

States, Nations, and Borders  
*The Ethics of Making Boundaries*

*States, Nations, and Borders: The Ethics of Making Boundaries* compares the views and principles of seven prominent ethical traditions on one of the most pressing issues of modern politics – the making and un-making of state and national boundaries. The traditions represented are Judaism, Christianity, Islam, natural law, Confucianism, liberalism and international law. The contributors, each an expert in one of these traditions, show how that tradition addresses the five dominant methods of altering state and national boundaries – conquest, settlement, purchase, inheritance, and secession.

Among the key questions addressed in the book are: Is conquest justified? What is the relationship between land and territory? What, if anything, can justify secession? What counts as settlement, and is it a morally sufficient ground for the acquisition of territory and the creation of boundaries?

*States, Nations, and Borders*, written by a distinguished group of international specialists, is unique in providing both normative and comparative perspectives on a range of troubling issues that will offer readers deep insights into inter-tradition conflict. The book will interest scholars and upper-level undergraduates in philosophy, political science, international relations, and comparative religion.

Allen Buchanan is Professor of Philosophy at Duke University.

Margaret Moore is Associate Professor of Political Studies at Queen's University, Canada.

THE ETHIKON SERIES IN COMPARATIVE ETHICS

Editorial Board

Carole Pateman, *Series Editor*

Brian Barry  
 Robert P. George

Sohail H. Hashmi  
 Will Kymlicka  
 David Miller

Philip Valera  
 Michael Walzer

The Ethikon Series publishes studies on ethical issues of current importance. By bringing scholars representing a diversity of moral viewpoints into structured dialogue, the series aims to broaden the scope of ethical discourse and to identify commonalities and differences between alternative views.

Previous Titles in the Series (not published by Cambridge)

Brian Barry and Robert E. Goodin, eds.  
*Free Movement: Ethical Issues in the Transnational  
 Migration of People and Money*

Chris Brown, ed.  
*Political Restructuring in Europe: Ethical Perspectives*

Terry Nardin, ed.  
*The Ethics of War and Peace: Religious and Secular Perspectives*

David R. Mapel and Terry Nardin, eds.  
*International Society: Diverse Ethical Perspectives*

David Miller and Sohail H. Hashmi, eds.  
*Boundaries and Justice: Diverse Ethical Perspectives*

Simone Chambers and Will Kymlicka, eds.  
*Alternative Conceptions of Civil Society*

Nancy L. Rosenblum and Robert Post, eds.  
*Civil Society and Government*

Jack Miles, foreword, and Sohail Hashmi, ed.  
*Islamic Political Ethics: Civil Society, Pluralism, and Conflict*

Richard Madsen and Tracy B. Strong, eds.  
*The Many and the One:  
 Religious and Secular Perspectives on Ethical Pluralism in the Modern World*

# States, Nations, and Borders

## *The Ethics of Making Boundaries*

Edited by

ALLEN BUCHANAN

*Duke University*

MARGARET MOORE

*Queen's University, Canada*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
 978-0-521-81971-8 — States, Nations and Borders  
 Edited by Allen Buchanan, Margaret Moore  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE  
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521819718](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521819718)

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2003

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2003

Reprinted 2012

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data*

States, nations, and borders : the ethics of making boundaries / edited by Allen  
 Buchanan, Margaret Moore.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-81971-7 – ISBN 0-521-52575-6 (pb.)

I. Boundaries – Moral and ethical aspects. I. Buchanan, Allen E., 1948–

II. Moore, Margaret, Ph.D.

JC323 .S73 2003

172-dc21 2002073554

ISBN 978-0-521-81971-8 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-52575-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>About the Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
1. Introduction: The Making and Unmaking of Boundaries <i>Allen Buchanan and Margaret Moore</i>	1
THE JEWISH TRADITION	
2. Making and Unmaking the Boundaries of Holy Land <i>Menachem Lorberbaum</i>	19
3. Man-Made Boundaries and Man-Made Holiness in the Jewish Tradition <i>Daniel Statman</i>	41
THE CONFUCIAN TRADITION	
4. The Making and Unmaking of Boundaries: A Contemporary Confucian Perspective <i>Daniel Bell</i>	57
5. Borders of Our Minds: Territories, Boundaries, and Power in the Confucian Tradition <i>L.H.M. Ling</i>	86
THE CHRISTIAN TRADITION	
6. The Christian Tradition <i>Anthony Pagden</i>	103
7. Christianity and Territorial Right <i>Oliver O'Donovan</i>	127

THE NATURAL LAW TRADITION	
8. The Making and Unmaking of Boundaries from the Natural Law Perspective <i>Richard Tuck</i>	143
9. Natural Law and the Re-making of Boundaries <i>John Finnis</i>	171
THE ISLAMIC TRADITION	
10. Political Boundaries and Moral Communities: Islamic Perspectives <i>Sohail H. Hashmi</i>	181
11. The Unbounded Law of God and Territorial Boundaries <i>Khaled Abou El Fadl</i>	214
THE LIBERAL TRADITION	
12. The Making and Unmaking of Boundaries: What Liberalism Has to Say <i>Allen Buchanan</i>	231
13. Liberalism and Boundaries: A Response to Allen Buchanan <i>David Miller</i>	262
THE INTERNATIONAL LAW TRADITION	
14. International Law and the Making and Unmaking of Boundaries <i>Andrew Hurrell</i>	275
15. People and Boundaries: An 'Internationalized Public Law' Approach <i>Benedict Kingsbury</i>	298
CONCLUSION	
16. Conclusion and Overview <i>Margaret Moore</i>	317
<i>Index</i>	339

