

### From International to World Society?

Barry Buzan offers an extensive and long overdue critique and reappraisal of the English school approach to International Relations. Starting on the neglected concept of world society and bringing together the international society tradition and the Wendtian mode of constructivism, Buzan offers a new theoretical framework that can be used to address globalisation as a complex political interplay among state and non-state actors. This approach forces English school theory to confront neglected questions both about its basic concepts and assumptions, and the constitution of society in terms of what values are shared, how and why they are shared, and by whom. Buzan highlights the idea of primary institutions as the central contribution of English school theory and shows how this both differentiates English school theory from realism and neoliberal institutionalism, and how it can be used to generate distinctive comparative and historical accounts of international society.

BARRY BUZAN is Professor of International Relations at the London School of Economics and a Fellow of the British Academy. He is the author, co-author or editor of over fifteen books and has published widely in academic journals.





CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS: 95

### From International to World Society?

Editorial Board

Steve Smith (Managing editor)

Thomas Biersteker Phil Cerny Michael Cox

A. J. R. Groom Richard Higgott Kimberley Hutchings

Caroline Kennedy-Pipe Steve Lamy Michael Mastanduno

Louis Pauly Ngaire Woods

Cambridge Studies in International Relations is a joint initiative of Cambridge University Press and the British International Studies Association (BISA). The series will include a wide range of material, from undergraduate textbooks and surveys to research-based monographs and collaborative volumes. The aim of the series is to publish the best new scholarship in International Studies from Europe, North America and the rest of the world.



Frontmatter More information

### CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS: 95

95 Barry Buzan

### From international to world society?

English School theory and the social structure of globalisation

94 K. J. Holsti

### Taming the sovereigns

Institutional change in international politics

93 Bruce Cronin

### Institutions for the common good

International protection regimes in international society

92 Paul Keal

### European conquest and the rights of indigenous peoples

The moral backwardness of international society

91 Barry Buzan and Ole Wæver

### Regions and powers

The structure of international security

90 A. Claire Cutler

### Private power and global authority

Transnational merchant law in the global political economy

93 Patrick M. Morgan

Deterrence now

92 Susan Sell

### Private power, public law

The globalization of intellectual property rights

87 Nina Tannenwald

### The nuclear taboo

The United States and the non-use of nuclear weapons since 1945

86 Linda Weiss (ed.)

### States in the global economy

Bringing domestic institutions back in

85 Rodney Bruce Hall and Thomas J. Biersteker (eds.)

The emergence of private authority in global governance

84 Heather Rae

### State identities and the homogenisation of peoples

(List continues at the end of book)



# From International to World Society?

English School Theory and the Social Structure of Globalisation

Barry Buzan





More information

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-83348-6 - From International to World Society?: English School Theory and the Social Structure of Globalisation Barry Buzan Frontmatter

#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521833486

© Barry Buzan 2004

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004 Third printing 2006

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data Buzan, Barry.

From international to world society?: English school theory and the social structure of globalisation / Barry Buzan.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in international relations; 95) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0 521 83348 5 (HB) – ISBN 0 521 54121 2 (PB) I. Globalization – Sociological aspects. I. Title. II. Series. JZ1318.B89 2004 303.48'2 – dc22 2003055816

ISBN 978-0-521-83348-6 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-54121-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.



To Richard Little





## **Contents**

| List of figures and tables                               | xi   |
|--|--|
| Preface  | xiii   |
| List of abbreviations                                    | XV   |
| Glossary   | xvii   |
| Introduction   | 1  |
| English school theory and its problems: an overview      | 6  |
| English school theory: a summary                         | 6  |
| World society, and the problems and potentials of        |  |
| English school theory                                    | 10   |
| The main areas of weakness in English school theory      | 15   |
| Is English school theory really theory?                  | 24   |
| World society in English school theory                   | 27   |
| The intellectual history of world society within English |  |
| school thinking  | 30   |
| The pluralist–solidarist debate                          | 45   |
| Conclusions  | 62   |
| Concepts of world society outside English school         |  |
| thinking   | 63   |
| IR writers with a sociological turn: Burton, Luard and   |  |
| Shaw   | 66   |
| Sociological conceptions of world society                | 70   |
| Global civil society                                     | 77   |
| Conclusions  | 87   |
| Reimagining the English school's triad                   | 90   |
| State and non-state                                      | 91   |
|  | Preface List of abbreviations Glossary  Introduction English school theory and its problems: an overview English school theory: a summary World society, and the problems and potentials of English school theory The main areas of weakness in English school theory Is English school theory really theory?  World society in English school theory The intellectual history of world society within English school thinking The pluralist—solidarist debate Conclusions  Concepts of world society outside English school thinking IR writers with a sociological turn: Burton, Luard and Shaw Sociological conceptions of world society Global civil society Conclusions  Reimagining the English school's triad |

