

Cambridge University Press

0521831652 - The Aesthetics of Emulation in the Visual Arts of Ancient Rome

Ellen Perry

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

THE AESTHETICS OF EMULATION IN THE VISUAL ARTS OF ANCIENT ROME

This book examines Roman strategies for the appropriation of Greek visual culture and argues that earlier scholarship on this topic, dominated by copy criticism (*Kopienkritik*), has not appreciated Roman values in the visual arts. Ellen Perry analyzes the Roman aesthetics that lie at the core of the visual conservatism – and innovation – in the art of that civilization. An understanding of these attitudes helps to demonstrate the relative rarity, in Roman sculpture, of copies after great Greek masters. Roman aesthetics, Perry demonstrates, call for a range of visual appropriation in Roman art – including not only copying, but also such manifestations as allusion, parody, and, most importantly, *aemulatio* – successful rivalry with one's models.

Ellen Perry is associate professor in the Department of Classics at the College of the Holy Cross. A Fellow of the American Academy in Rome, she is a scholar of Roman art and has contributed to *Classical Philology* and *Hesperia*.

Cambridge University Press

0521831652 - The Aesthetics of Emulation in the Visual Arts of Ancient Rome

Ellen Perry

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

THE AESTHETICS OF
EMULATION IN
THE VISUAL ARTS OF
ANCIENT ROME

ELLEN PERRY

College of the Holy Cross



Cambridge University Press
 0521831652 - The Aesthetics of Emulation in the Visual Arts of Ancient Rome
 Ellen Perry
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
 The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
 Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa
<http://www.cambridge.org>

© Ellen Perry 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without
 the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United States of America

Typeface Bembo 11/14.5 pt. *System* L^AT_EX 2_ε [TB]

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Perry, Ellen, 1965–

The aesthetics of emulation in the visual arts of ancient Rome / Ellen Perry.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-83165-2 (HB)

1. Sculpture, Roman – Themes, motives. 2. Sculpture, Greek – Copying.
 3. Aesthetics, Roman. I. Title.

NB115.P47 2004

733'.5 – dc22 2004045109

ISBN 0 521 83165 2 hardback

Cambridge University Press

0521831652 - The Aesthetics of Emulation in the Visual Arts of Ancient Rome

Ellen Perry

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

For my husband, whom I have learned to imitoot exarckly.

Cambridge University Press

0521831652 - The Aesthetics of Emulation in the Visual Arts of Ancient Rome

Ellen Perry

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Not to know what happened before you were born is always to remain a child. For what is a person's life if it is not woven into the lives of those who came before by the memory of things past?

– Cicero *Orator* 120 (trans. Ann Vasaly)

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xv
INTRODUCTION	
A Critical Time in the Study of Roman Artistic Imitation	I
The Case of the Apollo Belvedere: An Argument in Favor of Skepticism	I
Recent Scholarship on Imitation and Emulation in Roman Art	7
Two Problems: The Polarization of Scholarship and the Inertia of Institutions	12
The Present Study and Its Methods	17
Working Definitions of “Roman” and “Greek”	23
The Structure of the Present Investigation	24
CHAPTER ONE	
<i>Decorum</i> and Tradition: The Beginnings of a Theoretical Apparatus	28
A Definition of <i>Decorum</i>	31
Matter and Manner	38
Summary	48
CHAPTER TWO	
<i>Decorum</i> and the Patron: The Functions of Art	50
Appropriateness and Architectural Context	50
Patronage and Self-Representation	65
Summary	76

Contents

CHAPTER THREE	
The Marginalization of Innovation: <i>Kopienkritik</i> and the Construct of the Free Copy	78
How <i>Kopienkritik</i> Made Roman Art Invisible	78
The Dissemination of <i>Kopienkritik</i> : Adolf Furtwängler's <i>Meisterwerke</i>	81
Reactions to <i>Meisterwerke</i>	84
Exact Copies	90
The Free Copy: Some General Considerations	96
Case Study: An Amazon Caryatid from Loukou	99
Summary	109
CHAPTER FOUR	
The Strategy of Eclecticism	111
Ancient Theories of Eclecticism	111
Case Study: The Capua Venus and Its Descendants	122
Summary	148
CHAPTER FIVE	
<i>Phantasia</i>: The Artist's Vision as Model	150
A Description of the Process	150
Theon of Samos and Timomachus of Byzantium	163
CHAPTER SIX	
The Role of the <i>Antiqui</i> in Roman Art	172
One Ancient Motive for Sculptural Replication	172
Anonymous Artists	177
The Evidence of Ancient Theoretical Discussions	181
Conclusions	189
<i>References</i>	193
<i>Index</i>	203

