Michel de Montaigne, the inventor of the essay, has always been acknowledged as a great literary figure but has never been thought of as a philosophical original. This book is the first to treat Montaigne as a serious thinker in his own right, taking as its point of departure Montaigne’s description of himself as “an unpremeditated and accidental philosopher.”

Whereas previous commentators have treated Montaigne’s *Essays* as embodying a skepticism harking back to classical sources, Ann Hartle offers a fresh account that reveals Montaigne’s thought to be dialectical, transforming skeptical doubt into wonder at the most familiar aspects of life. The essay is the new philosophical form of this dialectical thought, in which the world is presented as radically contingent but where the divine is present in an incarnational and sacramental way.

This major reassessment of a much admired but also much underestimated thinker will interest a wide range of historians of philosophy as well as scholars in comparative literature, French studies, and the history of ideas.

Ann Hartle is Professor of Philosophy at Emory University.
To my son, Robert Wyman Hartle, Jr.
Michel de Montaigne

*Accidental Philosopher*

ANN HARTLE

*Emory University*
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgments</th>
<th>page vii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Note on the Texts</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PART I: A NEW FIGURE**

1. “That Is Where He Got It!”: Montaigne’s Caprices and the Humors of Ancient Philosophy  
   - Skepticism Transformed  
   - Deliberate Philosophy  
   - What Is Accidental Philosophy?  
   11  
   13  
   25  
   33

2. Bending and Stretching the Categories of Traditional Metaphysics  
   - Being and Becoming  
   - Nature  
   - Causality  
   - The Universal and the Particular  
   39  
   40  
   41  
   54  
   58

3. The Essay as Philosophical Form  
   - The Meaning of “Essay”  
   - Purpose  
   - Audience  
   - The Practice of Quotation and the Essence of Thought  
   - The Dialectic of History and Poetry  
   - Daemonic Order  
   62  
   63  
   65  
   72  
   74  
   78  
   83

**PART II: ACCIDENTAL PHILOSOPHY**

4. The Circular Dialectic of Self-Knowledge  
   - Circular Dialectic  
   - The Dialectic of Presumption  
   91  
   91  
   106
Contents

5 "What It Means to Believe"
   Nature and Grace 122
   The Dialectic of Faith and Reason 134
   The Harmony of Faith and Reason 144

6 The Latent Metaphysics of Accidental Philosophy
   Thought Thinking Thought 149
   Accidental Being 157

PART III: THE CHARACTER OF THE ACCIDENTAL PHILOSOPHER

7 Montaigne’s Character: The Great-Souled Man without Pride
   “Truth Said in Laughing” 171
   The Friendship That We Owe Ourselves 176
   Relocating the Great-Souled Man 182
   Openness of Heart and Tongue 188

8 What He Learned in the Nursery: Accidental Moral
   Philosophy and Montaigne’s Reformation 192
   The Accidental Authority of Example 193
   The Excesses of Virtue 194
   Moderating Virtue 199
   Natural Goodness and Innocence 204
   Montaigne’s Reformation 210

9 Christianity and the Limits of Politics
   The Limits of Politics 217
   Two Cities 220
   The Religion of Publicness 226

Notes 241
Works Cited 283
Index 297
Acknowledgments

This study of the philosophical life has kept me mindful of the debt that I owe to Joseph Carpino, Gerald Galgan, Brother Pascal Kelly, Nino Langiulli, and Francis Slade, who first made manifest to me the integrity of the philosophical life and the life of faith. I want to acknowledge that debt here and to express my deepest gratitude for the example and the friendship of each of them.

I am grateful for conversations over the years with Donald Livingston, Carl Page, and Donald Verene, conversations that never failed to shed light for me on the nature of philosophy and the worth of the philosophical life. Each of these friends read an earlier draft of this book and gave me valuable suggestions for improving it. My thanks are also due to Gregory Johnson, whose comments on an earlier draft were very helpful to me. The Research Committee of Emory University provided funding for a leave during which much of my research was done. My thanks are due to Michelle Brady for her assistance with the research, and to Christopher and Susan Anadale for their editorial assistance. I owe a debt greater than I can express to my husband, Robert, for the many conversations that helped me to clarify my project, for the many hours spent in preparing the manuscript, and for his unfailing encouragement.

Note on the Texts