

MEDIA VIOLENCE And Christian Ethics

How can audiences interact creatively, wisely and peaceably with the many different forms of violence found throughout today's media? Suicide attacks, graphic executions and the horrors of war appear in news reports, films, websites and even on mobile phones. One approach towards media violence is to attempt to protect viewers; another is to criticise journalists, editors, film-makers and their stories.

In this book Jolyon Mitchell highlights Christianity's ambiguous relationship with media violence. He goes beyond debates about the effects of watching mediated violence to examine how audiences, producers and critics interact with news images, films, video games and advertising. He argues that practices such as hospitality, friendship, witness and worship can provide the context where both spectacular and hidden violence can be remembered and reframed. This can help audiences to imagine how their own identities and communities can be based not upon violence, but upon a more lasting foundation of peace.

JOLYON MITCHELL is Senior Lecturer in Theology, Ethics and Communication at the University of Edinburgh and a former BBC World Service producer and journalist.



NEW STUDIES IN CHRISTIAN ETHICS

General Editor: Robin Gill Editorial Board: Stephen R. L. Clark, Stanley Hauerwas, Robin W. Lovin

Christian ethics has increasingly assumed a central place within academic theology. At the same time the growing power and ambiguity of modern science and the rising dissatisfaction within the social sciences about claims to value-neutrality have prompted renewed interest in ethics within the secular academic world. There is, therefore, a need for studies in Christian ethics which, as well as being concerned with the relevance of Christian ethics to the present-day secular debate, are well informed about parallel discussions in recent philosophy, science or social science. *New Studies in Christian Ethics* aims to provide books that do this at the highest intellectual level and demonstrate that Christian ethics can make a distinctive contribution to this debate – either in moral substance or in terms of underlying moral justifications.

NEW STUDIES IN CHRISTIAN ETHICS

TITLES PUBLISHED IN THE SERIES:

- I. KIERAN CRONIN
 Rights and Christian Ethics
- 2. IAN MCDONALD
 Biblical Interpretation and Christian Ethics
- 3. JAMES MACKEY
 Power and Christian Ethics
- 4. IAN S. MARKHAM
 Plurality and Christian Ethics
- 5. JEAN PORTER

 Moral Action and Christian Ethics
- 6. WILLIAM SCHWEIKER
 Responsibility and Christian Ethics
- 7. E. CLINTON GARDNER
 Justice and Christian Ethics
- 8. SUSAN PARSONS
 Feminism and Christian Ethics
- 9. LISA SOWLE CAHILL Sex, Gender and Christian Ethics



- IO. MICHAEL NORTHCOTT
 The Environment and Christian Ethics
- II. STANLEY RUDMAN
 Concepts of Person and Christian Ethics
- 12. GARTH HALLETT
 Priorities and Christian Ethics
- DAVID FERGUSSON
 Community, Liberalism and Christian Ethics
- 14. PETER SEDGWICK The Market Economy and Christian Ethics
- 15. ROBIN GILL Churchgoing and Christian Ethics
- 16. DOUGLAS HICKS Inequality and Christian Ethics
- 17. STEPHEN CLARK
 Biology and Christian Ethics
- 18. COLIN GRANT
 Altruism and Christian Ethics
- 19. ROBERT GASCOIGNE The Public Forum and Christian Ethics
- 20. GORDON GRAHAM Evil and Christian Ethics
- 21. ADRIAN THATCHER
 Living Together and Christian Ethics
- 22. DAVID HOLLENBACH
 The Common Good and Christian Ethics
- 23. DARLENE FOZARD WEAVER Self Love and Christian Ethics
- 24. ALBINO BARRERA Economic Compulsion and Christian Ethics
- 25. CELIA DEANE-DRUMMOND Genetics and Christian Ethics
- 26. ROBIN GILL
 Health Care and Christian Ethics
- 27. CHRISTOPHER C. H. COOK Alcohol, Addiction and Christian Ethics



- 28. STEPHEN J. POPE Human Evolution and Christian Ethics
- 29. ANTHONY BASH
 Forgiveness and Christian Ethics
- 30. JOLYON MITCHELL
 Media Violence and Christian Ethics



MEDIA VIOLENCE AND CHRISTIAN ETHICS

JOLYON MITCHELL

University of Edinburgh





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521812566

© Jolyon Mitchell 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data Mitchell, Jolyon P.

