MANAGING EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE AND REWARD

Managing Employee Performance and Reward is the first major text to explore employee performance and reward in a conceptually integrated way. It offers students, managers and general readers alike a detailed and cohesive coverage of these two pivotal and closely connected yet controversial and challenging facets of human resource management (HRM).

The book critically examines current theory and practice in each field and provides a conceptually informed yet practical framework for analysing and addressing the myriad performance and reward issues that confront today's managers and HRM professionals. In doing so, it draws on a wide range of up-to-date research evidence drawn from a wide range of academic disciplines – from organisational psychology and strategic management to critical management studies.

Chapters addressing performance and reward basics and key themes in employee psychology and human resource strategy are followed by multichapter parts dealing with options for performance management practice, for structuring and managing base pay and benefits, and for configuring performance-related rewards for individual employees, work groups and executives. Each part includes a major 'hands-on' case study exercise, complete with model solutions.

Written for a global readership, the book will have particular appeal to those studying and practising people management in the Asia–Pacific region.

JOHN SHIELDS is Associate Professor in the Faculty of Economics and Business at the University of Sydney, where he teaches human resource management. His principal areas of research and publication include reward management, executive remuneration and corporate governance, and business and labour history.

MANAGING EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE AND REWARD

Concepts, Practices, Strategies

John Shields



CAMBRIDGE

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, Vic 3207, Australia

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521820462 © Iohn Shields 2007

First published 2007

Printed in China by Printplus

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

National Library of Australia Cataloguing in Publication data

Shields, John. Managing Employee Performance and Reward: Concepts, Practices, Strategies. Bibliography. Includes index. ISBN-13 978-0-52182-046-2 paperback ISBN-10 0-52182-046-4 paperback 1. Personnel management. I. Title. 658.3

ISBN-13 978-0-52182-046-2 ISBN-10 0-52182-046-4

Reproduction and communication for educational purposes

The Australian *Copyright Act 1968* (the Act) allows a maximum of one chapter or 10% of the pages of this work, whichever is the greater, to be reproduced and/or communicated by any educational institution for its educational purposes provided that the educational institution (or the body that administers it) has given a remuneration notice to Copyright Agency Limited (CAL) under the Act.

For details of the CAL licence for educational institutions contact:

Copyright Agency Limited Level 15, 233 Liverpool Street Sydney NSW 2000 Telephone: (02) 9394 7600 Facsimile: (02) 9394 7601 E-mail: info@copyright.com.au

Reproduction and Communication for other purposes

Except as permitted under the Act (for example a fair dealing for the purposes of study, research, criticism or review) no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, communicated or transmitted in any form or by any means without prior written permission. All inquiries should be made to the publisher at the address above.

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

> For Catherine, Erin and Julia. They know why, only too well.

CONTENTS

Fo	t of figures and tables reword by John Egan knowledgements	<i>page</i> ix xiv xvii
Int	roduction: Setting the scene	1
Pai	rt I The fundamentals	
1	Performance and reward basics	19
2	Working with psychology	37
3	Managing motivation	65
4	Being strategic and getting fit	88
Pai	rt 2 Performance management in action	
5	Managing for results	121
6	Managing behaviour	142
7	Managing competencies	179
8	Performance review and development	200
	Case study. Delivering fairness: Performance assessment at Mercury Couriers	227
Pai	rt 3 Base pay and benefits	
9	Base pay purpose and options	233
10	Base pay structures	249

viii	Contents			
11	Developing position-based base pay systems	269		
12	Developing person-based base pay systems	296		
13	Employee benefits	318		
	Case study. Just rewards: Rethinking base pay and benefits at Court, Case & McGowan, commercial law partners	340		
Par	t 4 Rewarding employee performance			
14	Overview of performance-related rewards	347		
15	Merit pay for individual performance	369		
16	Recognition awards	387		
17	Results-based individual incentives	399		
18	Collective short-term incentives	413		
19	Collective long-term incentives	447		
20	Executive incentives	467		
	Case study. Beyond the hard sell: Performance incentives at Southbank	501		
Par	Part 5 Fitting it all together			
21	System review, change and development	509		
Appendix: Model responses to case studies References Index		540 555 584		
TIM		201		

