

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-83388-2 - Double Standards in Medical Research in Developing Countries

Ruth Macklin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Double Standards in Medical Research in Developing Countries

This book explores the ethical controversies that have surrounded the design and conduct of international medical research sponsored by industrialized countries or industry, and carried out in developing countries. The chief concern is that research subjects in developing countries may be exploited because sponsors of research employ double standards. One debate focuses on whether the standard of care provided to subjects of medical research in developing countries should be the same as that which research subjects receive in North America and Europe. Another controversy addresses the obligations of sponsors of medical research to provide the successful products of research to the population in developing countries where the research is conducted. Other concerns examined are whether the process of obtaining informed consent in developing countries is adequate, and whether prior ethical review of research meets standards that are well established in the industrialized world. Recent international developments show that essential medications can be made affordable and accessible to developing countries, and that double standards need not prevail. This is the first book to examine these issues, drawing the bold conclusion that double standards in medical research are ethically unacceptable.

RUTH MACKLIN is Professor of Bioethics at Albert Einstein College of Medicine in New York and is one of the founders of bioethics in the United States. Her books include *Against Relativism*, *Enemies of Patients*, and *Surrogates and Other Mothers*. She has also published numerous articles in scholarly and professional journals. Professor Macklin is a past president of the International Association of Bioethics, current vice-president of the Council for International Organizations of Medical Sciences, serves on the editorial board of several journals in bioethics, and is an adviser to the World Health Organization. She was appointed by President Clinton to the Advisory Committee on Human Radiation Experiments, and has served as a member of numerous scientific committees at the National Institutes of Health.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-83388-2 - Double Standards in Medical Research in Developing Countries

Ruth Macklin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*Cambridge Law, Medicine and Ethics*

This is a series of books focusing on medical law, but including titles in which both legal and ethical policy issues are discussed. The series is intended to respond to the growing importance of medical law not only in universities and in legal and medical practice, but in public and political affairs. It aims to reflect the fact that many major policy issues over the last few years have had a strong medical law dimension (organ retention, embryonic stem cell research, safety issues etc.). The emphasis is therefore on issues of public concern or practical significance rather than merely on the theoretical dimensions of the subject.

*General Editor*

Professor Alexander McCall Smith

*Editorial Advisory Board*

Dr Alexander Morgan Capron, *Director, Ethics and Health,  
World Health Organization*

Professor Jim Childress, *University of Virginia*

Professor Margot Brazier, *University of Manchester*

Dr Ruth Chadwick, *University of Lancaster*

Dame Ruth Deech, *University of Oxford*

Professor Martin Bobrow, *University of Cambridge*

*Books in the series*

Marcus Radetzki, Marian Radetzki, Niklas Juth

*Genes and Insurance: Ethical, Legal and Economic Issues*

0 521 83090 7

Ruth Macklin, *Double Standards in Medical Research in  
Developing Countries*

0 521 83388 4 hardback    0 521 54170 0 paperback

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-83388-2 - Double Standards in Medical Research in Developing Countries

Ruth Macklin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

# Double Standards in Medical Research in Developing Countries

---

Ruth Macklin



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-83388-2 - Double Standards in Medical Research in Developing Countries

Ruth Macklin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521833882](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521833882)

© Ruth Macklin 2004

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Macklin, Ruth, 1938–

Double standards in medical research in developing countries / Ruth Macklin.

p. cm. – (Cambridge law, medicine, and ethics; 2)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 83388 4 – ISBN 0 521 54170 0 (pbk.)

1. Medical care – Research – Developing countries. 2. Medical ethics – Developing countries. 3. Public health – Research – Developing countries. I. Title. II. Series.

