

Cambridge University Press

0521833051 - Dante and the Franciscans: Poverty and the Papacy in the 'Commedia'

Nick Havely

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

DANTE AND THE FRANCISCANS

Nick Havely examines the connections between Dante, the Franciscans and the Papacy as they appear in the *Commedia*, and presents the poem as one concerned with an often dramatic confrontation between authority and idealism in the Church. Havely draws on a wide range of literary, historical and art-historical sources relating to the controversy about Franciscan poverty during the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries. He argues that the Spiritual Franciscans' strict interpretation of evangelical poverty provided the poet with a means of addressing the state of the contemporary Papacy and of imagining the renewal of the Church. He also explores the origins and afterlife of the debate about this form of poverty and Dante's contribution to it. This study will appeal to scholars interested in medieval religious and intellectual history, as well as to readers of Dante's poem and other medieval visionary and political writing.

NICK HAVELY is Senior Lecturer in the Department of English and Related Literature at the University of York. He is the translator of *Chaucer's Boccaccio* (1980, 1992); editor of *The House of Fame* (1994), *Chaucer's Dream Poetry* (1997) and *Dante's Modern Afterlife* (1998); and author of numerous articles on Italian and English medieval literature, including the chapter on 'Literature in Italian, French and English' in volume VI of *The New Cambridge Medieval History* (2000).

Cambridge University Press

0521833051 - Dante and the Franciscans: Poverty and the Papacy in the 'Commedia'

Nick Havely

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN MEDIEVAL LITERATURE

General editor

Alastair Minnis, *University of York*

Editorial board

Zygmunt G. Barański, *University of Cambridge*

Christopher C. Baswell, *University of California, Los Angeles*

John Burrow, *University of Bristol*

Mary Carruthers, *New York University*

Rita Copeland, *University of Pennsylvania*

Simon Gaunt, *King's College, London*

Steven Kruger, *City University of New York*

Nigel Palmer, *University of Oxford*

Winthrop Wetherbee, *Cornell University*

Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, *Fordham University*

This series of critical books seeks to cover the whole area of literature written in the major medieval languages – the main European vernaculars, and medieval Latin and Greek – during the period c. 1100–1500. Its chief aim is to publish and stimulate fresh scholarship and criticism on medieval literature, special emphasis being placed on understanding major works of poetry, prose, and drama in relation to the contemporary culture and learning which fostered them.

Recent titles in the series

Rita Copeland *Pedagogy, Intellectuals and Dissent in the Later Middle Ages:*

Lollardy and Ideas of Learning

Kantik Ghosh *The Wycliffite Heresy: Authority and the Interpretation of Texts*

Mary C. Erler *Women, Reading, and Piety in Late Medieval England*

D. H. Green *The Beginnings of Medieval Romance: Fact and Fiction, 1150–1220*

J. A. Burrow *Gestures and Looks in Medieval Narrative*

Ardis Butterfield *Poetry and Music in Medieval France: From Jean Renart to*

Guillaume de Machaut

Emily Steiner *Documentary Culture and the Making of Medieval English Literature*

William Burgwinkle *Sodomy, Masculinity and Law in Medieval Literature*

A complete list of titles in the series can be found at the end of the volume.

Cambridge University Press

0521833051 - Dante and the Franciscans: Poverty and the Papacy in the 'Commedia'

Nick Havely

Frontmatter

[More information](#)



Dante and Virgil (left) confront Guido da Montefeltro as Franciscan in the flames (centre), with Pope Boniface VIII enthroned (right).

Cambridge University Press

0521833051 - Dante and the Franciscans: Poverty and the Papacy in the 'Commedia'

Nick Havely

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

DANTE AND THE FRANCISCANS

Poverty and the Papacy in the 'Commedia'

NICK HAVELY



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

0521833051 - Dante and the Franciscans: Poverty and the Papacy in the 'Commedia'

Nick Havely

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK

40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain

Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

<http://www.cambridge.org>

© Nick Havely 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Adobe Garamond 11.5/14 pt. *System* $\TeX$ 2 ϵ [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 83305 1 hardback

Cambridge University Press

0521833051 - Dante and the Franciscans: Poverty and the Papacy in the 'Commedia'

Nick Havely

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

'... nulla pastoralis auctoritate abutens, quoniam divitiae mecum non sunt'.

Dante, *Ep.* 11.5

'Bakker has . . . contended that his years in prison were his salvation. He re-read all the scriptures and crucially concluded that the so-called "prosperity preaching" of his P[raise] T[he] L[ord] days – wherein he equated dollar-wealth with godliness – was misguided. [. . .] And donations, believe it or not, are rolling in.'

