

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-82311-1 - Dispute Settlement in the World Trade Organization: Practice and Procedure: Second Edition

David Palmeter and Petros C. Mavroidis

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

	<i>Preface</i>	<i>page xvii</i>
<b>1</b>	<b>Overview</b>	<b>1</b>
§ 1.01	The ITO, the GATT, and the WTO	1
	[1] Bretton Woods and the Havana Charter	1
	[2] The negotiation of GATT	2
	[3] The Protocol of Provisional Application (PPA)	3
	[4] GATT's 47 "provisional" years	4
	[5] GATT dispute settlement	6
§ 1.02	The Uruguay Round	11
§ 1.03	The World Trade Organization	13
§ 1.04	The Dispute Settlement Body	15
§ 1.05	The Dispute Settlement Understanding	16
<b>2</b>	<b>Jurisdiction</b>	<b>17</b>
§ 2.01	Overview	17
§ 2.02	Terms of reference	18
	[1] Rationale for terms of reference	18
	[2] Parallelism between consultations and terms of reference	18
	[3] Standard terms of reference	19
	[4] <i>Non ultra petita</i>	19
	[5] The obligation of panels to consider all issues referred to in the terms of reference	20
	[6] Parallelism between the terms of reference and submissions to a panel	21
§ 2.03	Jurisdiction <i>Ratione Materiae</i>	21
	[1] Covered agreements	21

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-82311-1 - Dispute Settlement in the World Trade Organization: Practice and Procedure: Second Edition

David Palmeter and Petros C. Mavroidis

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

vii

[2] Conflicts among agreements	22
[3] Simultaneous application of different agreements	22
[4] Non-application between particular Members	23
[5] The DSU and the competence of other WTO bodies	23
[6] The “matter” before the Panel	24
[7] Measures changed during proceedings	24
[8] Change in legal justification for a measure	26
[9] Measures no longer in effect	26
[10] Review of measures taken to comply with rulings and recommendations of the DSB	28
§ 2.04 Jurisdiction <i>Ratione Personae</i>	29
[1] Non-Members	29
[2] Regional and local government measures	30
[3] Application of customary international law to WTO Members	32
§ 2.05 Standing ( <i>Locus Standi</i> )	33
[1] Requirement of a legal interest	33
[2] Exhaustion of local remedies	34
[3] Participation by <i>amicus curiae</i>	35
§ 2.06 Review of jurisdictional claims	40
[1] Challenge to jurisdiction by parties	40
[2] <i>Ex officio</i> review of jurisdiction	40
[3] <i>Res judicata</i>	41
[4] Estoppel	43
§ 2.07 Arbitration	45
§ 2.08 Appellate jurisdiction	46
[1] General	46
[2] Questions of municipal law	46
<b>3 Sources of Law</b>	<b>49</b>
§ 3.01 Overview	49
§ 3.02 Covered agreements	51
§ 3.03 Reports of prior panels and the Appellate Body	51
[1] GATT practice	52
[2] Adopted GATT Reports in the WTO	52

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-82311-1 - Dispute Settlement in the World Trade Organization: Practice and Procedure: Second Edition

David Palmeter and Petros C. Mavroidis

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

viii

## CONTENTS

	[3] Unadopted GATT Reports in the WTO	54
	[4] WTO Panel Reports	55
	[5] Appellate Body Reports	60
§ 3.04	Custom	65
§ 3.05	Teachings of the most highly qualified publicists	66
§ 3.06	General principles of law	68
§ 3.07	Other international agreements	69
	[1] Agreements referred to in the WTO Agreements	69
	[2] Other multilateral agreements	73
	[3] Agreements between the parties	75
	[4] Agreements to which the WTO is a party	78
§ 3.08	Decisions of other international tribunals	79
§ 3.09	Interpretation of WTO law	80
	[1] The <i>Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties</i>	80
	[2] <i>Travaux préparatoires</i>	81
	[3] Use of dictionaries	82
	[4] <i>Lex specialis</i>	82
	[5] Principle of “contemporaneity”	83
	[6] Principle of “effectiveness”	84
<b>4</b>	<b>The Panel Process</b>	<b>85</b>
§ 4.01	Overview	85
§ 4.02	Good offices, conciliation and mediation	86
§ 4.03	Consultations	86
	[1] Purpose	86
	[2] Form and content of the request	87
	[3] Whether consultations occur	89
	[4] Adequacy of consultations	90
	[5] Confidentiality	91
	[6] Time elements	93
	[7] Third parties	94
§ 4.04	Request for the establishment of a panel and terms of reference	94
	[1] General	94
	[2] Time elements	95
	[3] Form and content	96

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-82311-1 - Dispute Settlement in the World Trade Organization: Practice and Procedure: Second Edition

