Index

absence of state authority see authority 'abuse of rights' meaning, 734 accountability levels of, 84 and responsibility, 83-5 acquiescence see claims acts or omissions affecting aliens' rights see aliens, injury to as aid or assistance, 403-5 breach of obligations, 217-19 exonerating and extenuating circumstances, 738 giving rise to responsibility, 734-8 imputability, 737-8 instantaneous and continuing acts distinguished, 262-4 ad hoc judges appointment, 671-2 admissibility of claims see invocation of responsibility 'agent of an international organization' meaning, 761 Ago, Roberto committee chairman, 36 counsel, 269-70 Hague Lectures 1939, 26 judgments, 149 Special Rapporteur, 35-6, 54-5, 126, 143, 266, 270, 327, 490, 706-7 see also Table of reports of Special Rapporteurs theory of responsibility, 64, 270-1, 398-9, 405-6, 417 aid or assistance for wrongful act ARSIWA Article 16, 401-3 complicity and international organizations, 410-12 pacta tertiis rule, 409–10 'subjective' element, 405-8

customary international law, 400-1 definition, 401-5 development of ARSIWA Article 16, 400–1, 775–6 general principles, 405 from international organization, 764 omissions as, 403-5 from other state ARSIWA, 714 Draft Articles 1996, 749 secondary responsibility, 399 Al-Jedda case contributing state responsibility, 200 - 3aliens, injury to claims admissibility, 738-40 alien torts, 81-3 dispute settlement as to admissibility, 739-40 exhaustion of local remedies, 738-9 inadmissible restrictions on right to claim, 741 nationality of, 740-1 right to bring, 740 by state of nationality, 740-1 submission, 740–1 time limits, 741 waiver of diplomatic protection, 739 damages, 741–2 denial of justice, 734-5 deprivation of liberty, 735 expropriation measures, 736 expulsion, 735 interference with freedom of movement, 735 maltreatment, 735 nationalization measures, 736 negligence in protection, 735-6

808

INDEX 809

non-performance of contractual obligations, 736-7 non-repetition measures, 742 pecuniary damages, 741-2 public debts, repudiation/cancellation, 737 reparation, 741-2 restitution, 741-2 rights of aliens, 733 state responsibility acts or omissions giving rise to, 734-8 see also acts or omissions Draft Articles 1961, 733 elements of responsibility, 734 Alland, Denis on sanctions, 706-7 ancillary responsibility see secondary responsibility Anzilotti, Dionisio representation theory of indirect responsibility, 397 writings on responsibility, 23-4, 490 applicable law 'approximate application' principle, 109 cause of action distinguished, 603-8 humanitarian law as, 152-3 international law, 100-3 lex specialis, 103-5 other legal consequences, 108-10 overview, 99-100 peremptory norms, 106-8 self-contained regimes', 103–5 UN Charter, 106-8 Arangio-Ruiz, Gaetano Special Rapporteur, 37-8, 475, 495, 501-2, 509, 531-2 see also Table of reports of Special Rapporteurs Arbitral Tribunal Draft Articles 1996, 760 terms of reference, 758 arbitration ad hoc, 591 choice of, 589, 624-5 class actions, 637-40 compulsory, 97 consent to, 589, 613-14, 637-9 Draft Articles 1996, 758 force majeure, 295-6 imperative, 106-7 investment protection see investment protection inviolability of undertaking, 695 limit on recourse to, 602-3 loss of access to international arbitration, 624-5 multiparty, 637-40

optional, 98 referral to, 601 settlement by, 75, 95 treaty provision, 549, 601, 603, 624-5, 602 - 3types of, 589-90 undertaking to arbitrate, 695 unilateral, 97-8 validity of award, 758 voluntary, 95, 553-4 see also dispute settlement ARSIWA see ILC Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts 2001 (ARSIWA) assurance of non-repetition see repetition of breach attribution bases in ARSIWA, 115 cases of, 166 corporations see corporations direction and control see direction and control over wrongful act entities exercising governmental authority see entities exercising governmental authority ex post facto see conduct excess of authority see excess of authority general principles, 113 insurrectional movements see insurrectional movements international organizations see international organizations process, 113-15 secondary responsibility distinguished, 211 state organs see entries at organs states see entries at state terrorism see terrorism ultra vires see excess of authority Austin, J. L. (John Langshaw) philosophy of excuses, 274, 278-9 authority definition of 'governmental authority', 129-32 exercise in absence of state ARSIWA, 713 development of ARSIWA Article 9, 166-8 operation of provision, 168-70 Behrami and Saramati cases contributing state responsibility, 197 - 200Belli of Alba, Pierino writings on responsibility, 3-6 Bodin, Jean writings on responsibility, 3-4

Borchard, Edwin M. Harvard Draft Research, 32 writings on responsibility, 24 Bosnian Genocide case direction and control, 154-6 breach of obligations anticipatory breach, 233-5 cessation see cessation circumstances precluding wrongfulness see justification claims see claims complex breach, 269-73 components of, 94 composite breach ARSIWA, 714 character of, 265-8 determining scope of, 268-9 DARIO 2011, 764 continuing breach completion, 264-5 concept, 258–62 instantaneous breach distinguished, 262 - 4countermeasures see countermeasures Draft Articles 1996, 746 duration, 253-4, 748-9 excuses see justification exhaustion of local remedies, 748 existence, 746 ARSIWA, 714 DARIO 2011, 763 extending in time, 749 generally, 93-4 instantaneous breach concept, 254-8 continuing breach distinguished, 262-4 international crimes and delicts, 747 international organizations see international organizations intertemporal law application of, 241-5 and codification of responsibility, 244 - 5evolutive interpretation of treaties, 246-50 Island of Palmas case, 241-2 and law of treaties, 242-4 new peremptory norms, 250-1 retrospective acceptance of responsibility, 245-6 irrelevance of origin of obligation, 746 justification see justification material element generally, 215-16 'non-violation complaints', 238-9 not extending in time, 748 obligation in force ARSIWA, 714, 763

