

WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

Dispute Settlement Reports

2000  
Volume II

Pages 573-1185



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521813761](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521813761)

© World Trade Organization 2000, 2002

Material in this report may be reproduced, provided the source is acknowledged.

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2002

3rd printing 2012

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN 978-0-521-81376-1 Hardback

French edition and Spanish edition paperbacks of this title are both available directly from WTO Publications, World Trade Organization, Centre William Rappard, 154 rue de Lausanne, CH-1211 Geneva 21, Switzerland <http://www.wto.org>

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT REPORTS

The *Dispute Settlement Reports* of the World Trade Organization (the "WTO") include panel and Appellate Body reports, as well as arbitration awards, in disputes concerning the rights and obligations of WTO Members under the provisions of the *Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization*. The *Dispute Settlement Reports* are available in English, French and Spanish. Starting with 1999, the first volume of each year contains a cumulative index of published disputes.

*This volume may be cited as DSR 2000:II*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
<b>Argentina - Safeguard Measures on Imports of Footwear (WT/DS121)</b>	
Report of the Panel.....	575
<b>United States - Sections 301 - 310 of the Trade Act of 1974 (WT/DS152)</b>	
Report of the Panel.....	815

## ARGENTINA— SAFEGUARD MEASURES ON IMPORTS OF FOOTWEAR

### Report of the Panel

WT/DS121/R

*Adopted by the Dispute Settlement Body  
 on 12 January 2000  
 as modified by the Appellate Body Report*

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION .....	580
II. FACTUAL ASPECTS .....	581
III. FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS REQUESTED BY THE PARTIES .....	583
IV. PROCEDURAL ISSUES AND REQUESTS FOR PRELIMINARY RULINGS .....	584
A. Argentina's Requests Regarding the Panel's Terms of Reference .....	584
1. Minimum Specific Import Duties (DIEMS).....	584
(a) The European Communities' Account of the "Factual and Procedural History" of the Dispute .....	584
(b) Argument of Argentina .....	587
(c) Argument of the European Communities.....	588
2. Resolution MEYOSP 512/98, Resolution MEYOSP 1506/98, and Resolution SICyM 837/98, and Panel Recommendations on "Hypothetical Future Measures" .....	589
(a) Arguments of Argentina.....	589
(i) Resolution MEYOSP 512/98 and Resolution MEYOSP 1506/98 .....	589
(ii) Panel Recommendations on "Hypothetical Future Measures".....	590
(b) Argument of the European Communities.....	592
B. Submission of Evidence: Exhibit arg-21 .....	595
V. MAIN ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES CONCERNING THE ISSUES ARISING UNDER THE AGREEMENT ON SAFEGUARDS AND THE GATT 1994 .....	596

---

 Report of the Panel
 

---

	Page
A. Article XIX:1(a) of GATT 1994 – "Unforeseen Developments" .....	596
1. Argument of the European Communities .....	596
2. Argument of Argentina .....	602
3. Response by the European Communities .....	606
4. Rebuttal by Argentina .....	610
B. Interpretation and Application of Article 2.1 of the Agreement on Safeguards – "the Mercosur Question" .....	610
1. Argument of the European Communities .....	610
2. Argument of Argentina .....	614
(a) Introduction .....	614
(b) The Criterion Supported by the European Communities .....	615
(c) Applicable Provision: Meaning of the Text .....	616
(i) Application to the Claim by the European Communities .....	616
(ii) Literal Interpretation of Article 2.1 and Footnote 1 .....	617
(iii) Object and Purpose of the Footnote .....	619
(iv) Effectiveness of the Footnote .....	621
(v) Scope of the Obligation Contained in the Footnote .....	622
(vi) Meaning of the Phrase "and the Measure Shall be Limited to that Member State" in the Second Sentence of the Footnote .....	622
3. Response of the European Communities .....	623
C. Definitive Safeguard Measure .....	629
1. Standard of Review .....	629
(a) Argument of the European Communities .....	629
(b) Argument of Argentina .....	630
2. Article 2.1 of the Agreement on Safeguards: Alleged Failure to Demonstrate an "Increase" in Imports and Alleged Failure to Analyze the "Conditions" under which the Imported Products Investigated Entered the Import Market .....	631
(a) "Increased Imports" .....	631

---

 Argentina - Footwear (EC)

	Page
(i) Argument of the European Communities..	631
(ii) Argument of Argentina .....	635
(b) "Under such Conditions" .....	637
(i) Argument of the European Communities..	637
(ii) Argument of Argentina .....	641
3. Article 2.1 and Article 4 of the Agreement on Safeguards – Alleged Failure to Demonstrate that "Serious Injury" or "Threat of Serious Injury" Occurred to the Domestic Industry that Produces Like or Directly Competitive Products .....	645
(a) Period of Investigation .....	645
(i) Argument of the European Communities..	645
(ii) Argument of Argentina .....	646
(b) Segmentation of Products/Market .....	649
(i) Argument of the European Communities..	649
(ii) Argument of Argentina .....	651
(c) Investigation; Evaluation of "all Relevant Factors" .....	652
(i) Factors set out in Article 4.2(a) .....	652
(ii) Additional Factors Analyzed by Argentina .....	670
(d) Finding of Serious Injury .....	671
(i) Argument of the European Communities..	671
(ii) Argument of Argentina .....	673
(e) Threat of "Serious Injury" .....	675
(i) Argument of the European Communities..	675
(ii) Argument of Argentina .....	675
4. Article 2.1 and Article 4.2(b) of the Agreement on Safeguards - Alleged Failure to Demonstrate a "Causal Link" between Increased Imports and Serious Injury or Threat of Serious Injury .....	677
(a) Causal Link – First Sentence of Article 4.2(b).....	677
(i) Argument of the European Communities..	677
(ii) Argument of Argentina .....	682
(iii) Response by the European Communities ..	683
(iv) Rebuttal by Argentina .....	689

