

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81522-2 - The Parallel Worlds of Classical Art and Text
Jocelyn Penny Small
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

THE PARALLEL WORLDS OF CLASSICAL ART AND TEXT

The Parallel Worlds of Classical Art and Text is the first study to consider the relationship between artists and texts throughout Classical Antiquity and to cover the entire range of illustrated text from traditional literary to technical works. By systematically applying new and objective criteria to judge the fidelity between picture and text, Jocelyn Penny Small makes it clear that artists illustrate stories, not texts. Small argues that artistic transmissions follow the model of oral, not textual, transmission, where the variant rules and there is no original. Pictures on vases, she demonstrates, should not be used to reconstruct lost literary works. Finally, Small offers an analysis of literary sources on pictures in texts to prove that the appearance of the first illustrated literary classical texts occurred at the end of the late Roman Republic.

Jocelyn Penny Small is a Professor II at Rutgers University in the Department of Art History. A recipient of Woodrow Wilson, Guggenheim, and other fellowships, she is the author of books and articles on various aspects of Classical art, most recently *Wax Tablets of the Mind: Cognitive Studies of Literacy and Memory in Classical Antiquity*.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81522-2 - The Parallel Worlds of Classical Art and Text
Jocelyn Penny Small
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

THE PARALLEL WORLDS OF CLASSICAL ART AND TEXT

JOCELYN PENNY SMALL
Rutgers University

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81522-2 - The Parallel Worlds of Classical Art and Text
Jocelyn Penny Small
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA
www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/978052733069

© Jocelyn Penny Small 2003

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003
First paperback edition 2008

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Small, Jocelyn Penny, 1945–
The parallel worlds of classical art and text / Jocelyn Penny Small.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0-521-81522-3
1. Classical literature – Illustration. I. Title.
NC977 .S63 2003
753'.7'09014 – dc21 2002041241

ISBN 978-0 521-81522-2 hardback
ISBN 978-0-521-73306-9 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81522-2 - The Parallel Worlds of Classical Art and Text
Jocelyn Penny Small
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

For *Toby Jacoby, Leslie Fleck Newman, Constance Wiesman,*
and Joanne Nelson

CONTENTS

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	page ix	VII
<i>Preface</i>	xiii	
1 What does it mean to illustrate a text?	1	
2 The Evidence from Archaic and Early Classical Greek Art	8	
Literacy, Labels, and Stock Components	9	
What constitutes dependency of pictures on text?	21	
Examples of Artists Ignoring Texts	26	
The Importance of the Salient Detail	29	
Analysis of a “Typical” Representation of a Story Told by Homer	31	
Conclusion	36	
3 The Evidence for Greek Plays	37	
Choruses and Actors	37	
Representations of Andromeda	40	
The View Primarily from Statistics	43	
Representations of Medea	47	
Theatrical Representations on South Italian Vases	52	
The Importance of the Salient Detail and Telephos	63	
“Further Reality” on Vases	68	
Another View of Choice of Subject	71	
Conclusion	77	
4 The Evidence from Hellenistic and Roman Art	79	
Hellenistic Relief Bowls	80	
<i>Odyssey</i>	80	
<i>Iphigeneia in Aulis</i>	82	
An Excursus on Titles in Art	82	
The Relief Bowls with <i>Iphigeneia in Aulis</i>	86	

Contents

	Hellenistic Sculpture	90
	Roman Art	93
	The Iliac Tablets	93
	Theoretical Background	96
	The Odyssey Landscapes	98
	Representations of Ovid	100
	Representations of Menander's Comedies	104
	<i>Iphigeneia among the Taurians</i>	107
	Mosaics with Texts	110
	Historical Subjects	110
	Conclusion	116
	5 Illustrated Text from Antiquity	118
VIII	Maps and Plans	119
	Diagrams and Figures	121
	Portraits	129
	Reproduction of Pictures	134
	Representations of Rolls in Art	138
	The Physical Evidence: Extant Illustrated Papyri	138
	An Excursus on "Scenes" and the Codex	141
	Manuscripts of the <i>Aeneid</i>	143
	Conclusion	153
	6 There is no original!	155
	Polygnotus and His Sources	164
	The Argument from Literacy	172
	Why illustrate text?	173
	<i>Notes</i>	177
	<i>Bibliography</i>	223
	<i>Index</i>	241

