

ICSID Reports

Volume 7

The ICSID Reports provide the only comprehensive collection of the arbitral awards and decisions given under the auspices of the World Bank's International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes or pursuant to other multilateral or bilateral investment treaties. These decisions make an important contribution to the growing body of jurisprudence on international investment. The series also includes arbitration under the Additional Facility to the ICSID Convention which has increased in recent years, most notably in relation to the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA). The ICSID Reports are thus an invaluable tool for practitioners and scholars working in the field of international commercial arbitration. Volume 7 of the ICSID Reports brings the series substantially up to date (as at mid-2003) and includes the decisions in Methanex v. USA, the award of 26 June 2003 in Loewen v. USA and the rulings and awards in Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Canada.



ICSID REPORTS

Volume

7



This volume may be cited as: 7 ICSID Reports



ICSID REPORTS

Reports of cases decided under the Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States, 1965 and related decisions on international protection of investments

Volume

7

EDITED BY

JAMES CRAWFORD, SC, FBA, LLD (Cantab.)

Whewell Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge

AND

KAREN LEE, MA (Cantab.)

Fellow of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge Fellow of Girton College, Cambridge

CONSULTING EDITOR
Sir ELIHU LAUTERPACHT, CBE, QC

Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge Bencher of Gray's Inn

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS



PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 IRP, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Times 10/12 pt. System LaTeX 2ε [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 84133 X hardback

The publisher has used its best endeavours to ensure that the URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.



CONTENTS

	n
Introduction	Page ix
Editorial Note	хi
Acknowledgements	xiii
Table of Cases Reported in Volume 7	xiv
Table of Cases Reported in Volumes 1–7	xvi
Digest of Cases Reported in Volume 7	xxiii
CASES	
Ethyl Corporation v. Government of Canada	3
Decision on the Place of Arbitration, 28 November 1997 Award on Jurisdiction, 24 June 1998	5 12
Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada	43
Ruling on Interim Measures, 7 January 2000	54
Award on Preliminary Motion to Dismiss the Claim, 26 January 2000	55
Award on the "Harmac Motion", 24 February 2000	64
Interim Award, 26 June 2000	69
Award on Canada's Motion regarding the "Super Fee", 7 August 2000	92
Ruling on Claim of Crown Privilege, 6 September 2000	99
Award on the Merits of Phase 2, 10 April 2001	102
Award on Damages, 31 May 2002	148
Final Award on Costs, 26 November 2002	170
Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6)	173
Award, 12 April 2002	178



V111	CONTENTS	
Methanex Corporation v. United St	ates of America	208
Decision on the Place of Arbitrat Decision on Petitions from Third	· ·	213
"Amici Curiae", 15 January 20 First Partial Award (Decision on	001	224
7 August 2002	Juristiction and Admissionity),	239
United Parcel Service of America In	nc. v. Government of Canada	285
Award on Jurisdiction, 22 Noven	nber 2002	288
Feldman v. United Mexican States ((ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1)	318
Interim Decision on Preliminary	Jurisdictional Issues,	
6 December 2000		327
Award, 16 December 2002		341
Dissenting opinion		407
Decision on the Correction and I 13 June 2003	nterpretation of the Award,	418
The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymo America (ICSID Case No. ARB)	· ·	421
	tence and Jurisdiction, 9 January 2001	425
Award, 26 June 2003		442
CMS Gas Transmission Company v	Populis of Amounting	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8)	. керионс ој Агденини	492
Decision on Objections to Jurisd	iction, 17 July 2003	494
ANNEX	XES AND INDEX	
	ed with effect from 1 January 2003)	525
ICSID (Additional Facility) Arbitra	tion Rules (as amended with effect	
from 1 January 2003)		547
Cumulative Index, Volumes 1–7		568



INTRODUCTION

Arbitral tribunals and *ad hoc* committees set up under the Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States administered by the International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes have produced a large number of awards and decisions. In recent years, through the Additional Facility mechanism, their number has increased substantially, and their contribution to both the substance of international investment law and the procedure of international arbitration grows in importance. Chapter 11 arbitration under NAFTA will increasingly contribute its share; so too do the increasing number of *ad hoc* arbitral decisions under bilateral and regional investment treaties. Moreover many of these cases raise vital issues of investment protection and relate to fundamental questions of the relations between national and international law.

