

Index

- absurdity, 120–121
 “affirmations,” 47–48, 243
 inexpressible, 47–48, 49, 50–51
 ostensive element in, 50
 self-verifying, 48, 49, 66–67, 246
 analytic philosophers, 133
 analytic philosophy, 14–15, 16–17, 77, 234
 contribution to larger history, 195–196
 distinctive methods of, 147–148, 196, 197–198, 207
 history of, 114, 224
 and linguistic inquiry, 2–3, 209
 linguistic turn, 149
 as logical analysis, 29
 relation to phenomenology, 78, 79, 80, 106, 108
 analytic philosophy of mind, 23, 27–28, 149, 213, 222–223, 237
 analytic tradition, *see* analytic philosophy
 analytic/synthetic distinction, 157;
 see also synthetic a priori
 anomalous monism, 256
 Anscombe, G. E. M., 249
 argument from illusion, 113
 Armstrong, D., 183–184, 258
 Austin, J. L., 111, 113
 Ayer, A. J., 111, 112–113, 251

 behavior, 161
 behaviorism, 48–49, 106, 114, 115–116, 150
 Skinnerian, 169
 see also logical behaviorism

 Berkeley, George, 91, 113
 Black, M., 155–156, 160, 256
 Block, N., 187, 193
 Blumberg, A., 251

 Carnap, Rudolf, 13, 19, 52–58, 81, 197, 245
 Der Logische Aufbau der Welt, 10–13, 32–40
 distinguished from phenomenologists, 32–33
 logical construction in *Aufbau*, 12, 32–33
 logical syntax program, 52–53, 101
 “Physicalist Language as the Universal Language of Science, The,” 53–56
 “Protocol Sentences,” 56–58
 “Psychology and Physical Language,” 112
 quasi-analysis in *Aufbau*, 33, 241
 recent scholarship on, 32
 structural definite descriptions, 33–34, 38, 241
 structuralization, 34–36
 Cartesian theory of mind, 114, 121–122, 206, 233
 and knowledge, 122
 misportrays logic of language, 114, 117, 124
 origin of, 117
 and sensation, 126–131, 141
 Cassirer, E., 241
 category mistake, 116–121, 144–146
 examples, 116–117
 causal analysis, 184

- Cavell, S., 261
 Chalmers, David, 8–10, 13, 197, 202, 247
 “hard problem” of consciousness, 9
 “principle of structural coherence,” 13
 on structural and functional
 explanation, 8–10
 Chinese Nation, 240
 Chinese Room, 240
 Chisholm, R., 243
 Chomsky, N., 257
 Churchland, P., 254
 Coffa, A., 243
 cognitive science, 155, 191
 coherence theory of truth, 30, 46–47, 76,
 200, 240
 concepts, as necessary for knowledge,
 81–82
 color concepts, 98
 mental concepts, 112, 114, 124
 conceptual analysis, 12, 79, 104, 114, 134,
 146
 and epistemological insight, 11–12
 historical analysis as, 4
 in logical positivism, 84
 phenomenology as, 86
 Ryle’s conception of, 113, 114, 136,
 148–149
 consciousness
 basic elements of, 3, 6, 7, 12, 21, 67–68,
 70, 80, 221
 different streams of experience,
 39–40, 61–64
 elementary experiences, 32
 as field of interiority and privacy, 213
 as inexpressible, 22, 31, 65–67, 204
 intrinsic character of, 22
 as physical, 148
 place in nature, 208–209
 presence of basic experiences, 66–67
 problem of explaining, 1–3, 5, 17–19,
 31, 77, 105, 149, 151–152, 195–235
 problematic features of, 1, 2, 5–6,
 199–201, 237–238
 as resistant to structural explanation,
 14, 17, 19, 25, 26, 28, 67–68, 79, 105,
 106, 151–152, 195, 213–235, 240
 as a semantic problem, 19
 structure of, 2
 subjectivity of, 202, 237
 as unintelligible, 76
 see also experience
 conventionalism, 100–102, 104, 212
 correspondence theory of truth, 30, 75,
 240
 criteria for mental states, 173–174
 critique, 196, 201, 215–217, 222–223

