

BELLY AND BODY IN THE PAULINE EPISTLES

The belly is today a matter of much concern. Modern cultures, particularly in the West, have developed means to cultivate this part of the body: corsets, exercises, revealing fashions. In this compelling exploration of the 'belly' motif, Karl Olav Sandnes asks whether St Paul might be addressing a culture in which the stomach is similarly high on the agenda. The result is a surprising new insight into this writings.

Paul twice mentions the enigmatic phrase 'belly-worship' (Phil. 3; Rom. 16). The proper context for these texts is the moral philosophy debate about mastering the desires, and the reputation of Epicurus' philosophy as promoting indulgence. The belly became a catchword for a life controlled by pleasures. Belly-worship was not only pejorative rhetoric, but developed from Paul's conviction that the body was destined to a future with Christ.

KARL OLAV SANDNES is Professor in New Testament Theology at The Norwegian Lutheran School of Theology, Oslo. He has published two books in English: *Paul – One of the Prophets? A Contribution to the Apostle's Self-Understanding* (1991), and *A New Family: Conversion and Ecclesiology in the Early Church with Cross-Cultural Comparisons* (1994).



SOCIETY FOR NEW TESTAMENT STUDIES

MONOGRAPH SERIES

General Editor: Richard Bauckham

120

BELLY AND BODY IN THE PAULINE EPISTLES



Belly and Body in the Pauline Epistles

KARL OLAV SANDNES

The Norwegian Lutheran School of Theology, Oslo





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Karl Olav Sandnes 2002

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Times 10/12 pt System LATEX 2_E [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 81535 5 hardback



CONTENTS

Preface

	Prefa	ace	<i>page</i> xi
	Abbr	reviations	xiii
Part 1	Prole	egomena	
1	Intro	oduction, previous solutions, method and	
	Paul	ine context	4
	1.0	Introduction	4
	1.1	Bible translations	5
	1.2	The scholarly debate	7
	1.3	Methodological considerations	11
	1.4	Belly and body – the Pauline context of the study	14
Part 2	The	Graeco-Roman belly	
2	The	belly as a sign – ancient physiognomics	24
	2.0	Introduction	24
	2.1	The stomach as a sign	27
	2.2	Summary	34
3	The	belly in ancient moral philosophy	35
		Introduction	35
		Euripides (born probably in the 480s BC)	37
		Plato (c. 429–347 BC)	39
		Xenophon (born around 430 BC)	42
		Aristotle (384–322 BC)	45
		Dio Chrysostom (AD c. 40/50–110)	46
		Musonius Rufus (AD 30–AD 101/102)	47
	3.7	Epictetus (mid first century to second century AD)	49
	3.8	Plutarch (AD c. 50–c. 120)	52
		Athenaeus (flourished c. AD 200)	54
		Summary	57
			vii



viii	List of contents	
4	Ancient critique of Epicureanism	61
	4.0 Epicurus – the popularity and reputation of a doctrine	61
	4.1 Cicero	65
	4.2 Seneca	71
	4.3 Plutarch	74
	4.4 Summary	77
5	Banquets – opportunities for the belly	79
	5.0 Introduction	79
	5.1 Parties for pleasure	80
	5.2 Seneca – the moral philosopher	83
	5.3 Horace and Juvenal – two Roman satirists	86
	5.4 Athenaeus and Alciphron	89
	5.5 Summary	92
Part 3	The appropriated belly	
6	The belly-topos in Jewish-Hellenistic sources	97
	6.1 Sir. 23:6	97
	6.2 <i>T. Rub.</i> 2:1–3:8	97
	6.3 3 Macc. 7:10–11	98
	6.4 4 Maccabees	101
	6.5 Aristeas to Philocrates 140–1	104
	6.6 T. Mos. 7:2–4	105
	6.7 Cairo Geniza Wisdom	106
7	The belly in Philo's writings	108
	7.0 Introduction	108
	7.1 Anthropology	109
	7.2 The 'geography' of the belly	112
	7.3 The serpent crawling on its belly	113
	7.4 Esau selling his birthright for the sake of his belly	117
	7.5 Joseph and the servants of Pharaoh7.6 Jewish customs as means of controlling	121
	7.6 Jewish customs as means of controlling the stomach	123
	7.7 Fasts and Sabbaths	126
	7.8 Food laws	128
	7.9 Conversion – the safest way to rule the belly	130
	7.10 Summary	131
Part 4	Belly-worship and body according to Paul	
8	The lifestyle of citizens of the heavenly	
	politeuma – Phil. 3:17–21	136
	8.0 Introduction	136