Report of the Panel

	Page
(b) Other Factors – Second Sentence of Article 4.2(b).....	690
(i) Argument of the European Communities...	690
(ii) Argument of Argentina .....	692
5. Article 5.1 of the Agreement on Safeguards - Alleged Failure to Demonstrate that the Safeguard Measure was Applied only to the Extent "Necessary" to Prevent or Remedy Serious Injury and Facilitate " Adjustment.....	693
(a) Argument of the European Communities.....	693
(i) "Necessary" .....	693
(ii) Adjustment Plan .....	697
(b) Argument of Argentina .....	697
6. Article 12.1 and 12.2 of the Agreement on Safeguards – Alleged Failure to Fulfil Procedural Requirements .....	699
(a) Sufficiency of Notifications on Findings of Serious Injury and Causation .....	699
(i) Argument of the European Communities...	699
(ii) Argument of Argentina .....	700
(b) Non-Notification of Resolutions 512/98, 1506/98 and 837/98 .....	701
(i) Argument of the European Communities...	701
(ii) Argument of Argentina .....	702
D. Provisional Safeguard Measure .....	703
1. Arguments of the European Communities.....	703
2. Argument of Argentina.....	705
VI. ARGUMENTS OF THIRD PARTIES .....	706
A. Brazil, Paraguay and Uruguay .....	706
B. Indonesia .....	708
C. United States.....	711
1. Introduction .....	711
2. Standard of Review.....	711
3. Legal Arguments.....	712
(a) Argentina's Safeguard Measure Violates Article 2 of the Agreement on Safeguards .....	712



		Page
		Argentina - Footwear (EC)
	(b) Argentina's Safeguard Measure Violates Article 5 of the Agreement on Safeguards .....	716
	(c) Argentina's Purported Modification of its Safeguard Measure Violates Article 7.4 of the Agreement on Safeguards .....	718
	(d) The Requirements of Article XIX of GATT 1994 are Subsumed by the Agreement on Safeguards.....	719
	4. Conclusion .....	721
VII.	INTERIM REVIEW .....	721
VIII.	FINDINGS.....	729
A.	Factual Background .....	729
B.	Claims .....	733
C.	Terms of Reference and Scope of the Measures in Dispute .....	733
	1. Minimum Specific Duties (DIEMs).....	733
	2. Subsequent Modifications of the Definitive Safeguard Measure.....	733
D.	The Claim under Article XIX of GATT 1994 and "Unforeseen Developments".....	741
E.	Claims under the Safeguards Agreement.....	748
	1. The Imposition of Safeguard Measures in the Case of a Customs Union.....	748
	(a) Article 2 and the Footnote to Article 2.1 .....	749
	(b) Article XXIV of GATT.....	754
	2. Background to the Investigation .....	757
	(a) The Domestic Industry .....	757
	(b) The Footwear Products.....	758
	3. Standard of Review.....	760
	(a) No <i>de novo</i> Review .....	760
	(b) Consideration of "All Relevant Factors" .....	762
	(c) Argentina's Report on the "Detailed Analysis of the Case" Setting Forth its "Findings and Reasoned Conclusions" .....	763
	4. Claims under Articles 2 and 4 of the Agreement on Safeguards Regarding Argentina's Investigation, and Findings of Serious Injury, Threat of Serious Injury and Causation.....	765

---

 Report of the Panel
 

---

	Page
(a) Product Segments.....	766
(b) Are there "Increased" Imports in the Sense of Article 2.1 and Article 4.2(a) of the Agreement? .....	767
(i) Imports in Absolute Terms.....	767
(ii) Imports Relative to Domestic Production .....	769
(iii) Evaluation by the Panel.....	770
(c) Serious Injury.....	775
(i) Production .....	775
(ii) Sales .....	776
(iii) Productivity .....	778
(iv) Capacity Utilization.....	779
(v) Profits and Losses .....	780
(vi) Employment .....	781
(vii) Other Injury Indicators Considered .....	783
(viii) Evaluation by the Panel.....	784
(d) Causation .....	791
(i) Summary of Parties' Arguments .....	792
(ii) Coincidence of Trends .....	795
(iii) "Under such Conditions" .....	798
(iv) Other Factors .....	803
(v) Summary Regarding the Claims under Articles 2 and 4 .....	805
(e) Threat of Serious Injury .....	806
5. Claims Regarding the Application of Safeguard Measures (Article 5) .....	807
6. Claims Regarding the Provisional Safeguard Measure (Article 6).....	808
7. Claims Regarding Notification Requirements (Article 12).....	808
(a) The Notification of "all Pertinent Information" .....	809
(b) Notification of Subsequent Modifications .....	811
(c) Concluding Remark .....	812
IX. CONCLUSIONS .....	812

## I. INTRODUCTION

1.1 On 3 April 1998, the European Communities requested consultations with the Government of Argentina under Article XXII:1 of the GATT 1994 ("GATT") and pursuant to Article 4 of the Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the