

Cambridge University Press

0521826861 - The International Protection of Internally Displaced Persons

Catherine Phuong

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The International Protection of Internally Displaced Persons

Despite the fact that there are up to 25 million internally displaced persons around the world, their plight is still little known. Like refugees, internally displaced persons have been forced to leave their homes because of armed conflict and human rights abuses, but they have not left their country. This has major consequences in terms of the protection available to them. This book aims to offer a clear and easily accessible overview of this important humanitarian and human rights challenge. In particular, it seeks to provide an objective evaluation of UN efforts to protect the internally displaced. It will be of interest to all those involved with the internally displaced, as well as anyone seeking to gain an overall understanding of this complex issue.

CATHERINE PHUONG is a Lecturer in Law at the University of Newcastle. She studied law, politics and economics at the Institut d'Etudes Politiques de Paris (Sciences Po), and received her Master of Laws from the University of Durham and her Doctorate from the University of Nottingham. She has been Visiting Professor at the University of Lyon II, and Visiting Research Scholar at the University of Michigan.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL AND COMPARATIVE LAW

Established in 1946, this series produces high quality scholarship in the fields of public and private international law and comparative law. Although these are distinct legal subdisciplines, developments since 1946 confirm their interrelation.

Comparative law is increasingly used as a tool in the making of law at national, regional and international levels. Private international law is now often affected by international conventions, and the issues faced by classical conflicts rules are frequently dealt with by substantive harmonisation of law under international auspices. Mixed international arbitrations, especially those involving state economic activity, raise mixed questions of public and private international law, while in many fields (such as the protection of human rights and democratic standards, investment guarantees and international criminal law) international and national systems interact. National constitutional arrangements relating to 'foreign affairs', and to the implementation of international norms, are a focus of attention.

The Board welcomes works of a theoretical or interdisciplinary character, and those focusing on new approaches to international or comparative law or conflicts of law. Studies of particular institutions or problems are equally welcome, as are translations of the best work published in other languages.

- General Editors* James Crawford SC FBA
*Whewell Professor of International Law, Faculty of Law, and
 Director, Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law,
 University of Cambridge*
 John S. Bell FBA
Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge
- Editorial Board* Professor Hilary Charlesworth *Australian National University*
 Professor Lori Damrosch *Columbia University Law School*
 Professor John Dugard *Universiteit Leiden*
 Professor Mary-Ann Glendon *Harvard Law School*
 Professor Christopher Greenwood *London School of Economics*
 Professor David Johnston *University of Edinburgh*
 Professor Hein Kötz *Max-Planck-Institut, Hamburg*
 Professor Donald McRae *University of Ottawa*
 Professor Onuma Yasuaki *University of Tokyo*
 Professor Reinhard Zimmermann *Universität Regensburg*
- Advisory Committee* Professor D. W. Bowett QC
 Judge Rosalyn Higgins QC
 Professor J. A. Jolowicz QC
 Professor Sir Elihu Lauterpacht CBE QC
 Professor Kurt Lipstein
 Judge Stephen Schwebel

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume.

Cambridge University Press
0521826861 - The International Protection of Internally Displaced Persons
Catherine Phuong
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

The International Protection of Internally Displaced Persons

Catherine Phuong
University of Newcastle



Cambridge University Press
0521826861 - The International Protection of Internally Displaced Persons
Catherine Phuong
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa
<http://www.cambridge.org>

© Catherine Phuong 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Swift 10/13 pt. System L^AT_EX 2_ε [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Phuong, Catherine.

The international protection of internally displaced persons / Catherine Phuong.

p. cm. - (Cambridge studies in international and comparative law ; 38)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 82686 1 (hardback)

1. Refugees - Legal status, laws, etc. 2. Civil war. 3. Refugees - International cooperation. 4. Humanitarian law. I. Title. II. Series.