obligation requiring particular conduct, 748 obligation requiring specified result, 748 to prevent given event, 748-9 reparation for see reparation requirement that obligation be in force, 746-7 responsibility see responsibility; state responsibility time ARSIWA, 714 DARIO 2011, 763 of occurrence, 748-9 temporal element generally, 240-1 see also intertemporal law above Broniowski case judicial implementation of responsibility, 630-7 burden of proof justification and, 320-1 Bynkershoek, Cornelius van writings on responsibility, 11, 15-17 causation see injury cause of action applicable law distinguished, 603-8 cessation continued duty of performance distinguished, 464-5 'continuing' wrongful acts, 462-4 obligation of ARSIWA, 717 DARIO 2011, 768 restitution distinguished, 469 restoration of legal relations see restoration of relations Chorzów principle jurisdiction, 599-603 Christakis, Théodore on circumstances precluding wrongfulness, 279-80 circumvention of international obligations DARIO 2011, 765, 776 claims aliens see aliens, injury to applicable law see applicable law on behalf of others diplomatic protection see diplomatic protection generally, 566–7 by international organizations, 593 by third states, 593 counterclaims, jurisdiction, 609-14 dispute settlement, 95-9 entitlement to claim ARSIWA, 719-20

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-82266-4 - State Responsibility: The General Part James Crawford Index More information

INDEX 811

concerned states or other entities, 549-53 DARIO 2011, 771-2 generally, 541-2 injured state, 542-8 other injured parties, 549 generally, 95 joinder, 669-71 lapse of, 72-4, 560-3 loss of right acquiescence, 558-60 adjudication of claim, 557–65 ARSIWA, 720 DARIO 2011, 772 effects on related or derivative claims, 563-5 generally, 557-8 lapse of claim, 72-4, 560-3 lapse of time, 560-3 settlement of claim, 557–65 waiver, 558–60 multiple parties see multiple parties nationality of diplomatic protection, 573-80 Draft Articles 1961, 740-1 inadmissibility of claims, 69 process, 549-53 waiver and acquiescence, 558-60 inadmissibility of claim, 70-2 Monetary Gold principle, 668-9 see also arbitration; dispute settlement; remedies class actions investment arbitration, 637-40 coercion considerations as to, 421 definition, 419-21 DARIO 2011, 764, 776 generally, 419 of international organization, 422 collective countermeasures use of, 703-6 collective responsibility see joint or collective responsibility commercial and contract law applicable law, 99-100 arbitration, 295-6 concerted conduct, 334-5 diplomatic protection, 75 exhaustion of local remedies, 70 interest see interest non-performance as to aliens, 736-7 see also corporations, investment protection communitarian norms breaches of, 365

development of ARSIWA Article 48, 365-70 future development of law of, 389-90 invocation of, 370-6 relation to other norms, 376-8 see also peremptory norms companies see commercial and contract law; corporations compensation basic principle, 516-17 criminal proceedings, 641-3 double recovery rule, 673-4 entitlement, 754 international courts' practice, 518-19 justification and, 318-20 loss of profits, 522-3 meaning, 754 obligation ARSIWA, 718 DARIO 2011, 769 proportionality, 482-4 punitive damages, 523–6 quantification of damage, 519-22 reservation as to, 751 complex breach see breach of obligations compliance with peremptory norms as justification ARSIWA, 716 DARIO 2011, 767 complicity see aid or assistance for wrongful act composite breach see breach of obligations conciliation Draft Articles 1996, 757 Conciliation Commission Draft Articles 1996, 759-60 task of, 757-8 conduct acknowledged and adopted by international organization DARIO 2011, 714 acknowledged and adopted by state ARSIWA, 714 carried out in absence or default of official authorities see authority collective conduct see joint or collective responsibility directed or controlled by state see direction and control over wrongful act ex post facto adoption case law, 182 development of ARSIWA Article 11, 181 - 2Eichmann case, 183 Gabĉikovo-Nagymaros case, 186-7 Lighthouses Arbitration, 182-3

conduct (cont.) operation of provision, 187-8 Teheran Hostages case, 183-6 joint conduct see joint or collective responsibility obligations of conduct and result, 220-6 consent as justification ARSIWA, 715 DARIO 2011, 765 Draft Articles 1996, 750 generally, 283-9 consular inviolability obligations as to, 696-7 consular notification and access as human rights, 592 contemporaneity principle of, 242-3 continued duty of performance see obligations continuing breach see breach of obligations continuous nationality corporation, 730 natural person, 729 contract see commercial and contract law contravention of instructions see excess of authority contribution to injury see injury control over wrongful act see direction and control over wrongful act co-operation obligation of, 386-9 corporate criminal responsibility non-state actors, 80-1 corporations attribution and state-owned corporations, 161 - 5continuous nationality, 730 diplomatic protection, 730 direction and control, 161-5 state of nationality, 730 see also state-owned corporations counterclaims jurisdiction, 609-14 countermeasures collective countermeasures, 703-6 conditions ARSIWA, 722 DARIO 2011, 774-5 Draft Articles 1996, 755 generally, 700-2 consular and diplomatic inviolability, obligations as to, 696-7 DARIO 2011, 773-5 dispute settlement provisions, separability of, 694-6 generally, 95, 684-6