Media violence and christian ethics / Jolyon Mitchell.

p. cm. - (New studies in Christian ethics)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-81256-6 (hardback) ISBN-10: 0-521-81256-9 (hardback)

1. Christian ethics. 2. Violence on television. 3. Mass media – Religious aspects – Christianity.

4. Violence - Religious aspects - Christianity. I. Title.

BJ1251.M535 2007

241' .65 - dc22 2007016482

ISBN 978-0-521-81256-6 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> To Jasmine, Xanthe and Sebastian In Memory of Mark Birchall



Contents

List of figures	page x
General Editor's preface	xiii
Acknowledgements	XV
Introduction: regarding media violence	I
PART I MEDIA REALITIES?	19
I Remembering violent news	21
2 Reframing news	64
3 Re-envisaging photojournalism	115
PART II MEDIA FANTASIES?	157
4 Reviewing violent films	159
5 Reinterpreting films and video games	196
6 Reappraising advertisements	230
7 Conclusion: redescribing media violence	271
Select bibliography	306
Index	323

ix



Figures

0.1	Man carries body of a girl in Qana, Lebanon,	
	Sunday 30 July 2006 page	xviii
0.2	Labor Strife in Detroit, 3 April 1941, awarded first-ever Pulitzer	
	Prize for Photography (1942). Photo: Milton Brooks	8
I.I	Paradise Square, Baghdad, 9 April, 2003	27
1.2	Arend van Dam, Media: worldwide influence on public	32
2.I	St Paul's Cathedral in London, England, seen through ruins after a	
	bombing raid during World War II	66
2.2	On the We are Not Afraid site film or cinema references are	
	common	98
2.3	On the We are Not Afraid site religious references are rare	98
2.4	Michelangelo, <i>Pietà</i> , St Peter's Basilica, The Vatican,	
	c. 1498–1499	IIO
2.5	Giotto, Lamentation or The Deposition of Christ. Fresco,	
	Cappella Scrovegni (Arena Chapel), Padua, 1304–1306	III
3.I	Front page of Edinburgh's <i>Evening News</i> , 'The Man Who Had No	
	Hope', 1 May 1997	118
3.2	Front page of Edinburgh's Evening News, 'Tragic James	
	Gives Life to Others', 5 May 1997	119
3.3	Valley of the Shadow of Death. Photo: Roger Fenton, 1855	130
3.4	A Harvest of Death. Photo: Timothy O'Sullivan, 1863	131
3.5	Humilitas triumphant. Speculum Virginum. Second quarter	
	of the twelfth century	150
4. I	Still from the <i>Great Train Robbery</i> , 1903, directed by Edwin	
	Porter	166
5.I	An Arend van Dam cartoon reflecting the common belief	
	in the powerful 'influence' of media violence	206
6.I	Bosnian soldier, 1994 Benetton Group S.p.A.	
	Photo: Oliviero Toscani	263



	List of figures	xi
6.2	Blazing car, 1992 Benetton Group S.p.A. Photo: Gian Luigi	
	Bellini/Globe Photos. Concept: Oliviero Toscani	263
6.3	Nativity scene, 'At this point the first king realised he'd left	
	the tag on'	269
7 . I	Still from Sergei Eisenstein's Battleship Potemkin (USSR 1925)	276
7.2	Still from Sergei Eisenstein's Battleship Potemkin (USSR 1925)	276
7.3	Still from Michael Powell and Emeric Pressburger's A Matter	
	of Life and Death (1946)	277
7.4	Still from Michael Powell and Emeric Pressburger's A Matter	
	of Life and Death (1946)	277
7.5	Icon of the Ladder of Divine Ascent, twelfth century. Illustration	
	from an instruction book for monks, by John Climacus, Abbot	
	of the Sinai Monastery	279



