

## Hilary Putnam

The richness of Hilary Putnam's philosophical oeuvre consists not only in the broad spectrum of problems addressed but also in the transformations and restructuring his positions have undergone over the years. The essays collected in this volume are sensitive to both these dimensions. They discuss Putnam's major philosophical contributions to the theory of meaning, the philosophy of mind, the philosophy of science and mathematics, and moral theory. But, in addition, tracing threads of change and continuity, they analyze the dynamics underlying the unfolding of Putnam's thought. The volume also constitutes a critical introduction to a number of central issues in contemporary philosophy, including quantum logic, realism, functionalism, the 'mind as computer' metaphor, and the fact/value dichotomy.

Yemima Ben-Menahem is a member of the Department of Philosophy at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem.



## Contemporary Philosophy in Focus

Contemporary Philosophy in Focus offers a series of introductory volumes to many of the dominant philosophical thinkers of the current age. Each volume consists of newly commissioned essays that cover major contributions of a preeminent philosopher in a systematic and accessible manner. Comparable in scope and rationale to the highly successful series Cambridge Companions to Philosophy, the volumes do not presuppose that readers are already intimately familiar with the details of each philosopher's work. They thus combine exposition and critical analysis in a manner that will appeal to students of philosophy and to professionals as well as to students across the humanities and social sciences.

#### FORTHCOMING VOLUMES:

Paul Churchland edited by Brian Keeley
Ronald Dworkin edited by Arthur Ripstein
Jerry Fodor edited by Tim Crane
Saul Kripke edited by Alan Berger
David Lewis edited by Theodore Sider and Dean Zimmermann
Bernard Williams edited by Alan Thomas

### PUBLISHED VOLUMES:

Stanley Cavell edited by Richard Eldridge
Donald Davidson edited by Kirk Ludwig
Daniel Dennett edited by Andrew Brook and Don Ross
Thomas Kuhn edited by Thomas Nickles
Alasdair MacIntyre edited by Mark Murphy
Richard Rorty edited by Charles Guignon and David Hiley
John Searle edited by Barry Smith
Charles Taylor edited by Ruth Abbey



# Hilary Putnam

Edited by

YEMIMA BEN-MENAHEM

The Hebrew University of Jerusalem





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa
http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United States of America

Typefaces Janson Text 10/13 pt. and ITC Officina Sans System LATEX 2<sub>E</sub> [TB]

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Hilary Putnam / edited by Yemima Ben-Menahem.

p. cm. – (Contemporary philosophy in focus)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-81311-5 – ISBN 0-521-01254-6 (pbk.)

1. Putnam, Hilary. I. Ben-Menahem, Yemima, 1946– II. Series.

B945.P874H54 2004

191 – dc22

-----

ISBN 0 521 81311 5 hardback ISBN 0 521 01254 6 paperback



### Contents

	List of Contributors Acknowledgments	page ix xi
1	Introduction YEMIMA BEN-MENAHEM	1
2	Putnam's "The Meaning of 'Meaning'": Externalism in Historical Context JULIET FLOYD	17
3	The Face of Perception CHARLES TRAVIS	53
4	Realism, Beyond Miracles AXEL MUELLER AND ARTHUR FINE	83
5	Putnam on Skepticism YEMIMA BEN-MENAHEM	125
6	The Tale of Quantum Logic TIM MAUDLIN	156
7	Another Philosopher Looks at Quantum Mechanics, or What Quantum Theory Is Not NANCY CARTWRIGHT	188
8	Structural Realism and Contextual Individuality JOHN STACHEL	203
9	The Rise and Fall of Computational Functionalism ORON SHAGRIR	220
LO	The Pragmatic Turn: The Entanglement of Fact and Value RICHARD J. BERNSTEIN	251
	Index	267
		vii

© Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org



### Contributors

YEMIMA BEN-MENAHEM is a member of the Department of Philosophy at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. In her publications she has addressed a range of classic problems in the philosophy of science, including explanation, causality, and realism. Her *Conventionalism* is forthcoming from Cambridge University Press.

RICHARD J. BERNSTEIN is Vera List Professor of Philosophy and dean of the graduate faculty at New School University in New York City. He has written widely on political theory, American pragmatism, and critical theory. His books include *Praxis and Action* (1971), *Beyond Objectivism and Relativism:* Science, Hermeneutics and Praxis (1983), Freud and the Vexed Legacy of Moses (1998), and Radical Evil: A Philosophical Interrogation (2002).

NANCY CARTWRIGHT is a professor of philosophy in the Department of Philosophy, London School of Economics and Political Science, and chair of the London School of Economics Centre for Philosophy of Natural and Social Science. She is also a professor of philosophy at the University of California, San Diego. Among her books are *How the Laws of Physics Lie* (1983), *Nature's Capacities and Their Measurement* (1989), *The Dappled World: A Study of the Boundaries of Science* (1999), and *Measuring Causes: Invariance, Modularity and the Causal Markov Condition* (2000).

ARTHUR FINE is a professor of philosophy and adjunct professor of physics at the University of Washington. He has served as president of the Philosophy of Science Association and of the Central Division of the American Philosophical Association. His works in the philosophy of science focus, in particular, on the foundations of twentieth-century physics and include, among others, *The Shaky Game: Einstein, Realism and the Quantum Theory* (1986; 2d ed. 1996).

JULIET FLOYD is an associate professor of philosophy at Boston University. She has published on Kant, Wittgenstein, and the philosophy of



**X** Contributors

mathematics and coedited Future Pasts: Perspectives on the Analytic Tradition in Twentieth-Century Philosophy (2001).

TIM MAUDLIN is a professor of philosophy at Rutgers University. His two main research areas are metaphysics and the philosophy of physics. The author of *Quantum Non-Locality and Relativity* (1994), he has two books forthcoming from Oxford University Press: *Truth and Paradox: Solving the Riddles* and *Metaphysics Within Physics*.

AXEL MUELLER, of the Department of Philosophy at Northwestern University, works in pragmatism, the philosophy of language, and the philosophy of science. His *Referenz und Fallibilismus* (2001) is a study of Putnam's thought.

JOHN STACHEL is a professor emeritus of physics and director of the Center for Einstein Studies at Boston University. Founder of the Collected Papers of Albert Einstein, he has published extensively in the history and philosophy of theoretical physics, especially on the general theory of relativity. His most recent book is *Einstein from 'B'* to 'Z' (2002).

ORON SHAGRIR is a member of the Department of Philosophy and chair of the program in Cognitive Science at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. His areas of expertise include the philosophy of mind, cognitive science, and the history and philosophy of computing. His recent papers have been published in *Mind*, *Synthese*, the *Monist*, *Minds and Machines*, and *Theoretical Computer Science*.

CHARLES TRAVIS is a professor of philosophy at Northwestern University. He works in the philosophy of mind and the philosophy of language, focusing in particular on the interpretation of Wittgenstein's philosophy in these areas. His books include *The Uses of Sense: Wittgenstein's Philosophy of Language* (1989), *Unshadowed Thought* (2000), and *Les Liaisons Ordinaires* (2002).



## Acknowledgments

The papers collected here have not been published before. I would like to thank the authors for their responsiveness and patience during the editorial process. I would also like to thank Hilary Putnam, teacher and friend, who over the years has been a source of inspiration and encouragement.

Terence Moore of Cambridge University Press invited me to edit this volume and provided assistance throughout the process. His recent death is a great loss to the philosophical community. The many volumes he brought into the world, however, are a lasting tribute to his vision.