Article 48(5) of the ICSID Convention provides that the Centre shall not publish an award without the consent of the parties thereto. In the absence of an official series of reports of these texts, a number have appeared unofficially, from time to time, in a variety of publications in different parts of the world. For those who wish to refer to these awards and decisions in a systematic manner, this diffusion has been a source of difficulty which has only been partially remedied by the provision of selected decisions on the ICSID website. There remains considerable value in collecting and presenting this material in a single publication accompanied by summaries, tables of cases and with a detailed cumulative index. Some of the texts have previously been available only in French or Spanish, and it has been thought desirable to make these available in English.

The novelty and importance of the concepts introduced and applied within ICSID, and more generally in the field of international investment arbitration, fully warrant the ever-growing literature dedicated to them. It is our hope that the present series will encourage even greater use of this developing system.

James Crawford Karen Lee

Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law University of Cambridge

November 2003



EDITORIAL NOTE

The ICSID Reports contain decisions rendered by arbitral tribunals and ad hoc committees set up within the framework of the Centre established pursuant to the ICSID Convention (including those rendered by ICSID tribunals established pursuant to bilateral investment treaties) and other decisions, whether judicial or arbitral, relating to such proceedings. These are accompanied by a full scholarly apparatus and index.

Volume 1 contains, in addition to the Basic Texts of the ICSID system, decisions in cases commenced during the period 1972 to 1981. Volume 2 contains material relating to proceedings commenced between 1981 and 1983, and Volume 3 contains the first three proceedings commenced in 1984. Volume 4 contains the texts of decisions and awards relating to ICSID cases commenced between 1984 and 1992. Volume 5 contains available texts of decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1992 and 2000, and Volume 6 contains those commenced between 1995 and 2001. Volume 7 contains decisions and awards for arbitration proceedings commenced between 1997 and 2002. These cases are now printed in chronological order according to the date of the main award or the date of the first reported stage of proceeding. All the proceedings relating to any given case are, so far as possible, assembled together in their own chronological order.

The awards and decisions in these *Reports* are reproduced, to the greatest extent possible, in the form in which they were handed down. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of a summary and of a bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. These are followed by the full text of the original decision, if available, or its translation. No attempt has been made to tamper with the texts by purporting to correct any errors or clarify obscurities of expression.

Attempts have been made to obtain the full text of all awards and decisions. Where only excerpts are available these have been reproduced. Any omission of material is indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets stating the nature of the passage which has been omitted. Should the full text of a previously excerpted or omitted decision or award subsequently become available it will be published in a later volume in the series.

Bold-letter headings preceding each case indicate the main points of law involved in the decision. These entries are also collected in a digest at the beginning of the volume.

The source of the material in this volume is indicated at the end of each case. Where the material has been published in more than one language, one publication in each language is listed. The language of the original decision is also mentioned.

Various tables are printed at the beginning of each volume: an alphabetical table of cases reported in the volume, a consolidated alphabetical table of all the cases so far reported and a digest of the cases reported in the volume.



xii

EDITORIAL NOTE

An index (consolidated in each succeeding volume) is published at the end of each volume.

Occasionally, material relating to arbitral proceedings, such as select bibliographies or an article summarizing a decision not yet in the public domain, will be published as an Annex at the end of a volume.



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The permissions granted for the publication of the following texts are gratefully acknowledged.

In addition to those prepared by the Editors, summaries were written by Ms Kylie Evans, Mr Philip van Gelder-Kimpton, Dr Joanna Gomula and Professor Christopher Greenwood, CMG QC. Ms Kylie Evans also provided general assistance.

The Index was prepared by Miss Maureen MacGlashan, CMG and the Tables were prepared by the Editors.

Thanks are due to the Secretary-General and staff of ICSID for their assistance in many ways, including the provision of texts of decisions where this could be done consistent with ICSID rules. Responsibility for the summaries and other contents of this volume remains, however, solely with the Editors.



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 7

[ALPHABETICAL]

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Page
CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Republic of Argentina (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8)	492
	494
Ethyl Corporation v. Government of Canada	3
Decision on the Place of Arbitration, 28 November 1997 Award on Jurisdiction, 24 June 1998	5 12
Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1) Interim Decision on Preliminary Jurisdictional Issues,	318
6 December 2000	327
Award, 16 December 2002	341
	407
Decision on the Correction and Interpretation of the Award,	
13 June 2003	418
The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States	
-5	421
Decision on Objection to Competence and Jurisdiction, 9 January 2001	425
Award, 26 June 2003	442
71ward, 20 June 2003	772
Methanex Corporation v. United States of America	208
Decision on the Place of Arbitration, 31 December 2000	213
Decision on Petitions from Third Persons to Intervene as	
"Amici Curiae", 15 January 2001	224
First Partial Award (Decision on Jurisdiction and Admissibility),	220
7 August 2002	239
Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic	
of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6)	173
Award, 12 April 2002	178
Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada	43
Ruling on Interim Measures, 7 January 2000	54
Award on Preliminary Motion to Dismiss the Claim, 26 January 2000 Award on the "Harmac Motion", 24 February 2000	55 64
Interim Award. 26 June 2000	69

