

THE CULTURES WITHIN ANCIENT GREEK CULTURE

The Cultures within Ancient Greek Culture challenges the conventional perception of ancient Greece as the paradigm for unified models of culture. It offers an alternative view of archaic and classical Greece, one in which the contact, conflict, and collaboration of a variety of subcultures combine to comprise what we now understand as "greekness." This volume argues for the recognition and analysis of cultural contact within Greece, focusing on the micromechanics of cultural exchange, the permeability of cultural boundaries, and the significance of Delphi's geographically marginal, yet symbolically central location as an "internal contact zone." Through attention to everyday practices and professions, the essays reveal important new ways of conceiving of diversity within Greek culture, ranging from the non-elite culture of athletic trainers to the competing musical cultures at work in fifth-century Athens.

Carol Dougherty is Professor of Classical Studies at Wellesley College. She is the author of *The Raft of Odysseus: The Ethnographic Imagination of Homer's Odyssey*, as well as articles on Greek colonial discourse and other related topics.

Leslie Kurke is Professor of Classics and Comparative Literature at the University of California, Berkeley. She is the author of *The Traffic of Praise: Pindar and the Poetics of Social Economy* and *Coins, Bodies, Games, and Gold: The Politics of Meaning in Archaic Greece*, as well as numerous articles on archaic Greek poetry, Herodotus, and cultural history.





The Cultures within Ancient Greek Culture

Contact, Conflict, Collaboration



EDITED BY

CAROL DOUGHERTY
Wellesley College

LESLIE KURKE
University of California, Berkeley





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521815666

© Cambridge University Press 2003

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

The cultures within ancient Greek culture: contact, conflict, collaboration / edited by

Carol Dougherty, Leslie Kurke.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-81566-5

Ethnicity-Greece.
 Pluralism (Social sciences)-Greece.
 Greece-Civilization-To 146 B.C.

I. Dougherty, Carol. II. Kurke, Leslie.

DF135 .C85 2003 938 - dc21 2002034989

ISBN 978-0-521-81566-6 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-28519-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	List of Illustrations	page vii
	List of Contributors	ix
	Acknowledgments	xi
	Abbreviations	xiii
1	Introduction: The Cultures within Greek Culture Carol Dougherty and Leslie Kurke	1
	SECTION I: THE CIRCULATION OF CULTURES	
2	"Culture" or "Cultures"? Hellenism in the	
	LATE SIXTH CENTURY	23
	Jonathan M. Hall	
3	THE ARISTONOTHOS KRATER: COMPETING STORIES OF	
	CONFLICT AND COLLABORATION	35
	Carol Dougherty	
4	Hybridity and the Cultures within Greek Culture Carla Antonaccio	57
	SECTION II: NEGOTIATION AND CONFLICT AT THE MARGINS: THE CASE OF DELPHI	
5	Aesop and the Contestation of Delphic Authority Leslie Kurke	77
6	Aristocratic Victory Memorials and the	
	Absent Charioteer	101
	Nigel Nicholson	
7	Framing the Gift: The Siphnian Treasury at Delphi	
	AND THE POLITICS OF PUBLIC ART	129
	Richard T. Neer	

v



Contents

SECTION III: ATHENS: CONVERGENCES AND DIVERSITY WITHIN THE POLIS

8	THE PIPES ARE BRAWLING: CONCEPTUALIZING MUSICAL PERFORMANCE IN ATHENS Richard P. Martin	153
9	The Sound of Cultural Conflict: Kritias and the Culture of <i>Mousikê</i> in Athens Peter Wilson	181
10	Becoming the "Other": Attitudes and Practices at Attic Cemeteries Katarzyna Hagemajer Allen	207
11	Postscript: Culture, Thin Coherence, and the Persistence of Politics Josiah Ober	237
	Bibliography Index	257 283