 Davidson, D., 256; *see also* anomalous
 monism
 demonstrative element, *see* ostension,
 demonstrative element in
 Dennett, D. C., 205–207, 237, 258, 259
 Consciousness Explained, 206–207
 method of heterophenomenology,
 205–207
 Descartes, Rene, 78, 209; *see also*
 Cartesian theory of mind
 dispositions, 115, 122–126, 136, 220
 as inviting causal analysis, 134–135
 nonfactual account of, 123–126
 relation to facts, 123–126
 dualism, 163, 166, 202, 220

 eidetic variation, *see* free variation
 eliminativism, 139, 143, 254
 epiphenomenalism, 259
 epistemology, 29, 55–58, 85
 in *Aufbau*, 32, 38–40, 68
 and conceptual structures, 100
 difference in epistemic perspectives,
 62–63
 empiricist, 30, 68
 foundationalist, 46, 69, 127, 200, 243
 and qualia, 7
 reconstructional, 77
 scientific, 80
 of structure of experience, 96
 experience, 28, 78, 238–240
 as content, 80
 elementary experiences, 12, 32
 intractability of, 197
 language of, 3, 20–21, 24, 25, 110
 lived experience, 78
 pre-predicative, 93
 private, 11–12, 140
 streams of, 61–64
 see also consciousness
 explanation
 causal, 3
 deductive-nomological model, 247
 of forms of life, 109
 genetic, 4
 narrative, 4
 scientific, 11, 25
 semantic, 3
 structuralist, 3–4, 17–19
 explanatory gap, 5–6
 externalism, 187, 255

 Feigl, Herbert, 28, 74, 238–240, 251
 first-person methods
 limitations of, 206
 in phenomenology, 106

- Fodor, J., 185–186, 192
 anti-reductionism, 175, 184, 257
 “Explanations in Psychology,” 168–172
Psychological Explanation, 185
 formal/material distinction, 248
 formalization, *see* structuralization
 foundationalism, *see* epistemology,
 foundationalist
 free variation, 92, 93, 97
 Frege, G., 15, 210, 244, 252
 on sense and reference, 255
 Friedman, Michael, 241
 functional description, 159, 169–172,
 180
 one-many relationship to physical
 description, 175–177
see also logical-level description
 functional states, 177
 functionalism, 4, 17, 25, 150, 198, 200,
 208, 212, 254
 arguments for, 172–176
 as causal analysis, 190
 causal-role, 161, 181–188, 194, 238
 definition, 2, 4, 258
 development of, 186–188, 221–222
 difference from logical behaviorism,
 173–174
 difficulties explaining consciousness,
 25
 historical dynamics of origin, 200
 as hybrid doctrine, 190–193
 machine analogy, 163–166, 170, 179
 multiple-realization argument,
 174–176, 182–183
 objections to, 179–180
 origins in Fodor, 168–169
 origins in Putnam, 164–166
 as structuralist, 152, 153, 200, 204
- ghost in the machine, 114, 116
 “given” elements of experience, *see* basic
 elements of experience
 grammatical analysis, *see* conceptual
 analysis; linguistic analysis
- Haller, R., 243
 Hampshire, S., 140–142
 Hempel, C., 52, 72, 112, 247, 252, 256
 Hilbert, D., 40–41, 163–164
 Hintikka, J., 249
 historical analysis, *see* historical
 investigation
 historical investigation, 20, 28, 107, 192,
 199–201, 202, 203, 207–208, 240
 historical dynamics of consciousness
 debate, 199–201
- human self-image, 196, 213–214, 215
 Hume, David, 91
 Husserl, Edmund, 77–83, 198, 219–220
Cartesian Meditations, 78
Experience and Judgment, 93–95
*Ideas Pertaining to a Pure Phenomenology
 and to a Phenomenological Philosophy,
 First Book*, 92–93
 and language, 250
Logical Investigations, 89–92
 theory of abstraction, 88, 91
see also phenomenology; synthetic a
 priori; *Wesensschau*
- Hylton, P., 259
- Idealism, 215
 identity claims, logic of, 153, 154–155,
 160–161, 178
 identity theory, 114–115, 116, 131–150,
 152–157, 174, 182, 200, 220–221
 basis in reflection on language,
 138–140
 as empirical program, 155, 162
 identity thesis as synthetic rather than
 analytic, 133, 154–157
 objections to, 133
 structuralist assumptions of, 149–150
 imagination, 94
 relation to experience, 105
 as source of concepts, 97, 105
see also free variation
 implicit definition, 40–41
 incommunicability of content, 31, 39–40,
 42, 59–64, 66, 68
 in Schlick, 42–45
 indexicality, 64–66; *see also* ostension
 intrinsic monism, 13, 37
 introspection, 230–231, 232
 intuition, 39–40, 41, 42, 81
 categorial, 89, 93
 eidetic, 86–88
 intuitive act, 82
 knowledge by intuition impossible,
 81
 relation to concepts, 41–42
see also *Wesensschau*
 intuition of essences, *see* *Wesensschau*
 inverted spectrum, 25, 240
- Jackson, Frank, 237
 Jacobs, Norman, 251
 James, William, 6
- Kant, I., 119–120, 216; *see also* critique;
 neo-Kantianism
 Kaplan, D., 245