xiv



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 7	xv
Award on Canada's Motion regarding the "Super Fee", 7 August 2000	92
Ruling on Claim of Crown Privilege, 6 September 2000	99
Award on the Merits of Phase 2, 10 April 2001	102
Award on Damages, 31 May 2002	148
Final Award on Costs, 26 November 2002	170
United Parcel Service of America Inc. v. Government of Canada	285
Award on Jurisdiction, 22 November 2002	288



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–7¹

[ALPHABETICAL]

	Vol., Page
ADF Group Inc. v. United States of America	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/00/1)	6 , 449
Procedural Order No. 2 Concerning Place of Arbitration,	2,
11 July 2001	6 , 453
Procedural Order No. 3 Concerning Production of Documents,	3, 122
4 October 2001	6 , 461
Award, 9 January 2003	6 , 470
11. a.u.,	0, ., 0
Adriano Gardella SpA v. Government of Côte d'Ivoire	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/74/1)	1, 283
Award, 29 August 1977 (excerpts)	1 , 287
AGIP SpA v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo	
(ICSID Case No. ARB 77/1)	1, 306
Award, 30 November 1979	1, 309
Amco Asia Corp., Pan American Development Ltd and PT Amco	
Indonesia v. Republic of Indonesia (ICSID Case No. ARB/81/1)	1, 376
Jurisdiction, 25 September 1983	1, 389
Provisional Measures, 9 December 1982	1 , 410
Award, 20 November 1984	1, 413
Annulment, 16 May 1986	1, 509
Resubmitted Case: Jurisdiction, 10 May 1988	1, 543
Resubmitted Case: Award, 5 June 1990	1, 569
Resubmitted Case: Rectification, 10 October 1990	1, 638
American Manufacturing and Trading Inc. v. Republic of Zaire	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/93/1)	5 , 11
Award, 21 February 1997	5 , 14
Individual Opinions, 21 February 1997	5 , 37
mulvidual Opinions, 211 Columny 1997	3, 37
Asian Agricultural Products Ltd [AAP] v. Democratic Socialist	
Republic of Sri Lanka (ICSID Case No. ARB/87/3)	4 , 245
Award, 27 June 1990	4 , 250
Dissenting Opinion, 27 June 1990	4 , 296
6 - F,	-, -, 0

xvi

¹ The figures in bold type refer to the volume number.



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–7	xvii
Atlantic Triton Company Limited v. People's Revolutionary Republic of Guinea (ICSID Case No. ARB/84/1) France, Cour d'appel, Rennes, 26 October 1984	3, 3 3, 4
France, Cour de cassation, Rennes, 18 November 1986 Award, 21 April 1986	3 , 10 3 , 13
Autopista Concesionada de Venezuela CA v. Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/5)	
Decision on Jurisdiction, 27 September 2001	6 , 419
Azinian, Davitian and Baca v. United Mexican States	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/97/2)	5 , 269
Award, 1 November 1998	5 , 272
Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic	
of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2)	1, 330
Award, 8 August 1980	1, 335
France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981	1, 368 1, 369
France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987	1, 309 1, 373
Trailee, Cour de cussation, Furis, 21 July 1707	1, 373
Cable Television of Nevis Ltd and Cable Television of Nevis Holdings	
Ltd v. Federation of St Kitts and Nevis (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/2)	5 , 106
Award, 13 January 1997	5 , 108
Casado and President Allende Foundation v. Republic of Chile	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/98/2)	6 , 373
Decision on Provisional Measures, 25 September 2001	6 , 375
Ceskoslovenska Obchodni Banka AS v. Slovak Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/97/4)	5 , 330
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 24 May 1999	5 , 335
Decision on Further and Partial Objections to Jurisdiction, 1 December 2000	5 , 358
1 December 2000	3, 336
CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Republic of Argentina	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8)	7 , 492
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 17 July 2003	7 , 494
Compañía de Aguas del Aconquija SA and Compagnie Générale	
des Eaux/Vivendi Universal v. Argentine Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/97/3)	5 , 296
Award, 21 November 2000	5 , 299
Decision on the Challenge to the President of the Committee, 3 October 2001	6 , 330
Decision on Annulment, 3 July 2002	6 , 340
Decision on Filmument, 5 July 2002	0 , 540