	List o	of contents	ix
	8.1	'Stand firm' and the rhetoric of examples	138
	8.2	'Whose god is the belly'	141
	8.3	Opponents?	155
	8.4	Belly-worship and body in Philippians	159
	8.5	Summary	162
9		ring the belly' as kinship with Satan – Rom.	
	16:17		165
	9.0	Introduction	165
	9.1	Warning against deceivers	165
	9.2	Worshipping the belly – Gen. 3:15, Satan and flattery	169
	9.3	Why call the adversaries belly-worshippers?	172
	9.4 9.5	'Serving the belly' and body in Romans Summary	175 179
40		•	
10		Corinthian belly	181
	10.0	Introduction	181
	10.1	1 Cor. 15:32: Epicurean lifestyle versus faith in resurrection	181
	10.2	1 Cor. 11:17–34: the Lord's Supper or stuffing one's own stomach?	187
	10.3	1 Cor. 6:12-20: the Christian faith has implications	
		for stomach and sex	191
	10.4	1 Cor. 10:7 in context: the belly – a tempting force in	100
		Corinth as in the wilderness	199
	10.5	Belly and body in 1 Corinthians	212
	10.6	Summary	215
Part 5	The e	earliest expositors of Paul	
11	The b	belly-dicta of Paul in Patristic literature	219
	11.1	Clement of Alexandria (c. 150-c. 215)	219
	11.2	Tertullian (c. 160–c. 225)	223
	11.3	Origen (c. 185–c. 254)	226
	11.4	Cyprian (d. 258)	230
	11.5	Novatian (d. 257–8)	232
	11.6	Methodius of Olympus (d. c. 311)	234
	11.7	Ambrosiaster (c. 300)	235
	11.8	Pelagius (late fourth and early fifth centuries)	237
	11.9	,	238
		John Chrysostom (c. 347–407)	244
		Augustine of Hippo (354–430)	252
		Severian of Gabala (fl. c. 400)	256
		Tyrannius Rufinus (c. 345–411)	256
	11.14	Theodore of Mopsuestia (c. 350–428)	256



x	List	of contents	
	11.15	Theodoret of Cyrrhus (c. 393–c. 460)	258
	11.16	Peter Chrysologus (c. 400–50)	259
	11.17	Gennadius of Marseilles (fl. 470)	259
	11.18	Antiochus, the Patriarch of Antioch (d. 598)	260
	11.19	John Climacus (c. 570–c. 649)	261
	11.20	Summary	261
Part 6	Cone	clusions	
12	Conc	cluding remarks	265
	12.1	Paul's critique of belly-worship in an ancient setting	265
	12.2	Belly-worship and body in Paul's letters	269
Bibliogi	raphy		275
Works of reference		275	
Sources		276	
Secondary literature		278	
Index of modern authors		292	
Index of Graeco-Roman sources		295	
v		Testament, Apocrypha, Pseudepigrapha	
		ewish writings	303
		Testament and early Christian writings	311