human rights/humanitarian obligations, 691-4 international oversight, 706-11 as justification ARSIWA, 715 DARIO 2011, 766 Draft Articles 1996, 750 generally, 292-5 limits ARSIWA, 721 DARIO 2011, 773-4 object and scope, 686-8 object of ARSIWA, 721 DARIO 2011, 773-4 obligation to refrain from threat or use of force, 690-1 obligations not affected ARSIWA, 721 DARIO 2011, 774 prohibited countermeasures, 688-90, 756 proportionality, 697-9 ARSIWA, 722 DARIO 2011, 774 Draft Articles 1996, 756 separability of dispute settlement provisions, 694-6 by state or international organization other than injured state or organization ARSIWA, 722 DARIO 2011, 775 taking of, meaning, 755 termination ARSIWA, 722 DARIO 2011, 775 generally, 702-3 UN Security Council oversight, 706-11 Crawford, James Special Rapporteur, 39-40 see also Table of reports of Special Rapporteurs crimes against humanity charges, 149-50 claims, 82 communitarian norms, 369 continuing breach of provisions, 260 individual responsibility, 79–80 insurrectional movements, 180-1 peremptory norms, 316-17, 380 see also war crimes criminal responsibility compensation, 641-3 corporate, 80-1 as to human rights see human rights and fundamental freedoms

as to humanitarian law see humanitarian law individual, 79–80 international crimes of state, 390 Monetary Gold principle, 667-8 damage level for invocation of responsibility, 54-60 quantification of, 519-22 damages double recovery rule, 673–4 injury to aliens, 741–2 mitigation of, 494-5 punitive, 523-6 reservation as to, 751 de facto organs attribution, 124-6 defunct states Monetary Gold principle, 666-7 'delegated' powers question human rights and fundamental freedoms, 134 'delictual capacity', 62 denial of justice aliens, 734–5 investment protection, 270-1 deprivation of liberty aliens, 735 diplomatic inviolability obligations as to, 696–7 diplomatic protection alternatives to, 569, 584-5, 731 character of, 568-73 corporations, 730 countermeasures, 696-7 definition, 728 Draft Articles 2006 see ILC Draft Articles on Diplomatic Protection dual nationality, 729 generally, 567-8 institution of, 75-7 interaction with international law rules, 731 in international law, 74-5 by international organizations, 77-8 invocation generally, 584-5 human rights, 585-7 investment protection, 587-92 other routes, 592-3 legal persons, 730 local remedies, 580-4, 731 multiple nationality, 729 nationality of claims, 573-80 natural persons, 729 recommended practice, 732

refugees, 729 right to exercise, 728 rights in international law, 74-5 role of, 568-73 scope, 728 shareholders, 730 ships' crews, 731 and special rules of international law, 731 by state of nationality, 728 stateless persons, 729 by third states, 78-9 waiver as to aliens, 739 see also entries at consular; investment protection direction and control over wrongful act additional requirements for liability, 416-17 ARSIWA Article 17, 412-14 Bosnian Genocide case, 154-6 codification, 143-4 definition, 414-16 development of law, 141 DARIO 2011, 776 early cases, 141-3 'effective control' and 'overall control' distinguished, 146-7 of international organization, 417-18 international organizations, 764 knowledge of obligation, 416 Nicaragua case, 147-9 opposability of obligation, 416 persons acting on state instruction, 144 - 6standards as to secondary responsibility, 397 - 9by state, 144-6, 715 state-owned corporations, 161-5 Tadić case, 149-54 terrorism see terrorism see also coercion by state or other international organization 'disposal' definition, 133-5 dispute settlement as to admissibility of claims, 739-40 Draft Articles 1996, 757-8 generally, 95-9 separability of provisions, 694-6 see also arbitration distress as justification ÅRSIWA, 716 DARIO 2011, 766-7 Draft Articles 1996, 750-1 generally, 301-5 domestic law see internal law Draft Articles see entries at ILC Draft Articles

dual nationality diplomatic protection claim against state of nationality, 729 claim against third state, 729 due diligence obligation, 226-32 Dugard, John on diplomatic protection, 75-7, 569-73, 586 on insurrectional movements, 173 on Monetary Gold principle, 663 Dumberry, Patrick on insurrectional movements and attribution, 178-9 on succession to responsibility, 435-7, 440 duty of protection negligence as to aliens, 735-6 Eagleton, Clyde writings on responsibility, 24-6, 398 effective control definition, 203-5 Dutchbat case, 205-10 'overall control' distinguished, 146-7 test, 156–7 Eichmann case ex post facto adoption of conduct, 183 'empowered by the law' of the state definition, 132 entities exercising governmental authority attribution ARSIWA, 713 Draft Articles 1996, 744 generally, 126-9 definition of 'governmental authority', 129-32 'empowered by the law' of the state, definition of, 132 erga omnes obligations concept, 66-7 related concepts, 66-7 European Court of Human Rights see human rights and fundamental freedoms ex post facto adoption of conduct see conduct exception of non-performance (exceptio inadimpleti contractus) ILC Draft Articles 1961, 678-82 self-help measures, 678-82 excess of authority attribution ARSIWA, 713 generally, 136-40 excuses for breaches of obligations see justification

