CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-82607-5 - Logic and Theism: Arguments For and Against Beliefs in God
Jordan Howard Sobel
Table of Contents
More information

Contents

Preface *page* xvii

DIVINITY

I. 'God', 'god', and God 3
1. *Existence and essence questions* 3
2. *Names in questions of existence and belief* 4
3. *Etymology and semantics* 6
4. *The core attitudinal conception of God* 9
5. *The philosophers' conception of God – God as a perfect being* 11
6. *The common conception of traditional theology* 12
7. *Might there **be** a god, even if there **is not** a perfect being?* 19
8. *Might there **not** be a god, even if there **is** a perfect being?* 24

ARGUMENTS FOR THE EXISTENCE OF GOD

II. Classical Ontological Arguments 29
1. *Introduction* 29
2. *Part One: René Descartes's ontological proof* 31
3. *Part Two: "Mr. Spinoza, meet Mr. Russell"* 40
4. *Part Three: St. Anselm's argument of Proslogion* II 59
5. *Part Four: Immanuel Kant's critique of Descartes's ontological argument* 66
Appendix *A. Symbols and symbolizations* 70
Appendix *B. Derivations and models* 71
Appendix *C. Rules of inference and forms of derivations* 78

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-82607-5 - Logic and Theism: Arguments For and Against Beliefs in God
Jordan Howard Sobel
Table of Contents
More information

III. Modern Modal Ontological Arguments 81
1. *Norman Malcolm's argument* 81
2. *Charles Hartshorne's argument* 82
3. *A fly in the ointment?* 86
4. *Other Anselmian arguments* 88
5. *'It's the possibility!'* 89
6. *Foes of ontological arguments say that their possibility-premises beg questions* 90
7. *Friends of ontological arguments respond* 91
8. *But that – that conceivability entails possibility – is simply not true!* 92
9. *A demotion of the argument from a proof, to a license to believe* 96
Appendix *A. 'Possible worlds'* 99
A1. *Worlds enough* 99
A2. *Truth and actuality at possible worlds* 101
A3. *Modal realism without tears* 102
A4. *This is not a story* 103
A5. *A logic for possible worlds* 103
Appendix *B. Modal logic* 105
B1. *Sentential modal logic* 105
B2. *Hartshorne's modal ontological argument* 108
B3. *Quantified modal logic* 110
IV. Kurt Gödel's *Ontologischer Beweis* 115
1. *Introduction* 115
2. *Language and logic* 117
3. *Axioms, definitions, and two theorems* 118
4. *That it is necessary that there is a God-like being* 125
5. *Would that be God,* could *it be God?* 128
6. *Modal collapse* 132
7. *Concluding recommendations* 135
Appendix *A. Notes in Kurt Gödel's hand* 144
Appendix *B. Notes in Dana Scott's hand* 145
Appendix *C. Mainly derivations* 146
C1. *A logic for Gödel's system* 146
C2. *Two promised derivations* 148
C3. *Derivations of theorems in Gödel's system* 149
C4. *Derivations for Anderson's emendation of Gödel's system* 157
V. First Causes: "*The Second Way*" 168
1. *Part 1, Question 2, of* Summa Theologica – "The Existence of God" 168

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-82607-5 - Logic and Theism: Arguments For and Against Beliefs in God
Jordan Howard Sobel
Table of Contents
More information

2. *An articulation of the* Second Way 170
3. *'Efficient causes' in the argument – sustaining, or generating?* 175
4. *The infinite and infinite regresses* 181
5. *The preliminary conclusion* 190
6. *There is a gap in the argument* 192
7. *On the ultimate conclusion,* ***that God exists****: Whether this would follow even if all was well in the argument to it* 193

Appendix *A. Notes on Aquinas's other ways* 195
Appendix *B. Bangs and infinite regresses of causes* 198
B1. *Big bang*!! 198
B2. *A blast from the recent past – William Lane Craig's* kalām *causal argument* 198

