Environment, Power, and Injustice
A South African History

This book presents the socio-environmental history of black people in the area near Kuruman, on the edge of the Kalahari in South Africa. Considering successive periods – Tswana agropastoral chiefdoms before colonial contact, the Cape frontier, British colonial rule, Apartheid, and the homeland of Bophuthatswana in the 1980s – *Environment, Power, and Injustice* shows how the human relationship with the environment corresponded to differences of class, gender, and race. While exploring biological, geological, and climatological forces in history, this book argues that the challenges of existence in a semidesert arose more from human injustice than from deficiencies in the natural environment. In fact, powerful people drew strength from and exercised their power over others through the environment. At the same time, the natural world provided marginal peoples with some relief from human injustice.

Nancy J. Jacobs is Assistant Professor in the Department of Africana Studies and the Department of History at Brown University, Providence, Rhode Island, USA. She is a recipient of the Alice Hamilton article prize from the American Society for Environmental History.
STUDIES IN ENVIRONMENT AND HISTORY

Editors
Donald Worster, University of Kansas
J. R. McNeill, Georgetown University

Other books in the series
DONALD WORSTER Nature’s Economy: A History of Ecological Ideas
KENNETH F. KIPLE The Caribbean Slave: A Biological History
ALFRED W. CROSBY Ecological Imperialism: The Biological Expansion of Europe, 900–1900
ARTHUR F. MCEVOY The Fisherman’s Problem: Ecology and Law in the California Fisheries, 1850–1980
ROBERT HARMS Games Against Nature: An Eco-Cultural History of the Nuru of Equatorial Africa
WARREN DEAN Brazil and the Struggle for Rubber: A Study in Environmental History
DONALD WORSTER The Ends of the Earth: Perspectives on Modern Environmental History
MICHAEL WILLIAMS Americans and Their Forests: A Historical Geography
TIMOTHY SILVER A New Face on the Countryside: Indians, Colonists, and Slaves in the South Atlantic Forests, 1500–1800
THEODORE STEINBERG Nature Incorporated: Industrialization and the Waters of New England
J. R. MCNEILL The Mountains of the Mediterranean World: An Environmental History
ELINOR G. K. MELVILLE A Plague of Sheep: Environmental Consequences of the Conquest of Mexico
MARK ELVIN AND TSUI JUNG LIU Sediments of Time: Environment and Society in Chinese History
ROBERT B. MARKS Tigers, Rice, Silk, and Silt: Environment and Economy in Late Imperial South China
THOMAS DUNLAP Nature and the English Diaspora
ANDREW C. ISENBERG The Destruction of the Bison: An Environmental History, 1730–1920
EDMUND RUSSELL War and Nature: Fighting Humans and Insects with Chemicals from World War I to Silent Spring
JUDITH SHAPIRO Mao’s War against Nature: Politics and the Environment in Revolutionary China
ADAM ROME The Bulldozer in the Countryside: Suburban Sprawl and the Rise of American Environmentalism
Environment, Power, 
and Injustice

A South African History

NANCY J. JACOBS

Brown University
To my father, Fred Jacobs,

and the memory of my mother, Irene Jacobs
Contents

List of Illustrations xi
List of Tables xv
Preface xvii
Abbreviations xx

1 Approaching Kuruman 1
   The Kalahari Thornveld Today: A Tour 4
   Two Histories from Below: A Socio-Environmental Approach 16
   Doing Socio-Environmental History in Kuruman 21
   An Overview: The Frontier, Colonialism, and Segregation 28

2 Goat People and Fish People on the Agro-Pastoral Frontier, c. 1750–1830 32
   Goat People and Fish People Become Tlhaping 33
   The Ecological Cycle in an Agro-Pastoral Society 39
   Pastoralism: A Propitious Food Source 43
   Social Power and the Ecological Cycle 45
   Shifting Cultivation as Extensive Production 49
   Cultivation – A Sphere of Female Autonomy 52
   Environment, Production, and Class and Gender 56

3 Intensification and Social Innovation on the Cape Frontier, 1820s–1884 57
   Irrigation as an Innovation in Production and Society 57
   African Initiative in River Valleys 66
   Commercial Hunting and Wood Cutting: Profit and Extensive Production 70
   The Social Implications of Irrigation and Commerce 72
   An Ecological Revolution? 75
## Contents

4 Colonial Annexation: Land Alienation and Environmental Administration, 1884–1894 76  
Changing Customs of Tenure on the Cape Frontier 79  
The Scramble for Kuruman 81  
The British Bechuanaland Land Commission and the Alienation of Pastures 83  
The British Bechuanaland Land Commission and Land Tenure 87  
Land Disputes under Direct Rule 89  
Direct Rule and Environmental Administration 91  
Working the Land and Working for Cash 92  
Colonial Environmental Administration 95