FIGURES AND TABLES

Figures

0.1	The matrix of human resource processes	page 8
1.1	What is performance?	21
1.2	The performance management cycle	23
1.3	Components of 'total reward'	31
2.1	Hypothesised relationships between work attitudes and work	c .
	behaviour	45
2.2	Behaviour, attitudes and the psychological contract	50
2.3	A model of the psychological contract (employee	
	perspective)	52
2.4	Management-espoused psychological contracts	55
2.5	Equity theory (J. S. Adams)	59
2.6	'Fair pay' perceptions of Australian employees, 1995	62
3.1	Expectancy theory (Vroom)	78
3.2	Expectancy theory (Porter & Lawler)	79
3.3	Goal-setting theory (Latham & Locke)	81
4.1	A 'best fit' model of strategic human resource management	100
4.2	Four key elements of 'best fit' strategic alignment	106
4.3	An integrated typology of competitive strategies	108
4.4	Aligning strategy, structure, culture, espoused contracts and	
	performance requirements	114
5.1	'Smart' goals	130
5.2	Individual goal-setting instrument	131
5.3	The balanced scorecard: four phases of value creation	136
5.4	Example of an individual goal-setting instrument for a retail	
	sales role based on the balanced scorecard	137
6.1	Example of alternation ranking instrument	157

x	Figures	and	tables
~	11841.65	and	000100

6.2	Example of a paired comparison instrument	159
6.3	Forced distribution	160
6.4	Example of a simple graphic rating scale	163
6.5	Example of section of a mixed standards scale	164
6.6	Behavioural anchors	165
6.7	Examples of behaviourally anchored rating scales	166
6.8	Example of a section of a behavioural observation scale	169
6.9	Example of a section of a weighted checklist	170
6.10	Example of a section of a forced choice behavioural	
	assessment instrument	172
6.11	Inadequate grade descriptors	174
6.12	Inadequate guidelines for determining overall rating	175
6.13	Assessing behavioural assessment methods	177
7.1	Performance competencies: the Spencer & Spencer 'iceberg' model	183
7.2	Analysing and modelling differentiating competencies using	
	behaviour event interviewing	188
7.3	Section of a competency-based, behaviourally anchored	
	rating scale for a mid-level manager role	194
8.1	A basic diagnostic tool for analysing individual performance	
	deficits	201
8.2	Possible behavioural responses to receipt of negative	
	feedback	213
8.3	Example of an action planning and performance	
	development instrument	216
8.4	The behavioural coaching model	221
9.1	Options for base pay	238
10.1	Simple pay scale or spine	251
10.2	Narrow grades	254
10.3	From narrow grades to broad grades	257
10.4	Broad bands	259
11.1	Salary survey data presentation: range percentiles and	
	quartiles	272
11.2	Example of salary survey data presentation format: 'senior	
	human resources officer' position	273
11.3	Hay guide chart: 'know-how'	284
11.4	Hay guide chart: 'problem-solving'	286

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-82046-2 - Managing Employee Performance and Reward: Concepts,
Practices, Strategies
John Shields
Frontmatter
More information

	Figures and tables	xi
11.5	Developing job grades using points-factor scores:	
	(1) Plotting point scores and existing pay practice line	291
11.6	Developing job grades using points-factor scores:	
	(2) Developing a new pay policy line	292
11.7	Developing job grades using points-factor scores:	
	(3) Establishing grade boundaries and pay ranges	293
12.1	Skills analysis: skill dimensions for an administrative support	
	role	298
12.2	Sequential skill-based pay progression in a broad-graded	
	structure: a 'stair-step' model for an administrative support	
	role	301
12.3	Non-sequential skill-based pay progression in a broad-	
	graded structure: breadth skill sets for an administrative	
	support role	303
12.4	Competency- <i>based</i> pay progression in a broad-banded	
	structure	312
12.5	Competency-based pay at Glaxo Wellcome	315
12.6	Competency-related pay progression in a broad-banded	
	structure	316
14.1	Performance-related reward options	350
15.1	Compa-ratios	373
15.2	The merit grid	374
15.3	Merit increment curves	375
15.4	Merit increments: the annuity problem	378
15.5	Merit bonuses	381
17.1	Product market context and sales commission configuration:	
	four scenarios	407
18.1	Scanlon Plan gainsharing	424
18.2	Rucker Plan gainsharing	425
18.3	Improshare Plan gainsharing	426
18.4	Business unit multifactor goalsharing	435
19.1	How does a share option plan work?	462
20.1	Average remuneration of US CEOs in Standard & Poors 500	
	firms, 1992–2002	472
20.2	Average percentage composition of total reward of Australian	
	CEOs and other senior executives, 1990–2004	474
20.3	Black-Scholes option pricing formula	483
20.4	Share appreciation rights	486

xii Figures and tables

Framework for performance and reward system development	512
Example of a performance and reward strategy statement	517
The 'human capital management scorecard'	519
Example of a diagnostic employee attitude survey	520
Prescriptive questionnaire	521
	Example of a performance and reward strategy statement The 'human capital management scorecard' Example of a diagnostic employee attitude survey

