DEFLATION

Until recently, fears of deflation seemed nothing more than a relic of the Great Depression. However, beginning in the 1990s, persistently falling consumer prices emerged in Japan, China, and elsewhere. Deflation is also a distinct possibility in some of the major euro area economies, especially Germany, and became a concern of the U.S. Federal Reserve in 2003. Deflation may be worse than inflation, not only because the real burden of debt rises but also because firms would confront rising real wages in a world where nominal wage rigidity prevails. This volume explores some key themes regarding deflation including: (i) how economic agents and policy makers have responded to deflation; (ii) the links between monetary policy, goods price movements, and asset price movements; (iii) the impact of deflation under different monetary policy and exchange rate regimes; and (iv) stock market reactions to deflation.

Richard C. K. Burdekin is Jonathan B. Lovelace Professor of Economics at Claremont McKenna College, Claremont, California. His areas of interest include monetary and financial economics, Chinese economic reforms, and inflation and deflation. Professor Burdekin has published four books: Budget Deficits and Economic Performance (with Farrokh K. Langdana), Confidence, Credibility and Macroeconomic Policy (with Farrokh K. Langdana), Distributional Conflict and Inflation (with Paul Burkett), and Establishing Monetary Stability in Emerging Market Economies (edited with Thomas D. Willett, Richard J. Sweeney, and Clas Wihlborg). He has also authored more than forty refereed journal articles that have been published in the American Economic Review; the Journal of Economic History; the Journal of International Money and Finance; the Journal of Money, Credit, and Banking; and the Review of Economics and Statistics, among other leading publications.

Pierre L. Siklos is Professor of Economics at Wilfrid Laurier University, Waterloo, Ontario, Canada, and Associate Director of its Viessmann Centre for the Study of Modern Europe. He specializes in macroeconomics with an emphasis on the study of inflation, central banks, and financial markets and also conducts research in applied time series analysis. Professor Siklos has been a consultant to a variety of institutions and central banks. He is the author of several books, including the leading textbook in Canada on money and banking, and The Changing Face of Central Banking: Evolutionary Trends Since World War II (Cambridge University Press, 2002). He has also published numerous articles in eminent economics journals such as the Journal of Money, Credit, and Banking, the Journal of Econometrics, the Journal of Business and Economic Statistics, the Journal of International Money and Finance, and the Journal of Applied Econometrics. Professor Siklos has been a visiting lecturer or fellow at several universities in Europe, North America, New Zealand, and Australia. In 2000–2001 he was Wilfrid Laurier University’s University Research Professor.
STUDIES IN MACROECONOMIC HISTORY

SERIES EDITOR: Michael D. Bordo, Rutgers University

EDITORS: Forrest Capie, City University Business School, U.K.
Barry Eichengreen, University of California, Berkeley
Nick Crafts, London School of Economics
Angela Redish, University of British Columbia

The titles in this series investigate themes of interest to economists and economic historians in the rapidly developing field of macroeconomic history. The four areas covered include the application of monetary and finance theory, international economics, and quantitative methods to historical problems; the historical application of growth and development theory and theories of business fluctuations; the history of domestic and international monetary, financial, and other macroeconomic institutions; and the history of international monetary and financial systems. The series amalgamates the former Cambridge University Press series Studies in Monetary and Financial History and Studies in Quantitative Economic History.

Other books in the series:
Howard Bodenhorn, A History of Banking in Antebellum America (0-521-66999-5)
Michael D. Bordo, The Gold Standard and Related Regimes (0-521-55006-8)
Michael D. Bordo and Forrest Capie, editors, Monetary Regimes in Transition (0-521-41906-9)
Michael D. Bordo and Roberto Cortés-Conde, editors, Transferring Wealth and Power from the Old to the New World (0-521-77305-9)
Trevor J. O. Dick and John E. Floyd, Canada and the Gold Standard (0-521-40408-8)
Barry Eichengreen, Elusive Stability (0-521-44847-6)
Barry Eichengreen, editor, Europe's Postwar Recovery (0-521-48279-8)
Michele Fratianni and Franco Spinelli, A Monetary History of Italy (0-521-44315-6)

Continued on page 361
DEFLATION

Current and Historical Perspectives

Edited by

RICHARD C. K. BURDEKIN
Claremont McKenna College

PIERRE L. SIKLOS
Wilfrid Laurier University
From RCKB to Yanjie, Eileen, Emma, and my mother