RA441.M33 2004 174.28 – dc22 2003065532

ISBN 978-0-521-83388-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-54170-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page vii</i>
1 International research contested: controversies and debates	1
Why do clinical research in developing countries?	6
Which countries are “developing”?	9
Health needs in developing countries	12
The controversy that launched debates	13
The proposed Surfaxin study	17
Revision of the Declaration of Helsinki	18
Procedural solutions	21
Agreement on underlying propositions	24
Ethical guidelines: pragmatic or aspirational?	30
2 Maintaining ethical standards in research	36
Ethical standards and “standard of care”	38
Treat like cases alike	44
What do the guidelines say?	47
Conclusions	64
3 Striving for justice in research	68
Distributive justice in global research	69
Global disparities and health equity	72
Justice, health care, and research	75
Post-trial benefits of research: obligation or charity?	77
What the guidelines say	82
Responses to the CIOMS guideline	88
The FDA and PhRMA	90
National regulations and guidelines	92
Conclusions	94
4 Avoiding exploitation	99
Definitional debates	101
What is exploitation in multinational research?	105
What guidelines and commentators say	107
Candidates for circumstances of exploitation in international research	118
	v

vi	Contents	
	Inducing vulnerable subjects as exploitation	122
	Best current treatment and post-trial benefits as undue inducements	124
	Conclusion	127
5	Providing safeguards: informed consent and review of research	131
	Allegations of violations	133
	Inadequacies of safeguards	136
	Informed consent: standards and practices	139
	Adherence to US rules: universal standards or ethical imperialism?	145
	Research ethics committees: do they provide adequate protection?	150
	What the guidelines say	152
	The CIOMS debates	154
	More disagreements: the NBAC survey	157
	Conclusions	158
6	Making drugs affordable	163
	Differential pricing	166
	Prior agreements	171
	International collaborative efforts and public-private partnerships	174
	Manufacture of generic copies of patented drugs and compulsory licensing	182
7	Respecting, protecting, and fulfilling human rights	193
	Human rights and the concept of dignity	196
	The United States and human rights	198
	Human rights in the conduct of research	200
	Right to health care, right to health	202
	HIV/AIDS and the right to health	208
	Human rights, access, and affordability of drugs	210
	Human rights, international guidelines, and ethical principles	214
8	Striving for a single standard	226
	A single standard for control groups	230
	Providing successful products after a trial is concluded	238
	Irreconcilable differences	241
	Building capacity and assessing ethics in ongoing research	245
	Dilemmas in future HIV/AIDS preventive vaccine trials	248
	What the guidelines say	254
	Harmonizing international guidelines	257
	The future	260
	<i>Index</i>	263

## Acknowledgments

---

The author is grateful to the many people – some identified in endnotes, others unnamed – whose words and ideas were invaluable resources for this book. Special thanks go to the individuals and organizations who granted permission to quote their comments on drafts of the 2002 *CIOMS International Ethical Guidelines for Biomedical Research Involving Human Subjects*. I profited greatly from numerous conversations with Reidar Lie, who corrected some errors and provided much food for thought. I benefited from my collaborative work with Alice Page while serving as Senior Consultant to the National Bioethics Advisory Commission on its international project and after the project's completion. Colleagues on the professional staff of the World Health Organization, the Joint United Nations Program on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS), and CIOMS made possible my participation in meetings, workshops, and review of research that provided essential information for this book. I am especially indebted in this regard to David Griffin, José Esparza, Peter Piot, and Juhana Idänpään-Heikkilä. I also benefited from and am grateful to the anonymous reviewers of the proposal I submitted for this book to Cambridge University Press.

Work on the book was begun during a month's residency at the Rockefeller Foundation's Bellagio Study and Conference Center in Italy. There can be no better setting for reflection and productive work, and I am most grateful for the opportunity my residency there provided for organizing the book and completing the initial chapters. Several colleagues who were at Bellagio during my stay helped to shape my thinking on critical issues.

Last but not least, I thank the following people at CUP with whom I worked from beginning to end: Finola O'Sullivan, Nikki Burton, Alison Powell, and Diane Illott. I am grateful to the General Editor, Alexander McCall Smith, for including this book in the new Cambridge University Press Series.