Tables

1.1	Aims of performance management in Australian private and	1
	public sector organisations, 2003	page 26
3.1	Summary comparison of content theories of motivation	75
5.1	KRAs, KPIs and goals for a production manager role	126
6.1	Incidence and perceived effectiveness of performance	
	assessment methods in the UK, 2004: percentage of	
	respondent organisations using each method	144
6.2	Incidence of performance assessment methods in Australia,	
	2003: percentage of respondent organisations using	
	each method	144
7.1	Commonly applied performance competencies	186
9.1	Incidence of selected types of pay progression management	
	in the UK, by sector and occupational group, 2004:	
	percentage of respondent firms using each type	246
10.1	Incidence of methods for managing base pay structure in th	e
	UK, by sector and occupational group, 2004: percentage of	
	respondent firms using each type	253
10.2	'Best fit' with base pay structures	266
11.1	A simple 'policy capturing' points-factor job evaluation	
	instrument	280
13.1	Employee benefits: percentage of employees covered,	
	Australia, 2004	329
14.1	Incidence of performance pay plans in Canadian and	
	Australian firms, c. 2000: percentage of sample firms using	
	each plan type for non-managerial employees	352
14.2	Incidence of performance pay plans in the UK, by sector,	
	2004: percentage of respondent organisations using each	
	plan type	353

Cambridge University Press	
978-0-521-82046-2 - Managing Employee Performance and Reward: Concepts	,
Practices, Strategies	
John Shields	
Frontmatter	
More information	

15.1	Straight merit increments	371
17.1	Individual payment by results: standard piece rates,	
	differential piece rates and premium bonus plans	403
17.2	Goal-based individual bonuses: simple and sliding	
	scale plans	409
18.1	Matching collective incentives to team type	442
20.1	Long-term incentive plan types and hurdles, Australia	482
21.1	Illustrative review findings and diagnoses	522
21.2	Setting targets for total pre-tax remuneration mix	530
21.3	Aligning strategy, structure, culture and practice	534

Figures and tables xiii

FOREWORD

The design and management of remuneration programs in organisations of varying scale and style have become extremely complex. The influences include prevailing economic conditions, the perceptions of society, competition for scarce skills and changing theories and fashions in the marketplace. The relationships between these often conflicting elements can be confusing and, for many organisations, threatening.

In this book, John Shields teases out the principal frameworks and objectives of remuneration policy, the challenges that organisations face in the context of contemporary theories of remuneration structuring and the alignment to performance. He identifies how they fit into the overall process and how changes at one level affect the process at other levels. This he does with careful and comprehensive referencing of the sources of his proposals and by offering guidance towards understanding the prevailing practices. Useful comparisons are drawn between Australian and overseas practice, particularly that of the United States.

Unlike much that is currently written in this area, this book treats remuneration of executives as part of the overall reward pattern of the whole organisation, addressing the motivational and organisational challenges in formulating pay structures that can apply to individual entities, business groups and teams within them. It provides valuable insights into the effect of different incentive plans when used in concert and how these effects can be used or guarded against depending on prevailing circumstances.

The book addresses the following essential information:

- a clear analysis of the scope of remuneration theory
- useful research findings on market practice in the area
- a structure for the design of remuneration programs in widely differing circumstances.

xiv

Foreword xv

This book is therefore very helpful for students, as it offers a comprehensive theoretical structure thoroughly referenced to a very detailed and rapidly changing body of knowledge, while demonstrating the basic elements contrasted with the distractions supplied by the highly publicised changes of fad and fashion in remuneration structuring.

On the other hand, while the book is not intended to be a practitioner's primer, it provides management and professionals with a sound foundation for the analysis of existing policies and the basis for developing new proposals. It is refreshing that the author compares the prevailing theoretical approaches to remuneration management and provides helpful syntheses of theories that more readily reflect the decision-making dilemmas faced by many managers. It also offers useful sources of reference for more comprehensive consideration of these complex issues.

These insights are particularly useful in the current governance climate. Because of the intense media attention to the remuneration of CEOs and other executives, and the increasing disclosure requirements under legislation, scrutiny of remuneration is widespread. This can place managers, directors and their advisers in an awkward position. The book provides refreshing insights that offer a framework for developing a contemporary viewpoint.

