

Remedies against international organisations

International organisations have become major players on the international scene, whose acts, actions and omissions affect individuals, companies and states. Damage to interests or violation of rights sometimes occurs (such as during peacekeeping operations, for example). Karel Wellens considers what remedies are available to potential claimants such as private contractors, staff members or, indeed, anyone suffering damage as a result of their actions. Can they turn to an ombudsman or national courts, or do they have to rely on support from their own state? Are the remedies provided by international organisations adequate? Wellens' conclusions include suggestions for alternative remedial options in the future.

Karel Wellens is Professor of Public International Law and the Law of International Organisations, at the Catholic University of Nijmegen, the Netherlands. He is also Chairman of the Advisory Committee on International Legal Issues to the Dutch Foreign Ministry and Co-Rapporteur of the International Law Association Committee on Accountability of International Organisations. His other publications include editing Resolutions and Statements of the UN Security Council (1946–1992): A Thematic Guide (1993) and Economic Conflicts and Disputes before the World Court (1922–1995) (1996).



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL AND COMPARATIVE LAW

This series (established in 1946 by Professors Gutteridge, Hersch Lauterpacht and McNair) is a forum of studies of high quality in the fields of public and private international law and comparative law. Although these are distinct legal sub-disciplines, developments since 1946 confirm their interrelation.

Comparative law is increasingly used as a tool in the making of law at national, regional and international levels. Private international law is increasingly affected by international conventions, and the issues faced by classical conflicts rules are increasingly dealt with by substantive harmonisation of law under international auspices. Mixed international arbitrations, especially those involving state economic activity, raise mixed questions of public and private international law. In many fields (such as the protection of human rights and democratic standards, investment guarantees and international criminal law) international and national systems interact. National constitutional arrangements relating to 'foreign affairs', and to the implementation of international norms, are a focus of attention.

Professor Sir Robert Jennings edited the series from 1981. Following his retirement as General Editor, an editorial board has been created and Cambridge University Press has recommitted itself to the series, affirming its broad scope.

The Board welcomes works of a theoretical or interdisciplinary character, and those focusing on new approaches to international or comparative law or conflicts of law. Studies of particular institutions or problems are equally welcome, as are translations of the best work published in other languages.

GENERAL EDITORS

Professor James R. Crawford SC FBA Whewell Professor of International Law, Faculty of Law and Director, Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law University of Cambridge

Professor John S. Bell FBA Professor of Law Faculty of Law University of Cambridge

EDITORIAL BOARD

Professor Hilary Charlesworth, University of Adelaide Professor Lori Damrosch, Columbia University Law School Professor John Dugard, Universiteit Leiden



Professor Mary-Ann Glendon, Harvard Law School
Professor Christopher Greenwood, London School of Economics
Professor David Johnston, University of Edinburgh
Professor Hein Kötz, Max-Planck-Institut, Hamburg
Professor Donald McRae, University of Ottawa
Professor Onuma Yasuaki, University of Tokyo
Professor Reinhard Zimmermann, Universität Regensburg

ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Professor Sir D. W. Bowett QC
Judge Rosalyn Higgins QC
Professor Sir Robert Jennings QC
Professor J. A. Jolowicz QC
Professor Sir Eli Lauterpacht QC
Professor Kurt Lipstein QC
Judge Stephen Schwebel



Remedies against international organisations

Karel Wellens

Catholic University of Nijmegen





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Karel Wellens 2002

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Wellens, Karel.

Remedies against international organisations/Karel Wellens.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in international and comparative law; [21])
 Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 81249 6 (hardback)

1. Tort liability of international agencies. I. Title. II. Cambridge studies in international and comparative law (Cambridge, England: 1996); 21.

K967.5.W45 2002 341.2-dc21 2001043130

ISBN 0 521 81249 6 hardback



Contents

	Acknowledgements List of abbreviations	oage ix
	List of abbreviations	xi
	Introduction	1
Part I	General features of remedies against international organisations	
1	The accountability regime for international organisations	7
2	Remedies against international organisations	10
3	The different levels of accountability and the appropriatenes of various remedies: scope <i>ratione materiae</i>	s 28
4	Access to remedies	36
5	Remedies against whom: the scope ratione personae respondentis	44
6	The potential outcome of remedies: scope ratione remedii	54
Part II	Procedural aspects of remedial action against international organisations	
7	Introduction to procedural aspects of remedial action against international organisations	st 63
8	Procedural aspects of remedial action by member states	66
9	Procedural aspects of remedial action by staff members	81
10	Procedural aspects of remedial action by private claimants	88
	vii	

© Cambridge University Press



viii	CONTENTS	
11	Procedural obstacles for representational non-governmental organisations	106
12	Procedural obstacles common to remedial action by non-state claimants	114
Part III	Substantive outcome of remedial action against international organisations	
13	General features of remedial outcome	135
14	Remedial outcome for staff members	147
15	Remedial outcome for private claimants	156
Part IV	Alternative remedial action against international organisations and options for the future	
16	Introduction to alternative remedial action against international organisations and options for the future	169
17	Pre-remedial action	172
18	Non-legal alternative remedial action	177
19	Amendment of existing judicial remedies	198
20	An inevitable role for the International Court of Justice	224
	Conclusion	263
	Bibliography	271
	Index	279



Acknowledgements

My main debt of gratitude goes to Professor James Crawford. As the then ILA Director of Studies he put forward my name as one of the Co-Rapporteurs when the Executive Council decided to establish a new ILA Committee on Accountability of International Organisations. In his capacity as Director of the Lauterpacht Research Centre of International Law he kindly agreed to my stay as a Visiting Fellow at the Centre in the spring of 2000. The publication of this study in the International and Comparative Law Series of which he is one of the general editors would not have been possible without his active involvement at crucial moments of this endeavour.