Cambridge University Press

0521831652 - The Aesthetics of Emulation in the Visual Arts of Ancient Rome

Ellen Perry

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Figures

1. The Apollo Belvedere.	2
2. Ganymede and the Eagle.	3
3. Herm of Perikles.	9
4. Riace Warrior A.	14
5. Riace Warrior B.	15
6. Sea procession relief from the so-called Altar of Domitius Ahenobarbus.	39
7. Census scene from the so-called Altar of Domitius Ahenobarbus.	40
8. Arch of Titus, detail of triumphal procession on the attic.	51
9. Arch of Titus, spoils relief.	51
10. Olympias-Aphrodite sculpture, Villa Albani, Rome.	58
11. Olympias-Aphrodite sculpture, Uffizi, Florence.	59
12. Attic funerary relief from the Piraeus, National Museum, Athens.	63
13. Drawing of the Leda sarcophagus from Kephisia.	67
14. Drawing of a marble torso of a female, found in the Kephisia tomb.	69
15. A portion of the Mantinea base from the workshop of Praxiteles.	69
16. Document relief from Sparta (Sparta Museum 201) depicting the Dioskouroi and Helen.	72
17. Document relief from Sparta (Sparta Museum 202) depicting the Dioskouroi and Helen.	73
18. Plaster cast assembled by Adolf Furtwängler and identified by him as the Athena Lemnia of Phidias.	83
19. Replica of an Erechtheion caryatid, Hadrian's Villa at Tivoli.	92

Cambridge University Press

0521831652 - The Aesthetics of Emulation in the Visual Arts of Ancient Rome

Ellen Perry

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Figures

20. Replica of an Erechtheion caryatid, Hadrian's Villa at Tivoli.	93
21. Amazon caryatid from the estate of Herodes Atticus.	100
22. Detail of Amazon caryatid from the estate of Herodes Atticus.	101
23. Amazon of the Mattei type, Hadrian's Villa at Tivoli.	102
24. Amazon of the Lansdowne-Sciarra type, Hadrian's Villa at Tivoli.	103
25. Portrait of Marcia Furnilla from a villa near Lake Albano.	113
26. Capua Venus, Naples National Museum.	121
27. Victory of Brescia.	125
28. Victory from the Column of Trajan.	126
29. Reverse of a denarius: Venus holding Victory in her right hand.	127
30. Venus and Mars, Uffizi, Florence.	129
31. Portraits of a man and a woman as Mars and Venus, Capitoline Museums, Rome.	130
32. Portraits of a man and a woman as Venus and Mars, Louvre Museum, Paris.	131
33. Portraits of a man and a woman as Venus and Mars, Museo Nazionale, Rome.	132
34. Reverse of a dupondius from the reign of Marcus Aurelius: Venus Victrix and Mars.	133
35. Mars (Ares) Borghese, Louvre Museum, Paris.	135
36. Sarcophagus built into the wall of the Palazzo Mattei di Giove.	136
37. Detail of Figure 36, Venus and Mars.	137
38. Aphrodite of the Cnidian type from Hadrian's Villa at Tivoli.	139
39. Sarcophagus from the Villa Ada (Villa Savoia), Rome.	140
40. Detail of Figure 39, Victory writing on a shield.	141
41. Plebeian funerary relief from the Palazzo Valentini.	146
42. Muse Sarcophagus from the Palazzo Mattei di Giove.	147
43. Muse sarcophagus from Castellammare di Stabia.	147
44. Painting of Medea from the House of the Dioscuri, Pompeii.	166
45. Painting of Medea from the House of Jason, Pompeii.	167
46. A version of the Artemis of Ephesus.	174
47. Signature on a statue of Venus in the Palazzo Massimo.	175
48. The Laocoön.	179

Cambridge University Press

0521831652 - The Aesthetics of Emulation in the Visual Arts of Ancient Rome

Ellen Perry

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

In the humanities, a book that carries the name of a single author on the cover reflects a conventional fiction to which we all assent. Few books make it to press without the support of both friends and institutions. In my case, this support has been substantial.