General Editor's preface

Jolyon Mitchell's new monograph, *Media Violence and Christian Ethics*, breaks new ground for this series. Media and film studies have developed strongly in the academic world over the last few years, but so far they have attracted comparatively little attention within Christian ethics. The combination of a multimedia approach with a specific focus upon media violence is particularly novel and welcome in this series. It picks up on themes of evil and violence addressed earlier in Gordon Graham's *Evil and Christian Ethics*, albeit paying particular attention to violence depicted in different media forms. It also complements Anthony Bash's very recent *Forgiveness and Christian Ethics*. Like other monographs in the series, *Media Violence and Christian Ethics* fulfils well the two key aims of the series as a whole – namely to promote monographs in Christian ethics which engage centrally with the present secular moral debate at the highest possible intellectual level and, secondly, to encourage contributors to demonstrate that Christian ethics can make a distinctive contribution to this debate.

Jolyon Mitchell is well aware that there are deep ambiguities lying at the heart of a study of media violence and Christian ethics. In an original fashion, he vividly demonstrates how portraying spectacular violence can also obscure other more hidden forms of violence. A simplistic Christian approach might be just to denounce each and every depiction of violence in media, forgetting in the process that some representations serve important social and even moral functions. In contrast, he makes the significant observation that Christian responses to violence are often ambiguous because there is a violent act at the heart of the Christian story. Artists for many centuries and now film-makers have portrayed this violent act graphically, sometimes in the interests of piety and worship. Yet ironically some Christians today have simultaneously deplored media violence and applauded Mel Gibson's graphically violent film *The Passion of the Christ*. Ambiguity to violence and to violent depictions runs through Christian history, and Jolyon Mitchell depicts this carefully.



xiv

General Editor's preface

He also finally shows that amidst the ambiguity of Christian responses to violence there are still biblical longings for peace beyond present violence – involving witness, hospitality, friendship and worship – which form important correctives within an often violent world. This is a welcome and challenging book.

ROBIN GILL



Acknowledgements

Researching and writing this book has been an adventure. I am grateful to a number of friends and colleagues who have accompanied me. David Smith, Michael Northcott, Peter Mitchell, Duncan Forrester and Michael Banner read all, or almost all, of a complete draft. Their comments were rigorous and extremely helpful. Nick Adams, Mark Birchall, Rufus Black, Larry Hurtado, David Morgan, Oliver O'Donovan, Marcus Plested, Sam Wells and David Wright provided constructive and often inspiring feedback on specific chapters. Thank you to friends and colleagues at New College for their ongoing support and encouragement. The freedom to take research leave and colleagues who make it possible are great gifts. So too are postgraduate and undergraduate students who ask thoughtful questions and offer new ways of looking at the world.

I also learnt a huge amount in the context of the friendships and the hospitality that I experienced as a member of the International Study Commission for Media, Religion and Culture, with Kwabena Asamaoh-Gyadu, Lynn Schofield Clark, Roberto Goizueta, Juan Carlos Henríquez, Mary Hess, Stewart Hoover, Peter Horsfield, Adán Medrano, David Morgan, Fabio Pasqualetti, Frances Forde Plude, Germán Rey, Siriwan Santisakultarm and Bob White. I am indebted to the generosity of Porticus for funding our research, travel and conversations. What we witnessed together contributed towards much in this book. Similarly, I wish to express gratitude to the AHRC; the Moray, the Minos and the Carnegie Trusts for their generous support towards my research costs; as well as to the Montgomery Trust and the Scott Holland Trust for facilitating the opportunity to



xvi

Acknowledgements

present elements of this research in public. The questions and responses that I received in different parts of the UK and beyond have enriched my argument, as did the valuable comments by the Cambridge University Press anonymous readers. Kate Brett, and before her, Kevin Taylor, at the Press were both patient and encouraging. Thanks also to Gillian Dadd and Rosina Di Marzo at the Press, to Judith Lavendar for her work on the index and to Steve Barganski for his careful copy-editing. Julene Knox has been a huge help with picture clearances; and, I am particularly grateful to the series editor Robin Gill for his careful reading and wise comments throughout the writing process.