ix



### Contents

|   | Physical/mechanical and social concepts of system Society and community Individual and transnational Conclusions: reconstructing the English school's triad | 98<br>108<br>118<br>128 |
|---|---|-------------------------|
| 5 | Reconstructing the pluralist–solidarist debate What type of values, if shared, count as solidarist? Does it make any difference to solidarism how and why   | <b>139</b><br>143       |
|   | any given values are shared? What does 'thickness' mean in terms of type and number of values shared, and type and number of                                | 152                     |
|   | people and/or states sharing them?  | 154                     |
|   | Conclusions   | 158                     |
| 6 | The primary institutions of international society   | 161                     |
|   | Definitional problems   | 163                     |
|   | The concept of primary institutions in English school   | 4.5                     |
|   | literature  | 167                     |
|   | Hierarchy and functionalism within primary institutions   | 176                     |
|   | The range of institutions and the types of international  | 170                     |
|   | society   | 190                     |
|   | Conclusions   | 195                     |
| 7 | Bringing geography back in  | 205                     |
|   | Exclusive globalism is not necessary  | 207                     |
|   | Unwarranted pessimism   | 212                     |
|   | Understanding the interplay among the interhuman,   |                         |
|   | transnational and interstate domains  | 217                     |
|   | Conclusions: a vanguard theory of international social  | 222                     |
|   | structures  | 222                     |
| 8 | Conclusions: a portrait of contemporary interstate  |                         |
|   | society   | 228                     |
|   | A snapshot of contemporary interstate society   | 231                     |
|   | Looking back: what changed, what didn't and why? Driving forces, deeply rooted structures and   | 240                     |
|   | contradictions  | 249                     |
|   | Conclusions: where to from here?  | 263                     |
|   | List of references  | 271                     |
|   | Index   | 284                     |

 $\boldsymbol{x}$ 



# Figures and tables

## **Figures**

| 1 | The classical Three Traditions' model of English     |         |
|---|--|---------|
|   | school theory  | page 9  |
| 2 | The 'Three Traditions', first revision               | 98      |
| 3 | The 'Three Traditions', second revision              | 109     |
| 4 | The 'Three Traditions', third revision               | 133     |
| 5 | The 'Three Traditions', fourth revision              | 159     |
|   |  |         |
|   | Tables   |         |
| 1 | Candidates for primary institutions of international | society |

by author 174
The nested hierarchy of international institutions 184
Contemporary international institutions 187

4 The primary institutions of eighteenth-century European interstate society 242

xi





## **Preface**

This book started conscious life when I decided in the late 1990s to attempt a reconvening of the English school. Much of its agenda is already visible in a paper I wrote for the public launch of that project at the BISA Conference in 1999, and subsequently published in the Review of International Studies as part of a forum on the English school. That paper opens many of the criticisms of the English school classics, and some of the suggestions as to how to develop and apply the theory, that are followed up here. This book has deeper roots both in my earlier attempts to link English school ideas to American IR theory, which I extend here, and in my world historical writings with Richard Little, which point strongly towards the English school as an excellent site for developing grand theory. Its particular genesis was a growing feeling that a lot of the problems I saw in English school theory hinged on the concept of world society. World society occupied a key place in a triad alongside international society and international system, but was the Cinderella of English school theory, attracting neither consistent usage nor, and in contrast to international society, any systematic attempt to explore its meaning. The vagueness attending world society seemed to underpin a lot of the problems in English school theory about pluralism and solidarism, and how to handle the cosmopolitan and transnational aspects of international life. This dissatisfaction led me to apply for ESRC funding to look into world society. I originally offered an article, but as I dug into world society it quickly became obvious that I was writing a book, and that it would have to take on the whole body of English school theory. In that sense, writing this book has reminded me of the process of writing People, States and Fear twenty years ago - indeed, this book could be titled Peoples, States and Transnational Actors! Then I was trying to understand the concept of security, and had to follow the threads wherever

xiii



### Preface

they led without knowing what the whole thing would look like. Now I have pursued the threads opened by world society, and ended up focusing on institutions and the general theoretical framework of English school thinking.

I would like to thank the following for comments on all or parts of earlier versions of this work: Mathias Albert, William Bain, Chris Brown, Bruce Cronin, Thomas Diez, Tim Dunne, Ana Gonzalez-Pelaez, Stefano Guzzini, Lene Hansen, Andrew Hurrell, Dietrich Jung, John Keane, Morten Kelstrup, Bob Keohane, Anna Leander, Richard Little, Lene Mosegaard Madsen, Ian Manners, Noel Parker, Nick Rengger, John Ruggie, Brian Schmidt, Gerry Simpson, Hidemi Suganami, Ole Wæver, Adam Watson, Nick Wheeler, Richard Whitman, and several anonymous reviewers for the ESRC. My special thanks to Richard Little, Ole Wæver and the late Gerry Segal. Without my extensive collaborations with them I would never have learned half of the things I needed to understand in order to write this book. I dedicate it to Richard Little, who as well as being a good friend, has accompanied me on much of my intellectual journey towards the English school, and who has played a big role in the success of its reconvening.