VI. Ultimate Reasons: Proofs *a contingentia mundi* 200
1. *Classical sources* 200
2. *A Leibnizian cosmological argument* 208
3. *On the premises, and terminology* 209
4. *Comparisons with ontological, and again with first cause, arguments* 214
5. *Cleanthes' objection* 215
6. *A 'small problem' with our Leibnizian argument* 217
7. *That 'small problem' with the argument goes into bigger problems for its 'ambition'* 218
8. *Proofs* a contingentia mundi – *what a nice bad idea* 222

Appendix *A. Leibniz's problem with necessity* 228
A1. *What, according to Leibniz, is the reason for the existence of the World*? 228
A2. *Has he given a sufficient reason*? 228
A3. *Leibniz's 'trilemma'* 229

Appendix *B. Contingency in John Leslie's Axiarchism* 233
Appendix *C. Robert C. Koons's 'New Look' cosmological argument* 234
C1. *A start-up problem* 234
C2. *A terminal problem* 236

VII. Look 'Round! – Arguments from Design 238
1. *The argument of the* Dialogues – *first statement* 239
2. *On assessing arguments for causal explanations* 243
3. *Probabilities, plain and conditional* 247
4. *Bayes's theorems* 252
5. *A 'particular discussion of the evidence' – the* Dialogues, *Parts 5–8, 10, and 11* 258
6. *Part 12 of the* Dialogues: *Hume's 'philosophical theism'* 264
7. *New facts and new theories* 272

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-82607-5 - Logic and Theism: Arguments For and Against Beliefs in God
Jordan Howard Sobel
Table of Contents
More information

8. *The argument from design – millennial editions* 277
9. *It is best to leave God-like beings out of otherwise natural explanations* 287
Appendix. *Swinburne's teleological argument, and his cumulative argument, for the existence of God* 288
A1. *Swinburne's teleological argument* 288
A2. *The 'logic' of this argument* 289
A3. *The argument compared with Cleanthes'* 290
A4. *'Cumulative confirmation' – 'Don't try this at home*!' 291
A5. *On Swinburne's cumulative argument for the existence of God* 294

VIII. Clouds of Witnesses – "Of Miracles" 298
Introductory and prefatory remarks 298
1. *'Miracles'* 302
2. *'Laws of nature'* 305
3. *Evidence for miracles, and for God* 309
4. *On the first part of Hume's general maxim* 312
5. *A condition that is not only necessary, but also sufficient, for testimony sufficient to establish a miracle* 318
6. *On the second part of Hume's maxim* 319
7. *Bayes's theorem for the evidence of testimony* 319
8. *Thomas Bayes and Bayes's theorems* 321
9. *Richard Price* 322
10. *Lotteries – Price thought they made his case* 324
11. *Hume, 'I must weigh this'* 327
12. *Two experiments* 328
13. *Responses to these results* 329
Appendix *A. A proof of Hume's theorem* 331
Appendix *B. Condorcet's rule, witness reliability, and 'last degrees of assurance'* 333
B1. *Bayesing Condorcet's rule* 333
B2. *Witness reliability* 335
B3. *On last degrees of assurance* 336

ON TWO PARTS OF THE COMMON CONCEPTION

IX. Romancing the Stone 345
1. *On the 'common names' of God* 345
2. *Omnipotence* 346
3. *'Essential properties'?* 350
4. *On whether omnipotence is possible* 353
5. *On essential omnipotence* 361

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-82607-5 - Logic and Theism: Arguments For and Against Beliefs in God
Jordan Howard Sobel
Table of Contents
More information

6. *On necessarily everlasting existence conjoined with essential omnipotence* 364
7. *On omnipotence conjoined with other conditions and attributes* 364
8. *What is left for God of omnipotence?* 365
Appendix. *A formal articulation of the argument of Section 5* 367

