 1814 Salon	154
37	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Philip V of Spain Investing the Marshal of Berwick with the Golden Fleece</i> , 1819 Salon	155
38	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Paolo and Francesca</i> , 1819	156
39	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>The Entry into Paris of the Dauphin, Future Charles V</i> , 1821 (1824 Salon)	157
40	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Louis-François Bertin</i> , 1833 Salon	158
41	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Comte Louis-Mathieu Molé</i> , 1834	159
42	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>La petite Odalisque (Odalisque à l'esclave)</i> , 1840	160
43	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>La Comtesse d'Haussonville</i> , 1845	161
44	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Venus Anadyomène</i> , 1848	182
45	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>La Baronne James de Rothschild</i> , 1848	183
46	Titlepage of [Albert Magimel] <i>Oeuvres de J. A. Ingres</i> , 1851	195
47	Advertisement for the <i>Oeuvres de J. A. Ingres</i> , <i>Journal des Débats</i> , November 2–3, 1851	196
48	Achille Réveil after J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Oeuvres de J. A. Ingres</i> , 1851	197
49	Plan of the Hôtel de Ville	203
50	J.-A.-D. Ingres, Sketch for <i>The Apotheosis of Napoleon I</i> , circa 1854	205
51	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>The Apotheosis of Homer</i> , 1827–28 Salon	209
52	J.-A.-D. Ingres, <i>Napoleon I on his Imperial Throne</i> , 1806 Salon	217
53	Anonymous, Installation photograph of Ingres's Gallery in the 1855 Exposition Universelle	218
54	Anonymous, Installation photograph of Ingres's Gallery in the 1855 Exposition Universelle	219

## Abbreviations

A	<i>L'Artiste</i>
BMI	<i>Bulletin du Musée Ingres</i>
Boyer d'Agen 1909	[J. A. B.] Boyer d'Agen, ed., <i>Ingres, d'après une correspondance inédite</i> , Paris: Daragon, 1909.
Ch	<i>Le Charivari</i>
Delaborde 1870	Henri Delaborde, <i>Ingres: Sa vie, ses travaux, sa doctrine, d'après les notes manuscrites et les lettres du maître</i> , Paris: Plon, 1870.
JdA	<i>Journal des artistes</i>
JdD	<i>Le Journal des Débats</i>
Lapauze 1911	Henry Lapauze, <i>Ingres: Sa vie et son oeuvre (1780–1867)</i> , Paris: Petit, 1911.
MU	<i>Le Moniteur universel</i>
Naef I, II, III, IV, V	Hans Naef, <i>Die Bildniszeichnungen von J.-A.-D. Ingres</i> , 5 vols., Bern: Benteli, 1977–1980.
RDM	<i>Revue des Deux Mondes</i>
Ternois 2001	Daniel Ternois, <i>Lettres d'Ingres à Marcotte d'Argenteuil: Dictionnaire</i> , Archives de l'art français, new per., 36, 2001.

## Acknowledgments

This project began as a doctoral dissertation written under the direction of Robert Rosenblum at the Institute of Fine Arts, New York University, and it is undoubtedly to the steady but unobtrusive guidance of Professor Rosenblum that the present volume is most indebted. I should also like to thank Professors Donald Posner and Linda Nochlin, the other primary members of my dissertation committee, as well as Michael Marrinan, whose inspiring lectures at Columbia University first sparked my interest in art history and whose continued guidance and advice have been of inestimable value in the development of this book. Finally, Patricia Mainardi, whose groundbreaking work on nineteenth-century exhibitions established the principal framework for so much of what I have tried to do with Ingres, provided crucial encouragement and support during the very last stages of the project.

The research and writing of the dissertation from which this book was derived were supported by the Institute of Fine Arts as well as predoctoral fellowships at the Metropolitan Museum of Art. I would like to thank Everett Fahy and especially Gary Tinterow for making my time at the museum so productive and illuminating. I also thank Gary, along with his co-curators Philip Conisbee of the National Gallery of Art and Christopher Riopelle of the National Gallery in London, for inviting me to contribute to their award-winning catalogue, *Portraits by Ingres: Image of an Epoch*.