The Independent on Sunday, 15 June 2003

Contents

<i>List of illustrations</i>	<i>page</i> x
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Note on citations, translations and manuscript sources</i>	xiii
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xv
Introduction	I
1 From shame to honour: Tuscan and Franciscan poverty	8
2 <i>Inferno</i> : avarice and authority	44
3 <i>Purgatorio</i> : poverty in spirit	88
4 <i>Paradiso</i> : poverty and authority	123
Epilogue	181
Appendix I: The <i>Sacrum commercium</i> : manuscripts and date of composition	188
Appendix II: The Bardi Dossal: landscape and ideology	190
<i>Bibliography</i>	192
<i>Index</i>	208

Illustrations

Dante and Virgil confront Guido da Montefeltro as Franciscan in flames, with Pope Boniface VIII enthroned. From Madrid, BN MS 10057, 51r (Italian, middle of the fifteenth century), illustrating *Inferno* 27 (by permission of the Ministerio de Educación, Cultura y Deporte). *frontispiece*

1: St Francis and the devil in dispute over the soul of Guido da Montefeltro; Boniface VIII absolves Guido. From Florence, Riccardiana MS 1005, 81r (Bolognese, second quarter of the fourteenth century), illustrating *Inferno* 27 (by permission of the Direzione, Biblioteca Riccardiana, Florence). *page 67*

2: St Francis listening to the Gospel and removing his shoes. From the scenes of the Life of St Francis in the Bardi Dossal, Santa Croce, Florence (mid to late thirteenth century; by permission of the Prefettura di Firenze). 136

3: The Stigmatization at La Verna, from the panel of scenes from the Life of St Francis in the Church of San Francesco, Pescia (dated 1235 and signed by Bonaventura Berlinghieri; by permission of the Ordine Francescano, Pescia). 141

4: St Francis before Innocent III and the Sultan, with the Stigmatization. From Florence, BN, MS Banco Rari 39, 351v (Lombard, c. 1400), illustrating *Paradiso* 11 (by permission of the Direzione, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Florence). 145

5: St Francis renouncing worldly goods. From Florence, BN, MS Banco Rari 39, 349r (Lombard, c. 1400), illustrating *Paradiso* 11 (by permission of the Direzione, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Florence). 146

Cambridge University Press

0521833051 - Dante and the Franciscans: Poverty and the Papacy in the 'Commedia'

Nick Havely

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgements

References in all that follows reflect the extent of my indebtedness to other writers on this subject. Particular thanks are due to a number of scholars, friends and colleagues, notably the late Peter Armour, Mark Balfour, John Barnes, Jacques Berthoud, Peter Biller, the late Charles Davis, Carlo Delcorno, Anne Hudson, Fr Stephen Innes, Christopher Kleinhenz, Alastair Minnis, Marjorie Reeves and Corinna Salvadori Lonergan for comments, advice and assistance of various kinds. Since 1991, panellists and audiences at Dante sessions in the Kalamazoo Congress on Medieval Studies have responded generously to my initial papers on this subject. Of these I should name especially Santa Casiani, Caron Cioffi, Rick Emmerson, Christie Fengler-Stephany, Ron Herzman, Chris Kleinhenz (again), Fr Paul LaChance, Dennis Looney, Claudia Rattazzi Papka, Janet Smarr, Bill Stephany, and Barbara Watts. Parts of Chapters 2–4 have appeared as articles in *Dante Studies* (1992 and 1996), *The Journal of the Institute of Romance Studies* (1994) and *Italian Studies* (1997), and I am grateful to the editors of those journals both for their readers' comments on those articles and for permission to reprint some material from them here. Linda Bree's work as Commissioning Editor and Jackie Warren's as Production Editor has been throughout patient, efficient and perceptive, and the copy editing by Dr Rosemary Williams has been both meticulous and scholarly.

Thanks are also due to the Arts and Humanities Research Board, who funded research leave in the autumn of 2000 and thus enabled this book to reach completion. The basic task of research would have been impossible without the assistance of staff in a number of libraries in Britain, Continental Europe and the USA, and, above all, the librarians of the Taylor Institution in Oxford. And persistence in the task

Cambridge University Press

0521833051 - Dante and the Franciscans: Poverty and the Papacy in the 'Commedia'

Nick Havely

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgements*

would have been difficult without the stimulus of undergraduate and postgraduate students of Dante at the University of York, for whom the book is written.

The cover illustration from Madrid BN MS 10057 is reproduced with the permission of the Ministerio de Educación, Cultura y Deporte; figure 1 (from MS Ricc. 1005) with the permission of the Direzione, Biblioteca Riccardiana, Florence; figures 2 and 3 (from the Bardi Dossal, Santa Croce, Florence and from the panel in San Francesco, Pescia) with the permission of the Prefettura di Firenze (figure 2) and the Ordine Franciscano, Pescia (figure 3); and figures 4 and 5 (from MS Banco Rari 39) with permission of the Direzione, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Florence.

Cambridge University Press

0521833051 - Dante and the Franciscans: Poverty and the Papacy in the 'Commedia'

Nick Havely

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Note on citations, translations and manuscript sources

Quotations from the *Commedia* follow the text established by G. Petrocchi in *'La Commedia': secondo l'antica vulgata* (3 vols., Milan, 1966–7), and those from Dante's other works follow the editions mentioned in the Notes and Bibliography. The Vulgate Bible is cited from the *Biblia Vulgata*, ed. A. Colunga and L. Turrado (4th edn, Madrid, 1965), and the translations are from *The New Jerusalem Bible (Standard Edition)*, general editor H. Wansbrough (London, 1985). All other translations, unless otherwise specified, are my own.