5 Environmental Trauma, Colonial Rule, and the Failure of Extensive Food Production, 1895–1903 96  
Environmental Change over the Long Term 96  
Epizootic and Violence, 1895–1897 101  
Failures of Production and Distribution: Food Shortage and Famine 106  
Wage Labor and Government Intervention during the 1903 Famine 111  
Entitlements under Colonial Rule 116

6 The Environmental History of a “Labor Reservoir,” 1903–1970s 117  
Population and Production 118  
Producing Food: Browsers and Grazers in a Bushier Veld 120  
Producing Food: Extensive Cultivation and Casual Irrigation on Reserves 129  
Selling Labor for Wages and Other Remuneration 133  
“If We Were All Equal, There Would Be No Cooperation” 141

Environmental Rights of Tribal Subjects 149  
The Whites of the Eye 151  
Segregation of the Flowing Eye 153  
Extensive Agriculture Meets Agricultural Extension 158  
Eschewing the Trust 162  
Removals from Black Spots and White Farms, 1943–1963 164  
Separate Development and Removals, 1963–1977 169  
Environmental History and Racial Segregation 172
## Contents

8 Betterment and the Bophuthatswana Donkey Massacre:
   The Environmental Rights of Tribal Subjects, 1940s–1983  173
   Indirect Rule and Environmental Rights  174
   The Ideology of Betterment in the Thornveld  177
   Redeveloping the Landscape  180
   Hindering Subsistence, Promoting Commercial Production  185
   The Effects of Betterment: Evidence from Above  189
   The Great Bophuthatswana Donkey Massacre  195
   Coercion and Conservation  204

9 Retrospectives on Socio-Environmental History
   and Socio-Environmental Justice  206
   Histories of Decline and Adaptation  207
   The Endurance of Extensive Production  209
   Indigenous Theories of Environmental Justice  210
   Socio-Environmental History and Socio-Environmental Justice  217

Appendix A South African Census Statistics on Human Population  223
Appendix B South African Census Statistics on Stock Population  226
Appendix C1 1991 Individual Interviews  228
Appendix C2 1997–1998 Individual Interviews  230
Appendix D A Note on Archival Sources  235
Notes  239
Index  293
List of Illustrations

Cover illustration: Sophie Tshekoeng near Ncweng, 1998. (Photograph courtesy of Peter Heywood.)

1-1 South Africa. Based on information in the public domain. page 2
1-2 Kuruman District mean monthly rainfall, 1931–97. 6
1-3 Kuruman rainfall, 1932–65. 8
1-4 Kuruman rainfall, 1966–97. 9
1-5 The Kuruman area today. 10
1-6 The Eye at Ga-Mopedi, 2001. 13
3-1 The pond at the Eye of Kuruman in the 1880s. 60
3-2 Wheat at the Kuruman LMS mission, 1870s. 65
4-1 Kuruman crown and native reserves. 81
6-1 The black population in Kuruman, 1896–1950. 119
6-2 The view from on the Ghaap Plateau looking toward the Kuruman Hills, 1998. 121
6-3 Herd size (LSUs) by number of households, Konong, 1959. 122
6-4 Goats, sheep, cattle, and donkeys in selected years. 125
6-5 Gladys Motshabe and friend in her donkey cart, 2001. 126
6-6 Exceptional irrigated gardening near Batlharios, 1998. 130
6-7 An unclaimed asbestos mine above the Neweng primary school, 1998. 140
7-1 Surveyor’s map of the Kuruman Eye and the Upper Kuruman River Valley, 1917. 154
7-2 Surveyor’s map of the Kuruman River Valley below the mission. 155
7-3 Segregation of land in Kuruman. 165
8-1 The Lower Kuruman River Valley in 1958. 190
List of Illustrations

8-2 The Lower Kuruman River Valley in 1981. 191
8-3 The Horseshoe Block in 1965. 192
8-4 The Horseshoe Block in 1972. 193
8-5 The Horseshoe Block in 1981. 194
8-6 The Kalahari Northeast of the Matlhwareng River in 1958. 196
8-7 The Kalahari Northeast of the Matlhwareng River in 1965. 197
8-8 The Kalahari Northeast of the Matlhwareng River in 1972. 198
8-9 Cattle and donkeys in the Thaping-Tharo District. 200
List of Tables

4-1 Kuruman Crown and Native Reserves  page 85
7-1 Segregation of Land in Kuruman  166
8-1 Rotational Grazing  184
Preface

