

The Lion and the Springbok

The Lion and the Springbok presents a unique account of the dynamics and divergences of the 'uneasy special relationship' between Britain and South Africa. From the bruising experience of the South African War (1899–1902) to South Africa's withdrawal from the Commonwealth in 1961, the authors chart this relationship in all its political, economic, cultural, and geostrategic aspects.

All the major disputes are discussed, including the struggle for the High Commission Territories, the crisis over Seretse Khama's marriage, and the transfer of the Simon's Town naval base. These issues trace, for the most part, a continuing deterioration in relations, as Afrikaner nationalist identity hardened and South African politics slid into the extremes of apartheid. The perceptions each side had of the other after 1948 are examined through representations in the media, and an epilogue considers the reasons for the return of the 'new South Africa' to the Commonwealth in 1994.

RONALD HYAM is Emeritus Reader in British Imperial History, University of Cambridge, and a Fellow and former President of Magdalene College.

PETER HENSHAW is a Research Professor in History at the University of Western Ontario.





Nelson Mandela after admission to an Honorary Fellowship at Magdalene College, Cambridge, 2 May 2001. Left to right: security officer, Dr Mandela, Cheryl Carolus (South African high commissioner), Professor W. R. Cornish (President), Professor Sir John Gurdon (Master), Thabo Makupula (Mandela Magdalene Scholar). *Source*: Magdalene College Archives, P/30/2/10



The Lion and the Springbok

Britain and South Africa since the Boer War

Ronald Hyam and Peter Henshaw





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521824538

© Ronald Hyam and Peter Henshaw 2003

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-82453-8 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-04138-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

| rio | niispiece | page n |
|------|--|--------|
| List | t of illustrations | vii |
| List | t of tables | ix |
| Pre | face | xi |
| Ack | nowledgements | xiv |
| List | t of abbreviations | XV |
| 1 | The uneasy special relationship: dynamics and divergencies | 1 |
| 2 | Breakdown: into war, 1895–1899 | 37 |
| 3 | Post-war: the myth of magnanimity, 1905–1907 | 57 |
| 4 | African interests and the South Africa Act, 1908-1910 | 76 |
| 5 | 'Greater South Africa': the struggle for the High Commission Territories, 1910–1961 | 102 |
| 6 | The economic dimension: South Africa and the sterling area, 1931–1961 | 118 |
| 7 | Britain, the United Nations, and the 'South African disputes', 1946–1961 | 146 |
| 8 | The political consequences of Seretse Khama and Ruth, 1948–1952 | 168 |
| 9 | Containing Afrikanerdom: the geopolitical origins of the Central African Federation, 1948–1953 | 198 |
| 10 | Strategy and the transfer of Simon's Town, 1948-1957 | 230 |
| 11 | The parting of the ways: the departure of South Africa from the Commonwealth, 1951–1961 | 254 |

V



| V1 | Contents | |
|--|---|-----|
| 12 | Enfeebled lion? How South Africans viewed Britain, 1945–1961 | 273 |
| 13 | Springbok reviled: some British reactions to apartheid, 1948–1994 | 307 |
| Epilogue The relationship restored: the return of the new South Africa to the Commonwealth, 1994 | | 343 |
| Sele | ect bibliography | 351 |
| Index | | 372 |



Illustrations

| ΜA | APS | |
|-----|---|----------|
| | Plans for a 'Greater South Africa' The Tomlinson Commission's threat to the High Commission Territories and the creation of Bantustans, | page 104 |
| | 1955 | 109 |
| 9.1 | Central African Federation | 199 |
| FIC | GURES | |
| 1.1 | The evolution of Afrikaner political parties | 20 |
| 1.2 | The institutional structure of Afrikanerdom | 24 |
| 6.1 | British gold imports, 1931–72 | 122 |
| | South African gold production by prices realised and quantities, 1931–72 | 123 |
| 6.3 | British reserves of gold and convertible currencies, | 123 |
| 0.0 | 1931–72 | 124 |
| 6.4 | South African imports from and exports to Britain | |
| | as a percentage of total South African imports and | |
| | exports of produce (excluding gold), 1931–72 | 125 |
| ILI | LUSTRATIONS | |
| Fro | ntispiece: Nelson Mandela in Cambridge, 2001 | ii |
| 1. | 1 Cartoon: Dienswillig die uwe: Smuts as 'your willing servant' | |
| | of Britain (Die Burger, 1942) | 29 |
| 2. | 1 Boer prisoners in St Helena: | |
| | (a) Broadbottom Camp and Boer enclosure | |
| | (b) General Cronje and his officers | 55 |
| 11. | 1 Cartoon: Britain aligns with the Asians at the United Nations | |
| | after South Africa's departure from the Commonwealth | |
| | (Die Transvaler, 1961) | 271 |

