

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81844-5 - Rethinking the Novel/Film Debate
Kamilla Elliott
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Rethinking the Novel/Film Debate

The relationship between books and film has been one of the key topics of cinema studies. Much of this criticism, however, has been inherited from eighteenth-century debates on poetry and painting and thus has fostered false and limiting paradigms in which words and pictures are opposed. *Rethinking the Novel/Film Debate* historicizes and critiques the central paradigms of this debate. Testing theory against practice and uncovering the hidden agendas, Kamilla Elliott creates new critical models that can be applied to the novel/film issue in an effort to transform the field for future inquiry. In the process, she mounts a major critique of novel theory and film history and theory, demonstrating how rivalries have shaped and falsified each discipline when considered separately.

Kamilla Elliott is Assistant Professor of English and American literature at the University of California, Berkeley, where she teaches literature, film, and Victorian studies.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81844-5 - Rethinking the Novel/Film Debate
Kamilla Elliott
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81844-5 - Rethinking the Novel/Film Debate
Kamilla Elliott
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Rethinking
the
NOVEL/FILM
DEBATE

Kamilla Elliott

University of California, Berkeley



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81844-5 - Rethinking the Novel/Film Debate
Kamilla Elliott
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521818445

© Kamilla Elliott 2003

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-81844-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-10750-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81844-5 - Rethinking the Novel/Film Debate
Kamilla Elliott
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

To George Bluestone,
forerunner and mentor,
with respect and gratitude

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81844-5 - Rethinking the Novel/Film Debate
Kamilla Elliott
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Contents

List of Illustrations	<i>page</i> ix
Acknowledgments	xi
Introduction	1
1 Analogy and Category	9
The Celluloid Laocoön	11
Picturing Words/Wording Pictures	16
Categorizing Analogies/Analogizing Categories	26
2 Prose Pictures	31
Prose Painting/Illustration Commentary	31
Penning the Pencil: Prose Criticism of Illustrations	36
Prose at the Pictures	50
Pictured Prose: The Victorian Pictorial Initial	56
Penciling the Pen: The Pictorial Initials of <i>Vanity Fair</i>	57
Pictured Prose versus Prose Pictures	57
Dramatic Analogies: Character Character	59
Picture Symbols/Symbol Pictures	66
The Ends of the Spectrum	71
3 Film Language	77
Film Pictures as Language	77
Film Words as Literature	83
The Word in Silent Cinema	87
Titling Cinema: Silent Film Intertitle Criticism	87
Cinematizing Titles: Intertitles and Montage Theory	90
Book Illustration as Film	96
Textual Scenes of All Sorts	99
	vii

viii	<i>Contents</i>
4 Cinematic Novels/Literary Cinema	113
Exposing the Cinematic Victorian Novel	118
Cinematizing the Cinematic Novel and/or Literary Cinema	125
5 Literary Cinema and the Form/Content Debate	133
The Psychic Concept of Adaptation	136
The Ventriloquist Concept of Adaptation	143
The Genetic Concept of Adaptation	150
The De(Re)composing Concept of Adaptation	157
The Incarnational Concept of Adaptation	161
The Trumping Concept of Adaptation	173
Conclusion	181
6 Adaptation and Analogy	184
Adaptation and the Literalized Analogy	188
“You Know Very Well You’re Not Real”: Alice in Literaland	189
Adaptation and the Structural Analogy	194
“As Large as Life and Twice as Natural”: Alice in Verbal-to-Visualand	196
Adaptation and Psychoanalytic Analogy	205
“I Don’t Like Belonging to Another Person’s Dream”: Alice in Latentland	206
Adaptation and Looking Glass Analogies	209
From Word and Image to Figure and Image	215
“Why Is a Raven (Film) Like a Writing Desk (Novel)?”: Alice Through the Looking Glass	223
Live-Action Figures: Thomas Hardy’s <i>Tess of the D’Urbervilles</i> (1897) and Roman Polanski’s <i>Tess</i> (1979)	233
Prefatory Conclusions/Concluding Prefaces	241
Notes	245
Works Cited	277
Index	295

List of Illustrations

1	<i>Vanity Fair</i> 's vignette of Miss Swartz.	page 21
2	<i>Vanity Fair</i> 's full-page plate of Miss Swartz.	22
3	<i>Vanity Fair</i> 's vignette of Jones reading <i>Vanity Fair</i> at his club.	25
4	George Cruikshank's 1827 frontispiece to <i>Facetiae and Miscellanies</i> .	35
5	George Du Maurier's 1890 illustration, "An Edition de Luxe!"	36
6	<i>Vanity Fair</i> 's vignette of the Steyne children.	44
7	<i>Vanity Fair</i> 's plate, "Becky's Second Appearance in the Character of Clytemnestra"	45
8	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 25's pictorial initial.	58
9	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 26's pictorial initial.	58
10	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 3's pictorial initial.	60
11	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 60's pictorial initial.	60
12	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 37's pictorial initial.	61
13	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 9's pictorial initial.	62
14	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 39's pictorial initial.	63
15	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 44's pictorial initial.	66
16	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 64's pictorial initial.	67
17	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 20's pictorial initial.	67
18	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 27's pictorial initial.	68
19	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 1's pictorial initial.	68
20	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 12's pictorial initial.	69
21	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 41's pictorial initial.	69
22	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 23's pictorial initial.	71
23	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 13's pictorial initial.	74
		ix