xviii TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–7

Compañía del Desarrollo de Santa Elena SA v. Republic of Costa Rica (ICSID Case No. ARB/96/1) Award, 17 February 2000 Rectification of Award, 8 June 2000	5 , 153 5 , 157 5 , 180
Ethyl Corporation v. Government of Canada Decision on the Place of Arbitration, 28 November 1997 Award on Jurisdiction, 24 June 1998	7 , 3 7 , 5 7 , 12
Fedax NV v. Republic of Venezuela (ICSID Case No. ARB/96/3) Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 11 July 1997 Award, 9 March 1998	5 , 183 5 , 186 5 , 200
Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1) Interim Decision on Preliminary Jurisdictional Issues, 6 December 2000 Award, 16 December 2002 Dissenting Opinion Decision on the Correction and Interpretation of the Award, 13 June 2003	7, 318 7, 327 7, 341 7, 407 7, 418
Genin and Others v. Republic of Estonia (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/2) Award, 25 June 2001 Decision on Claimants' Request for Supplementary Decisions and Rectification, 4 April 2002	6 , 236 6 , 241 6 , 304
Goetz and Others v. Republic of Burundi (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/3) Award, 10 February 1999 Part 1. Decision on Liability, 2 September 1998 Part 2. The Parties' Agreement, 23 December 1998	6, 3 6, 5 6, 5 6, 46
Gruslin v. Malaysia (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/3) Award, 27 November 2000	5 , 483 5 , 484
Kaiser Bauxite Company v. Government of Jamaica (ICSID Case No. ARB/73/3) Jurisdiction and Competence, 6 July 1975	1, 296 1, 298
Klöckner Industrie-Anlagen GmbH, Klöckner Belge SA and Klöckner Handelsmaatschappij BV v. Republic of Cameroon and Société Camerounaise des Engrais SA (ICSID Case No. ARB/81/2) Award, 21 October 1983 (excerpts) Dissenting Opinion, 21 October 1983 (excerpts) Annulment, 3 May 1985	2, 3 2, 9 2, 77 2, 95



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–7	xix
LANCO International Inc. v. Argentine Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/97/6)	5 , 367
Preliminary Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 1998	5 , 369
•	
Lemire v. Ukraine (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/1)	6 , 59
Award embodying the Parties' Settlement Agreement,	,
18 September 2000	6 , 60
Liberian Eastern Timber Corporation [LETCO] v. Government of the	
Republic of Liberia (ICSID Case No. ARB/83/2)	2 , 343
Award, 31 March 1986	2 , 346
Rectification, 10 June 1986	2 , 380
United States, District Court, Southern District of New York,	
5 September 1986	2 , 383
United States, District Court, Southern District of New York,	
12 December 1986	2 , 385
United States District Court, District of Columbia, 16 April 1987	2 , 390
The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States of	
America (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/3)	7 , 421
Decision on Objection to Competence and Jurisdiction,	.,
9 January 2001	7 , 425
Award, 26 June 2003	7 , 442
Maffezini v. Kingdom of Spain (ICSID Case No. ARB/97/7)	5 , 387
Decision on Request for Provisional Measures (Procedural Order	2,007
No. 2), 28 October 1999	5 , 393
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 25 January 2000	5 , 396
Award, 13 November 2000	5 , 419
Rectification of Award, 31 January 2001	5 , 440
Maritime International Nominees Establishment [MINE] v. Republic	
of Guinea (ICSID Case No. ARB/84/4)	4, 3
United States, District Court, District of Columbia, 12 January 1981	4 , 4
United States, Court of Appeals, District of Columbia,	4.0
12 November 1982	4 , 8
Belgium, Rechtbank van eerste aanleg, Antwerp, 27 September 1985	4 , 32
Switzerland, Tribunal fédéral, 4 December 1985	4 , 35
Switzerland, Tribunal de première instance, Geneva, 13 March 1986 Switzerland, Autorité de surveillance des offices de poursuite pour	4 , 41
dettes et de faillite, Geneva, 7 October 1986	4 , 45
Award, 6 January 1988	4 , 54