David Palmeter and Petros C. Mavroidis

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

ix

[4] The specific measure at issue	97	
[5] Amendment of measures after the panel request		98
[6] The “claim” or the legal basis of the complaint		99
[7] Products listed in the request	101	
[8] Standard terms of reference	102	
[9] Special terms of reference	103	
[10] Reviews and arbitrations	103	
§ 4.05 Establishment and composition of panels		105
[1] Establishment	105	
[2] Composition	105	
[3] Nominating panelists	106	
§ 4.06 Function, authority and responsibility of panels	108	
§ 4.07 Third parties, multiple complainants and counter-complaints	109	
[1] Overview	109	
[2] Third parties	109	
[3] Third party rights in reviews and arbitrations		111
[4] Multiple complainants	111	
[5] Counter-complaints	112	
[6] <i>Amicus curiae</i> briefs	113	
§ 4.08 Role of the Secretariat	114	
§ 4.09 Evidence and information	116	
[1] General	116	
[2] Panel’s right to seek evidence and information		116
[3] Duty to provide evidence and information		117
[4] Adverse inferences	118	
[5] Experts	121	
[6] Admissions and statements	123	
[7] Deadlines for submission of evidence		125
[8] Evidence not used in reaching national decisions	128	
[9] Evidence of municipal law	129	
[10] Sufficiency and forms of evidence		133
§ 4.10 Confidential information	135	
[1] Overview	135	
[2] Issues involving private counsel and advisors		136
[3] Special procedures to protect confidentiality		138
[4] Government information	142	

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-82311-1 - Dispute Settlement in the World Trade Organization: Practice and Procedure: Second Edition

David Palmeter and Petros C. Mavroidis

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

x

CONTENTS

§ 4.11	Burden of proof	143
	[1] General	143
	[2] Burden of proving a <i>prima facie</i> case	144
	[3] Exceptions	148
	[4] Burden of proof under specific agreements and GATT articles	148
	[5] “General rule-exception” analysis	150
	[6] Article 22.6 arbitrations	152
§ 4.12	Standard of review	152
§ 4.13	Written submissions to panels	156
	[1] General	156
	[2] First written submission	156
	[3] Second written submission	158
	[4] Executive summaries of submissions	159
§ 4.14	Meetings of panels with the parties	159
	[1] General	159
	[2] First meeting of the Panel with the parties	159
	[3] Second meeting of the Panel with the parties	160
§ 4.15	Computation of time	161
§ 4.16	“Violation,” “non-violation” and “other situation” complaints	162
	[1] General	162
	[2] Violation complaints	163
	[3] Non-violation complaints	163
	[4] “Other situation” complaints	164
§ 4.17	Representation by private attorneys	165
§ 4.18	Panel reports	166
	[1] General	166
	[2] Descriptive portions of the report	166
	[3] Interim reports	167
	[4] Final reports	168
<b>5</b>	<b>Special Rules and Procedures</b>	<b>171</b>
§ 5.01	Overview	171
§ 5.02	GATT and WTO rules for developing countries	171

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-82311-1 - Dispute Settlement in the World Trade Organization: Practice and Procedure: Second Edition

David Palmeter and Petros C. Mavroidis

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

xi

- § 5.03 The 1966 Understanding and developing countries 172
  - [1] Consultations 172
  - [2] Good offices, conciliation or mediation 173
  - [3] Establishment of panels 173
  - [4] Panel procedures 173
- § 5.04 Developing country-related provisions of the DSU 174
  - [1] Consultations 174
  - [2] Panel process 174
- § 5.05 Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures 175
- § 5.06 Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade 175
  - [1] General 175
  - [2] Measures covered by the TBT Agreement 176
  - [3] Experts 176
- § 5.07 Agreement on Implementation of Article VI of GATT 1994 (Antidumping Agreement) 177
  - [1] General 177
  - [2] Establishment of a panel 178
  - [3] The “matter” before an antidumping panel 179
  - [4] Article 17.6 – standard of review 179
  - [5] Article 17.6(i) – review of factual determinations 180
  - [6] Article 17.6(ii) – review of legal determinations 182
  - [7] Confidential information 183
  - [8] Developing countries 184
  - [9] Overlap with countervailing duties 184
- § 5.08 Agreement on Implementation of Article VII of GATT 1994 (Customs Valuation Agreement) 185
- § 5.09 Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures 185
  - [1] Prohibited subsidy procedures 186
  - [2] Requests for consultations – SCM Article 4.2 187
  - [3] Procedures before the Permanent Group of Experts 188
  - [4] Actionable subsidy procedures 190
  - [5] Annex V procedures for developing information concerning serious prejudice 191

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-82311-1 - Dispute Settlement in the World Trade Organization: Practice and Procedure: Second Edition

David Palmeter and Petros C. Mavroidis

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xii

## CONTENTS

	[6] Multiple subsidy procedures	193
	[7] Non-actionable subsidies	194
	[8] Countervailing measures	194
	[9] Developing countries	195
	[10] Remedies	195
§ 5.10	Agreement on Textiles and Clothing (ATC)	195
	[1] Overview	195
	[2] ATC procedures	196
	[3] Textiles Monitoring Body Working Procedures	199
	[4] TMB jurisdiction and panel jurisdiction	200
§ 5.11	General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS)	200
	[1] General	200
	[2] Double taxation treaties	201
	[3] Non-violation nullification and impairment	201
	[4] Modification of schedules	201
	[5] Air transport services	202
	[6] Panelists	202
§ 5.12	Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS)	203
§ 5.13	Agreement on Government Procurement	203
	[1] Background	203
	[2] Proposals and DSU notification	204
	[3] DSB authority	204
	[4] Terms of reference	204
	[5] Time limits	205
	[6] No cross-retaliation	205
§ 5.14	Agreement on Trade in Civil Aircraft	206
§ 5.15	Arbitration	206
	[1] Generally	206
	[2] Non-actionable subsidies	208
	[3] Services	208
<b>6</b>	<b>The Appellate Process</b>	<b>210</b>
§ 6.01	Overview	210
§ 6.02	The task of the Appellate Body	210
§ 6.03	Right of appeal	212