KZ6530.P49 2004

341.4'86 - dc22 2004049738

ISBN 0 521 82686 1 hardback

The publisher has used its best endeavours to ensure that the URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

0521826861 - The International Protection of Internally Displaced Persons

Catherine Phuong

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*A mes parents
Pat et Louis*

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	page xii
<i>Table of cases</i>	xiv
<i>Table of treaties and other international documents</i>	xvi
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xviii
Introduction	1
Internal displacement and containment policies	3
A problem of international concern	6
Analysing the problem of internal displacement within a human rights framework	9
1 Internally displaced persons and refugees: conceptual differences and similarities	13
Refugees and internally displaced persons	16
Defining internally displaced persons	28
Conclusion	37
2 The legal protection of internally displaced persons	39
An overview of the law applicable to situations of internal displacement	40
Towards the Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement	48
Legal analysis of the Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement	56
Beyond the Guiding Principles?	66
Conclusion	74

X	CONTENTS	
3	The institutional framework of protection for the internally displaced	76
	The role of UNHCR with regard to internally displaced persons	77
	An extended role for UNHCR?	84
	Formulating coherent IDP policies in other international agencies	92
	Improving the UN response to crises of internal displacement	102
	Conclusion	115
4	Protection strategies for the internally displaced	117
	Defining protection for internally displaced persons	118
	Means of protection for internally displaced persons	125
	Special protection strategies for vulnerable groups of internally displaced persons	142
	New initiatives	148
	Conclusion	152
5	Case study: internal displacement in Bosnia and Herzegovina	155
	Background to the crisis	157
	International responses to internal displacement	165
	International responsibility towards the internally displaced	174
	Reversing ethnic cleansing: strategies for the return of refugees and internally displaced persons	184
	Conclusion	205
6	Reconceiving sovereignty and intervention	208
	Internal displacement and sovereignty issues	209
	Situations of internal displacement justifying external intervention	219
	Means of intervention and impact on IDP protection issues	226
	Conclusion	232

Conclusions	235
Refugees and internally displaced persons: different frameworks of analysis	235
Internal displacement as a human rights issue	237
Possible improvements to the UN's response to the problem of internal displacement	239
Internal displacement, human rights and sovereignty	241
Annex 1: The Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement	244
<i>Bibliography</i>	255
<i>Index</i>	279

Acknowledgments

This book would not have been written without the assistance and support of a number of people, of whom there are too many to list here. It started as a doctoral thesis at the University of Nottingham where I had the privilege to be supervised by Patrick Twomey. I have received invaluable guidance from him. He has spent long hours reading through and commenting on my many drafts, and discussing my ideas with me. I am extremely grateful for his help. I would also like to thank Ian Forbes for his advice and support. My examiners, Guy Goodwin-Gill, Dino Kritsiotis and Richard Aldrich, gave me very helpful suggestions with regard to the final version of this work.

I am particularly indebted to the University of Nottingham and the Jean Monnet Fund for their generous financing of this project. The Schools of Law and Politics have both funded my trips to national and international conferences where I was able to present and discuss my ideas, as well as a trip to Geneva. In addition, I would like to thank the J. C. Smith Travelling Fund (Nottingham) and the Gilbert Murray Trust (Oxford) for funding the field trip to the former Yugoslavia. I would especially like to thank the University of Newcastle for awarding me an internal research fellowship and the School of Law for granting me a period of research leave to allow for the completion of this book. I would further like to thank Finola O'Sullivan of Cambridge University Press for her enthusiasm and encouragement.

For this book, I have interviewed or spoken with many individuals, mainly in Geneva and the former Yugoslavia, who have taken time to discuss my ideas and/or given me access to invaluable source materials. It is impossible for me to list all their names. Special thanks go to Jane Alexander, Axel Bisschop, Jeff Crisp, Birgit van Delft, Thierry Domin, Jacoba van den Ende, Walpurga Englbrecht, Madeleine Garlick,

Cambridge University Press
0521826861 - The International Protection of Internally Displaced Persons
Catherine Phuong
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS XIII

Marguerite Garling, Lutz Gauger, Daniel Helle, Guy Hovey, Ayaki Ito, Michael Kingsley, Hans Lunshof, Erin Mooney, Viktor Nylund and Werner Wendt. In addition, I would like to thank for their assistance the library staff at the Refugee Studies Centre Library in Oxford and the UNHCR Library in Geneva.

