

WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

Dispute Settlement Reports

2000

Volume VI

Pages 2621-3040





Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521813808](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521813808)

© World Trade Organization 2000, 2002

Material in this report may be reproduced, provided the source is acknowledged.

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

French edition and Spanish edition paperbacks of this title are both available directly from WTO Publications, World Trade Organization, Centre William Rappard, 154 rue de Lausanne, CH-1211 Geneva 21, Switzerland <http://www.wto.org>

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN 978-0-521-81380-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT REPORTS

The *Dispute Settlement Reports* of the World Trade Organization (the "WTO") include panel and Appellate Body reports, as well as arbitration awards, in disputes concerning the rights and obligations of WTO Members under the provisions of the *Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization*. The *Dispute Settlement Reports* are available in English, French and Spanish. Starting with 1999, the first volume of each year contains a cumulative index of published disputes.

*This volume may be cited as DSR 2000:VI*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
<b>United States - Imposition of Countervailing Duties on Certain Hot-Rolled Lead and Bismuth Carbon Steel Products Originating in the United Kingdom (WT/DS138)</b>	
Report of the Panel.....	2623
<b>Canada - Certain Measures Affecting the Automotive Industry (WT/DS139, WT/DS142)</b>	
Report of the Appellate Body .....	2985

**UNITED STATES - IMPOSITION OF COUNTERVAILING  
 DUTIES ON CERTAIN HOT-ROLLED LEAD AND  
 BISMUTH CARBON STEEL PRODUCTS ORIGINATING  
 IN THE UNITED KINGDOM**

**Report of the Panel**  
 WT/DS138/R/Corr. 2

*Adopted by the Dispute Settlement Body  
 on 7 June 2000*

*As Upheld by the Appellate Body Report*

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION .....	2624
II. FACTUAL ASPECTS .....	2625
III. ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES.....	2627
IV. ARGUMENTS OF THE THIRD PARTIES.....	2627
A. Brazil .....	2627
B. Mexico.....	2645
V. INTERIM REVIEW .....	2650
A. Comments by the European Communities .....	2650
B. Comments by the United States .....	2651
VI. FINDINGS.....	2652
A. Introduction .....	2652
B. Preliminary Issues.....	2652
C. Were the Countervailing Duties Imposed as a Result of the 1995, 1996 and 1997 Administrative Reviews Consistent with Articles 10 and 19.4 of the SCM Agreement? .....	2659
VII. CONCLUSION.....	2682
VIII. RECOMMENDATION .....	2683
ATTACHMENT 1: European Communities' Submissions	
1.1 First Submission of the European Communities .....	2684
1.2 Oral Statement and Concluding Statement of the European Communities at the First Meeting with the Panel .....	2723
1.3 Responses of the European Communities to Written Questions from the Panel - First Meeting .....	2739

## Report of the Panel

	Page
1.4 Responses of the European Communities to Written Questions from the United States - First Meeting.....	2743
1.5 Second Submission of the European Communities .....	2760
1.6 Oral Statement of the European Communities - Second Meeting .....	2793
1.7 Responses of the European Communities to Written Questions from the Panel - Second Meeting.....	2809
ATTACHMENT 2: United States' Submissions	
2.1 First Written Submission of the United States.....	2826
2.2 Oral Statement of the United States at the First Meeting of the Panel.....	2880
2.3 Responses of the United States to Questions from the Panel - First Meeting .....	2895
2.4 Responses of the United States to Questions from the European Communities - First Meeting.....	2912
2.5 Second Submission of the United States .....	2921
2.6 Oral Statement of the United States - Second Meeting .....	2937
2.7 Final Statement of the United States - Second Meeting .....	2954
2.8 Responses of the United States to Questions from the Panel - Second Meeting.....	2956

**I. INTRODUCTION**

1.1 On 12 June 1998, the European Communities requested consultations with the United States pursuant to Article 4 of the Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes (DSU), Article XXII:1 of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994 (GATT 1994) and Article 30 of the Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures (SCM Agreement) with respect to the imposition of countervailing duties by the United States on certain hot-rolled lead and bismuth carbon steel products (lead bars) originating in the United Kingdom in the context of three successive annual reviews (WTO document WT/DS138/1). The European Communities and the United States held consultations on 29 July 1998, but failed to reach a mutually satisfactory solution.

1.2 On 14 January 1999, pursuant to Articles 4 and 6 of the DSU, Article XXIII of the GATT 1994 and Article 30 of the SCM Agreement, the European Communities requested the establishment of a panel with respect to the imposition of countervailing duties by the United States on certain hot-rolled lead and bismuth carbon steel products originating in the United Kingdom in the context of three successive annual reviews (WTO documents WT/DS138/3 and WT/DS138/3/Corr.1).

1.3 At its meeting on 17 February 1999, the Dispute Settlement Body (DSB) established a panel pursuant to the above request. At that meeting, the parties to