From PLS to H.B., and here’s hoping for the best for the boys
Contents

List of Tables and Figures  page xiii
List of Contributors  xix
Preface  xxi

1  Fears of Deflation and the Role of Monetary Policy: Some Lessons and an Overview
   Richard C. K. Burdekin and Pierre L. Siklos
   Introduction  1
   Fears of Deflation Then and Now  3
   What is Deflation Anyway? Historical and International Perspectives  7
   Historical Evidence on Deflationary Episodes  10
   Deflation Today in China and Japan  16
   Overview of the Contributions to Deflation  20

PART ONE. FEARS OF DEFlation AND THE ROLE OF MONETARY POLICY

2  Deflation, Silent Runs, and Bank Holidays in the Great Contraction
   Hugh Rockoff
   Separate Regions with Separate Banking Systems  31
   The Role of Deflation  33
   Silent Runs and Noisy Runs  38
   The Banking Holidays  50
   Regional Aspects of the Conflict Over Monetary Policy  54
   The Banking Crises of the Early 1930s From a Regional Perspective  56
3 Price Change, Financial Stability, and the British Economy, 1870–1939
Forrest Capie and Geoffrey Wood

Introduction
61
The British Economy
62
Hypotheses
65
Price Expectations
68
Proxying the Keynes and Fisher Effects
70
Price Level and Price Level Change Expectations
72
Real Interest Rates
74
Expectations and the Bond Market
77
Bond Rate Spreads
80
Intertemporal Substitution
83
Conclusions
84

4 Deflation Dynamics in Sweden: Perceptions, Expectations, and Adjustment During the Deflations of 1921–1923 and 1931–1933
Klas Fregert and Lars Jonung

Introduction
91
The Deflation of 1920–1922
93
The Deflation of 1931–1933
112
Conclusions
125

PART TWO. DEFLATION AND ASSET PRICES

5 Boom–Busts in Asset Prices, Economic Instability, and Monetary Policy
Michael D. Bordo and Olivier Jeanne

Introduction
131
Historical Perspectives: Two Dramatic Episodes
134
Identifying Booms and Busts in Asset Prices: The Postwar OECD Theory
139
Conclusions and Policy Implications
160
Appendix
161

6 Deflation, Credit, and Asset Prices
Charles Goodhart and Boris Hofmann

Introduction
166
Deflation and Financial Fragility: The Historical Record
170
Credit and Asset Prices: Theory and Evidence
174
A Role for Monetary Policy?
182
Conclusions
186
Contents

PART THREE. INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVES ON DEFLATION

7  Is Deflation Depressing? Evidence From the Classical Gold Standard
   Michael D. Bordo and Angela Redish
   Introduction 191
   Empirical Analysis – United States 203
   Empirical Analysis – Canada 208
   Discussion of Results and Conclusion 212

8  The Strong Lira Policy and Deflation in Italy’s Interwar Period
   Michele Fratianni and Franco Spinelli
   Introduction 218
   The Strong Lira Policy 220
   The Deflation Years 227
   Lending of Last Resort 232
   The Link Between Deflation and Depression 236
   The Thirties vs. the Nineties 237
   Conclusions 239

9  Deflation and Stagnation in Japan: Collapse of the Monetary Transmission Mechanism and Echo From the 1930s
   Michael M. Hutchison
   Introduction 241
   Recession and Deflation in Japan 244
   Credit Crunch or Liquidity Trap? 249
   What Has Held Up the Japanese Economy? 258
   Banking Crisis 260
   Efforts by the Bank of Japan to Stop Deflation and Inflation Targeting 263
   Conclusions 267

PART FOUR. STOCK MARKET ADJUSTMENTS TO DEFLATION

10  Deflation, the Financial Crises of the 1890s, and Stock Exchange Responses in London, New York, Paris, and Berlin
    Lance Davis, Larry Neal, and Eugene White
    Introduction 271
    The Effect of Deflation on the U.S. Financial Markets 275
    The Effect of Deflation on the Other Core Financial Markets 280
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assessment</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 The Stock Market and the Business Cycle in Periods of Deflation,</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Hyper-) Inflation, and Political Turmoil: Germany, 1913–1926</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Martin T. Bohl and Pierre L. Siklos</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data and Historical Backdrop: Stock Market Performance and Politics</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in Germany, 1913–1926</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Present Value Relation of Asset Prices, Bubbles, and Asymmetric</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Booms and Slumps</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Econometric Testing: Cointegration and Threshold Adjustment</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empirical Results</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary and Conclusions</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Deflationary Pressures and the Role of Gold Stocks: 1929, 1987,</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and Today</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Richard C. K. Burdekin and Marc D. Weidenmier</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empirical Analysis</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concluding Remarks</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>353</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tables and Figures