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

1	“Spring is here.” Attic red-figure pelike.	page 11	IX
2	Games of Patroklos. Fragment of Attic black-figure dinos by Sophilos.	13	
3	“François Vase.” Attic black-figure volute-krater by Kleitias and Ergotimos.	14	
4	Games of Pelias. Corinthian black-figure krater.	14	
5	Fight over fallen warrior. Center of East Frieze of the Siphnian Treasury at Delphi.	15	
6	Briseis led away from Achilles. Attic red-figure kylix by the Briseis Painter.	17	
7	Briseis led away from Achilles. Attic red-figure skyphos by Makron.	18	
8	Death of the Niobids. Attic red-figure calyx-krater by the Niobid Painter.	18	
9	Heroes with Athena and Herakles. Attic red-figure calyx-krater by the Niobid Painter.	19	
10	Briseis arrives at Agamemnon’s camp. Attic red-figure kylix by the Briseis Painter.	22	
11	White Rabbit. Lewis Carroll, <i>Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland</i> , illustrated by John Tenniel.	23	
12	Peter Rabbit. Beatrix Potter, author and illustrator, <i>Peter Rabbit</i> .	25	
13	Odysseus and the Sirens. Attic red-figure stamnos by the Siren Painter.	28	
14	Chariot scene with men and women. Attic red-figure column-krater by the Cleveland Painter.	30	
15	Dragging of Hektor. Attic black-figure hydria by the Leagros Group.	32	
16	Funeral games of Patroklos and Dragging of Hektor. Apulian volute-krater by the Darius Painter.	35	
17	Chorus of Knights. Attic black-figure amphora by the Painter of Berlin 1686.	38	
18	Chorus of Youths. Attic red-figure column-krater.	39	

List of Illustrations

	19	Andromeda. Attic red-figure hydria from the Workshop of the Coghill Painter.	40
	20	Andromeda. Attic red-figure pelike attributed to the Kensington Painter and Kensington Class.	41
	21	Chorus of Birds. Attic black-figure oinochoe by the Gela Painter.	44
	22	Chorus of Birds. Attic red-figure calyx-krater by the Painter of Munich 2335.	45
	23	Medea. Lucanian red-figure hydria by the Policoro Painter.	48
	24	Medea. Lucanian red-figure calyx-krater attributed to near the Policoro Painter.	49
	25	Medea, detail of Jason. Lucanian red-figure calyx-krater attributed to near the Policoro Painter.	49
×	26	Birth of Helen. Apulian bell-krater, from Bari by the Dijon Painter.	53
	27	Oedipus. Sicilian calyx-krater by the Capodarso Painter.	55
	28	Maron and Odysseus. Sicilian calyx-krater by the Maron Painter.	55
	29	Iphigeneia among the Taurians. Campanian bell-krater attributed to the School of the Errera Painter (near to the Painter of B.M. F 63).	56
	30	Unidentified scene from a tragedy. Sicilian calyx-krater by the Capodarso Painter.	57
	31	Darius, King of the Persians. Volute-krater by the Darius Painter.	58
	32	Ganymede and the Swan. Apulian calyx-krater attributed to the Berlin Ganymede Group.	59
	33	Actor. Fragmentary Gnathian bell-krater.	61
	34	Cast of a satyr-play, left side. Attic red-figure volute-krater by the Pronomos Painter.	62
	35	Cast of a satyr-play, center. Attic red-figure volute-krater by the Pronomos Painter.	62
	36	“Telephos” threatening “Orestes.” Apulian bell-krater by the Schiller Painter.	63
	37	Telephos threatening Orestes with Clytemnestra. Lucanian red-figure calyx-krater attributed to near the Policoro Painter.	67
	38	Jason and the Golden Fleece. Attic red-figure column-krater by the Orchard Painter.	74
	39	Satyr as Jason. Attic red-figure column-krater by the Orchard Painter.	75
	40	Chorus of Satyrs. Attic red-figure bell-krater by Polion.	76
	41	Odysseus and the Suitors. Hellenistic relief bowl.	81
	42	Odysseus and the Suitors. Hellenistic relief bowl.	82
	43	Iphigeneia in Aulis. Hellenistic relief bowl.	83
	44	Iphigeneia in Aulis. Hellenistic relief bowl.	88
	45	Archelaos Relief.	92
	46	Iliac Tablet. “Capitoline Tablet,” central panel.	94
	47	Iliac Tablet. “Capitoline Tablet,” right portion.	95