An early version of the Introduction and Chapter 1 of this book was published as 'Internally Displaced Persons and Refugees: Conceptual Differences and Similarities' (2000) 18 *Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights* 215, and is reproduced here in its adapted form with the kind permission of the copyright holder. An early version of Chapter 3 appeared in 'Improving the United Nations Reponse to Crises of Internal Displacement' (2002) 13 *International Journal of Refugee Law* 491. This is reproduced here with the kind permission of Oxford University Press, as is part of Chapter 5, which was first published as "'Freely to Return": Reversing Ethnic Cleansing in Bosnia and Herzegovina' (2000) 13 *Journal of Refugee Studies* 165.

I would like to thank my family and friends for their constant support throughout the last few years. In particular, friends and colleagues at the Universities of Nottingham and Newcastle have been a source of invaluable help and support. Gemma Hayton, Joanne Pinnock and Ann Sinclair provided unvaluable assistance to complete the manuscript. Finally, I would like to thank Alistair for his critical comments and constant encouragement. All errors and omissions remain mine alone.

CATHERINE PHUONG
October 2003

The law is stated as at 1 October 2003, although later developments have been incorporated where possible.

Table of cases

International Court of Justice

Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (Merits)
 (*Nicaragua v. United States*) (1986) ICJ Reports 14 page 45, 213

Permanent Court of Arbitration

Island of Palmas case (*Netherlands v. United States*) (1928) 2 Reports of
International Arbitral Awards 829 217

European Court of Human Rights

Akdivar and others v. Turkey (Merits) (1997) 23 EHRR 143 63
Akdivar and others v. Turkey (Article 50), 1 April 1998, Reports, 1998-II,
 711 63
Bilgin v. Turkey (2003) 36 EHRR 879 63
Cyprus v. Turkey (2002) 35 EHRR 30 63
Loizidou v. Turkey (Article 50), 28 July 1998, Reports, 1998-IV, 1807 63
Mentes and others v. Turkey (Article 50), 24 July 1998, Reports, 1998-IV,
 1686 63
Selcuk and Asker v. Turkey (1998) 26 EHRR 477 63
Soering v. United Kingdom et al. (1989) 11 EHRR 439 61
Yöyler v. Turkey, Application No. 26973/9524, Decision of
 24 July 2003 63

International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia

Prosecutor v. Kunarac, Kovac and Vukovic, Case No. IT-96-23 and IT-96-23/1,
 Judgment of 22 February 2001 144
Prosecutor v. Simic et al., Case No. IT-95-9, Decision on the Prosecution
 Motion under Rule 73 for a Ruling Concerning the Testimony of a
 Witness, 27 July 1999, and Decision Denying Request for Assistance

in Securing Documents and Witnesses from the International
 Committee of the Red Cross, 7 June 2000 176

United Kingdom

Horvath v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2000]

3 WLR 379 214

R. v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte Shah [1999] 2 AC 629 214

International Criminal Tribunal in Rwanda

Prosecutor v. Akayesu, Case No. ICTR-96-4-T, Judgment of 22

February 2001 144

Table of treaties and other international documents

- 1933 Montevideo Convention on the Rights and Duties of States 217
- 1945 United Nations Charter 9, 77, 126, 153, 167, 212, 215, 216, 219, 220
- 1946 Constitution of the International Refugee Organization 16, 77
- 1948 Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide 42, 213
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights 42, 51, 62, 64, 213
- Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field 44, 67, 136, 137
- Geneva Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War 44, 45, 46, 47, 49, 59, 61, 67, 136, 137
- 1950 European Convention on Human Rights 41, 63, 213
- Statute of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees 78, 84, 90, 119, 178
- Convention relating to the Status of Refugees 1, 4, 9, 13, 14, 16, 17, 20, 21, 23, 28, 36, 43, 47, 55, 61, 66, 77, 78, 80, 95, 118, 164, 236
- First Protocol to the European Convention on Human Rights 62, 63, 193
- 1954 Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons 80
- 1965 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination 42, 213
- 1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 42, 43, 50, 51, 62, 64, 213