The research that became this book was possible because of several generous grants. I have been a recipient of the following support: a Fulbright-Hays Grant in 1991; an Indiana University College of Arts and Sciences Second Semester Fellowship in 1994; an American Council of Learned Societies/Social Science Research Council International Postdoctoral Fellowship (made possible with funding from the National Endowment for the Humanities) in 1997–8; and a Bernadotte E. Schmitt Grant from the American Historical Association in 1998. I am also grateful to the Brown University Office of the Dean of the Faculty for a Junior Sabbatical in 1997 and for a subvention to underwrite the costs of producing this book. I would like to acknowledge the permission of the Chief Directorate of Surveys and Mapping in South Africa to use their copyrighted map material and aerial photographs to make the maps and reproductions of aerial photographs in this book. I also thank the MacGregor Museum in Kimberley for permission to use copyrighted historic photographs of the Kuruman area.

Of all the people I must thank for their assistance and support, I will begin with my teachers. First, I thank my professors at Calvin College, who taught me to consider justice and encouraged me to take up the academic life. I am especially grateful to Wallace Bratt and Barbara Carvill. Alan Boesak, who taught me at Calvin College for one semester, was a tremendous influence. At UCLA, where I did an MA in African Studies, I received generous guidance from Richard Sklar and Joseph Lauer. The best decision I made in my academic life may have been to enroll in a Ph.D. program in the History Department at Indiana University. There, I received stimulating instruction and unfailing support. I am extremely indebted to Phyllis Martin for serving as my doctoral advisor. She remained cheerful and encouraging, while reading critically and asking probing questions. She also gave me the freedom to pursue environmental history.
Preface

Also at Indiana University, I benefited greatly from working with many other members of the faculty, including Randall Baker, George Brooks, William Cohen, Paula Girshick, John Hanson, C. R. D. Halisi, and Patrick O’Meara.

My next acknowledgment must be to the collegiality of my peers. I am especially honored to have been a classmate of the late Christopher Gray at Indiana University. I have also enjoyed knowing and learning from Allison Shutt. In Bloomington, Moira Wedekind and Hank Huffman taught me that the environment was important in ways I had not recognized. As I formulated this book, conversations with many people instructed me about new ways to consider environmental and African studies. I would like to acknowledge my long-standing debts to the following: Kevin Shillington, Pieter Snyman, Neil Parsons, Charles van Onselen, Jan-Bart Gewald, John Wright, Robert Harms, Jim Giblin, Jim McCann, Jane Carruthers, the late Ruth Edgecombe, Greg Maddox, Teresa Barnes, Jamie Monson, Tom Johnson, Chris Conte, Immanuel Krieke, Ravi Ravjan, Laura Mitchell, Derick Fay, Joshua Forrest, Robert Gordon, Jock McCulloch, David Ward, Suzanne Vetter, Richard Madsen, Kim Euston-Brown, Kees Bootsman, Andy Manson, James Drummond, Lerato Thahome, and David Phalatse. These people helped me in many ways by asking me the right questions, by answering the questions I asked them, and by reading earlier versions of this manuscript. Of these colleagues, Ruth Edgecombe, Andy Manson, Neil Parsons, and James Drummond generously opened their homes to me.

As an American, conducting research in South Africa is a logistical challenge. Over the years, I have received the generous hospitality and assistance of people at the Moffat Mission, including Alan and Hilda Butler, the late Joseph and Marjory Wing, Steve DeGruchy and Marian Loveday, and Sophie Rieters. In addition to providing me with housing, Moffat Mission staff helped me create a research network. In Cape Town and Johannesburg, I thank Nick Binedell, Rob and Sue Stelzner, and Jeannine Jennings and Peter Ibbotson for giving me a place to live for extended periods.

Doing worthwhile interviews is a difficult project and other people helped me find success. I thank my old friend Steve Michmerhuizen for introducing me to Rapid Rural Appraisal (RRA). I have a tremendous debt to two former students who joined me in Kuruman to do RRA interviews. Working as volunteers, Megan Waples and Kristin Russell figured out the RRA technique, found their way around Kuruman villages, cooked, cleaned, and kept the car running and entertained everyone. Bhangi Mosala and Kgomo(tso Tshetelh joined us as interpreters but became RRA interviewers in their own right. Other interpreters worked with me for shorter periods: Richard Mogwera, Constance Paul, Rosey Molokoane, Poppy Afrikaner, Bhangi Mosala, Tsolo Steenkamp,
Preface

Victoria Tsatsimpe, and Kopano Chirwa. I hardly know how to thank Julius Mogodi, Benjamin Barnette, Gaogonelwe Motsamai, Peter Mokomele, and especially Stephen Kotoloane. At times they worked as interpreters, but their contribution was more fundamental. They all took interest in the project, introduced me to people and encouraged them to trust me, and advised me on my work. Clearly, the interviews for this book were a collaborative effort, and I am deeply indebted to all who helped with them.