vii



| viii | List of illustrations | |
|------|---|-----|
| 12.1 | Cartoon: The 'enfeebled lion' and the riddle of the Sphinx | |
| | (Suez Crisis) (Rand Daily Mail, 1957) | 295 |
| 13.1 | Cartoon: Verwoerd: a nation mourns (<i>Private Eye</i> , 1966) | 324 |
| 13.2 | Cartoon: The campaign against the Springbok cricket tour | |
| | of 1970 (New Statesman, 1 May 1970) | 326 |



Tables

| 1.1 Trade between Britain and South Africa, 1946–1961 | page 13 |
|--|---------|
| 6.1 South African exports to Britain, 1931–1963 | 119 |
| 6.2 External capital investment in South Africa, 1913–1972 | 120 |
| 6.3 The sterling area 'dollar pool', 1946–1956 | 121 |
| 9.1 Immigrants into the Rhodesias, 1946–1950 | 226 |





Preface

'A special relationship and its mutual benefits, which history has bound us in' is how Nelson Mandela described relations between Britain and South Africa in the spring of 2001. The tragedy is that for most of the twentieth century this 'special relationship' was compromised, first by jingoistic Britain, then by Afrikaner nationalist South Africa. This book is about that tragedy.

We have worked together, with a shared outlook, over many years, with the long-term intention of producing a study more comprehensive than either of us could have managed to write by ourselves. Since it is based overwhelmingly on fundamental research in British government archives, there are two inevitable limitations. One is that the perspective is mainly, though not exclusively, from the British side – so the book finds its home in the general field of British imperial and Commonwealth history, as well as South African history. The other is that the emphasis is on the period before the departure of South Africa from the Commonwealth in 1961, the British government's 'thirty-year rule of access' – in practice more like thirty-five years – preventing us from tackling the issues after the 1960s with anything like the authority we hope we bring to the period before then.

Our main concern is with inter-governmental relations, and we do not aim to give an account of the long British tradition of radical and liberal criticism of what happened in South Africa. But in conformity with current historical interest in identity-formation and media representation, and since it would otherwise look hopelessly incomplete, we have traced anti-apartheid opinion through to the 1990s (using newspaper evidence). South African perceptions of Britain are also examined. And we have attempted in an epilogue a brief assessment of the return of the new South Africa to the Commonwealth in 1994.

We present a series of studies rather than a connected narrative, but our chapters are not chosen at random. Their selection is dictated by the weight of evidence surviving in the archival record: in other words, they reflect the issues

хi

Although many other overseas archives have been trawled, the returns were much less rewarding, not least because the National Party government in South Africa operated a 'fifty-year rule' of access, and in the 1980s and early 1990s imposed a blanket closure on external affairs records.



xii Preface

which excited most attention at the time. There might be objections to this way of proceeding, but it can hardly be said to be unhistorical.

We deal with problems which have always been controversial, and are contested by scholars. We should therefore like to express our thanks to those historians and social scientists with whom we sometimes disagree, since they have provided not merely additional stimulus but also a sense of historiographical purpose. More positively, we wish to thank a number of research students who have contributed enthusiastically to the project over the years, among them more particularly Simon Cardy, Marc Feigen, and Lesley Reeves; and to thank our colleagues Rodney Davenport, Alan Jeeves, John Lonsdale, Bill Nasson, Ian Phimister, Christopher Saunders, and Iain R. Smith, for their friendship and support, though we hasten to add that we do not mean to claim from them any sort of endorsement. Finally, we should say how much we have appreciated the patience and expertise of Andrew Brown and his team at the Cambridge University Press.