List of Illustrations

48	Odysseus in the Land of the Laestrygonians. Panel from the Odyssey Landscapes.	99
49	Narcissus alone. Roman wall painting.	101
50	Narcissus with Eros. Roman wall painting.	102
51	Narcissus with Eros and Echo. Roman wall painting.	103
52	<i>Synaristosai</i> of Menander. Mosaic from Mytilene, the House of Menander.	105
53	<i>Synaristosai</i> of Menander. Mosaic from Pompeii.	106
54	<i>Phormio</i> 2.3 of Terence. Manuscript illumination.	107
55	Orestes, Pylades, and Iphigeneia among the Taurians. Roman wall painting.	108
56	Battle of Pydna. Frieze from the Monument of Aemilius Paullus.	113
57	Riot in the amphitheater at Pompeii. Roman wall painting.	113
58	Denarii of L. Marcus Censorinus with “Marsyas in the Forum” on the reverse.	115
59	Imperial bronzes with “Marsyas in the Forum.”	115
60	Mathematical text with illustrations.	123
61	Haterii Relief.	128
62	Unidentified text with illustrations.	139
63	Text with deeds of Herakles.	139
64	Islands and a city (Pergamea or Delos). Vatican Vergil.	144
65	Aeneas sailing around Sicily. Vatican Vergil.	145
66	The Penates appear in a dream of Aeneas. Vatican Vergil.	146
67	Sack of Troy. Vatican Vergil.	147
68	The Trojan Horse. Late Etruscan funerary urn.	148
69	Death of Laocoon. Vatican Vergil.	149
70	Laocoon.	150
71	Flames about Iulus’ head. Vatican Vergil.	151
72	Herakles and Athena. Black-figure side of Attic bilingual amphora. Andokides Painter/Lysippides Painter.	162
73	Herakles and Athena. Red-figure side of Attic bilingual amphora. Andokides Painter.	163
74	Theft of the Horses of Rhesus. Apulian volute-krater by the Darius Painter.	169

PREFACE

“There is no phenomenon, however complex, which when examined carefully will not turn out to be even more complex.”

×III

Psychologist David Krech (in Gazzaniga 1988a, 175)

My research belongs among Zeno’s paradoxes. Twice now, when I thought I was going to write about time and space in classical pictorial narrative, I have written something else that I naively believed would merely be a chapter or two of introduction. For the previous book, I realized that one could not have a concept of time without memory, and then it ever so slowly became apparent that the issue of memory and its “obverse,” literacy, could not be dealt with briefly. And so I wrote *Wax Tablets of the Mind: Cognitive Studies of Literacy and Memory in Classical Antiquity*. This time I felt confident that the “preliminary” sections were done and that once I had discussed the issue of artists’ use of texts, I would be able – finally – to tackle time and space. I even was very fortunate to receive a Guggenheim Fellowship in 2000 expressly for that purpose. To no avail! After I sent off a draft of the first three “chapters” to colleagues, I did a word count and realized I already had a book. All that was lacking were an introduction and conclusion. Artists’ use of text for over a millennium is not a tiny topic. Nor have I by any means exhausted the subject. I do believe, however, that my next book has a good chance of being on time and space, if only because I am not intending to write about it.