executive definition, 119-20 expropriation measures affecting aliens, 736 expulsion aliens, 735 extra-judicial implementation of responsibility generally, 675-6 self-help measures see self-help measures federal subdivisions see political subdivisions Fitzmaurice, Malgosia on circumstances precluding wrongfulness, 275-6 contemporaneity principle, 242-3 on law of treaties, 367 force obligation to refrain from, 690-1 force majeure as justification ARSIWA, 716 DARIO 2011, 766 Draft Articles 1996, 750 generally, 295-301 fork-in-the-road clauses election of remedies, 624-6 fortuitous event as justification, 750 freedom of movement interference with aliens', 735 fundamental freedoms see human rights and fundamental freedoms Gabĉíkovo-Nagymaros case ex post facto adoption of conduct, 186 - 7negative succession rule, 446 Gaja, Giorgio on aid or assistance, 405 on assurances and guarantees, 471–2 on diplomatic protection by third-state nationals, 78-9 García-Amador, F. V. Special Rapporteur, 34-6, 567 see also Table of reports of Special Rapporteurs theory of responsibility, 275-6 general international law see international law Gentili, Alberico writings on responsibility, 3-4, 6-8 Germany reunification and negative succession rule, 449-51 Versailles Treaty and responsibility, 27-8

good offices Draft Articles 1996, 757 governing law see applicable law governmental authority see authority Grotius, Hugo writings on responsibility, 3-4, 8-11, 378-9 guarantee of non-repetition see repetition of breach guarantees joint or collective responsibility, 354 - 5Hague Codification Conference 1930 development of law of responsibility, 28 - 32and Harvard Draft Research, 32 harm level for invocation of responsibility, 54-60 Hart, H. L. A. (Herbert Lionel Adolphus) distinction between primary and secondary rules, 64 Harvard Draft Research 1929 Draft, 32-3, 123-4, 397-8 1961 Draft, 34-5 and Hague Codification Conference 1930, 32 Heffter, August Wilhelm writings on responsibility, 21-2 Higgins, Rosalyn on assurances and guarantees, 477, 479 on non ultra petita rule, 628-9 on state responsibility, 328 human rights and fundamental freedoms 'abuse of rights', meaning, 734 aid or assistance, 410 alien torts, 81-3 of aliens, 733 as alternative to diplomatic protection, 569, 584-5 applicable law, 100-1 applicable obligations, 460-1 assurances and guarantees, 474 attribution dual, 204 joint, 196-7 Broniowski case, 630-7 claims, 100 communitarian norms, 364, 366-8, 370 - 6compensation obligation to make reparation, 481 proportionality, 482-4 quantification of damage, 519-22 right of election, 508 consent to waiver. 287

consular notification and access as, 592 continuing breach, 261–2, 463 contributing state responsibility, 197-203 countermeasures, 689, 691-4, 704-5 crimes against humanity see crimes against humanity criminal responsibility, 79 damage quantification, 519-22 damage requirement, 55, 57 damages, punitive, 526 definition, 733 'delegated' powers question, 134 denial, 53-4 derogation, 291 diplomatic protection, 585-7 dispute settlement, 98 'equivalent' protection by international organizations, 430-3 erga omnes obligations, 67 evolutive interpretation, 248-50 independent responsibility, 335–6 'injured state', meaning of, 535-6 instantaneous breach, 258 insurrectional movements, 173-4, 180 'integral obligations', 547 interest post-judgment, 535-6 judicial implementation of responsibility, 630 - 7level of responsibility, 84 lex specialis, 104–5 'material damage', 55 'military necessity', 315 'moral damage', 55, 58 non-state party responsibility, 549 peremptory norms, 384, 387, 390 primary and secondary obligations distinguished, 216, 221 state contribution to international organizations, 346-54 state responsibility for acts of subdivisions, 124 systematic remedies, 630-7 time of start of state liability, 433-4 treaty mechanisms, 596 use of force as to violations, 704-5 violation, 618-19, 682, 709 waiver, 287 humanitarian intervention aid or assistance, 401 consent, 284 distress, 302-3, 305 force majeure, 297-8 peacekeeping by international organizations, 193-7 recourse to use of force, 277-8

humanitarian law alignment with state responsibility, 155 applicable law, 152-3 conduct of private persons, 360-1 countermeasures, 688-9, 691-4 intransgressible rules of, 291-2 iurisdictional immunity of state, 467-8 lawfulness of forcible, 315 level of responsibility, 84 lex specialis, 291-2 'military necessity', 315 necessity, 306-7 peremptory norms, 382-3 use of force, 708-9 violation, 147-9, 618-19, 641, 682 see also crimes against humanity ILC development of law of responsibility, 35 - 44first reading, 1949-1996, 35-9 responses to ARSIWA, 42-4 second reading, 1998-2001, 39-42 ILC Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts 2001 (ARSIWA) bases for attribution. 115-16 concept of state responsibility, 49-51 content, 45-9 development during second reading 1998-2001, 39-42 General Assembly resolutions as to, 724 - 7interaction with UN Charter, 723 responses to, 42-4 text, 712-23 typology of state responsibility, 51-4 ILC Draft Articles on Diplomatic Protection 2006 specific provisions see diplomatic protection text, 728-32 ILC Draft Articles on State Responsibility 1996 development during first reading 1949-1996, 35-9 text, 743-60 ILC Draft Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations 2010, 777 lex specialis, 777 scope of articles, 761 specific provisions see international organizations terminology, 761 text, 761-77 and United Nations Charter, 777

implementation of responsibility see claims; diplomatic protection; extrajudicial implementation of responsibility; invocation of responsibility; judicial implementation of responsibility inadmissibility of claims see invocation of responsibility indemnities joint or collective responsibility, 354-5 independent responsibility exceptions, 336-9 principle, 333-6 indirect responsibility Anzilotti's representation theory of, 397 individual criminal responsibility non-state actors, 79-80 individuals responsibility of ÂRSIWA, 723 injury, 682-4 to aliens see aliens, injury to causation concurrent causes, 495-500 contribution to injury, 500-3 expanded scope of, 492-4 mitigation of damage and reparation, 494–5 claims see claims countermeasures see countermeasures definition, 485-6 'injured state' meaning, 752–3 plurality, 503-5 invocation of responsibility see invocation of responsibility joint or collective contribution, 355-8 ʻlegal injury', 487 material and moral injury, 486–7 non-repetition measures, 742 plurality of injured states ARSIWA, 720 reparation see reparation secondary responsibility, 429-30 to shareholders, 730 instantaneous breach see breach of obligations Institut de Droit International work on state responsibility, 32, 328 insurrectional movements attribution ARSIWA, 713 creation of new government, 174-6 creation of new state, 176-9 development of ARSIWA Article 10, 170 - 4