MANUSCRIPTS CONSULTED:

Dante: illustrated manuscripts of the Commedia

Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale, MS Banco Rari 39 (microfiche)

Biblioteca Riccardiana, MS 1005 (slides)

London, British Library, Additional MS 19587

Egerton MS 943

Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, MS 10057 (microfilm)

Giordano of Pisa: sermons

Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS canon. ital. 132

Petrus Iohannis Olivi: Lectura super Mattheum

Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS New College 49

Lectura super Apocalypsim

Rome, Biblioteca Angelica, MS 382 (microfilm)

Sacrum commercium sancti Francisci cum domina Paupertate

Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Canon. misc. 263

Cambridge University Press

0521833051 - Dante and the Franciscans: Poverty and the Papacy in the 'Commedia'

Nick Havely

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Note on citations

Servasanto da Faenza: Liber de Virtutibus et Vitiis

Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale, MS Cod. E.6.1046, conventi soppressi

Vaticinia de summis pontificibus

Florence, Biblioteca Riccardiana, MS 1222.2

Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Douce 88

Abbreviations

<i>AFH</i>	<i>Archivum Franciscanum Historicum</i> (Quaracchi).
<i>ALKG</i>	<i>Archiv für Literatur- und Kirchengeschichte des Mittelalters</i> , ed. H. Denifle and F. Ehrle (7 vols.) (Berlin, 1885–1900).
<i>BF</i>	<i>Bullarium Franciscanum</i> , ed. J. H. Sbaralea and C. Eubel (5 vols.) (Rome, 1759–1898).
<i>BMS</i>	<i>Illuminated Manuscripts of the Divine Comedy</i> , ed. P. Brieger, M. Meiss and C. S. Singleton (2 vols.) (New York and London, 1969).
<i>BR</i>	<i>Dante Alighieri: La Divina Commedia</i> , ed. U. Bosco and G. Reggio (3 vols.) (Florence, 1979).
<i>Bull.</i>	<i>Bullettino della Società Dantesca Italiana</i> .
<i>1 Celano</i>	Thomas of Celano, <i>Vita prima</i> .
<i>2 Celano</i>	Thomas of Celano, <i>Vita secunda</i> .
<i>CHMPT</i>	<i>The Cambridge History of Medieval Political Thought, c.350–c.1450</i> , ed. J. H. Burns (Cambridge, 1988).
<i>CL</i>	<i>Dante: Commedia</i> , ed. A. M. Chiavacci Leonardi (3 vols.) (Milan (2nd edn), 1997).
<i>Conv.</i>	Dante, <i>Convivio</i> .
<i>DDJb</i>	<i>Deutsches Dante-Jahrbuch</i> .
<i>DE</i>	<i>The Dante Encyclopedia</i> , ed. R. Lansing (New York and London, 2000).
<i>DS</i>	<i>Dante Studies</i> .
<i>DVE</i>	Dante, <i>De vulgari eloquentia</i> .
<i>ED</i>	<i>Enciclopedia dantesca</i> , dir. U. Bosco, ed. G. Petrocchi (6 vols.) (Rome, 1970–8).
<i>Ep.</i>	Dante, <i>Epistolae</i> .

Cambridge University Press

0521833051 - Dante and the Franciscans: Poverty and the Papacy in the 'Commedia'

Nick Havelly

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Abbreviations

<i>FF</i>	<i>Fonti francescane: Scritti e biografie di san Francesco d'Assisi; Cronache e altre testimonianze del primo secolo francescano; Scritti e biografie di santa Chiara d'Assisi</i> , ed. E. Caroli (Padua, 1990).
<i>GDLI</i>	<i>Grande Dizionario della Lingua Italiana</i> , ed. S. Battaglia (19 vols. [continuing], Turin, 1961–).
<i>GSLI</i>	<i>Giornale storico della letteratura italiana</i> .
<i>Habig</i>	<i>St Francis of Assisi: Writings and Early Biographies: An English Omnibus of the Sources for the Life of St Francis</i> , ed. M. A. Habig (Chicago, 1973).
<i>Inf.</i>	Dante, <i>Inferno</i> .
<i>JEH</i>	<i>Journal of Ecclesiastical History</i> .
<i>Mon.</i>	Dante, <i>Monarchia</i> .
<i>Par.</i>	Dante, <i>Paradiso</i> .
<i>PL</i>	<i>Patrologiae Cursus Completus, Series Latina</i> , ed. J. P. Migne (221 vols.) (Paris, 1844–64).
<i>PMLA</i>	<i>Publications of the Modern Language Association</i> .
<i>Purg.</i>	Dante, <i>Purgatorio</i> .
<i>SCH</i>	<i>Studies in Church History</i> .
<i>S Th</i>	Aquinas, <i>Summa Theologiae</i> , Blackfriars Edition (61 vols.) (New York, 1964–76).