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-82311-1 - Dispute Settlement in the World Trade Organization: Practice and Procedure: Second Edition

David Palmeter and Petros C. Mavroidis

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

xiii

§ 6.04	Appellate Body Rules	212
	[1] Overview	212
	[2] Prohibited subsidy cases	212
	[3] Divisions of the Appellate Body	213
	[4] Decision making and collegiality	213
	[5] Documents	214
	[6] Notice of appeal	215
	[7] Working schedule	216
	[8] Appellant's submission	217
	[9] Appellee's submission	218
	[10] Multiple or "cross" appeals	219
	[11] Third participants	219
	[12] Record on appeal	220
	[13] Oral hearing	221
	[14] Written responses to questions	221
	[15] Failure to appear and withdrawal of appeal	221
	[16] Representation by private attorneys	223
	[17] <i>Amicus curiae</i> briefs	223
§ 6.05	Time elements	224
	[1] Limits imposed by the DSU	224
	[2] Limits imposed by the Appellate Body	225
	[3] Timing – tactical considerations	226
§ 6.06	Lack of remand authority	227
	[1] The problem	227
	[2] Legal issues undecided by a panel	228
	[3] Factual issues undecided by a panel	232
<b>7</b>	<b>Adoption and Implementation of Reports</b>	<b>234</b>
§ 7.01	Overview	234
§ 7.02	Consideration and adoption of reports	234
§ 7.03	Notification of implementation intentions	235
§ 7.04	"Reasonable period of time"	236
	[1] Legal framework	236
	[2] The Arbitrator	236
	[3] Jurisdiction of the Arbitrator	237
	[4] Agreements establishing the reasonable period of time	239
	[5] Time within which to request arbitration	240
	[6] Time allowed for implementation	240



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-82311-1 - Dispute Settlement in the World Trade Organization: Practice and Procedure: Second Edition

David Palmeter and Petros C. Mavroidis

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xiv

CONTENTS

§ 7.05	Factors affecting time allowed for implementation	242
	[1] Overview	242
	[2] Complexity	243
	[3] Need for legislative action	244
	[4] Domestic opposition	245
	[5] Economic harm	246
	[6] Developing countries	246
§ 7.06	Surveillance by the DSB	247
§ 7.07	Disputes regarding implementation	247
	[1] Overview	247
	[2] Scope of Article 21.5 “compliance” review	249
	[3] Standing of respondent to initiate Article 21.5 proceedings	253
	[4] “Existence” of an implementing measure	255
	[5] Requirement of consultations	255
	[6] Burden of proof	256
	[7] Third party rights	256
	[8] Suggestions as to implementation	258
§ 7.08	Prohibited and actionable subsidies	258
§ 7.09	“Other situation” complaints	261
<b>8</b>	<b>Remedies</b>	262
§ 8.01	General	262
§ 8.02	GATT practice	262
§ 8.03	Overview of the WTO remedy regime	265
§ 8.04	Negotiation on compensation	265
§ 8.05	Suspension of concessions or other obligations	266
	[1] Request for authorization to suspend concessions	266
	[2] “Carousel” suspension	269
	[3] Jurisdiction of the arbitrators	269
	[4] Consequences of arbitration	271
	[5] Time limits	271
	[6] Burden of proof	272
	[7] Information submitted by private parties	274

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-82311-1 - Dispute Settlement in the World Trade Organization: Practice and Procedure: Second Edition

David Palmeter and Petros C. Mavroidis

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

xv

	[8] Applicable principles	275	
	[9] Third party rights	277	
§ 8.06	The “sequencing” problem	278	
	[1] Overview	278	
	[2] <i>Bananas III</i>	280	
	[3] <i>Ad hoc</i> solutions	284	
	[4] Proposals for change	286	
	[5] The safeguards “sequencing” problem	288	
§ 8.07	Prohibited and actionable subsidies	290	
	[1] Overview	290	
	[2] “Appropriate countermeasures”	291	
	[3] Multiple complainants	293	
§ 8.08	Panel and Appellate Body implementation suggestions	295	
	[1] Overview	295	
	[2] Antidumping and countervailing duty cases	296	
	[3] Other WTO cases	298	
	[4] Legal effect of implementation suggestions	299	
§ 8.09	“Other situation” reports	300	
§ 8.10	Purpose of suspension of concessions	300	
<b>9</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>	303	
	<b>Appendix</b>	306	
	<i>Bibliography</i>	310	
	<i>Index</i>	316	