Illustrations

1.	Sea battle. Aristonothos Krater from Caere (side A),	
	са. 650 в.с.е.	page 37
2.	Sea battle. Fibula from Sparta, 8th century B.C.E.	38
3.	Blinding of Polyphemus. Aristonothos Krater from	
	Caere (side B), ca. 650 B.C.E.	39
4.	Syracuse, Giardino Spagna, tomb 121. Syracuse, Museo	
	Archeologico Regionale "Paolo Orsi."	68
5.	Corinth, North Cemetery, tomb 299.	69
6.	Corinth, North Cemetery, tomb 300.	69
7.	Athens, Kerameikos, tomb hS 120.	70
8.	Athens, Kerameikos, tomb hS 204.	70
9.	Four-horse chariot and charioteer being greeted by Athena.	
	Neck amphora from South Italy (side A), ca. 480.	106
10.	Four-horse chariot with charioteer and prize inscription.	
	Panathenaic amphora from Orvieto (side B), mid-sixth century.	108
11.	Athena Polias with the victor in the chariot race. Panathenaic	
	amphora from Orvieto (side A), mid-sixth century.	109
12.	View of the Siphnian Treasury from the Northeast, coming	
	up the Sacred Way (restored).	130
13.	The East pediment and frieze of the Siphnian Treasury, partially	
	restored (the lacunae in the pediment and the frieze are retained).	134
14.	The Struggle for the Tripod: central group of the pediment of the	
	Siphnian Treasury at Delphi, ca. 525.	135
15.	Aeneas, Memnon, Antilokhos, Achilles. The East frieze of the	
	Siphnian Treasury at Delphi (detail), ca. 525.	138
16.	The North frieze Siphnian Treasury, partially restored	
	(the lacunae in the frieze are retained).	141
17.	Gigantomachy: Themis' lions attack a giant; Apollo and Artemis	
	fight a phalanx of Giants, while one Giant flees and another	
	lies dead. The North frieze of the Siphnian Treasury at	
	Delphi (detail), ca. 525.	142
18.	Satyr playing aulos. Attic black-figure cup (detail), ca. 520 B.C.E.	154

 v_{11}^{\dots}



ILLUSTRATIONS

19.	Goose listening to aulos. Attic black-figure amphora, ca. 560 B.C.E.	167
20.	Singing at the symposium to aulos accompaniment. Attic red-figure	
	krater attributed to Euphronios, ca. 510-500.	168
21.	Sacrifice accompanied by <i>aulos</i> and lyre. Votive plaque from	
	Pitsa, ca. 540.	170
22.	Broad-jumper accompanied by aulos. Attic red-figure	
	cup by Douris, ca. 480.	171
23.	Auletris and krotala dancer. Attic red-figure oinochoe,	
	attributed to the Brygos Painter, first quarter of the fifth century.	172
24.	Peribolos of Dionysios of Kollytos, reconstruction.	212
25.	Grave stele from Sinope, ca. 450 B.C.E.	217
26.	Tomb of Darius I at Naqsh-i Rustam, view from the southeast of	
	the central façade and upper main panel, ca. 486 B.C.E.	218
27.	Naiskos of the family of Alexos from Sounion, fourth century B.C.E.	
	Athens, National Archaeological Museum 2574 + 2584.	222
28.	The Nereid Monument from Xanthos, East façade, ca. 380 B.C.E.	223
29.	Attic red-figure dinoid volute krater and stand by the Meleager	
	Painter, detail of stand decoration, side A.	230



Contributors

Carla Antonaccio is Professor of Classical Studies and Archaeology at Wesleyan University and co-director of the Morgantina project. Her research interests include all aspects of Iron Age and early Archaic Greece, and the archaeology of colonization and ethnicity.

Carol Dougherty is Professor of Classical Studies at Wellesley College. She is the author of *The Poetics of Colonization: From City to Text in Archaic Greece* (1993) and *The Raft of Odysseus: The Ethnographic Imagination of Homer's Odyssey* (2001). She also coedited with Leslie Kurke *Cultural Poetics in Archaic Greece: Cult, Performance, Politics.* She is currently working on issues of culture and politics in early fifthcentury Athens.

Katarzyna Hagemajer Allen is Assistant Professor in the Department of Classics at the University of Wisconsin–Madison. Her research focuses on the interactions between the Greeks and non–Greeks, and the problems of ethnic and cultural identity formation. She is currently preparing her dissertation for publication, in which she examines material, epigraphical and literary evidence that complicates the thesis of consistently negative evaluation of the barbarian in fourth–century Greece.

Jonathan M. Hall is Professor in the Departments of History and Classical Languages and Literatures, the Committee on the Ancient Mediterranean World and the College at the University of Chicago. He is the author of *Ethnic Identity in Greek Antiquity* (1997) and *Hellenicity: Between Ethnicity and Culture* (2002) as well as several articles on the sociocultural history of the Greek World.