- 1966 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 42, 50, 62, 64, 213
- 1967 Protocol relating to the Status of Refugees 1, 17
- 1967 UN Declaration on Territorial Asylum 20
- 1969 American Convention on Human Rights 41, 62, 213
 OAU Convention relating to the Specific Aspects of Refugee Problems in Africa 19, 29, 80
- 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 73
 Declaration on Principles of International Law concerning Friendly Relations and Co-operation among States in Accordance with the Charter of the United Nations 24, 67, 213
 Protocol I, Additional to the 1949 Geneva Convention, and relating to the Victims of International Armed Conflicts 44, 45, 49, 50, 61, 67, 136, 138
 Protocol II, Additional to the 1949 Geneva Convention, and relating to the Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts 44, 45, 46, 48, 49, 50, 61, 67, 146
- 1979 Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women 42, 213
- 1981 African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights 41, 213
 Cartagena Declaration on Refugees 19, 29, 80
 Convention against Torture and Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment 42, 213
- 1989 Convention concerning Indigenous and Tribal Peoples in Independent Countries, ILO Convention No. 169 49, 51
 UN Convention on the Rights of the Child 42, 99, 213
 Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women 74
- 1995 Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities 65
 Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement 2, 8, 9, 32, 35, 36, 39, 40, 41, 48, 53, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 71, 72, 73, 74, 75, 95, 96, 119, 120, 122, 134, 143, 145, 146, 147, 149, 217, 239, 244
- 1998 Statute of the International Criminal Court 32
- 2000 Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the Involvement of Children in Armed Conflicts 146

Abbreviations

1951 Convention	Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees
1967 Protocol	Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees
ASIL	American Society of International Law
CFSP	Common Foreign and Security Policy (of the EU)
CHR	Commission on Human Rights
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
COHRE	Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions
CRPC	Commission on Real Property Claims of Displaced Persons and Refugees (in Bosnia and Herzegovina)
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
ECRE	European Council on Refugees and Exiles
EHRR	<i>European Human Rights Reports</i>
ERC	Emergency Relief Coordinator
ETS	<i>European Treaty Series</i>
EXCOM	Executive Committee (of UNHCR)
FRY	Federal Republic of Yugoslavia
GA	General Assembly
GAOR	<i>General Assembly Official Records</i>
HC	Humanitarian Coordinator
HIWG	Humanitarian Issues Working Group
IASC	Inter-Agency Standing Committee
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

ICISS	International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
ICVA	International Council of Voluntary Agencies
IDP	internally displaced person
ILM	<i>International Legal Materials</i>
IOM	International Organization for Migration
IRO	International Refugee Organization
KLA	Kosovo Liberation Army
NGO	non-governmental organisation
OAU	Organization of African Unity
OCHA	Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
OHR	Office of the High Representative
OJ	<i>Official Journal of the European Communities</i>
OSCE	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe
PLIP	Property Law Implementation Plan
SC	Security Council
SCOR	<i>Security Council Official Records</i>
SFOR	Stabilization Force (in Bosnia and Herzegovina)
UNAMIR	United Nations Assistance Mission in Rwanda
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNMIBH	United Nations Mission in Bosnia and Herzegovina
UNPA	United Nations Protected Area
UNPROFOR	United Nations Protection Force in the Former Yugoslavia
UNTS	<i>United Nations Treaty Series</i>
USCR	United States Committee for Refugees
WFP	World Food Programme
WHO	World Health Organization
WLR	<i>Weekly Law Reports</i>