INDEX 817

Draft Articles 1996, 745-6 failed insurgency, 179-81 imputability of acts or omissions, 738 'integral obligations' human rights and fundamental freedoms, 547 interest basic principle, 531-3 calculation, 536-8 period in which payable, 534-6 pre-judgment and post-judgment interest distinguished, 533-4 rate, 536-8 reparation ARSIWA, 718 DARIO 2011, 770 internal law irrelevance as justification ARSIWA, 717 internal subdivisions see political subdivisions international crimes consequences, 756 development of Draft Article 19, 390 Draft Articles 1996, 756-7 obligations for all states, 756-7 specific consequences, 756 international forums oversight of countermeasure, 706-11 international law as applicable law ARSIWA, 723 DARIO 2011, 777 generally, 100-3 diplomatic protection see diplomatic protection peremptory norms see peremptory norms International Law Commission see ILC 'international obligations of the state' meaning, 734 international organizations accountability, 84 agents conduct, 762-3 contravention of instructions, 763 excess of authority, 763 meaning, 761 attribution ARSIWA, 744 to contributing states, 197-203 DARIO 2011, 745, 762-3 secondary responsibility distinguished, 211 breach of international obligation composite act, 764 DARIO 2011, 763-4

existence, 763 requirement that obligation be in force, 763 serious breach, 770-1 time, 763 coercion of, 422 complicity, 410-12 conduct acknowledged and adopted, 763 joint or collective, 343-54 contributing state responsibility Al-Jedda case, 200-3 Behrami and Saramati cases, 197-200 case law, 197 countermeasures against conditions, 774-5 DARIO 2011, 773-5 limits, 773-4 object of, 773-4 obligations not affected, 774 proportionality, 774 by states or international organizations other than injured state or organization, 775 termination, 775 diplomatic protection by, 77-8 direction and control of, 417-18 Draft Articles see ILC Draft Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations 2010 early theory and practice, 190-3 effective control definition, 203-5 Dutchbat case, 205-10 'equivalent' human rights protection by, 430-3 functional protection by, 593 imputability of acts or omissions, 738 internationally wrongful acts aid or assistance for, 764, 775-6 cessation, 768 characterization, 762 circumvention of international obligations, 765, 776 coercion by state or other international organization, 764, 776 compensation, 769 continued duty of performance of obligation, 768 contribution to injury, 770 countermeasures see countermeasures against above direction and control over, 764, 776 DARIO 2011, 764-5 elements, 762 fulfilment of reparation obligation, 770 interest, 770

international organizations (cont.) international organization member of other international organization, 765 justification, 765-7 legal consequences, 768 non-repetition, 768 relevance of rules of organization, 768 reparation, 768-70 responsibility, 723, 762 restitution, 769 satisfaction, 769 scope of obligations, 768 state connection with, 775-7 state member of organization, 777 joint or collective responsibility, 343-54 meaning, 761 organs conduct, 745, 762-3 contravention of instructions, 763 excess of authority, 763 meaning, 761 placed at disposal of other organization, 762 placed at disposal of state, 744 peacekeeping, 193-7 reparation by DARIO 2011, 768–70 forms of, 769 fulfilment of obligation, 770 obligation, 768 responsibility of individuals, 777 responsibility of applicability of international law rules, 777 ARSIWA, 723 connection with act of state or other international organization, 764-5 DARIO 2011, 761-77 implementation, 771-5 invocation, 771-3 rules meaning, 761 relevance, 768 secondary responsibility acceptance, 428-9 attribution distinguished, 211 basic rule, 423-4 exceptions, 428-30 injured party reliance, 429-30 judicial confirmation of basic rule, 424 - 7member state responsibility, 422-3 separate personality, abuse of, 430-4 states, attribution to, 188-90

international responsibility as state responsibility, 3 internationally wrongful acts aid or assistance for see aid or assistance for wrongful act of another state responsibility, 749-50 attribution see attribution cessation ARSIWA, 717 Draft Articles 1996, 753 characterization ARSIWA, 712 Draft Articles 1996, 743 circumstances precluding wrongfulness see justification coercion by other state ARSIWA, 715 continued duty of performance see obligations countermeasures see countermeasures customary international law, 752 direction and control over see direction and control over wrongful act elements ARSIWA, 712 Draft Articles 1996, 743 ILC Articles see ILC Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts 2001 (ARSIWA) international organizations see ILC Draft Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations 2010; international organizations justification see justification legal consequences ARSIWA, 717 Draft Articles 1996, 751-3 lex specialis see lex specialis non-repetition ARSIWA, 717 reparation ARSIWA, 717 responsibility of any state, 743 applicability of international law rules, 723, 777 ARSIWA, 712 Draft Articles 1996, 743 of individuals, 723 of international organizations, 723 obligations arising from see obligations plurality of responsible states, 720 see also breach of obligations, international crimes