Leslie Kurke is Professor of Classics and Comparative Literature at the University of California, Berkeley. She is the author of *The Traffic in Praise: Pindar and the Poetics of Social Economy* (1991) and *Coins, Bodies, Games, and Gold: The Politics of Meaning in Archaic Greece* (1999); with Carol Dougherty, she is coeditor of *Cultural Poetics in Archaic Greece: Cult, Performance, Politics* (1993). She is currently working



Contributors

on the figure of Aesop as a form of mediation between high and popular cultures in ancient Greece.

Richard P. Martin holds the Antony and Isabelle Raubitschek Chair of Classics at Stanford University. He is the author of *Healing, Sacrifice and Battle: Amechania and Related Concepts in Early Greek Poetry* (1983) and of *The Language of Heroes: Speech and Performance in the Iliad* (1989) as well as articles on Greek and Latin poetry. Among his other publications are a revised and annotated edition of *Bulfinch's Mythology* (HarperCollins, 1991) and a retelling of Greek myths (Penguin 2002). His current work includes a book on rhapsodia, one on the representation of performance in Greek mythopoetics, and a screenplay of the *Iliad*.

Richard T. Neer is Associate Professor of Art History and serves on the Committee on the Ancient Mediterranean World at the University of Chicago. He is the author of Corpus Vasorum Antiquorum: Malibu, The J. Paul Getty Museum, fascicule 7 (1997); Style and Politics in Athenian Vase-Painting: The Craft of Democracy, circa 530–460 B.C.E. (2002); and articles on Greek painting and sculpture, French classicism, and theories of style.

Nigel Nicholson is Associate Professor of Classics and Humanities at Reed College. He is the author of various articles on archaic Greek culture, including "Pindar Ne. 4.57–8 and the Arts of Poets, Trainers and Wrestlers," Arethusa 34 (2001): 31–59, and "Pederastic Poets and Adult Patrons in Late Archaic Lyric," CW 93 (2000): 235–59, and is currently completing a book on the representation of charioteers and athletic trainers in archaic Greek victory memorials.

Josiah Ober is David Magie Professor of Classics with joint appointment in the University Center for Human Values at Princeton University. His books include Mass and Elite in Democratic Athens (1989), The Athenian Revolution (1996), Political Dissent in Democratic Athens: Intellectual Critics of Popular Rule (1998), and Dêmokratia: A Conversation on Democracies, Ancient and Modern (1996; co-edited with Charles Hedrick). He is currently writing a book on "Promiscuous Knowledge," a study of the interrelationships between politics, organizational performance, and the circulation of social and technical knowledge in classical Athens.

Peter Wilson is a Lecturer in the University of Oxford and Fellow in Classics of New College, Oxford. His research interests lie in the culture of ancient Greece, in particular the history and sociology of the Greek theater, music and poetry. His first book, *The Athenian Institution of the Khoregia: the Chorus, the City and the Stage*, was published in 2000.



Acknowledgments

This volume of essays is based on a conference held at Wellesley College in November 2000, entitled "The Cultures within Greek Culture: Contact, Conflict, Collaboration." Ten years earlier, in October of 1990, we had organized a conference at Wellesley which became the volume *Cultural Poetics in Archaic Greece: Cult, Performance, Politics* (Cambridge University Press, 1993). The current volume is intended as a follow-up to the first Wellesley Conference collection, extending our methodology while focusing on a cluster of issues surrounding "the cultures within Greek culture." The papers at this conference set out to explore the diverse and competing forces at work within Greek culture itself. We wanted thereby to make a theoretically informed intervention into the discussion of ancient multiculturalism, as well as assessing where we are methodologically ten years later.

The conference itself was strikingly successful, with speakers offering a range of diverse yet complementary approaches to the issue of "difference within" and generating a day's worth of lively and heated conversations. For that success, we would like to thank the conference audience and the original conference participants: Danielle Allen, Carla Antonaccio, Karen Bassi, Jonathan Hall, Richard P. Martin, Ian Morris, and Richard Neer. Thanks also to all those at Wellesley who first made the conference possible and then made it such a memorable event: the faculty members of the Classical Studies Department who participated in the conference, Randall Collaizi, Mary Lefkowitz, Miranda Marvin, Brendon Reay, and Ray Starr; students Sarah Barton, Alex Dunne-Bryant, Amanda Freeman, Natalie Ribelet, Dawne Thorne, and Leslie Tu; and to Patricia Bois for all her logistical help and local savvy. Thanks also to individuals whose contribution was enormous: Joel Krieger, Selwyn Cudjoe, and for his genial participation as a member of the audience and unofficial conference gadfly, thanks to Martin Bernal. We would like to thank Wellesley College for its generous funding for the conference, especially the Edwards Fund in Special Events and the Horton Fund in Classical Studies.