xx TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–7

Annulment, 22 December 1989 Request for Annulment, Procedural Order No. 1, 17 May 1988	4 , 79 4 , 110
Application for Stay of Enforcement of Award, Interim Order No. 1, 12 August 1988	
No. 1, 12 August 1966	4 , 111
Metalclad Corporation v. United Mexican States	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/97/1)	5 , 209
Award, 30 August 2000	5 , 212
Canada, Supreme Court of British Columbia, United Mexican	
States v. Metalclad	
Judicial Review, 2 May 2001	5 , 236
Supplementary Reasons for Judgment, 31 October 2001	6 , 52
Methanex Corporation v. United States of America	7 , 208
Decision on the Place of Arbitration, 31 December 2000	7 , 213
Decision on Petitions from Third Persons to Intervene as	
"Amici Curiae", 15 January 2001	7 , 224
First Partial Award (Decision on Jurisdiction and Admissibility),	
7 August 2002	7 , 239
Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic	
of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6)	7 , 173
Award, 12 April 2002	7 , 178
Mihaly International Corporation v. Democratic Socialist Republic	
of Sri Lanka (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/2)	6 , 308
Award, 15 March 2002	6 , 310
Individual Concurring Opinion, 15 March 2002	6 , 323
8-1	-,
Mobil Oil Corporation, Mobil Petroleum Company Inc., Mobil Oil	
New Zealand v. Her Majesty the Queen in Right of New Zealand	4 117
(ICSID Case No. ARB/87/2)	4 , 117
New Zealand, High Court, 1 July 1987 Findings on Liability, Interpretation and Allied Issues, 4 May 1989	4 , 119 4 , 140
	,
Mondev International Ltd v. United States of America	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/2)	6 , 181
Miscellaneous Procedural Orders	6 , 186
Award, 11 October 2002	6 , 192
Olguín v. Republic of Paraguay (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/5)	6 , 154
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 August 2000	6 , 156
Award, 26 July 2001	6 , 164



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–7	xxi
Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada	7 , 43
Ruling on Interim Measures, 7 January 2000	7 , 54
Award on Preliminary Motion to Dismiss the Claim,	,
26 January 2000	7 , 55
Award on the "Harmac Motion", 24 February 2000	7 , 64
Interim Award, 26 June 2000	7 , 69
Award on Canada's Motion regarding the "Super Fee",	
7 August 2000	7 , 92
Ruling on Claim of Crown Privilege, 6 September 2000	7 , 99
Award on the Merits of Phase 2, 10 April 2001	7 , 102
Award on Damages, 31 May 2002	7 , 148
Final Award on Costs, 26 November 2002	7 , 170
Salini Costruttori SpA and Italstrade SpA v. Kingdom of Morocco	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/00/4)	6 , 398
Decision on Jurisdiction, 23 July 2001	6 , 400
Scimitar Exploration Limited v. Republic of Bangladesh and	
Bangladesh Oil, Gas and Mineral Corporation	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/92/2)	5 , 3
Award, 5 April 1994	5, 4
Société Ouest Africaine des Bétons Industriels [SOABI] v. State of	
Senegal (ICSID Case No. ARB/82/1)	2 , 164
Jurisdiction, 1 August 1984	2 , 175
Award, 25 February 1988	2 , 190
Dissenting Opinion, 25 February 1988	2 , 277
Declaration of the President of the Tribunal, 25 February 1988	2 , 333
France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 5 December 1989	2 , 337
France, Cour de cassation, 11 June 1991	2 , 341
Southern Pacific Properties (Middle East) Limited [SPP(ME)] v. Arab	
Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/84/3)	3 , 45
ICC Award No. YD/AS No. 3493, 11 March 1983	3 , 49
France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 12 July 1984	3 , 79
Netherlands, District Court, Amsterdam, 12 July 1984	3 , 92
France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 6 January 1987	3 , 96
Jurisdiction (No. 1), 27 November 1985	3 , 101
Jurisdiction (No. 2), 14 April 1988	3 , 131
Dissenting Opinion, 14 April 1988	3 , 163
Award, 20 May 1992	3 , 189
Dissenting Opinion, 20 May 1992	3 , 249