TABLES

1.1 The Historical Experience with Deflation: pre-1945  page 11
1.2 Pair-Wise Correlations Between Aggregate Demand and Aggregate Supply Shocks: Historical Evidence  15
2.1 Real Prices of Agricultural Commodities and Real Farm and Mineral Income, 1925–1932  34
2.2 Terms of Trade by Census Divisions of the United States, 1925–1932 (1925 = 100)  36
2.3 Suspended Deposits, Terms of Trade, and Personal Income by Region, 1930–1933  37
2.4 State and Local Bank Holidays in 1932–1933  51
2.5 State Bank Restrictions, Sunday, March 5, 1933  58
4.1 Monetary Policy Announcements and Actions, 1920–1924  95
4.2 Wage Reductions (Ordinary Wage/Piece Rate) in National Agreements by Quarter in Percent, 1921–1923  102
4.3 Monetary Policy Announcements and Actions, 1931–1933  117
4.4 Wage Reductions (Ordinary Wage/Piece Rate) in Major National Agreements by Quarter in Percent, 1931–1934  120
6.1 Summary of Impulse Response Analysis  179
7.1 Income, Money, and Prices: Levels and Growth Rates  193
7.2 Predicted Effects of Each Innovation  202
7.3 Forecast Error Variance Decomposition (FEVD): United States  205
7.4 Forecast Error Variance Decomposition: Canada  210
8.1 Italian Balance of Payments, 1928–1933 (Millions of Lire)  225
8.2 AR(1) Models of the Rate of Inflation for Italy and the United States  228
8.3 The Exchange Equation for Italy and the United States from 1921 to 1937 (Annual Percentage Changes)  228
Tables and Figures

8.4 Decomposition of Money Growth in Italy and the United States, 1921–1937 (Percentage Points) 230
8.5 Lending of Last Resort (LOLR) Estimates, 1928–1935 (Millions of Lire) 235
9.1 Variance Decomposition of Industrial Production: Short-Term Interest Rates as the Monetary Policy Variable 255
9.2 Variance Decomposition of Industrial Production: Broad Money (M2 + CDs) as the Monetary Policy Variable 256
9.3 Response of Industrial Production to One Standard Deviation Shock (Standard Errors in Parentheses) 257
10.1a Value of Shares Quoted in the London Stock Exchange Official List, 1853–1913 (Millions of Pounds) 282
10.1b Percentage of the Value of Shares Quoted in the London Stock Exchange Official List, 1853–1913 282
10.2 Size and Number of Failed Members of the London Stock Exchange, 1879–1899 (Commissions Are a Fixed Percentage of the Payouts to Creditors) 284
10.3 Nominations and Cessations, Annually: Paris Bourse, 1880–1914 288
11.1 Testing for Asymmetric Adjustment in the Dividend-Price Ratio: ADF vs. MTAR Approaches 313
11.2 Cointegration Tests for the Structural Booms and Slumps Hypothesis: Conventional vs. TAR Approaches 315

FIGURES

1.1 Alternative Forecasting Models of Inflation: Annual U.S., 1800–2000 14
2.1 Interregional Gold Flows, 1926–1937 (as a Percentage of Total Gold Held by the Gold Settlement Fund) 41
2.2 The Flow of Gold to Eastern Financial Centers on Private Accounts, 1926–1933 43
2.3 Gains and Losses of Deposits by Federal Reserve District, 1929–1930 44
Tables and Figures