- Kim, J., 9, 156, 175, 239
 “knowledge argument,” 240
 Kripke, S., 254
- language
 and the intelligibility of consciousness, 25–28
 learning of, 98, 129
 logical structure of, 2, 15, 16, 52
 in phenomenology after Husserl, 108
 priority of, 26–28, 110, 237–239
 social background of, 135
 structuralist theory of, *see* structuralist theory of meaning
 as unified structure, 196
 language learning, 129
 language of consciousness, *see* language of experience
 language of experience, 3, 25, 69, 109, 141–143, 147, 214
 and analytic clarification, 233
 in basis of functionalism, 151, 152, 191–194, 221
 as evidence for identity theory, 150
 as impossible or inadequate, 20–21
 meaningful prior to any structuralist theory, 71
 as mysterious, 209
 new approach to, 153
 in projects of analytic philosophy, 24
 resists structuralist project, 22, 28, 214–215, 216, 238–240
 and structuralism, 204, 222–223
 as yielding insights in analytic philosophy, 213–214
 “layered model” of the world, 7–8, 239
 Lehrer, K., 246
 Leibniz, G., 89
 Lewis, C. I., 6–8, 13, 19, 251
 on “given element in experience,” 6–7
 Lewis, D., 181–194
 “Argument for the Identity Theory, An,” 181–183
 “How to Define Theoretical Terms,” 188–190
 physicalism of, 182
 lightning, 154
 linguistic analysis, 3, 14–15, 25, 103, 105, 110, 116, 147, 210–213
 clarifies meaning, 217–223
 committed to structuralist picture, 14–15, 16–17
 history of, 1930–50, 111–113
 in phenomenology, 92
see also analytic philosophy; logical analysis
 Locke, J., 91, 113
- logical analysis, 60, 77, 111, 180, 181, 190
 logical behaviorism, 114, 152, 153–154, 158–159, 168, 180, 184, 190, 252
 arguments against, 167–168, 172–173, 182
 in Carnap, 112, 114, 256
 definition, 256
 dispositionalist, 131–132, 133
 in Hempel, 112
 in Lewis’s account, 259
 logical form of experience, 79–80
 logical positivism, 81, 84, 112, 147, 211
see also Carnap, R.; Neurath, O.; Schlick, M.; Vienna Circle
 logical structure of language, 211
 logical-level description, 163–164
 versus physical-level description, 164
 Lyons, W., 253
- material a priori, *see* synthetic a priori
 materialism, *see* physicalism
mathesis universalis, 89–90
 McGinn, C., 260
 meaning
 objectivity of, 15
 as logical structure, 37, 147, 148
 metaphysical realism, 98
 method of analytic reflection, 223–224, 233–235
 answers to specific needs, 232–233
 and first-person methods, 229–231
 produces clarifications, 230–231, 232
 as self-reflection, 225–227
 and third-person methods, 227–229
 mind-body problem, 18
 Mohanty, J. N., 248
 Moore, G. E., 111, 113
 Moran, R., 261
 Morris, Bertram, 251
 Morris, Charles, 251
- Nagel, Ernest, 251
 Nagel, Thomas, 72, 237, 247
 naturalism, 52, 72; *see also* physicalism
 neo-Kantianism, 85, 241
 Neurath, O., 30–31, 152, 218–219, 242, 245
 and physicalism, 43–52
 physicalist view of language, 42–45, 50
 response to Schlick, 48–49
 and structuralism, 44–47
see also physicalism, semantic neurophysiological states, 12
 neutral monism, *see* intrinsic monism