For the finished volume, we are grateful to those contributors who were willing to jump in at a later stage: Katarzyna Hagermajer Allen, Nigel



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Nicholson, Josh Ober, and Peter Wilson (and thanks to S. Sara Monoson for her stimulating engagement at that point). For assisting the long metamorphosis from conference to volume, we are particularly grateful to Beatrice Rehl (who always believed in us), Richard Neer (whose advice and technical assistance on pictures were invaluable), and Deborah Kamen (whose patience, good humor, and meticulous attention never flagged). Thanks also to Boris Maslov for invaluable last-minute bibliographic assistance and for indexing. For reading and criticizing earlier drafts of the Introduction, thanks to Joel Krieger, Ian Morris, and Josh Ober.

Carol Dougherty Leslie Kurke



ABBREVIATIONS

Ancient Authors and Works

Aelian VH Varia Historia
Aes. Aeschylus
Agam. Agamemnon
Eum. Eumenides
Pers. Persians

Prom. Bound Prometheus Bound

Suppl. Suppliants

APPalatine AnthologyApollod.ApollodorusAr.AristotleDe An.De Anima

Pol.

NE Nicomachean Ethics

Politics

Rhet. Rhetoric
[Ar.] ps.-Aristotle
Ath. Pol. Athênaiôn Politeia
Arist. Aristophanes

Thesmo. Thesmophoriazousai

Athen. Athenaeus
Ba. Bacchylides
Cicero Verr. Verrines

Com. Adespot. Comica Adespota
Dem. Demosthenes
D.S. Diodorus Siculus

Dion. Hal. Dionysius of Halicarnassus Etym. Gen. Etymologicum Genuinum

Eur. Euripides *Heracl. Heraclidae*

IA Iphigeneia in Aulis

Hdt. Herodotus

X111



ABBREVIATIONS

Hes. Hesiod Th.Theogony WDWorks and Days Him. Or. Himerius, Orationes Hom. Homer Il. Iliad Od. Odyssey Isok. Isokrates Lykourg. Lykourgos Lys. Lysias Paus. Pausanias Pi. Pindar Is. Isthmian Nem. Nemean Ol. Olympian Pyth. Pythian Pl. Plato Rep. Republic Symp. Symposium Tht. Theaetetus Tim. Timaeus [Pl.] Ps.-Plato Ep.Epistulae Pliny NH Natural History Plut. Plutarch Life of Agesilaus Ages. Alc. Life of Alcibiades Alex.Life of Alexander Lyc. Life of Lycurgus Mor. Moralia Nic. Life of Nicias Life of Pericles Per. Ps.-Plut. Ps.-Plutarch Schol. Scholiast Sim. Simonides Soph. Sophocles OTOedipus Tyrannos Str. Strabo Thuc. Thucydides Tzetzes Chil. Chiliades Virgil Aen. Aeneid Xen. Xenophon

xiv



AA

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-81566-6 - The Cultures within Ancient Greek Culture: Contact, Conflict, Collaboration Edited by Carol Dougherty and Leslie Kurke Frontmatter More information