INDEX 819

ARSIWA, 720

interpretation of treaties intertemporal law and, 246-50 intertemporal law see breach of obligations interventions see humanitarian intervention investment protection as alternative to diplomatic protection, 569 applicable law, 100-2 attribution, 164 as basis for law of state responsibility, 24, 34-5 Chorzów principle, 600-3 claims, 100 class actions, 630, 637-40 compensation, 519, 620-1 consent, 287 counterclaims, 611-14 denial of justice, 270-1 diplomatic protection and, 569, 587-92 exhaustion of local remedies, 581-2 fork-in-the-road clauses, 624-6 'hybrid' character, 102 interest, 535-8 investor-state arbitration, 74-5, 128-9 nationality of claims, 577-80 obligation to make reparation, 481 primary rules, 33 recourse to, 549 secondary obligations applicable, 460-1 see also arbitration invocation of responsibility admissibility of claims see claims 'delictual capacity' principle, 62 erga omnes obligations see erga omnes obligations formal requirements, 67-8 inadmissibility of claims see claims international organizations, 771-3 level of harm, damage or injury required, 54-60 liability, concept of, 62-3 multiple parties see multiple parties notice of claim ARSIWA, 720 DARIO 2011, 771 'objective responsibility' principle, 60-2 obligations erga omnes see erga omnes obligations primary and secondary distinguished, 64-6 plurality of injured states or international organizations ARSIWA, 720 DARIO 2011, 772 plurality of responsible states or international organizations

DARIO 2011, 772 prerequisites for, 54-62 primary and secondary rules distinguished, 64-6 responsibility, concept of, 62-3 by state other than injured state or international organization ARSIWA, 720-1 DARIO 2011, 772-3 Jagota, S. P. on necessity, 306-7 joint or collective responsibility attribution to multiple states, 333-6 breach of communitarian norms see communitarian norms claims, 358-61 contribution between persons collectively responsible, 355-8 generally, 325 guarantees and indemnities, 354–5 historical development, 326-8 implication in act of another state, 336–9 independent responsibility exceptions, 336-9 principle, 333-6 international organizations, 343-54 joint organs, 339-41 other bases for solidary responsibility, 341-3 private law analogies, 328-32 by states, 333 see also secondary responsibility; succession to responsibility judges ad hoc appointment, 671-2 judicial implementation of responsibility class actions in investment arbitration, 637-40 criminal compensation, 641-3 election of remedies claimant's right to elect, 621-4 election during proceedings, 621-4 fork-in-the-road clauses, 624-6 non ultra petita rule, 626-9 generally, 598 human rights see human rights and fundamental freedoms jurisdiction Chorzów principle, 599-603 counterclaims, 609-14 distinction between cause of action and applicable law, 603-8 remedial discretion, 615-21 judiciary definition, 121-3

jurisdictional immunity of state humanitarian law, 467-8 iustice denial see denial of justice justification ARSIWA, 715-17 Austin's philosophy of excuses, 274, 278 - 9burden of proof, 320-1 category of 'circumstances precluding wrongfulness', 274-80 compensation and, 318-20 consequences of invoking ARSIWA, 717 DARIO 2011, 767 Draft Articles 1996, 750-1 DARIO 2011, 765-7 generally, 274 irrelevance of internal law ARSIWA, 717 obligations arising from peremptory norms, 315-18 reservation as to compensation for damage, 751 termination or suspension of obligations, 281 - 3types of, 283-315 Lauterpacht, Hersch 'approximate application' principle, 109 on interest, 536 on reparation, 537–8 work on state responsibility, 34 law of treaties as applicable law, 281 exception of non-performance, 678-9, 681 intertemporal law and, 242-4 law of state responsibility distinguished, 684 obligations under, 216-17 reports on, 367 suspension or termination of treaty, 684 Vienna Convention see Table of treaties legal persons diplomatic protection, 730 legislature definition, 120-1 imputability of acts or omissions, 737 lex specialis applicable law, 103-5 ARSIWA, 722 Draft Articles 1996, 752 liability, concept of invocation of responsibility, 62-3 liberty deprivation of aliens', 735

Lighthouses Arbitration ex post facto adoption of conduct, 182 - 3negative succession rule, 443-5 local remedies diplomatic protection, 731 exceptions to local remedies rule, 731 exhaustion of diplomatic protection, 580-4, 731 Draft Articles 1961, 738-9, 748 inadmissibility of claims, 69-70 loss of profits compensation, 522-3 Lowe, Vaughan on circumstances precluding wrongfulness, 280 maltreatment aliens, 735 mediation Draft Articles 1996, 757 'military necessity treaty provision, 315 Monetary Gold principle application, 660-6 criminal prosecution, 667-8 defunct states, 666-7 exceptions, 666 generally, 655-7 jurisprudence, 659-60 scope, 657, 664–5 waiver of claim, 668-9 multiple nationality diplomatic protection claim against state of nationality, 729 claim against third state, 729 multiple parties ad hoc judges, 671-2 claimants, 645-8 double recovery rule, 673-4 generally, 644-5 intervention by third states, 650–5 see also Monetary Gold principle joinder of claims, 669-71 respondents, 648-50 Namibian independence negative succession rule, 453-5 national law see internal law nationality of claims see claims nationalization measures affecting aliens, 736 natural persons continuous nationality, 729 diplomatic protection, 729 state of nationality of, 728

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-82266-4 - State Responsibility: The General Part James Crawford Index More information