I must also address my tremendous outstanding debt to the people who allowed me to interview them. My research brought no evident benefits to people in Kuruman, and I was touched that so many were willing to consider my questions. As John Molema told a neighbor, “Nancy is not here to help us, we must help her,” and he and others taught me much. I would like to thank all individual informants cited by name in the references. Because many of my interviews were in groups, I will thank those people by recognizing the villages they lived in. My research assistants and I were hospitably received in the following villages: Bothetheletsa, Manyeding, Ncweng, Ga-Mopedi, Batlaros, Seodin, Kagung, Sedibeng, Ga-Sebolao, Ga-Lothlare, Maipeneke, Ga-Diboe, Logobate, and Churchill and by many individuals in Mothibistad and the town of Kuruman.

Finding the right documents is another challenge, one that archivists and librarians helped me meet. I am particularly grateful to the staff at the National Archives in Pretoria and the Cape Archives in Cape Town. They were unfailingly helpful and patient. Furthermore, my research on removals has benefited considerably from the assistance of the staff at The Association for Community and Rural Advancement (AnCRA) in Kuruman and from researchers at the Department of Land Affairs in Pretoria. Both organizations unstintingly shared materials on removals of Kuruman reserves.

At Brown University, I thank members of the Departments of History and Africana Studies, especially those who considered my ideas: John Thomas, Jim Campbell, Rhett Jones, Maud Mandel, Michael Vorenberg, Kerry Smith, Karl Jacoby, and Amy Remensnyder. Conversations with Shepard Krech, Peter Uvin, and Blenda Femenias have also helped me refine my thoughts. I have also relied on the particular skills of Lynn Carlson, who made my maps, and Jess Lopez, who prepared illustrations. I must thank Nancy Soukup for support and proofreading. One joy of being at Brown University is working with the students. The following students have read and commented helpfully on parts of the manuscript: Matthew Lange, Katherine Bayerl, and Adam Schupack. I thank the Brown Undergraduate Teaching and Research Assistantship Program that enabled me to work with Elisa Margolis on the history of rinderpest and with Joe Winter on graphics.

xix
Preface

I am also grateful to my collaborators in the 2001 asbestos research project that made Kuruman its case study. I thank my colleagues Sophia Kisting, Lundy Braun, John Trimbur, and Simphiwe Mbuli, as well as our students Scott Bulcao, Kristen Erickson, Alice Kidder, Theo Luebke, Marc Manseau, Mpho Matsipa, Almea Matanock, Kagisho Motseme, Fanomezantsoa Endor Rakoto, Casey Roberts, Kat Saxton, and Lucia Trimbur. We also owe a debt of gratitude to the new director of the Moffat Mission, Richard Aitken, who with Jane Argall, supported the project and became our valued collaborators. A Richard B. Salomon Faculty Research Award from Brown University and supplemental funding from the Dean of the Faculty allowed me to return to South Africa for the asbestos research. Returning to Kuruman with this group gave me new perspectives on its history and a much deeper understanding of contemporary environmental problems. I thank them for their dedication to the work and to the international collaboration.

Following convention, in this last paragraph of the acknowledgments I thank my family. My parents, Fred Jacobs and the late Irene Jacobs, of Holland, Michigan, always encouraged me to study and travel. Their support was crucial to my studies and research. Even after years of hearing about it, my siblings and in-laws usually took interest in my work and were always humorous when they did not. I am especially grateful to the other historians in the family, my sister Chris and brother-in-law Dirk Mouw, who read parts of the manuscript. Finally, my husband Peter Heywood, a biologist who committed to both me and Kuruman in a ceremony in the Moffat Church, astounds me with his generosity, insight, integrity, and talent. In countless ways he has supported my research and helped me turn it into this book. His most evident contributions are the photographs of contemporary Kuruman and my understanding of photosynthesis, but he has been involved in many less obvious ways as well. Not least, he has been a thoughtful companion in seeking equitable ways of using and preserving the environment, and of living in this world.

Nancy Jacobs
2002
Abbreviations

ANC   African National Congress
AnCRA The Association for Community and Rural Advancement
ARD   Asbestos-Related Disease
BAD   Union and Republic of South Africa Bantu Administration and Development Department
BB    British Bechuanaland
BBLC  British Bechuanaland Land Commission
BIC   Bantu Investment Corporation
BP    Bechuanaland Protectorate
CC    Cape Colony
GLW   Griqualand West
LMS   London Missionary Society
LSU   Large Stock Unit
NAC   Native Affairs Commission
NAD   Native Affairs Department
OFS   Orange Free State
SANT  South African Native Trust
SAR   South African Republic
UCDP  United Christian Democratic Party