2.4 Gains and Losses of Deposits by Federal Reserve District, 1930–1931 45
2.5 The Big-Four New York Banks 46
3.1 Gross National Product (£m), 1870–1939 63
3.2 Level of Gross National Product Deflator, 1870–1939 (1913 = 100) 64
3.3 U.K. Interest Rates: Average Annual Prime Bank Bill Rate 1870–1914 65
3.4 U.K. Interest Rates: Average Annual Yield on Consols, 1870–1914 65
3.5a Actual and Predicted Level of GNP Deflator, 1870–1914 (1913 = 100) 72
3.5b Year-by-Year Rates of Change in GNP Deflator, 1870–1913 73
3.6a Actual and Predicted Level of GNP Deflator, 1920–1939 (1913 = 100) 73
3.6b Year-by-Year Rates of Change in GNP Deflator: 1921–1939 74
3.7a Expected Real Rate, 1872–1913 75
3.7b Realized Real Rate, 1871–1913 75
3.8a Expected Real Rate, 1923–1939 76
3.8b Realized Real Rate, 1922–1939 76
3.9 Index of Security Prices, 1925–1939 (1924 Average = 100) 82
3.10 Indices of Home Building Costs (1913–1938) and Average Price of Dwelling Houses (1923–1938): 1925 = 100 85
4.1 Unemployment, Change in Industrial Production, Wage Inflation, and Price Inflation 1913–1939 94
4.2 The Wholesale Price Index and the Hourly Total Wage for Males for Four Groups 103
4.3 Conflict Intensity, 1913–1945 104
4.4 Nominal Money, Real Money Balances, Prices, Inflation, and Interest Rates, 1920–1923 108
4.5 Shocks and Outcome in the Industrial Sector, 1920–1925, Relative to 1920 = 100, Yearly Averages 109
4.6 Simulated Aggregate Wage Under Four Sets of Parameter Assumptions and the Actual Wage, 1921–1923 111
4.7 Shocks and Outcome in the Industrial Sector, 1930–1935, Relative to 1930 = 100, Yearly Averages 124–125
4.8 Collective Agreements, 1920–1940, in the Industrial Sector 126
5.1 Stock Price Index: Standard and Poor’s 500, 1922–1941 135
5.2 Bank Loans: Total, Secured by Securities, and Secured by Real Estate 1921–1941 135
5.3 Agricultural Land Prices Per Acre, 1910–1945 136
5.4 Nominal Land Prices, 1980–1998 137
5.5 Bank Loans: Total, Secured by Securities and Other Assets, and Secured by Real Estate, 1982–1998


