

Quality of Life and Human Difference

This innovative volume brings together two important literatures for the first time. One concerns the role of quality-of-life assessments in social policy, and especially in health policy. The second concerns ethical and social issues raised by prenatal testing for disability; a theme of this literature has been the role played by controversial assumptions about the quality of life of people with disabilities.

Hitherto, these two literatures have had little contact with each other. Few scholars have written about both or have compared the two domains in a systematic way, and people with disabilities and disability scholars are underrepresented in recent discussions about health policy and quality-of-life assessment. This book brings to bear the perspectives of disability scholars on issues that have largely been the province of health methodology, policy, and philosophy, while focusing philosophical policy analysis on problems that have largely been the province of disability scholarship.

This volume will be sought after by bioethicists, philosophers, and specialists in disability studies and health care economics.

David Wasserman is Research Scholar at the Institute for Philosophy and Public Policy, University of Maryland.

Jerome Bickenbach is Professor in the Department of Philosophy and Faculties of Law and Medicine, Queen's University, Ontario.

Robert Wachbroit is Research Scholar at the Institute for Philosophy and Public Policy, University of Maryland.



Cambridge University Press

0521832012 - Quality of Life and Human Difference: Genetic Testing, Health Care, and Disability

Edited by David Wasserman, Jerome Bickenbach and Robert Wachbroit

Frontmatter More information

Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and Public Policy

General editor: Douglas MacLean, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill

Other books in series

Mark Sagoff: The Economy of the Earth

Henry Shue (ed.): *Nuclear Deterrence and Moral Restraint* Judith Lichtenberg (ed.): *Democracy and Mass Media*

William Galston: *Liberal Purposes* Elaine Draper: *Risky Business*

R. G. Frey and Christopher W. Morris: Violence, Terrorism, and Justice

Douglas Husak: Drugs and Rights

Ferdinand Schoeman: Privacy and Social Freedom

Dan Brock: Life and Death

Paul B. Thompson: The Ethics of Aid and Trade

Jeremy Waldron: Liberal Rights

Steven Lee: *Morality, Prudence, and Nuclear Weapons* Robert Goodin: *Utilitarianism as a Public Policy* Bernard Rollin: *The Frankenstein Syndrome*

Robert K. Fullinwider (ed.): Public Education in a Multicultural Society

John Kleinig: *The Ethics of Policing* Norman Daniels: *Justice and Justification* James P. Sterba: *Justice for Here and Now* Erik Nord: *Cost-Value Analysis in Health Care*

David Wasserman and Robert Wachbroit (eds.): Genetics and

Criminal Behavior

David Boonin: A Defense of Abortion

Deen K. Chatterjee and Don E. Scheid (eds.): Ethics and Foreign

Intervention

Ajume H. Wingo: Veil Politics in Liberal Democratic States



Quality of Life and Human Difference

Genetic Testing, Health Care, and Disability

Edited by

DAVID WASSERMAN

University of Maryland

JEROME BICKENBACH

Queen's University

ROBERT WACHBROIT

University of Maryland





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

http://www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521832014

© Cambridge University Press 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Quality of life and human difference: genetic testing, health care, and disability/edited by

David Wasserman, Jerome Bickenbach, Robert Wachbroit
p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in philosophy and public policy)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0-521-83201-2 – ISBN 0-521-53971-4 (pbk.)

1. Prenatal diagnosis – Moral and ethical aspects. 2. Prenatal diagnosis – Social aspects. 3. Fetus – Abnormalities – Diagnosis. 4. Genetic screening – Moral and ethical aspects. 5. Genetic screening – Social aspects. 6. Medical ethics. 7. Quality of life. I. Wasserman, David T. II. Bickenbach, Jerome Edmund. III. Wachbroit,

Robert Samuel. IV. Series. RG628.Q35 2005

618.3′2042–dc22 2004062839

ISBN-13 978-0-521-83201-4 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-83201-2 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-53971-5 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-53971-4 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this book and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Cor	ntributors 1	page ix
Ack	knowledgments	xi
	Introduction DAVID WASSERMAN, JEROME BICKENBACH, AND ROBERT WACHBROIT	1
1	Assessing Quality of Life: Clinical versus Health Policy Uses ROBERT WACHBROIT	27
2	Predicting Genetic Disability while Commodifying Health ANITA SILVERS	43
3	Preventing Genetically Transmitted Disabilities while Respecting Persons with Disabilities DAN W. BROCK	67
4	Disability, Ideology, and Quality of Life: A Bias in Biomedical Ethics RON AMUNDSON	101
5	Values for Health States in QALYs and DALYs: Desirability versus Well-Being and Worth ERIK NORD	125
6	Preventing the Existence of People with Disabilities JEFF McMAHAN	142
7	Where Is the Sin in Synecdoche? Prenatal Testing and the Parent-Child Relationship ADRIENNE ASCH AND DAVID WASSERMAN	172

vii



Contents

8	The Social Context of Individual Choice	217
	TOM SHAKESPEARE	
9	Disability and Health Systems Assessment	237
	JEROME BICKENBACH	
Index		267



Contributors

Ron Amundson, University of Hawaii
Adrienne Asch, Wellesley College
Jerome Bickenbach, Queen's University, Ontario
Dan W. Brock, Harvard Medical School
Jeff McMahan, Rutgers University
Erik Nord, National Institute of Public Health, Oslo, Norway
Tom Shakespeare, Ethics and Life Sciences Research Institute,
Newcastle, UK
Anita Silvers, San Francisco State University
Robert Wachbroit, University of Maryland
David Wasserman, University of Maryland



Acknowledgments

The present volume explores the relationship of variations in physical and mental functioning to the quality of human lives, and the relevance of the expected or assessed quality of a human life to decisions about whether to create or extend it. It arises from a working group the editors convened in January 2001 (with support from NIH Grant HG011979-02) to address issues about disability, well-being, and the valuation of lives raised by recent developments in health technology and methodology. Most of the chapters in this volume were initially prepared for the working group and were revised in light of its deliberations.