xxii TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1-7 Tradex Hellas SA v. Republic of Albania (ICSID Case No. ARB/94/2) **5**, 43 Decision on Jurisdiction, 24 December 1996 **5**, 47 Award, 29 April 1999 **5**, 70 United Parcel Service of America Inc. v. Government of Canada 7, 285 Award on Jurisdiction, 22 November 2002 7,288 Vacuum Salt Products Limited v. Government of Republic of Ghana (ICSID Case No. ARB/92/1) 4, 320 Provisional Measures, 14 June 1992 **4**, 323 Award, 16 February 1994 **4**, 329 Waste Management Inc. v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/2) **5**, 443 Award, 2 June 2000 **5**, 445 Dissenting Opinion, 2 June 2000 **5**, 462 (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/00/3) **6**, 538 Decision on Venue of the Arbitration, 26 September 2001 **6**, 541 **6**, 549 Decision on Preliminary Objection, 26 June 2002 Wena Hotels Ltd v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/4) **6**, 67 Decision on Jurisdiction, 29 June 1999 **6**, 74 Award, 8 December 2000 **6**, 89 Decision on Annulment, 5 February 2002 6, 129



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 7

Admissibility

Additional claims – ICSID Arbitration Rule 40 – Additional claims admissible in reply when no limitation as to reply's contents

Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6), 173

Nature and subject-matter of dispute – Separate disputes or single continuous dispute – Events occurring before and after Request for Arbitration not a determinant factor – Incidental or additional claims under Article 46 of the ICSID Convention

CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Republic of Argentina (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8), 492

Of claims – Ancillary and additional claims – NAFTA Article 1102 – NAFTA Article 1120(2) – Article 48 of the Additional Facility Arbitration Rules – Omission to rely on claim in notice of arbitration

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1), 318

Of claims – Claims pre-dating NAFTA's entry into force – Course of action continuing after NAFTA's entry into force

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1), 318

Of claims – Time limitation for making claims – Meaning of "making a claim" – NAFTA Article 1117 – Receipt of claim by ICSID Secretary-General – Suspension of period of limitation – "Discouraging" a claim not a factor in suspension of period of limitation

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1), 318

Applicable law

Egypt–Greece Bilateral Investment Treaty, Article 11 – What constitutes agreement as to the rules of law within the meaning of ICSID Convention, Article 42(1) – Application of national law provisions limiting claims existing under a bilateral investment treaty

Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6), 173

xxiii



xxiv

DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 7

Arbitration

Arbitration tribunal – UNCITRAL – North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11 – Jurisdiction and powers – Procedure and evidence

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada, 43

Arbitration tribunal – UNCITRAL – North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11 – Jurisdiction and powers – Procedure and evidence – Award of costs

Ethyl Corporation v. Government of Canada, 3

North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11 – UNCITRAL arbitration – Investor commencing arbitration proceedings under NAFTA, Chapter 11 – Whether Canada violating Articles 1102, 1105, 1106 and 1110 of NAFTA

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada, 43

North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11 – UNCITRAL arbitration – Jurisdiction – Investment disputes – Definition – Whether measure relating to trade in goods capable of being measure relating to an investment – Procedural requirements for bringing claim – Waiver of right to institute or continue national proceedings – Whether going to jurisdiction

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada, 43

North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11 – UNCITRAL arbitration – Place of arbitration – Jurisdiction – Procedure – Investment disputes – Definition – Whether measure relating to trade in goods capable of being measure relating to an investment – Procedural requirements for bringing claim – Whether going to jurisdiction – Award of costs

Ethyl Corporation v. Government of Canada, 3

North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11 – UNCITRAL arbitration – Procedure and evidence – Claim of Crown privilege – Whether available before UNCITRAL arbitral tribunal – Whether State required to identify documents and produce reasoned submissions regarding their confidentiality – Whether UNCITRAL Tribunal empowered to compel production of documents – Scope of solicitor–client privilege – Claim – Amendment to claim

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada, 43

Compensation

Compound interest – Integral part of compensation due for expropriation – Standard of international law in expropriation cases

Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6), 173



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 7

xxv

Costs

Final phase of arbitration – Circumstances of case – Whether reasonable to apportion costs – Necessity to consider variety of aspects to reach reasonable result – Canada failing on important legal aspects of case – Difficulties caused by Canada's failure to produce documents – Articles 38 and 40 of UNCITRAL Arbitration Rules

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada, 43

Damages

Egypt–Greece Bilateral Investment Treaty, Article 4 – Claim for damages must relate to expropriation measure – Article 4 does not cover losses due to commercial risk or State procedures not covered by Article 4

Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6), 173

Heads of damages – Value of management time devoted to claim – Alleged losses flowing from shutdown of mills – Out of pocket expenses relating to Verification Review Episode – Out of pocket expenses directly incurred by Investor with respect to Interim Hearing – Whether recoverable