I am grateful to the ESRC (award no. R000239415-A) for funding a two-year teaching buyout which enabled me to focus on this project, and to the University of Westminster, and then the London School of Economics, for giving me leave. I am also grateful to the late and much lamented Copenhagen Peace Research Institute (COPRI) for funding both my presence there, and a regular seminar at which many drafts related to this book received incisive criticism.

xiv



More information

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-83348-6 - From International to World Society?: English School Theory and the Social Structure of Globalisation Barry Buzan Frontmatter

**Abbreviations** 

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations
BIS Bank for International Settlements
BISA British International Studies Association

CEO Chief Executive Officer

CITES Convention on International Trade in Endangered

Species

COPRI Copenhagen Peace Research Institute
CSD Centre for the Study of Democracy

ECPR European Consortium for Political Research
ESRC Economic and Social Research Council

EU European Union

FIDE International Chess Federation

FIFA International Federation of Football Associations

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

GCS Global Civil Society

IAEA International Atomic Energy Agency
IBRD International Bank for Reconstruction and

Development, aka World Bank

ICC International Criminal CourtICJ International Court of JusticeIGO Intergovernmental OrganisationIMF International Monetary Fund

INGO International Non-Governmental Organisation IPCC Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change

IPE International Political Economy

IPSA International Political Science Association

IR International Relations

xv



More information

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-83348-6 - From International to World Society?: English School Theory and the Social Structure of Globalisation Barry Buzan Frontmatter

### List of abbreviations

ISA International Studies Association

MFN Most Favoured Nation

Montreal Protocol (1987) to the Vienna Convention for Protection of the Ozone Layer (1987)

NAFTA North American Free Trade Association NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organisation

OECD Organisation for Economic Cooperation and

Development

OIC Organisation of the Islamic Conference

PKO peacekeeping operation

QUANGO quasi-autonomous non-governmental organisation

TNA transnational actor
TNC transnational corporation

UN United Nations

UNFCCC United Nations Framework Convention on Climate

Change (1992) and Kyoto Protocol (1997)

UNGA United Nations General Assembly

UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

US United States

WHO World Health Organisation
WSRG World Society Research Group
WTO World Trade Organisation



## Glossary

Binding forces – coercion, calculation, belief
Interhuman society – social structures based on interactions amongst individual human beings, and in this book referred to as first-order societies, and mainly manifested as large-scale patterns of shared identity
International society has two meanings in this book:

- (1) The classical English school usage: is about the institutionalisation of shared interest and identity amongst states, and puts the creation and maintenance of shared norms, rules and institutions at the centre of IR theory. I call this *interstate society*
- (2) A more specific meaning developed along the way in this book to indicate situations in which the basic political and legal frame of international social structure is set by the states-system, with individuals and TNAs being given rights by states within the order defined by interstate society

*Interstate society – see international society definition (1)* 

International system – refers generally to the macro side of the interactions that tie the human race together, and more specifically to the interactions among states. Its usage in classical English school thinking is close to that in realism, being about power politics amongst states within a political structure of international anarchy.

*Montreal Protocol* – (1987) to the Vienna Convention for Protection of the Ozone Layer (1987)

Pluralism – defines second-order societies of states with a relatively low degree of shared norms, rules and institutions amongst the states, where the focus of society is on creating a framework for orderly coexistence and competition, or possibly also the management of collective problems of common fate (e.g. arms control, environment)

xvii



### Glossary

Primary institutions – the institutions talked about by the English school as constitutive of both states and international society in that they define both the basic character and purpose of any such society. For second-order societies such institutions define the units that compose the society

Secondary institutions – the institutions talked about in regime theory are the products of certain types of international society (most obviously liberal, but possibly other types as well), and are for the most part consciously designed by states

Second-order societies – those in which the members are not individual human beings, but durable collectivities of humans possessed of identities and actor qualities that are more than the sum of their parts

Solidarism – can be used as a synonym for cosmopolitanism, but in my usage defines international societies with a relatively high degree of shared norms, rules and institutions among states, where the focus is not only on ordering coexistence and competition, but also on cooperation over a wider range of issues, whether in pursuit of joint gains (e.g. trade), or realisation of shared values (e.g. human rights)

State – any form of post-kinship, territorially based, politically centralised, self-governing entity capable of generating an inside–outside structure

The three domains – interstate, interhuman and transnational society

Transnational society – social structures composed of non-state collective actors

Vanguard – the idea common to both military strategy and Leninist thinking that a leading element plays a crucial role in how social movements unfold

World society – has two meanings in this book:

- (1) the traditional English school usage takes individuals, non-state organisations and ultimately the global population as a whole as the focus of global societal identities and arrangements, and puts transcendence of the states-system at the centre of IR theory
- (2) the usage developed in this book labelling situations in which no one of the three domains or types of unit is dominant over the other two, but all are in play together

xviii