ABBREVIATIONS

Ages. Agesilaus Cyr. Cyropaedia Hell. Hellenica

Editions, Reference Works, and Journals

Archäologischer Anzeiger

АА	Archaologischer Anzeiger
AAA	Athens Annuals of Archaeology
ABV	J. D. Beazley. 1956. Attic Black-Figure Vase-Painters. Oxford
$Add.^2$	T. H. Carpenter, T. Mannack, and M. Mendonça, eds. 1989.
	Beazley Addenda. 2nd ed. Oxford
AION	Annali dell' Istituto universitario orientale di Napoli
AJA	American Journal of Archaeology
AJP	American Journal of Philology
AK	Antike Kunst
AM	Mitteilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts,
	Athenische Abteilung
ARV^2	J. D. Beazley. 1963. Attic Red-Figure Vase-Painters.
	2nd ed. Oxford
BCH	Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique
BICS	Bulletin of the Institute of Classical Studies of the
	University of London
BSA	The Annual of the British School at Athens
CA	Classical Antiquity
CAT	C. W. Clairmont. 1993. Classical Attic Tombstones.
	Kilchberg
CB	L. Caskey and J. D. Beazley. 1931. Attic Vase Paintings in the
	Museum of Fine Arts, Boston. London
CID	Corpus des inscriptions de Delphes
CP	Classical Philology
CQ	Classical Quarterly
DK	H. Diels and W. Kranz, eds. 1966-7. Die Fragmente der
	Vorsokratiker. 12th ed. Berlin
FGrH	F. Jacoby, ed. 1954-69. Die Fragmente der griechischen
	Historiker. Leiden
Gentili-Prato	B. Gentili and C. Prato. 1979. Poetarum elegiacorum
	testimonia et fragmenta. Leipzig
GRBS	Greek, Roman and Byzantine Studies
Greene	W. C. Greene, ed. 1938. Scholia Platonica. Haverford, Pa.
IG	Inscriptiones Graecae
JHS	Journal of Hellenic Studies



ABBREVIATIONS

K.-A. R. Kassel and C. Austin, eds. 1983–. Poetae

Comici Graeci. Berlin

Kock T. Kock, ed. 1880–8. Comicorum Atticorum

Fragmenta. 3 vols. Leipzig

Leutsch-Schneidewin E. L. Leutsch and F. G. Schneidewin. 1958.

Corpus paroemiographorum graecorum. Hildesheim

LIMC 1991–97. Lexicon Iconographicum

Mythologiae Classicae. Munich

LSJ⁹ H. G. Liddell, R. Scott, and H. S. Jones. 1968.

A Greek-English Lexicon. 9th ed., with Supplement.

Oxford

Merkelbach-West R. Merkelbach and M. L. West. 1967. Fragmenta

Hesiodea. Oxford

OGI W. Dittenberger, ed. 1903–5. Orientis Graeci

Inscriptiones Selectae. Leipzig

Ostr. U. Wilcken. 1899. Griechische Ostraka aus Ägypten

und Nubien. Leipzig and Berlin

P.Lond. Greek Papyri in the British Museum

P.Oxy. The Oxyrhynchus Papryi P.Teb. The Tebtunis Papyri

Para J. D. Beazley, Paralipomena: Additions to Attic

Black-Figure Vase-Painters and to Attic Red-Figure

Vase-Painters. 2nd ed. Oxford

Perry Test. B. E. Perry. 1952. Aesopica. Vol. 1. Urbana

Pfeiffer R. Pfeiffer, ed. 1949–53. Callimachus. 2 vols. Oxford PMG D. L. Page, ed. 1962. Poetae Melici Graeci. Oxford PSI Papiri greci e latini (Pubblicazioni della Società

italiana per la ricerca dei papiri greci e latini in

Egitto)

QUCC Quaderni Urbinati di Cultura classica

Rose V. Rose, ed. 1966. Aristoteles fragmenta. Stuttgart

SEG Supplementum Epigraphicum Graecum

S-M B. Snell and H. Maehler, eds. 1975. Pindarus. Pars II.

Fragmenta. Indices. 4th ed. Leipzig

SOD W. W. Fortenbaugh and E. Schütrumpf. 1999.

Demetrius of Phalerum: Text, Translation and Discussion.

New Brunswick

TAPA Transactions of the American Philological Association
TrGF B. Snell, ed. 1971. Tragicorum Graecorum Fragmenta.

Vol. 1. Göttingen, or R. Kannicht and B. Snell, eds.

1981. Tragicorum Graecorum Fragmenta. Vol. 2.

Göttingen

Wehrli F. Wehrli, ed. 1967. Die Schule des Aristoteles:

Texte und Kommentar. Basel

xvi



ABBREVIATIONS

West M. L. West, ed. 1989–92. Iambi et Elegi Graeci.

2 vols. 2d ed. Oxford

Westerink L. G. Westerink, ed. 1976-77. The Greek Commentaries on

Plato's Phaedo. Amsterdam and Oxford

ZPE Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik





THE CULTURES WITHIN ANCIENT GREEK CULTURE