INDEX 821

necessity as justification ARSIWA, 716 DARIO 2011, 767 Draft Articles 1996, 751 generally, 305-15 negative succession rule case law, 442-3 critiques of, 438-42 early theory and practice, 437-8 Gabĉikovo-Nagymaros case, 446 generally, 435-7 Lighthouses Arbitration, 443-5 state practice dissolution of Yugoslavia, 451–2 German reunification, 449-51 Namibian independence, 453-5 role of, 447-8 separation from USSR, 452-3 succession where predecessor ceases to exist, 448–9 succession where predecessor continues to exist, 452 summary of issues, 455 negotiation Draft Articles 1996, 757 new government creation of, 174-6 new state creation of, 176-9 Nicaragua case direction and control, 147-9 non-assistance obligation of, 385-6 non-performance exception (exceptio inadimpleti contractus) ILC Draft Articles 1961, 736-7 self-help measures, 678-82 non-recognition obligation of, 381-5 non-repetition assurances and guarantees, 755 injury to aliens, 742 obligation of ARSIWA, 717 DARIO 2011, 768 non-state actors claims against, 81-3 corporate criminal responsibility, 80 - 1individual criminal responsibility, 79-80 non ultra petita rule election of remedies, 626-9 norms see communitarian norms; peremptory norms

'objective responsibility' principle, 60-2 obligations acts or omissions see acts or omissions arising from peremptory norms, 315-18 breach see breach of obligations of cessation and non-repetition ARSIWA, 717 classification of, 219-20 of conduct and result, 220-6 continued duty of performance ARSIWA, 717 cessation distinguished, 464-5 DARIO 2011, 768 of co-operation, 386-9 due diligence, 226–32 illusory, 235-8 'integral obligations', 547 knowledge of, 416 of non-assistance, 385-6 of non-recognition, 381–5 opposability of, 416 of prevention, 226-32 primary autonomy of, 216-17 secondary obligations distinguished, 64-6 termination of, 251-3 procedural, 232 reparation see reparation scope of ARSIWA, 717 secondary primary obligations distinguished, 64-6 serious breach see peremptory norms substantive, 232 suspension as self-help measure, 682-4 termination or suspension as justification, 281-3 of primary obligation, 281-3 O'Connell, Daniel P. on succession to responsibility, 435-6, 442 officials imputability of acts or omissions, 737 organs acting outside competence or instructions attribution, 745 organs of another state attribution, 745 organs of insurrectional movement attribution, 745-6 organs of international organization see international organizations organs of the state attribution ARSIWA, 712 Draft Articles 1996, 743

organs of the state (cont.) irrelevance of position in state organization, 744 other empowered entities or persons see entities exercising governmental authority responsibility generally, 116-18 de facto, 124-6 definition, 118 'delegated' powers question, 134 imputability of acts or omissions, 737 and international organizations see international organizations joint or collective responsibility, 339-41 see also entities exercising governmental authority organs placed at disposal of another state attribution additional requirements, 135-6 ARSIWA, 713 Draft Articles 1996, 744 generally, 132–3 definition of 'disposal', 133–5 organs placed at disposal of international organization attribution DARIO 2011, 762 'overall control' 'effective control' distinguished, 146-7 vacta tertiis rule complicity and, 409-10 Pauwelyn, Joost instantaneous and continuing acts distinguished, 262-4 peacekeeping see humanitarian intervention pecuniary damages injury to aliens, 741-2 peremptory norms applicable law, 106 compliance as justification ARSIWA, 716 DARIO 2011, 767 consequences of serious breach generally, 380-1 obligation of co-operation, 386-9 obligation of non-assistance, 385-6 obligation of non-recognition, 381 - 5definition of, 378-80 serious breach ARSIWA, 719 DARIO 2011, 770-1 particular consequences, 719, 770-1 see also communitarian norms

persons exercising governmental authority locator 744 persons not acting on behalf of state attribution, 745 political subdivisions definition, 123-4 imputability of acts or omissions. 738 prevention of event breach of obligation of, 226-32, 749 primary obligation continuation after restoration of relations, 461 primary rules autonomy of, 216-17 secondary rules distinguished, 64-6 profits, loss of compensation for, 522-3 proof see burden of proof proportionality compensation, 482-4 of countermeasures see countermeasures protection, duty of see duty of protection public debts repudiation/cancellation measures affecting aliens, 737 Pufendorf, Samuel von writings on responsibility, 3-4, 11-15 punitive damages as compensation, 523-6 Rachel, Samuel writings on responsibility, 11 refugees diplomatic protection, 729 relief operations see humanitarian intervention remedies election of see judicial implementation of responsibility judicial discretion as to, 615-21 reparation and, 506-10 see also compensation; interest; restitution; satisfaction reparation assurances and guarantees against repetition of breach distinguished, 475-6 available forms of, 506–8 basic principle, 480-1 claims see claims contribution to injury ARSIWA, 719 DARIO 2011, 770 election, right of, 508-9 entitlement, 753

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-82266-4 - State Responsibility: The General Part James Crawford Index More information

INDEX 823

forms of ARSIWA, 718 DARIO 2011, 769 see also compensation; restitution; satisfaction 'full' reparation ARSIWA, 481-3 case law, 483-5 generally, 94 hierarchy of, 509-10 interest see interest by international organization see international organizations mitigation of, 494-5 obligation ARSIWA, 717 DARIO 2011, 768 fulfilment, 770 remedies and, 506-10 right of election, 508-9 see also injury; remedies repetition of breach assurances and guarantees against appropriateness of, 476-9 generally, 469 obligation to offer, 469 reparation distinguished, 475-6 rescue operations see humanitarian intervention responsibility and accountability, 83-5 concept of, 62-3 criminal responsibility see criminal responsibility in early international law writings, 4-20 Hague Codification Conference 1930 see Hague Codification Conference 1930 Harvard Draft Research see Harvard Draft Research historical development, 3-44 ILC's work on see ILC Articles on Diplomatic Protection 2006; ILC Draft Articles on State Responsibility 1996 implementation see claims, diplomatic protection, invocation of responsibility independent responsibility see independent responsibility indirect responsibility see indirect responsibility nineteenth- and early twentieth-century developments, 20-35 retrospective acceptance, 245-6 secondary responsibility and attribution distinguished, 211