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada, 43

Mitigation of – Duty to mitigate as part of general principles of international law – ICSID Convention, Article 42

Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6), 173

Expropriation

Compensation for – Egypt–Greece Bilateral Investment Treaty, Article 4 – Compensation shall amount to market value of investment

Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6), 173

Definition – North American Free Trade Agreement, Article 1110 – Measures tantamount to expropriation – Meaning – Whether extending beyond concept of expropriation in general international law – Creeping expropriation

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada, 43

Egypt–Greece Bilateral Investment Treaty, Article 4 – Prohibition of imports – Seizure of ship without appropriate notification

Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6), 173



xxvi

DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 7

NAFTA Article 1110 – Claimant must establish denial of justice under NAFTA Article 1105 – Claimant unable to establish breach of Article 1105

The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States of America (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/3), 421

NAFTA Article 1110 – Expropriation through taxation – Tax rebates for export of cigarettes – "Creeping" expropriation – Governmental regulatory activities – Expropriation and regulation

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1), 318

Foreign Investment

Definition of investment – Egypt–Greece Bilateral Investment Treaty, Article 1 – Licence for importation and storage of goods – Lease of vessel by investor constitutes "investment"

Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6), 173

Investment disputes – Egypt–Greece Bilateral Investment Treaty, Article 10.2 – Submission of dispute to either the competent national court or an international arbitration tribunal

Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6), 173

Interest

On Award on Damages – On Award on Costs – Rate of interest – Date from which interest payable

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada, 43

Interpretation

Fair and equitable treatment – Egypt–Greece Bilateral Investment Treaty, Article 2.2 – Failure to apply appropriate notification procedures

Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6), 173

ICSID Convention, Article 25(1) – Interpretation of "investment" – Shares as an investment – Whether minority shareholders have a different standing and an independent claim from the corporation – Whether an investment must involve control or majority ownership

CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Republic of Argentina (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8), 492



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 7

xxvii

Interpretation and correction of award - Interpretation and supplementary decision

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1), 318

North American Free Trade Agreement, Article 1101 – Measures adopted or maintained by a Party – Whether judicial acts included

The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States of America (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/3), 421

North American Free Trade Agreement, Article 1101 – Measures adopted or maintained by a Party – Whether State conduct inducing private settlement agreement included

The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States of America (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/3), 421

North American Free Trade Agreement, Article 1101(1)—"Relating to"—Legally significant connection between disputed measure and investor required to establish claim

Methanex Corporation v. United States of America, 208

North American Free Trade Agreement, Article 1102 – Discrimination against foreign investors – Example of "most favourable treatment accorded in like circumstances" required – No example available to Tribunal – Breach not demonstrated

The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States of America (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/3), 421

North American Free Trade Agreement, Article 1105 – Meaning of obligations to provide "fair and equitable treatment" and "full protection and security" – Whether free-standing obligations or obligations under customary international law – Whether bad faith and malicious intention required – Whether conduct of trial was so flawed that it constituted a manifest injustice and breach of minimum standards prescribed in NAFTA and international law – Gross failure of trial judge to afford due process breached minimum standards

The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States of America (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/3), 421

North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11 – Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969, Article 31(1) – No rule of restrictive interpretation

Methanex Corporation v. United States of America, 208



xxviii

DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 7

Jurisdiction

Bilateral investment treaty – Exchange of notes does not constitute the submission of a dispute to arbitration

Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6), 173

Claims brought by investor – NAFTA Article 1116(1)(b) – Limitations on investor–State disputes – NAFTA Article 1502(3)(a) – Relationship between NAFTA Chapter 11 and Chapter 15 – Section A of NAFTA Chapter 11 – Claims concerning actions of monopolies

United Parcel Service of America Inc. v. Government of Canada, 285

Domestic dispute settlement provisions in contract – Relation between contractual claims and treaty claims – Functions of different instruments – "Fork-in-theroad" provision – Whether domestic litigation involved the same dispute and the same parties

CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Republic of Argentina (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8), 492

Failure to exhaust domestic remedies – Distinguished from waiver of domestic proceedings – Requirement to exhaust local remedies applicable to NAFTA – Remedies available to Claimants not exhausted

The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States of America (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/3), 421

Legal dispute arising directly out of an investment – Whether claims relating to general emergency economic policies directly affect the investment

CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Republic of Argentina (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8), 492

Minimum requirements of pleading – Essential elements of claim – Whether Amended Statement of Claim adequately giving notice to Canada of essential elements of claim – Whether enabling Canada to formulate statement of defence