## About the Contributors

**Khaled Abou El Fadl** is the Omar and Azmeralda Alfi Distinguished Fellow in Islamic Law and an Acting Professor of Law at the University of California, Los Angeles, School of Law. His most recent publications include *Rebellion and Violence in Islamic Law* (Cambridge University Press, 2001); *Speaking in God's Name: Islamic Law, Authority, and Women* (Oneworld Press, 2001); and *The Conference of the Books: The Search for Beauty in Islam* (University Press of America, 2001).

**Daniel Bell** is associate professor in the Department of Political and Social Administration at the City University of Hong Kong. He is the author of *Communitarianism and Its Critics*; *East Meets West: Human Rights and Democracy in Asia*; and co-author of *Towards Illiberal Democracy in Pacific Asia*. He also co-edited (with Joanne Bauer) *The East Asian Challenge for Human Rights*. He has been a Fellow of the Center for Human Values, Princeton University, and has also been awarded a fellowship at the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences, Stanford University. He has just completed a co-edited volume entitled *Confucianism for the Modern World*, forthcoming from Cambridge University Press in 2003.

**Allen Buchanan** is professor of public policy and of philosophy at Duke University. He is the author of *Secession: The Morality of Political Divorce* and *Justice, Legitimacy, and Self-Determination* (forthcoming). His special interests include problems related to secession and self-determination, and he has published many journal articles on issues related to these topics.

**John Finnis** is professor of law and legal philosophy at Oxford University; Biolchini Family Professor of Law, University of Notre Dame; a Fellow of the British Academy; and a member of the Holy See's Council for Justice and Peace of the International Theological Commission. He is the author of *Natural Law and Natural Rights*; *Aquinas: Moral, Political, and Legal Theory*;

*Fundamentals of Ethics; Moral Absolutes; and Nuclear Deterrence, Morality, and Realism* (with Joseph Boyle and Germain Grisez). He has also served as special advisor to the House of Commons on patriation of the Canadian constitution.

**Sohail H. Hashmi** is associate professor of international relations at Mount Holyoke College and a member of the editorial board of the Ethikon Series in Comparative Ethics. His research and teaching interests include comparative international ethics and Middle Eastern and South Asian history and politics. He has contributed chapters to a number of books, and is at present completing a book on the Islamic ethics of war and peace. He is also co-editor (with David Miller) of *Boundaries and Justice: Diverse Ethical Perspectives*.

**Andrew Hurrell** is University Lecturer in International Relations and Fellow of Nuffield College. His major interests include international relations theory, with particular reference to international law and institutions, and the international relations of Latin America. Recent publications include co-editor with Louise Fawcett of *Regionalism in World Politics* (Oxford University Press, 1995); co-editor with Ngaire Woods of *Inequality, Globalization and World Politics* (Oxford University Press, 1999); and *Hedley Bull on International Society* (Macmillan, 2000).

**Benedict Kingsbury** is professor of law at New York University Law School. He has been a visiting professor at Harvard Law School, the University of Tokyo, and the University of Padua, and was formerly university lecturer in law at Oxford University. He is the author of *Indigenous Peoples in International Law* (forthcoming), and has published articles on a wide range of topics in the theory and history of international law, including compliance, trade-environment disputes, Grotius, sovereignty, and inter-state arbitration. He is the co-editor of several books, including *United Nations, Divided World: The UN's Roles in International Relations* (with Adam Roberts); *The International Politics of the Environment* (with Andrew Hurrell); *Hugo Grotius and International Relations* (with Hedley Bull and Adam Roberts); and *Indigenous Peoples of Asia* (with R.H. Barnes and Andrew Gray).

**L.H.M. Ling** is affiliated with the New School University as a Core Faculty member in the Graduate Program in International Affairs and is associate editor of the *International Feminist Journal of Politics* (IFJP). She is the author of *Postcolonial International Relations: Conquest and Desire between Asia and the West* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2002). Her journal articles include "Sex Machine: Global Hypermasculinity and Images of the Asian Woman in Modernity" (*Positions: East Asia Cultures Critique*, 72 (2) November 1999: 1–30); "Confucianism with a Liberal Face: The Meaning of Democratic Politics in Postcolonial Taiwan" (co-authored with C.Y. Shih, *Review of Politics* 60 (1) January 1998: 55–82); and "Authoritarianism in the Hypermasculinized State: Hybridity, Patriarchy, and Capitalism in Korea" (co-authored with



Jongwoo Han, *International Studies Quarterly* 42 (1) March 1998: 53–78). She has also contributed chapters to several books.