succession to see negative succession rule wrongful acts see internationally wrongful acts see also state responsibility restitution basic principle, 510-11 cessation distinguished, 469 disproportionate burden of, 514-15 flexible approach to, 515-16 forms of, 511-12 impossibility of, 512-13 injury to aliens, 741-2 in kind, 754 limitations, 512-15 obligation ARSIWA, 718 restoration of relations assurances and guarantees against repetition see repetition of breach cessation of breach see cessation continuation of primary obligation, 461 generally, 459-60 legal effects of breach, 460–1 secondary obligations applicable, 460 - 1retorsion use of, 676-8 rights aliens see aliens, injury to human rights see human rights and fundamental freedoms injury to see injury Riphagen, William Special Rapporteur, 36–7, 464, 475 see also Table of reports of Special **Rapporteurs** rules primary and secondary rules distinguished, 64-6 'rules of the organization' meaning, 761 satisfaction basic principle, 527 case law, 529-30 entitlement, 754 forms of, 527-9, 754 limitations, 530-1 obligation ARSIWA, 718 DARIO 2011, 769 secondary responsibility aid or assistance for breach see aid or assistance for wrongful act attribution distinguished, 211

secondary responsibility (cont.) direction and control see direction and control over wrongful act of international organizations see international organizations restoration of relations, 460-1 scope of, 395-6 scope of state responsibility, 395-9 secondary rules primary rules distinguished, 64-6 'self-contained regimes' lex specialis and, 103-5 self-defence as justification ÅRSIWA, 715 DARIO 2011, 765 Draft Articles 1996, 751 generally, 289-92 self-help measures countermeasures by injured state see countermeasures exception of non-performance (exceptio inadimpleti contractus), 678-82 retorsion, 676-8 suspension of obligations, 682-4 serious breach of obligations under peremptory norms see peremptory norms shareholders diplomatic protection, 730 direct injury to, 730 Shelton, Dinah on punitive damages, 526 ships' crews diplomatic protection, 731 Simma, Bruno on assurances and guarantees, 469-70 on communitarian norms, 372-4 on erga omnes obligations, 389 on exception of non-performance, 681 on insurrectional movements, 173 on joint-and-several liability doctrine, 331 on 'legal injury', 487 on multiple responsibility, 328-9 on obligations arising from peremptory norms, 317 on right to take countermeasures, 105 on suspension of obligations, 682 Soviet Union, separation from negative succession rule, 452-3 state absence of see authority creation of new, 176-9 see also negative succession rule injured see injury jurisdictional immunity, 467-8 see also third state

state direction and control see direction and control over wrongful act state of nationality claims on behalf of aliens, 740-1 of corporation, 730 definition, 728 diplomatic protection by, 728 of natural person, 728 state of necessity see necessity state officials see officials state organs see entries at organs state-owned corporations direction and control, 161-5 state responsibility acts or omissions giving rise to see acts or omissions concept, 49–51 as to conduct of international organization, 775-7 convention, 90-2 critiques of governmental, 85–7 scholarly, 87-90 direction and control see direction and control over wrongful act Draft Articles 1961 see ILC Draft Articles on State Responsibility 1961 Draft Articles 1996 see ILC Draft Articles on State Responsibility 1996 ILC Articles 2001 see ILC Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts 2001 (ARSIWĂ) international responsibility seen as, 3 investment protection as basis for law of, $24.3\overline{4}-5$ invocation see invocation of responsibility law of treaties distinguished, 684 terminology, 51-62 typology, 51-4 and UN Charter see United Nations Charter stateless persons diplomatic protection, 729 Suárez, Francisco writings on responsibility, 3-4 successor states see negative succession rule Tadić case direction and control, 149-54 Tams, Christian J. on right of claim, 564-5 on suspension of obligations, 682 Teheran Hostages case ex post facto adoption of conduct,

183-6

INDEX 825

terrorism direction and control bases of responsibility, 157-61 effective control test, 156-7 Textor, Johann Wolfgang writings on responsibility, 11 third state diplomatic protection by, 78-9 diplomatic protection claims against, 729 functional protection by, 593 imputability of acts or omissions, 738 intervention in multi-party claims, 650-5 see also Monetary Gold principle threat or use of force obligation to refrain from, 690-1 time breach of obligation see breach of obligations contemporaneity principle, 242-3 intertemporal law see breach of obligations start of state liability, 433-4 submission of claims, 741 tort alien torts, 81-3 treaty interpretation intertemporal law and, 246-50 Treaty of Versailles 1919 German responsibility, 27-8 Triepel, Heinrich writings on responsibility, 22-3 ultra vires see excess of authority unilateral self-help measures see self-help measures United Nations Charter

applicable law, 106

and ARSIWA, 723 and DARIO 2011, 777 and Draft Articles 1996, 723 United Nations General Assembly resolutions as to ARSIWA, 724-7 United Nations Security Council oversight of countermeasure, 706-11 use or threat of force obligation to refrain from, 690-1 USSR, separation from negative succession rule, 452-3 Vattel, Emerich de writings on responsibility, 18-20, 76, 170, 181, 569–70 Vitoria, Francisco de writings on responsibility, 3-4 waiver of claim see claims war crimes charges, 149-50 Wheaton, Henry writings on responsibility, 20-1 Whiteman, Marjorie M. on interest, 537 Wolff, Christian writings on responsibility, 11, 17-19 wrongfulness circumstances precluding see justification internationally wrongful acts see internationally wrongful acts Yugoslavia, dissolution of negative succession rule, 451-2

Zouche, Richard writings on responsibility, 3–4, 11, 11–12