PREFACE

I have incurred many debts in the course of this project. The present study was written during my sabbatical (1998/1999); I am grateful to the Norwegian Lutheran School of Theology (Det teologiske Menighetsfakultet, Oslo), where I teach, for this opportunity. I owe thanks to the library there for patiently providing me with the necessary material. Most of the work was, however, carried out in Cambridge. I am very grateful for the hospitality and access to the library which was given me at Tyndale House. This excellent library for Biblical research made it possible for me to finish most of the work during my time there. I owe special thanks to the head librarian at Tyndale House, Dr David I. Brewer as well as his staff. I am grateful for the fellowship I enjoyed at Tyndale House, and to the scholars who were there together with me. This fellowship stimulated and contributed in various ways to my investigation. I owe special thanks to the Warden, Dr Bruce W. Winter, for his willingness to share his knowledge with me and to bring relevant literature to my attention, and for having introduced me to the Cambridge University Library as well as the library of the Classical Faculty. Without access to these libraries and the kind assistance which I found there, this investigation would not have been possible. These Cambridge days bring to mind also the kind hospitality which I enjoyed in the house of my hostess Mrs Veronica Becho.

Many colleagues at my own school encouraged me in this work; some also read and commented upon my manuscripts. I am grateful for the help I received from Dr Hans Kvalbein, Dr Reidar Hvalvik, Dr Oskar Skarsaune, and Martin Synnes. Special thanks are owed to my colleagues Bjørn-Helge Sandvei and Jan Schumacher, whom I consulted regarding Greek and Latin. My Latin teacher from college, Bjørgulv Rian, kindly assisted me with some Latin passages.

I owe thanks to the Research Council of Norway (Norges Forskningsråd) for granting me the necessary support to improve my English. This work has been done with much enthusiasm and patience

хi



xii Preface

by Dr David Pugh, Bergen. His work included critical comments, fruitful suggestions and involvement. His contribution extends beyond working with the language. Although I have benefited from the help of many people, any faults or mistakes remain fully my own responsibility.

I am very grateful to Dr Richard Bauckham, editor of this series, for recommending my study to Cambridge University Press for publication. His comments and suggestions have contributed considerably to the improvement of the manuscript. Senior Publishing Assistant Gillian Dadd and Publishing Director Kevin Taylor and their co-workers have patiently guided me through the publication process itself.

Finally, I owe special thanks to my wife, Tone, who took upon herself the sole care of our home and three youngsters, and thus made it possible for me to stay in Cambridge.



ABBREVIATIONS

The text of the New Testament is K. Aland et al., *Novum Testamentum Graece* 27th edition, Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft 1993. Abbreviations are those used by the American Academy of Religion and Society of Biblical Literature. Quotations of Biblical texts are drawn from the *NRSV*. If not stated otherwise, Graeco-Roman sources are quoted in English from the LCL. Texts from Old Testament Pseudepigrapha are quoted according to the *OTP*. The Philonic works are abbreviated according to the guidelines set out in *Studia Philonica Annual* (1993), p. 256. Text editions from well-known series are not listed in the bibliography, but the series and volume will appear in footnotes. The following abbreviations will be of help to the reader.

ANF	The Ante-Nicene Fathers
BAGD	W. Bauer, W. F. Arndt, F. W. Gingrich, F. Wilbur, F. W.
	Danker, Greek-English Lexicon of the New Testament
BDF	F. Blass, A. Debrunner and R. W. Funk, A Greek Grammar
	of the New Testament
CCL	Corpus Christianorum Latinorum
CSEL	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum
FC	The Fathers of the Church, A New Translation
GCS	Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller der erste
	Jahrhunderte
JSHRZ	Werner G. Kümmel (ed.), Jüdische Schriften aus
	hellenistisch-römischer Zeit
LCL	Loeb Classical Library
LSJ	Liddell-Scott-Jones, Greek-English Lexicon
LXX	The Septuagint
NPNF	Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers
NRSV	New Revised Standard Version
OTP	J. H. Charlesworth (ed.), The Old Testament
	Pseudepigrapha

xiii



xiv	List of abbreviations
PG	J. Migne, Patrologia Graeca
PL	J. Migne, Patrologia Latina
SC	Sources Chrétiennes
s.v.	sub voce
SVF	H. von Arnim (ed.), Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta
TDNT	G. Kittel, G. Friedrich (eds.), Theological Dictionary
	of the New Testament