5.7 Boom–Bust in Residential Property Prices, 1970–1998

5.8 Boom–Bust in Industrial Share Prices, 1970–2001

5.9 U.S. Stock Prices: S&P 500, 1874–1994

5.10 U.S. Stock Prices: Dow Jones Industrial Average, 1899–1999

5.11 Ancillary Variables: Boom–Bust in Stock Prices

5.12 Ancillary Variables: Boom–Bust in Property Prices

5.13 The Irrational Exuberance Case

5.14 The Role of Private Sector Optimism

6.1 Early Episodes of Consumer Price Deflation and Financial Fragility

6.2 Credit Growth and Inflation in the United States, 1891–1934

6.3 Credit Growth and CPI Inflation, 1985–2001

6.4 Credit Growth and House Price Inflation, 1985–2001

6.5 Credit Growth and Equity Price Inflation, 1985–2001

6.6 Dynamic Interaction Between Credit and Asset Prices

6.7 The Effect of a Real Interest Rate Innovation

6.8 Monetary Policy and Asset Price Bubbles

7.1a Log Real GDP, U.S. and Canada

7.1b Per Capita Real GDP ($1900), U.S. and Canada

7.2a Price Levels (1900 = 100), U.S. and Canada

7.2b Canadian Terms of Trade and Price Level

7.3a (log) Per Capita Money Stocks, U.S. and Canada

7.3b Annual Gold Production

7.4 U.S. Impulse Responses

7.5 U.S. Shocks

7.6 Historical Decomposition of U.S. Prices

7.7 Historical Decomposition of U.S. Output

7.8 Historical Decomposition of U.S. Money

7.9 Canadian Impulse Responses

7.10 Canada Shocks

7.11 Historical Decomposition of Canadian Prices

7.12 Historical Decomposition of Canadian Output

7.13 Historical Decomposition of Canadian Money

8.1 Price Level, 1920–1939

8.2 Lira–Dollar Exchange Rate

8.3 Lira–Pound Rate and Italian Wholesale Price Index

9.1 Deflation in Japan, 1993–2002

9.2 Unemployment Rate and Real GDP Growth in Japan

9.3 Equity Prices in Japan (Index), 1970Q1–2001Q4
Tables and Figures

9.5 Monetary Base and Broad Monetary Growth 247
9.6 Money Multiplier in Japan (Ratio of M2 + CDs to Base Money) 248
9.7 Bank Loans Outstanding in Japan 248
9.8 Real Lending Rate in Japan 250
9.9 Recursive Residual Test for Structural Break in Money Multiplier 253
10.1 Seat Prices: New York Stock Exchange, 1883–1914 278
10.2 Members and Proprietors of the London Stock Exchange, 1880–1914 283
11.1 Dividend Yields During Deflation: Germany, 1913–1926 300
11.2 Dividend Yields During Inflation: Germany, 1913–1926 300
11.3 Unemployment Rate and Dividend Yields, 1913–1926 302
11.4 Real Stock Price Index 304
12.1 Homestake Mining vs. the S & P 500 Index, 1926–1937 323
12.2 Cumulative Abnormal Returns for Homestake Mining, 1926–1937 323
12.4 S & P 500 vs. Gold Indices, 1999–Present 326
12.5 Gold Indices, 1999–Present 328
Contributors

MARTIN T. BOHL
European University Viadrina, Frankfurt

MICHAEL D. BORDO
Rutgers University

RICHARD C. K. BURDEKIN
Claremont McKenna College

FORREST CAPIE
City University Business School, London

LANCE DAVIS
California Institute of Technology

MICHELE FRATIANNI
Indiana University

KLAS FREGERT
Lund University, Sweden

CHARLES GOODHART
London School of Economics

BORIS HOFMANN
Center for European Integration Studies, University of Bonn, Germany

MICHAEL HUTCHINSON
University of California, Santa Cruz

OLIVIER JEANNE
International Monetary Fund

xix
Contributors

LARS JONUNG
European Commission and Stockholm School of Economics

LARRY NEAL
University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign

ANGELA REDISH
University of British Columbia, Canada

HUGH ROCKOFF
Rutgers University

PIERRE L. SIKLOS
Wilfrid Laurier University, Canada

FRANCO SPINELLI
Università di Brescìa, Italy

MARC D. WEIDENMIER
Claremont McKenna College

EUGENE WHITE
Rutgers University

GEOFFREY WOOD
City University Business School, London
Preface

Both of us, independently and jointly, have devoted many years to studying inflation and hyperinflation and analyzing central banking institutions. Indeed, it was our shared interests in these areas that led us to engage in joint research. In 1998, we began to think seriously about whether the incipient deflations in Asia, most notably in China and Japan, amounted to something other than simply the flip side of inflation. It quickly became apparent to us there was, potentially at least, something substantially different about studying an economy in the throes of a deflation. We also decided, early on, that the best way to proceed would be to call upon several interested academics to engage in research that would parallel our own interests, enabling us to provide a much broader perspective on historical and modern experiences with deflation. The end result is the present edited volume. The contributed papers were presented at two major conferences on the topic. One was held in April 2000 at Claremont McKenna College. We also organized a session at the XIIIth International Economic History Congress in Buenos Aires in 2002 that was devoted to deflation.

The rather long gestation period for this project partly reflects the fact that the study of deflation is, in many ways, in its infancy, especially regarding the conduct of monetary policy in such an environment. We were also determined to take the time to hone our ideas through seminar and conference participation, and in other ways to seek out respected colleagues’ opinions. We trust that the end product will serve as a useful starting point for academics and policy makers wishing to learn more about the economics of deflation.

Richard Burdekin is very grateful to President Pamela Gann and Dean Bill Ascher of Claremont McKenna for supporting this project and funding the 2000 Claremont Conference on Deflation. He also extends a special
thanks to the many contributors and discussants, who made sometimes very long trips to come to the conference – with Charles Goodhart not only cheerfully enduring the long trip from England but also serving with such aplomb as our dinner keynote speaker. Pierre Siklos thanks Wilfrid Laurier University, the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, and the German-American Academic Council for financial support. He is also grateful for the many invitations received to discuss the issues and to his family for their constant support, even when he was far away or, as he much preferred, when they were able to tag along. Deflation need not be all that bad. However, we hope no one has to go through situations similar to some of the worst deflations studied here.

Both editors are also grateful to Elsie Grogan for her invaluable help in the preparation of the manuscript.