In France, my work was facilitated by the patient assistance and unfailing helpfulness of the staffs of the Bibliothèque nationale, where the bulk of my research was conducted; the Département de la Bibliothèque et de la Documentation of the Institut national d'histoire de l'art (Jacques Doucet collection); and the Service de documentation, Département des peintures, Musée du Louvre.

The adulation Ingres inspired in his acolytes was legendary during his own lifetime, and I have often thought that this tradition of veneration lives on among art historical *ingristes*, many of whom are little short of fanatical about their object of study. At the same time, however, I could not have asked for a more congenial and generous set of scholars with whom to share this peculiar passion. I continue



to marvel at the productivity of the doyen of French *ingristes*, Monsieur Daniel Ternois, whom I have never had the pleasure of meeting, but whose work has functioned as the predicate for (and occasionally the corrective of) my own. The tenure of Georges Vigne at the Musée Ingres in Montauban constituted nothing less than a revolution in Ingres studies, and I have benefited enormously from the steady stream of publications that issued from his pen over the past decade. Sarah Betzer, Carol Ockman, Adrian Rifkin, and Susan Siegfried have offered invaluable encouragement and advice in addition to the example of their own extraordinarily stimulating scholarship. I can only hope that my own work proves worthy of the competition.

This book could never have been completed without the unfaltering support of the faculty and staff in the Department of History of Art as well as the administration of the College of the Arts at The Ohio State University. Much research and almost all the revisions were carried out during summer trips to Paris funded by the College of the Arts as well as two quarters released from teaching awarded by the dean. A grant from the College also helped defray the cost of photographs. More crucial still has been both the intellectual and emotional support provided by my colleagues on the faculty. While not a single person at OSU failed to provide the requisite pat on the back or (gentle) kick in the pants when necessary, I am particularly indebted to the encouragement and support of Mark Fullerton (chair), Myroslava Mudrak (interim chair 2003–2004), Arline Meyer, Benjamin David, Lisa Florman, Barbara Haeger, and Anne and Jim Morganstern. The support, humor, and unflagging friendship of Stephanie Bernhardt, curator of the Visual Resources Library, as well as the unparalleled professionalism and efficiency of Gwyn Schwindt, former assistant to the chair and departmental office manager, were no less crucial to the completion of this project.

The list of personal friends and professional acquaintances who have contributed to this project in various ways is, of course, far too long to cite here. Some individuals cannot go unmentioned, however: Kathleen Heins and Alison Lonshein, stalwart friends and supporters since my days at the Institute; Stephen Mazoh, whose kindness and generosity throughout my years of graduate study have never been forgotten; Robert Parker, who housed me during my initial year abroad in Paris, and Francesca Weinmann, who has more recently permitted her beautiful apartment in the *cinquième* to become my second home; Paul Josefowitz, Nora Kilbane, Leslee Kuhn, Rebecca Rabinow, and Baron Guy de Rothschild, who helped procure crucial photographs; Jenny Wilker, who first alerted me to the wealth of commentary on Ingres in *Le Charivari*; Beatrice Rehl, Glenna K. Gordon, and the editorial and production staffs at Cambridge, whose patience and understanding made the birth of a first book much less painful than it might otherwise have been; members of the Kaufman and Greenwald families, who have provided invaluable cheer and encouragement; and, most crucially, of course, Eric H. Kaufman, without whose friendship and support there simply would have been no book.

## Acknowledgments

xiii

Finally, I should like this study to serve as a personal tribute to my mother, Hasseltine Robertson Aiken, whose tenacity in raising a child alone in a socially and politically unsympathetic age is the precondition of everything that I might achieve. I dedicate this volume to her.

Columbus, January 2005