I would like to thank the American School of Classical Studies in Athens, the American Academy in Rome, and the University of Michigan for the time, financial support, and libraries that allowed me to begin research on the dissertation in which I first presented some of the ideas that appear here. The American Academy in Rome also provided me with several congenial colleagues and mentors – including Carmen Bambach, Greg Bucher, Chris Celenza, Guy Hedreen, Sanda Iliescu, Liz McGowan, and Malcolm Bell – who responded to my nascent studies with kindness and encouragement. The University of Michigan provided me with an excellent dissertation committee, which included Thelma Thomas, James Porter, and Margaret Root.

My debt is great to the many friends and colleagues who have since been gracious enough to talk with me about my ideas and theirs. These include all of the participants of a 1994 NEH summer seminar in Rome called the “Roman Art of Emulation,” among whom I would like to single out for special mention Liz Bartman, Michael Koortbojian, Nancy Ramage, Richard Spear, Jennifer Trimble, and Ruth Weisberg.

Others deserve to be named for the time they dedicated to reading and commenting on the manuscript. Although errors of fact or interpretation surely crept in in spite of their gentle interventions, these friends are

Cambridge University Press
0521831652 - The Aesthetics of Emulation in the Visual Arts of Ancient Rome
Ellen Perry
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

responsible for considerable improvements to my work. My friends Neel Smith and Lea Stirling and my husband, Mark Landon, graciously read the manuscript and helped me to make the worse argument not only seem better, but actually be so. Jas Elsner, Simon Goldhill, and Susan Alcock read two chapters and offered encouragement at just the right time. My two anonymous readers deserve thanks for their thoughtful and detailed comments. I owe the same and more to Beatrice Rehl for the time and expertise that she dedicated as editor, and for the patience with which she responded to my many inquiries; and to Susan Detwiler and her production team for the meticulous care with which they pulled the book together.

I would also like to thank the College of the Holy Cross for funds that allowed me to travel and study, for a leave that allowed me to broaden the scope of my thinking considerably, and for funds to purchase photographs at the final stages of publication. But I am even more grateful to Holy Cross for providing me with colleagues who have been ceaselessly, even heroically, supportive of my work. Each of these colleagues deserves to be mentioned by name: John Hamilton, Thomas Martin, Blaise Nagy, Neel Smith, and William Ziobro.

Many institutions and individuals graciously permitted me to study their holdings or generously provided me with photographs. I would like to single out for particular mention Jan Sanders and the Civici Musei d'Arte e Storia di Brescia, for providing photographs and reproduction rights free of charge in a field where reproduction fees can be the primary reason that books are insufficiently illustrated, and to the employees of the Soprintendenza per i Beni Archeologici del Piemonte for their assiduous help in my attempts to locate a missing sculptural group.

Earlier versions of some of the ideas presented here have appeared in *Hesperia* 70 (2001) and in E. K. Gazda, ed., *The Ancient Art of Emulation: Studies in Artistic Originality and Tradition from the Present to Classical Antiquity* (2002). A part of Chapter Three is reprinted from the latter and appears by permission of the University of Michigan Press. All translations not otherwise noted are mine.

I have saved my most heartfelt gratitude for last. If this book serves a useful purpose, it is in great part due to the guidance and insights of

Acknowledgments

Elaine Gazda, who, as my dissertation advisor, first encouraged me to work on this subject over a decade ago, and to Miranda Marvin, whose support for my work has been unflagging for nearly as long. Both of their names properly appear in several of the preceding paragraphs: together, they are responsible for organizing the 1994 NEH seminar, and each read through several iterations of the manuscript. My debt to them extends far beyond that, though. Each has supported me tirelessly in every detail of my career thus far, and each has read drafts of everything I have ever published. For this, and for their unfailing encouragement, which at times kept me going, I owe a debt that simply cannot be repaid.