24	<i>Vanity Fair</i> 's vignette of the Pinkerton sisters, Chapter 1.	98
25	<i>Vanity Fair</i> 's full-page plate, "Rebecca's Farewell," Chapter 1.	99
26	<i>Vanity Fair</i> : Chapter 1's endpiece.	100
27	Becky's intrigue with the Marquis of Steyne, from Vitagraph's <i>Vanity Fair</i> , 1911.	103
28	Heathcliff (Laurence Olivier) and Catherine (Merle Oberon), MGM's <i>Wuthering Heights</i> , 1939.	146
29	Heathcliff (Timothy Dalton) terrorizing servants, AIP's <i>Wuthering Heights</i> , 1970.	159
30	Alejandro (Jorge Mistral) and Catalina (Irasema Dilian), Luis Buñuel's <i>Abismos de Pasión</i> , Plexus Films 1953.	171
31	Onimaru (Yusaku Matsuda) and Kinu (Yuko Tanaka), <i>Arashi ga oka</i> , 1988.	173
32	The banquet scene, Paramount's <i>Alice in Wonderland</i> , 1933.	191
33	The mad tea party, Jan Švankmajer's <i>Alice</i> , Condor Films, 1988.	200
34	John Tenniel, the Mock Turtle, <i>Alice in Wonderland</i> , Chapter 9.	214
35	Alice and the Caterpillar, Walt Disney's <i>Alice in Wonderland</i> , 1951, © Disney Enterprises, Inc.	224
36	Lewis Carroll's Mouse's Tail/Tale, <i>Alice in Wonderland</i> , Chapter 3.	228
37	The Chase, Tess (Natassia Kinski) and Alec (Leigh Lawson), Roman Polanski's <i>Tess</i> , Renn Productions, 1979.	237
38	The Aftermath, Tess (Natassia Kinski), Roman Polanski's <i>Tess</i> , Renn Productions, 1979.	238

Acknowledgments

A book is never the production of a single person, least of all an academic book. *Rethinking the Novel/Film Debate* builds on the work of many scholars before me and benefits from the astute input of many insightful readers. Foremost of these, Elizabeth Abel, Seymour Chatman, and Joss Marsh read more than one version of the manuscript and offered invaluable feedback as well as staunch personal support. Katie Snyder, Robert Stam, and John Glavin offered excellent feedback on an early draft of the manuscript, as did several anonymous reviewers who must, therefore, remain unnamed. Mitch Breitweiser has been a mentor in every sense of the word, offering astute comments on portions of the manuscript as well as advice on its broader presentation. Russell Merritt, Colleen Lye, Celeste Langan, Catherine Gallagher, and Sharon Marcus gave indispensable input on single chapters. Ryan McDermott lent meticulous proofreading skills.

Elaine Scarry, Philip Fisher, and George Bluestone supported and informed my research in its earlier dissertation stages, but their hand and influence remain. Scarry blended astute insights with immaculate attention to detail, suggesting the most rigorous of revisions with the most velvet of gloves, and providing constant encouragement along with ever higher goals. Scarry subsequently lent polishing touches to this book in its final stages of development. Fisher offered early challenges and focus. And Bluestone, whose book *Novels Into Film* (1957) marks the starting point of novel and film studies proper, was enormously generous and supportive even from retirement.

I am further indebted to the film archivists and technical staff of the Motion Picture Reading Room at the Library of Congress (Madeleine Matz, Rosemary Hanes, and Joe Balian) and of the National Film Archive at the British Film Institute in London (Ros Cranston, Alison Strauss,

and Kathleen Dickson), whose professionalism made research a pleasure. My thanks too to the Bancroft Library at the University of California, Berkeley, the Margaret Herrick Library at the Academy of Motion Picture Arts and Sciences, the British Film Institute (especially Nina Harding), and to Patrick Fay at University Copy in Berkeley, California, for provision of and assistance with the illustrations. Without the assistance of dissertation grants from Harvard University and the Whiting Foundation and from the University of California's Committee on Research, I would never have been able to amass the base of archival research that underlies this project or to make my arguments with such confidence in their wider applicability. And without my research assistants, Arun Nevader, Marguerite Nguyen, Joe Nugent, and Nicole Asaro, this book would have been at least a year longer in the making.

I am also indebted to friends and family for their unflagging encouragement, support, and patience. Joss Marsh has been a stalwart friend as well as a mentor and collaborator. Sharon Doublet-Thompson offered perspective and unfailing humor at even the most dismaying twists and turns of the process. My brother, Kenton Sparks, provided financial assistance for additional research trips and earthquake insurance for the manuscript, receiving and storing countless e-mail versions of it far from the Hayward fault. Other family members and friends too numerous to name provided a constant stream of encouragement and support. Most of all, I wish to thank my children, Lucas and Christina Denman, for their unwavering confidence in my ability to complete this book, which spans a good part of their lifetimes, and for their blithe faith in its contents without reading a single word of it.