For many decades, executives were proud to work for an agreed annual remuneration. They were expected to provide their best level of performance on the basis of that payment. Payment on the basis of performance was limited to sales staff and agents. Current discourse on remuneration no longer canvasses whether or not executives should have some remuneration at risk; that is taken for granted. This does not acknowledge that organisations may need a range of executive types – some intrepid risk-takers and some more cautious, who are charged with the conservation and protection of company assets.

John Shields' analysis of incentives and performance management provides the background for a clear-minded assessment of a whole range of employer challenges in addressing this vexed issue unencumbered by the influences of current fashion and market pressures. In a period of such fast change, this guidance should be most useful.

From time to time, in most specialities, it is necessary to record the current state of development in the elements being considered. This book is most timely in providing that service for the study of performance and reward management. With comprehensive and contemporary references xvi Foreword

and evidence supporting its propositions and conclusions, this book will provide the basis for a fruitful and ongoing dialogue between academe and management practitioners on performance and reward matters for many years to come.

> John V. Egan Principal, Egan Associates Adjunct Professor, Faculty of Economics and Business, University of Sydney

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Evidently, at his peak, Charles Dickens managed to knock out a book chapter a day, armed only with quill and ink, midnight oil, a marvellous eye for the human condition, and varying quantities of the demon drink. Even in the era of the word processor, authorial output of this quantity and quality is something to which we lesser mortals can only aspire. In one sense, perhaps novelists have an easier task, since they are unencumbered by the burden of facts, figures and footnotes and limited only by the power of their imagination. An academic monograph, however, entails an altogether different purpose and a quite different type of intellectual and emotional journey. In some ways, it is perhaps a more onerous and exacting challenge than that faced by novelists – at least, this has been my experience. Almost a decade has passed since this book was first mooted. In truth, it has been a long, demanding and constantly evolving task. The final product is very different from that first envisaged; and the writer is also a very different person from the one who began the journey all those years ago. However, its writing has also been an immensely rewarding experience - and my abiding hope is that readers will also find the book worthy of its set brief: an integrated examination of the theory and practice of employee performance and reward management.

Texts of this type necessarily have a long gestation; they are also a collective intellectual exercise – and my indebtedness to others is thus inestimable. But let me try to tally the debt nevertheless. My first thanks goes to those who, in their own utterly different ways, first awakened my interest in the matter of employee reward more than a decade ago: Edward Lawler, George Milkovich, Barry Gerhart, Michael Armstrong and Ian Kessler, and, closer to home, David Plowman, Braham Dabschek, Michael Quinlan, Chris Wright, Robin Kramar and John Egan, as well as the remarkable Australian worker– intellectual, the late Jack Hutson. Then there are those who encouraged me

xviii Acknowledgements

to take my neophyte interest further, and to sharpen my conceptual take on the strategic and behavioural dimensions of reward management, none more so than my Canadian friend and mentor, Rick Long. Along the way, my horizons were also broadened by practitioners with a wealth of knowledge in the field, including the doyen of Australian remuneration advisers, John Egan, and the practitioner members of the Australian Human Resources Institute.

This is also a text crafted in the cut and thrust of the classroom. The ideas, the arguments, the interpretations have all had to run the gauntlet of student scrutiny and, in a very real sense, the book is testimony to the dialogue and debate that I have been privileged to enjoy with the students in my human resource management units since the mid-1990s. Some, like my friend and sometime colleague Ben Jelden, have artfully turned the tables, becoming the teacher rather than the taught. Special thanks are also due to Alex Capezio, Vera Lim and my other doctoral students, past and present, for their critical but constructive contribution to my chapter drafts and for awaiting the return of their own chapter drafts with such patience and good humour.

Book-writing, of necessity, is also a most solitary activity and, as such, there is a further debt that I know I shall never be able to repay – that to my family. They have been my rock, even as the months rolled into years, and the magic and laughter of childhood yielded to the exhilaration and promise of youth. They have lost a year of Sundays to this cause – but, to my relief and delight, they have stayed the course.

My thanks, too, to the Australian staff of Cambridge University Press, past and present, for their forbearance and encouragement. To Glen Sheldon, in particular, I own a deep dept of gratitude for showing faith in the project – and in this most troublesome author. I am also eternally grateful for having had the benefit of Cathryn Game's exceptional editing skills. I am in awe of her powers of literary concentration and, more to the point, her ability to conjure up a silk purse from a sow's ear.

Finally, I must thank those organisations that have kindly granted me permission to reproduce their material in the text: the Hay Group Australia, CSi – the Remuneration Specialists Pty Ltd and Egan Associates.