Finally, I would like to thank my parents who, in the time-honored tradition of good parents everywhere, have always believed that I could do this or anything else to which I might set my mind, and my husband, Mark Landon, for living with some of these ideas almost as long as I have and for providing me with the most unstinting support, moral and intellectual, that any scholar could ask for or want.

Ellen Perry
College of the Holy Cross
Worcester, Massachusetts

Cambridge University Press

0521831652 - The Aesthetics of Emulation in the Visual Arts of Ancient Rome

Ellen Perry

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Abbreviations

Abbreviations of classical authors and texts follow, wherever possible, those listed in S. Hornblower and A. Spawforth, eds., *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 3rd edition, Oxford and New York, 1996.

<i>AA</i>	<i>Archäologischer Anzeiger</i>
<i>AbhHeid</i>	<i>Abhandlungen der Heidelberger Akademie der Wissenschaften</i>
<i>AJA</i>	<i>American Journal of Archaeology</i>
<i>AJP</i>	<i>American Journal of Philology</i>
<i>AM</i>	<i>Athenische Mitteilungen</i>
<i>ANRW</i>	<i>Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt</i>
<i>AntPl</i>	<i>Antike Plastik</i>
<i>BSA</i>	<i>Annual of the British School at Athens</i>
<i>CP</i>	<i>Classical Philology</i>
<i>CQ</i>	<i>Classical Quarterly</i>
<i>DialArch</i>	<i>Dialoghi di archeologia</i>
<i>EntrHardt</i>	<i>Entretiens Hardt</i>
<i>Gazda, Emulation</i>	<i>The Ancient Art of Emulation: Studies in Artistic Originality and Tradition from the Present to Classical Antiquity</i> , ed. E. K. Gazda, Ann Arbor, 2002
<i>G&R</i>	<i>Greece & Rome</i>
<i>Gnom. Vat.</i>	<i>Gnomologium Vaticanum</i> , ed. L. Sternbach, Berlin, 1963
<i>HCSP</i>	<i>Harvard Studies in Classical Philology</i>

Cambridge University Press

0521831652 - The Aesthetics of Emulation in the Visual Arts of Ancient Rome

Ellen Perry

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Abbreviations

Helbig ⁺	W. Helbig, <i>Führer durch die öffentlichen Sammlungen klassischer Altertümer in Rom</i> , 4th ed., supervised by H. Speier, Tübingen, 1963–72
<i>JdI</i>	<i>Jahrbuch des deutschen Archäologischen Instituts</i>
<i>JRA</i>	<i>Journal of Roman Archaeology</i>
<i>LIMC</i>	<i>Lexicon Iconographicum Mythologiae Classicae</i> , Zurich, 1981–99
<i>LTUR</i>	<i>Lexicon Topographicum Urbis Romae</i> , supervised by E. M. Steinby, Rome, 1993–2000
<i>MadMitt</i>	<i>Madriider Mitteilungen</i>
<i>MAAR</i>	<i>Memoirs of the American Academy in Rome</i>
<i>MemPontAcc</i>	<i>Memorie. Atti della Pontificia Accademia romana di archeologia</i>
<i>NGG</i>	<i>Nachrichten von der Gesellschaft der Wissenschaften zu Göttingen</i>
<i>OeJh</i>	<i>Österreichisches Jahrbuch</i>
Platner and Ashby	Samuel Ball Platner and Thomas Ashby, <i>A Topographical Dictionary of Rome</i> , Oxford, 1926
<i>RA</i>	<i>Revue archéologique</i>
Richardson	L. Richardson, <i>A New Topographical Dictionary of Rome</i> , Baltimore and London, 1992
<i>REG</i>	<i>Revue des études grecques</i>
<i>RM</i>	<i>Römische Mitteilungen</i>
<i>TAPA</i>	<i>Transactions of the American Philological Association</i>