I have adapted, expanded and updated two previously published articles: 'The Ethics of Photojournalism', *Studies in Christian Ethics* 13.1 (2000), pp. 1–16, and 'Seeing through the Drama: Reframing Violent News', in Trevor Hart and Steven Guthrie (eds.), *Faithful Performances: The Enactment of Christian Identity in Theology and the Arts* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007), pp. 123–46. I valued Esther Reed and Trevor Hart's helpful remarks on these essays. I am grateful to the publishers of these pieces, as well as to all the copyright holders of the pictures reproduced in this book. Specific credits are to be found by the images. Once any additional production costs are covered, royalties from this book will be donated to *The Samaritans*.

I have found myself exploring both new and old territory, and am appreciative of those who encouraged or guided me through questions related to this book, including Marcella Althaus Reid, Deanna Barch, Andrew Barr, Catharine Beck, Jeremy Begbie, Paul Binski, Judith Buchanan, Todd Braver, Jay Brown, Luke Bretherton, Heidi Campbell, Yam Chi-Keung, Cliff Christians, Eric Christianson, David Clough, Nick Couldry, Chris Deacy, Tim Dean, Frederick Dove, John Eldridge, Richard Ellis, John Ferré, Ineke de Feijter, David Fergusson, David Ford, Paul Foster, Peter Francis, Elaine Graham, Myrna Grant, Rosalind Hackett, Amy Laura Hall, Cees Hamelink, Dan Hardy, Douglas Hedley, Hannah Holtschneider, Morna Hooker, Tim Jenkins, Rob Johnston, Anna King, Elizabeth Koepping, Brian Larkin, F. Ellis Leigh, Alf Lindermann, David Lyon, John Lloyd, Knut Lundby, Gordon Lynch, Jeffrey Mahan, Clive Marsh, Alexander and Nadine Matheson, John McDowell, Birgit Meyer, Jeremy Morris, George Newlands, Dorota Ostrowska, John Orr, Fiona and Richard Parsons, Susan Parsons, Chad Pecknold, Martyn Percy, S. Brent Plate, John



Acknowledgements

xvii

Pritchard, Ben Quash, Milja Radovic, David Reimer, Joshua Rey, Amy Richards, Scott Ross, Roger Silverstone, Paul Soukup, Geoffrey Stevenson, Will Storrar, John Sweet, Rod Taylor, Bill Telford, Günter Thomas, John Thompson, Fraser Watts, and Nicholas Wood. Looking back over all these names is a reminder of valuable conversations, helpful emails, generous friends.

The friendships, hospitality and worship at St James, Leith, in Edinburgh and St Bene't's, in Cambridge, were invaluable, so too were the peaceable spaces created by Iona Birchall in the Cotswolds, as well as Pom and Kit Bowen and Judith and Andrew Matheson in the Highlands. Clare creates beautiful spaces and so much more, making this book possible. This book is dedicated to our children Sebastian, Jasmine and Xanthe, who bear witness to the gifts of wonder and laughter every day. It is in memory of a great friend and one of the readers of my earliest drafts, Iona's husband, and Clare, Katharine and John's father: Mark Birchall.





Figure O.I. Man carries body of a girl in Qana, Lebanon, Sunday 30 July 2006. Photo: Frederic LaFargue / Gamma, Camera Press London. Reproduced with permission.