South Africa Freedom Day, 27 April 2002

R. H. P. J. H.

My particular understanding of Anglo-South African relations has been sharpened up over many years by discussions with the late Nicholas Mansergh and R. E. Robinson, with Noel Garson, Ged Martin, and David Throup, and above all with Rodney Davenport. I had the good fortune to have a family home close to the Public Record Office at Kew. My research has been generously supported in Cambridge by Magdalene College, with grants from the Morshead–Salter Fund, and by the Managers of the Smuts Memorial Fund, who enabled me to travel through the heartlands of Afrikanerdom in the darkest days of apartheid, and to visit Swaziland, Lesotho, and Mozambique. I remain grateful for the hospitality and insights of the USPG Fathers of the Community of the Resurrection at their mission houses in Luyengo, Swaziland, and Rosettenville (Sophiatown), Johannesburg.

R. H. Cambridge

My work on this book began in 1986 as a Cambridge PhD student with Ronald Hyam, continued in Cape Town from 1990 to 1997, and was completed at Queen's University in Kingston, Ontario. It could not have been accomplished without the assistance of a number of individuals and institutions. For their financial support, thanks go to St John's College, the Managers of the Smuts



Preface xiii

Memorial Fund, and of the Holland Rose studentship, all in Cambridge; to the National Maritime Museum, Greenwich for the Caird junior research fellowship; and Queen's University, Kingston. I would also like to thank the many librarians and archivists who have assisted my research - especially the librarians at the African Studies Library, the Jagger Library, and the Special Collections Library at the University of Cape Town; Stephen Lees at the Cambridge University Library; and the archivists at the South African National Archives in Pretoria. Doing archival research has almost invariably meant imposing myself for considerable periods on friends and relations. I owe a particular debt of gratitude to Anna Mary Young and her family, whose home in Putney has been a frequent base for my sessions at the Public Record Office; and to Paul Haines and Pauline Graham in Cambridge. Chris and Elaine Dodson provided extended and incomparable hospitality at Woodcroft, KwaZulu-Natal. My parents in Ottawa have always given their unstinting support. Finally, my wife Belinda Dodson deserves special acknowledgement for her intellectual, practical, and personal contributions to this endeavour.

> P. J. H. London, Ontario



Acknowledgements

Ronald Hyam is grateful to the publishers of the following journals and books for permission to reproduce material which first appeared in their pages: the *Historical Journal* (chapters 4, 8, and 9), the *Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* (chapter 11), the *Joernaal vir die Eietydse Geskiedenis* (chapter 5), and *Reappraisals in British imperial history*, by R. Hyam and Ged Martin (Macmillan, 1975) (chapter 3). Peter Henshaw is similarly grateful in respect of the *Historical Journal* (chapter 6), the *Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* (chapter 10), the *South African Historical Journal* (chapter 7), and *The international impact of the Boer War*, ed. Keith Wilson (Acumen Publishing, Chesham, 2001) (chapter 2).

Quotations from Crown copyright material are used by permission of the Public Record Office under licence from the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office. The photograph of Nelson Mandela is by permission of the Master and Fellows of Magdalene College, Cambridge. Cartoons reproduced by permission of *Die Burger*, *Rand Daily Mail*, *Die Transvaler*, *Private Eye*, and *New Statesman*.

xiv



BDEEP

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-82453-8 - The Lion and the Springbok: Britain and South Africa since the Boer War Ronald Hyam and Peter Henshaw Frontmatter More information

Abbreviations

The following abbreviations are used in the footnotes:

| CAB | Cabinet Office Records |
|------|--|
| CO | Colonial Office Records |
| CRO | Commonwealth Relations Office |
| DO | Dominions Office/CRO records |
| FO | Foreign Office |
| HJ | Historical Journal |
| JAH | Journal of African History |
| JICH | Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History |
| JSAS | Journal of Southern African Studies |
| PREM | Prime Minister's Office Records |
| PRO | Public Record Office, Kew |
| SAHJ | South African Historical Journal |
| | |

British Documents on the End of Empire Project