**Menachem Lorberbaum** is a senior lecturer of Jewish philosophy at Tel Aviv University and a research Fellow at the Shalom Hartman Institute of Jerusalem. He is the author of *Politics and the Limits of Law: Secularizing the Political in Medieval Jewish Thought* (forthcoming, Stanford University Press) and co-editor with Michael Walzer and Noam Zohar of a multi-volume series on *The Jewish Political Tradition* for Yale University Press.

**David Miller** is Official Fellow in social and political theory at Nuffield College, Oxford University, and a member of the editorial board of The Ethikon Series in Comparative Ethics. He is the author of *On Nationality* (Oxford University Press, 1995); *Principles of Social Justice* (Harvard, 1999); and *Citizenship and National Identity* (Polity, 2000). He is also the editor of *Liberty* and co-editor (with Michael Walzer) of *Pluralism, Justice, and Equality*, and (with Sohail Hashmi) of *Boundaries and Justice: Diverse Ethical Perspectives* (Princeton University Press, 2001). His research interests include theories of justice and equality and ideas of nationality and citizenship.

**Margaret Moore** is Queen's National Scholar in the Department of Political Studies, Queen's University, Canada. She is the author of *Foundations of Liberalism* (1993) and *Ethics of Nationalism* (2001) and editor of *National Self-Determination and Secession* (1998). She is interested in issues connected to citizenship theory, distributive justice, and the ethics of nationalism and secession.

**The Rev. Oliver O'Donovan** is Regius Professor of Moral and Pastoral Theology and Canon of Christ Church, Oxford. He is a Fellow of the British Academy. He has served as President of the Society for the Study of Christian Ethics and as a member of the Second Anglican-Roman Catholic International Commission. He is the author of *The Desire of the Nations: Rediscovering the Roots of Political Theology*; *Peace and Certainty: A Theological Essay on Deterrence*; *On the Thirty-Nine Articles: A Conversation with Tudor Christianity*; *Resurrection and the Moral Order: An Outline for Evangelical Ethics*; *Begotten or Made?*; and *The Problem of Self-Love in Saint Augustine*. With Joan Lockwood O'Donovan, he edited *From Irenaeus to Grotius: A Sourcebook in Christian Political Thought*.

**Anthony Pagden** is Professor of Political Science and History at UCLA; formerly the Harry C. Black Professor of History at Johns Hopkins University; University Reader in Modern Intellectual History at Cambridge University; and Fellow of King's College, Cambridge. His most recent publications are *Peoples and Empires: Europeans Overseas from Antiquity to the European Union* (2001), and, as editor, *The Idea of Europe* (2002). He is also the author of *The Fall of Natural Man*; *The American Indian and the Origins of Comparative Ethnology* (1982); *Spanish Imperialism and the Political Imagination* (1990); *Lords of*

*All the World: Ideologies of Empire in Spain, Britain, and France* (1995); and *La Ilustracion y sus enemigos* (2002). His special interests include the thought of Francis of Vitoria, Bartolomé de las Casas, and the Renaissance Scholastics.

**Daniel Statman** is associate professor of philosophy at Bar Ilan University. He is the author of *Moral Dilemmas*, co-author of *Religion and Morality*, and editor of *Moral Luck* and *Virtue Ethics*. A past member of the Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton, his interests include Jewish philosophy and philosophical psychology, as well as moral, political, and legal philosophy.

**Richard Tuck** is professor of the history of political thought at Harvard University and university lecturer in history at Cambridge University. He is the author of *Natural Rights Theories; Hobbes*; and *Philosophy and Government*. His scholarly interests include political authority, natural law, human rights, toleration, and the history of political thought on international politics from Grotius, Hobbes, Pufendorf, Locke, and Vattel to Kant. He is presently engaged in a work on the origins of twentieth-century economic thought.

## Acknowledgments

This book is the result of a dialogue project organized by the Ethikon Institute in collaboration with the Carnegie Council on Ethics and International Affairs. The trustees of the Ethikon Institute join with Philip Valera, president, and Carole Pateman, series editor, in thanking all who contributed to the success of this project.

We are especially grateful to Joan Palevsky, the Carnegie Council, and the Sidney Stern Memorial Trust for major financial support, and to Joel H. Rosenthal, president of the Carnegie Council, for his much-valued collaboration in this effort.

Special thanks are due to Allen Buchanan and Margaret Moore for taking on the important and challenging task of editing this book. They in turn are grateful to Anna Drake and Patti Tamara Lenard for research assistance and help in transforming the various papers into a manuscript ready to be sent to the publisher.

In addition to the authors' contributions, the active participation of other dialogue partners – Chris Brown, Russell Hardin, Susan James, Zarko Puhovski, and Nancy Sherman – greatly enhanced the project and its results.

We would also like to thank the four anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press for their helpful comments on the manuscript; Terence Moore, the commissioning editor at Cambridge University Press, for his support and advice; Ronald Cohen, who carefully edited and improved the text and efficiently guided this book through its various stages; and Rob Swanson for preparing the index.