- Oberdan, Thomas, 243
- objectivity, 29, 33, 51, 107, 197, 199, 208
 in analytic tradition, 198
 as dependent on structuralization, 34–36
 logical forms of, 89
 objective reality, 78
 structuralism suited to, 107
 tied to expressibility, 38
- Oppenheim, P., 73–74, 162
- ordinary language, 100, 109, 124, 129, 134, 139
 background skills ascribed in, 122
 commitments of ordinary mentalistic concepts, 140–142, 143–144, 146
 and Husserl, 88
 influenced by Cartesian theory, 143
- ordinary language philosophy, 113, 166, 252, 261
- ostension, 34, 43, 50, 60, 61–64, 66, 218
 demonstrative element in, 47–48
 ostensive reference to particulars, 36
 private ostension, 65, 246
 as replaceable by objective description, 65–67, 245
 use in establishing meanings of basic terms, 41
see also affirmations, ostensive element in; protocol sentences, ostensive element in
- panpsychism, 259
- passive synthesis, 95, 97–98, 101
- Paul, G. A., 112–113, 254
- Peirce, Charles S., 6
- phenomenalism, 32
- phenomenological laws, 94, 219; *see also* phenomenological propositions
- phenomenological propositions, 83–110, 219
 origin of, 87, 88–99
 tied to particular experiential domains, 101
see also synthetic a priori
- phenomenology, 77–79, 82–85, 230–231
 eidetic analysis, 104
 first-person method, 78
 method of *epoché*, 78
 phenomenological analysis, 103
 relation to analytic philosophy, 77, 250
 tradition after Husserl, 108
see also free variation; passive synthesis; phenomenological laws; phenomenological propositions; *Wesensschau*
- philosophical history, *see* historical investigation
- physical language, 53–58
- physicalism, 9, 11, 15, 16, 17, 31–32, 70–71, 149–150, 203, 208
 definition, 2, 3–4
 in Dennett's heterophenomenology, 206
 development after Neurath, 71–75, 112
 history of, 10
 in Identity Theory, 131, 152–153, 182, 221
 as ontological doctrine, 72–75, 247
 physicalist explanation as relational, 10
 physicalistic description, 169
 relation to functionalism, 161–162, 184
 semantic physicalism, 11, 16, 44–46, 59, 68, 69–71, 73, 75, 76, 192, 240
see also naturalism
- physicalistic description, 169
- physics, as completely structuralized, 34
- Place, U. T., 24, 114, 131–150
see also identity theory
- Platonic realism, 86
- Popper, Karl, 57, 244
- pragmatism, 111
- Price, H. H., 112–113
- problem of consciousness, *see* consciousness, problem of explaining
- protocol sentence debate, 30, 112, 218–219, 247
 standard interpretation of, 30–31
- protocol sentences, 24, 29, 43–58, 244
 and brain processes, 58, 59
 as certain, 46–48
 “comparison” to facts, 45
 as descriptions of physical events, 48
 ostensive element in, 47–48
 revisable, 48–49
 translatable into physical language, 54–55
 unrevisable, 56–58
- psychological explanation, 168–172
 commonsensical, 162
 as two-phased, 169–170
- psychophysical parallelism, 156
- Putnam, H., 73–74, 157–194
 “Brains and Behavior,” 167–168
 on materialism, 176, 177, 181
 “Mental Life of Some Machines, The,” 172
 “Minds and Machines,” 159–160
 “Nature of Mental States, The,” 172
 “Psychological Concepts, Explication, and Ordinary Language,” 157
 “Robots: Machines or Artificially Created Life?,” 172