X. 'God Knows (Go Figure)' 369
1. *Introduction* 369
2. *The primary argument from the impossibility of a set of the reflective parts of an omniscient's knowledge* 370
3. *'Totalities'* 374
4. *The argument trimmed* 374
5. *Subtotalities, mappings, more than, and Cantor for totalities* 375
6. *On kinds of multiplicities* 378
7. *Taking the measure of these challenges to omniscience* 380
8. *All truths and possibilities for omniscience* 382
9. *Divine knowledge, a guarded recommendation* 386
10. *Taking stock, to move on* 388
11. *Grim's radical argument against omniscience* 389
12. *Conclusions* 391
Appendix. *Notes on Cantorian set theory* 394
A1. *Power sets* 394
A2. *Cardinalities* 394
A3. *Cantor's Theorem* 395
A4. *Cardinalities of power sets* 397

ARGUMENTS AGAINST THE EXISTENCE OF GOD

XI. Atheologies, Demonstrative and Evidential 401
1. *'That that's sawce for a goose is sawce for a gander'* 401
2. *Ambitious atheistic demonstrations* 403
3. *Modest atheistic demonstrations* 404
4. *Hume's argument in Part 11 of the* Dialogues 405
5. *The evidential argument from evil of Rowe (1986)* 409
6. *The evidential arguments from evil of Rowe (1988) and (1996)* 413
7. *A Bayesian issue for evidence of evil* 427
8. *Another skeptic* 429
9. *It can be different strokes for different folks* 432
Appendix. *Promised derivations* 432

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-82607-5 - Logic and Theism: Arguments For and Against Beliefs in God
Jordan Howard Sobel
Table of Contents
More information

XII. The Logical Problem of Evil 436
1. *The argument from evil* 437
2. *The argument from the world's not being a best world* 439
3. *The argument from the world's not being a best divinely creatable world* 461
4. *The argument from the world's not being a best divine bet world* 465
5. *The problem of the best* 466
6. *The argument from there being a better world than this one* 468
7. *A dilemmatic argument to the world's being improvable* 470
8. *Might love be the answer?* 477
Appendix *A. On alleged incompatibilities of divine omniscience and freedom* 479
A1. *An argument from the purported impossibility of foreknowledge of exercises of freedom* 481
A2. ***Mere*** *everlasting omniscience and freedom: An argument 'after' one of Nelson Pike's* 483
A3. *An adaptation of the argument to* ***essential*** *everlasting omniscience* ***without*** *necessary existence* 486
A4. *A similar argument for* ***essential*** *everlasting omniscience* ***with*** *necessary existence* 490
Appendix *B. A deduction in Section 2.2.3 spelled out* 494

PRACTICAL ARGUMENTS FOR AND AGAINST THEISTIC BELIEFS

XIII. Pascalian Wagers 499
1. *Theoretical and practical reasons* 499
2. *The wager* 501
3. *Part Two. Belief-options* 503
4. *Part Three. On the variety of possible Pascalian wagers* 506
5. *Case 2: Believing would have only other-world rewards* 514
6. *Case 3: Belief is not considered to be cost-free* 516
7. *Case 4: Alternative reward-policies for salvation are taken seriously* 518
8. *Variants of Cases 3 and 4* 520
9. *Case 5: Competing God-hypotheses are taken seriously* 521
10. *Case 6: Alternative policies not only for rewards, but also for punishments, are taken seriously* 522
11. *Case 7: Reason itself is considered another great thing* 524
12. *Case 8: All goods and evils are considered commensurable* 527
13. *Case 9: God would frown upon willful believing* 528

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-82607-5 - Logic and Theism: Arguments For and Against Beliefs in God
Jordan Howard Sobel
Table of Contents
More information

Appendix. *Hyperreals and decision theory* 532
A1. *Hyperreals* 532
A2. *Hyperreals in decision theory* 536

Notes 539
References 630
Index of Names 647

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org