The basic research for this book was completed in the summer of 2001, and references from publications after that date, with a few exceptions, could not be included. Abbreviations for citations follow the modern convention of last name of the author and year published with the exception of abbreviations long standard in the field, such as *ABV*, where citation by author and year is irksome. When known, authors’ names are given in full for ease of searching in library indices. Similarly, journal names are not abbreviated. I admit to a somewhat

Preface

idiosyncratic method for the date of publication. I add a letter of the alphabet after the year (e.g., Small 1997a), even if I cite only one something by that author. I developed that practice when working on an open-ended database where it was obvious that years later additional works by the same author would be added, and I thought it neither efficient nor wise to retroactively change all the existing references. I am redundant in giving the year published in both the abbreviation and the full citation, because I like having the year where I expect to see it. In the notes, I try to give the author's name for citations of entries in encyclopedias. For references to the *LIMCI* I give the author's name if I refer to the commentary, but omit it for simple bibliographical citations of individual objects in the catalog sections.

XIV I have given up on consistency in transliterating Greek. I use the forms I am most accustomed to. I find the recent habit of writing "Aiskhulos," for instance, really strange and prefer "Aeschylus," though I write "Telephos." Then, in Chapter 6, when I discussed "Polygnotos," I thought it jarring to the reader to have me use "-os," when the translation from the Loeb Classical Library used "-us." So I went with "Polygnotus." Worse yet, as friends who read the manuscript pointed out, I am not always consistent. Please forgive me.

Acquiring photographs is always a long and arduous task, especially in this case, when nearly thirty collections are involved. I am very grateful to all the curators and staff who made the process easier. The collections are acknowledged in the captions. In addition, I try to cite in the notes at least one photograph for every object I mention. For those references, I emphasize basic handbooks, etc. that are readily available. I have made no attempt to give full bibliographies, which are quite large in some instances. I also give full information for each object's current location, including inventory numbers.

Rutgers University during the course of my work on this book generously supported my research with grants and faculty leaves. In particular, I thank again Ryoko Toyama for her enthusiastic encouragement. It is also a pleasure to acknowledge the graduate students in the Art History Department and my colleague, Professor Elizabeth MacLachlan, with whom I have twice taught a course on the rise of the illustrated text from Antiquity through the Middle Ages. Professor MacLachlan has also tirelessly answered my questions about medieval art.

The subject of this book has been gestating for a number of years, and I have enjoyed discussions with a number of colleagues. Some of them, whom I asked about specific points, are acknowledged at the appropriate places in the notes. Others have been of more general assistance: Dee Clayman, A. A. Donohue, Ingrid Edlund, and James Tatum. I very much appreciate the patience of the readers of the infamous first draft that seemed like a few

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-81522-2 - The Parallel Worlds of Classical Art and Text
Jocelyn Penny Small
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Preface

columns short of a building: A. A. Donohue, Carol Mattusch, Christine Perkell, Brunilde S. Ridgway, Barbara Tversky, and Susan Woodford. Comments from the readers for Cambridge University Press saved me from some really silly errors that I should have caught. One day I hope to be able to count quadrigas accurately. I also had the pleasure of giving a talk on the topic at Bryn Mawr College in the Fall of 2000. Claire Lyons kindly invited me to participate in a colloquium on “copies” that she organized for a joint session of the Archaeological Institute of America/American Philological Association in 2001; part of the last chapter formed the nub of that talk. This year I presented the section on the Vatican Vergil as part of a panel arranged by Maura Lafferty for the Medieval Latin Studies Group: *Literacy and Latinity in Antiquity and the Middle Ages*, Philadelphia, PA, January 2002. Many thanks are also due to Beatrice Rehl, my editor at Cambridge University Press, for her exemplary and remarkably swift shepherding of the manuscript through the various stages of publication.

Finally, as is most appropriate, the dedication. In 1995 my elementary school class from PS 15 in Crestwood, New York, part of Yonkers, held an informal reunion in Crestwood to celebrate our fiftieth birthdays. The entire group had not been together since senior year in high school, but something like fourteen of the possible seventeen came from near – in my case – and far, like Mexico and California. It was a magical three days. This book is dedicated to the four, in addition to me, who still live in the “area.” We continue to meet for dinner for our individual birthdays and whenever there is a “suitable” occasion, such as another classmate visiting. They recognize the heavy responsibility that comes with being dedicatees, even if it is a shared duty. They have graciously agreed to accept *full* responsibility for any errors that remain in this book despite my best efforts.

xv