- qualia, 5–9, 19, 20, 152, 203, 259
 as conceivable relationally, 8, 27,
 237–239
 conceptual origins of, 5–8
 epistemic properties of, 27, 237–239
 as indescribable, 6–7, 9–10
 as private, 7, 27–28, 237
 reactions to concept, 238
 thought experiments involving, 240
 unclarity of concept, 200
see also consciousness, basic elements of
 quasi-ontological statements, 118, 119
 Quine, W. V., 30, 52, 72, 104, 157, 246,
 251
- railroad map, 35, 36–38, 64
 Ramsey, F. P., 188–190
 Ramsey sentence, 188–189
 “Theories,” 188–190
 recognition, 108, 109
 reduction, 177–181
 and “bridge laws,” 189
 of consciousness, 153, 156
 intertheoretic, 188–194
 of mental states, 171–172
 of scientific laws, 73
 of scientific terms, 73
- Rorty, R., 254
 rules of use, linguistic, 50, 52, 80, 84–85,
 87, 103, 203, 219
 as conventional, 42–43, 107, 108, 212,
 260; *see also* conventionalism
 as formal, 99–104
 logico-syntactic, 102
 phenomenological, 98, 101
 as syntactical, 102
- Russell, Bertrand, 13, 37, 84, 111, 241
 theory of descriptions, 118
- Ryle, Gilbert, 24, 111, 113–150, 198, 200,
 203, 206, 220–221
 “Categories,” 119–121
Concept of Mind, The, 113–150
 early criticism on, 140–142
 method of analysis, 147–149, 152, 212,
 233
 relation to behaviorism, 125–126
 relation to Husserl, 252
 “Systematically Misleading
 Expressions,” 118–119, 145
see also linguistic analysis; logical
 behaviorism; sensation
- Schlick, Moritz, 30–31, 51–52, 79, 80,
 91, 198, 203, 219–220, 243, 247,
 251
 attack on Husserl, 80–88, 95–110
- “Form and Content,” 42–43, 51, 251
General Theory of Knowledge, 40–42, 81,
 82
 “On the Foundation of Knowledge,”
 46–48
 scientific propositions, as dependent on
 structuralization, 33–37
 Searle, John, 237
 self-knowledge, 108, 226, 234–235
 Sellars, Wilfred, 248, 254
 sensation, 126, 131, 136–142
 logical behavior of concept, 129–131
 no “neat” vocabulary for, 129
 and observation, 126–129, 130,
 141–143, 144
 sensation reports, 138, 141–142, 149
 sense-data, 19, 33
 Ryle’s attack on, 126–129
 sense-datum theory, 112–113, 220
 Shelton, J., 87
 Smart, J. J. C., 24, 114, 131–150, 255;
see also identity theory
 social background of language use, 230
 Strawson, P. F., 111
 structuralism, 17, 18, 26–27, 77, 106, 146,
 237
 analysis as dependent upon, 145–150
 assumption of totality, 106–107
 defined, 3–4
 distinguished from microstructure,
 238
 distinguished from structuralism of
 Saussure, 238
 historically specific, 18–20
 linguistic provenance of, 21
 semantic structuralism, 151, 188
 structuralist account of objectivity, 16
 structuralist conception of
 explanation, 199
 structuralist picture of language, 190,
 210–213
 structuralist picture of meaning,
 15–16, 29, 31, 37–38, 49, 58–60, 77,
 105, 107, 110, 146, 148, 199
 structuralist theory of knowledge, 35,
 36–37, 38
 structuralist theory of meaning
 (definition), 37
 structure of language, 146
 in twentieth-century philosophy of
 mind, 22–25
 structuralist assumption of explanatory
 totality, 196, 203–208, 222–223
 structuralist explanation, *see*
 functionalism; physicalism;
 structuralism

- structure of experience, 79, 108, 197
 linked to possibilities of meaning, 88, 96
 necessity of, 109
 as neither subjective nor objective, 107
 as not generally explicable, 107
 in phenomenology, 78
 subjective experience, 215
 subjectivity, 18–20, 179, 208, 217
 as definitive of conscious states, 26–27, 237
 in phenomenology, 78
 as property of qualia, 2, 5–6
 subjective difference not accessible to science, 35–36
 to be eliminated, 36, 56–58
 transcendental, 78
 super-Spartans, 167–168, 172, 182–183
 supervenience, 25
 synthetic, a priori, 82–86, 92, 96; *see also* phenomenological propositions
- theoretical terms, meaning of, 157–161
 diachronic change in reference, 159, 166, 192, 193
 therapy, 231
 topic neutrality, 254
 Turing, A. M., 163
 Turing machine, 163, 166, 167, 168, 172, 177
 preference-functions, 172–173
- Uebel, T., 243
 unity of science, 11, 44, 72, 73–74, 161–162
- defined by pure “theory of theories,” 89
- van de Pitte, M. M., 86–87
- verification, 46, 51, 53, 60, 112, 147
 as dependent on subjective acts, 51
 role of “affirmations,” 47
 structuralist account of, 58, 59
 verification theory of meaning, 244
- Vienna Circle, 52, 77, 84, 111, 244, 246
 structuralism in, 29
- Wesensschau* (essential intuition), 80–81, 91, 106
 establishes existence of objects, 90
 as psychological act, 82
 Schlick’s attack on, 81, 82–99
- Wisdom, John, 140–142
- Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 77, 81, 84, 99–100, 102–104, 112, 113, 224–235, 242, 249, 250
 on Husserl, 248
 “On Logical Form,” 99–100
 “phenomenology” in, 103, 249
Philosophical Investigations, 114, 133, 225, 260
Philosophical Remarks, 103, 249, 250
 relation to behaviorism, 256
 role in development of analysis, 251
 on sensations, 132–133, 139, 254
 on tautologies, 84
Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus, 37, 82, 102–103, 145, 211, 216, 250, 259
- zombie, 25, 240