United Parcel Service of America Inc. v. Government of Canada, 285

Minimum standard of treatment – NAFTA Article 1105 – Obligation to accord fair and equitable treatment – Customary international law – No rule of customary international law prohibiting anticompetitive behaviour – Uncompetitive and unfair conduct of monopoly – Government's failure to supervise



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 7

xxix

or exercise control over monopoly – Interpretation of NAFTA Free Trade Commission

United Parcel Service of America Inc. v. Government of Canada, 285

National treatment – "Cultural industries" exemption – "Subsidies" exemption – Insufficient evidence to decide on jurisdiction

United Parcel Service of America Inc. v. Government of Canada, 285

Sources of applicable law – Whether national law or international law applies – Parties' choice of law – Article 42 of ICSID Convention

CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Republic of Argentina (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8), 492

Municipal Law

Denial of justice – Access to domestic courts – NAFTA Article 1110

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1), 318

Nationality

National treatment – Non-discrimination – NAFTA Article 1102 – Like circumstances – Less favourable treatment of foreign investors

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1), 318

Standing – Nationality and permanent residence – Definition of nationals – NAFTA Article 201

Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1), 318

Whether continuous nationality of claimant required – Language of NAFTA not dispositive – Issue to be decided in accordance with applicable rules of international law – Continuous nationality to date of award required

The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States of America (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/3), 421

Procedure

Amicus curiae petitions – UNCITRAL Arbitration Rules, Article 15(1) – Tribunal's power to accept – UNCITRAL Arbitration Rules, Article 25(6) – Tribunal's discretion to deal with submissions – UNCITRAL Arbitration Rules, Article 25(4) – Requirement for oral hearings to be held in camera – Confidentiality – Amicus curiae submissions permitted but petitioners not to be present



XXX

Cambridge University Press 052184133X - ICSID Reports, Volume 7 Edited by James Crawford and Karen Lee Frontmatter More information

DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 7

at in camera oral hearings – Disclosure of arbitration materials to petitioners a matter for disputing parties not Tribunal

Methanex Corporation v. United States of America, 208

Challenges to jurisdiction – Standard of proof required of Claimant on allegations of fact and law at preliminary stage – Credible allegations of factual and legal basis of claim sufficient

Methanex Corporation v. United States of America, 208

Distinction between challenges to jurisdiction and challenges to admissibility – UNCITRAL Arbitration Rules, Article 21(1) – Tribunal's power to rule on objections to jurisdiction and admissibility – No power to rule on admissibility of claim

Methanex Corporation v. United States of America, 208

Place of arbitration – UNCITRAL Notes on Organizing Arbitral Proceedings – Suitability of law on arbitral procedure and enforcement – Availability and cost of support services – Location of subject-matter of dispute – Neutrality

Methanex Corporation v. United States of America, 208

State Responsibility

Organ of State – Type of organ immaterial for attribution – Article 4 of International Law Commission's Articles on State Responsibility, 2002

CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Republic of Argentina (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8), 492

Treatment of aliens – Investor protection – North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11 – National treatment – Meaning of "like circumstances" – Minimum standard of treatment – Fair and equitable treatment – Full protection and security – Use of terms in bilateral investment treaties – Expropriation

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada, 43

Treaties

Interpretation – North American Free Trade Agreement, Chapter 11 – Article 1105 – NAFTA Free Trade Commission interpreting Article 1105 – Effect – Whether valid exercise of power – Whether binding – Whether operating retroactively – Proper interpretation of Article 1105 – Canada failing to produce documents relevant to negotiating history when requested – Effect on Tribunal's work and Chapter 11 process – Distinction between international law and customary



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 7

xxxi

international law - Nature and content of customary international law with respect to Article 1105 - Whether Investor entitled to damages under Article 1105

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada, 43

Interpretation – Principles of interpretation – Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969, Articles 31 to 33 – Application to North American Free Trade Agreement

Ethyl Corporation v. Government of Canada, 3

Interpretation – Principles of interpretation – Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969, Articles 31 to 33 – Application to North American Free Trade Agreement

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada, 43

North American Free Trade Agreement – Aims and objectives – Interpretation – Requirement of national treatment – Minimum standard of treatment

Ethyl Corporation v. Government of Canada, 3

Trade – Investment – North American Free Trade Agreement – Aims and objectives – Interpretation – Relationship with general international law – Requirement of national treatment – Minimum standard of treatment – Performance requirements

Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada, 43