As regards my stay in Cambridge, particular thanks must go to all staff members and visiting fellows of the Lauterpacht Centre whose presence and friendship was invaluable throughout the process of writing, and to Clare Hall for having provided me with hospitality at West Court.

I should also like to express my gratitude to Miss Lesley Dingle, Foreign and International Law Librarian of the Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge, for her kind assistance.

I also greatly appreciated the support and encouragement of Sir Franklin Berman and Professor Malcolm Shaw, Chairman and Co-Rapporteur of our ILA Committee, and of my fellow Committee members: their dedication in carrying out the mandate given to us has been a constant source of inspiration in the preparation of this study.

Of course, all the errors and mistakes remain my exclusive accountability and the views expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the ILA Committee or of any of its members. I have attempted to render this study up to date as of 30 June 2000. This inevitably implies that important later developments could not be covered.

ix



X ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am indebted to the anonymous readers who reviewed my draft manuscript for Cambridge University Press; their valuable comments and suggestions, which I have largely followed, helped to improve the book. I am particularly grateful to Finola O'Sullivan and her team for preparing this publication in their well-known efficient and professional way.

On the institutional side I would like to express my gratitude to the Faculty of Law of the Catholic University of Nijmegen: my brief sabbatical period would not have been possible without their financial support.

My sincere admiration goes to Peter Morris for his meticulous English revision of the draft manuscript.

Finally, and most importantly, I would like to thank my wife, Chris, who not only had to endure several months of sabbatical separation, but with kindness and patience took over from my incapable hands the arduous task of ensuring the technical improvement of the final manuscript. This book is dedicated to her.



Abbreviations

AFDI Annuaire Français de Droit International
AJIL American Journal of International Law
ASIL American Society of International Law

ATCA Alien Tort Claims Act

BYIL British Yearbook of International Law

CFI Court of First Instance

CHR Commission on Human Rights

DPKO United Nations Department of Peacekeeping Operations
EBRD European Bank for Reconstruction and Development

EC European Community/Communities ECHR European Court of Human Rights

ECJ European Court of Justice
ECOSOC Economic and Social Council
EFTA European Free Trade Association

EU European Union

FSIA Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade IACHR Inter-American Court of Human Rights

IBRD International Bank for Reconstruction and Development

ICAO International Civil Aviation Organisation

ICJ International Court of Justice

ICLQ International and Comparative Law Quarterly
ICRC International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

ICTY International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia

ILA International Law AssociationILC International Law CommissionILM International Legal Materials

хi



XII LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ILO International Labour Organisation

ILOAT ILO Administrative Tribunal ILR International Law Reports

ITLOS International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

JAB Joint Appeals Board

[WTL Journal of World Trade Law

LJIL Leiden Journal of International Law
NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organisation
NGO Non-governmental organisation
NILR Netherlands International Law Review
OAS Organisation of American States

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

OIOS Office of Internal Oversight Services
ONUC Opérations des Nations Unies au Congo

OJ Official Journal

OPCW Organisation for the Prohibition of Chemical Weapons

PCA Permanent Court of Arbitration

PCIJ Permanent Court of International Justice

RBDI Revue Belge de Droit International

RCADI Recueil des Cours de l'Académie de Droit International

SOFA Status of Forces Agreement

UN United Nations

UNAMIR United Nations Assistance Mission for Rwanda

UNAT United Nations Administrative Tribunal

UNCITRAL United Nations Commission on International Trade Law

UNCLOS United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

UNEF United Nations Emergency Force

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural

Organisation

UNFICYP United Nations Peacekeeping Force in Cyprus

UNHCHR United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund

UNMIK United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo

UNOSOM United Nations Operation in Somalia
UNPROFOR United Nations Protection Force

UNRIAA United Nations Reports of International Arbitral Awards



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS XIII

UNRWA United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestinian Refugees in the Near East UNSCOM United Nations Special Commission on Iraq

UNTAC United Nations Transitional Authority in Cambodia
UNTAES United Nations Transitional Administration for Eastern

Slavonia, Baranja and Western Sirmium

UNTAET United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor

UNTEA United Nations Temporary Executive Authority

US United States

WHO World Health Organisation

WIPO World Intellectual Property Organisation

WTO World Trade Organisation

ZAÖRV Zeitschrift für Ausländisches, Öffentliches Recht und Völkerrecht