

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO  
BRENTANO

Franz Brentano (1838–1917) led an intellectual revolution that sought to revitalize German-language philosophy and to reverse its post-Kantian direction. His philosophy laid the groundwork for philosophy of science as it came to fruition in the Vienna Circle, and for phenomenology in the work of such figures as his student Edmund Husserl. This volume brings together newly commissioned chapters on his important work in theory of intentionality, theory of judgment, the reform of syllogistic logic, empirical descriptive psychology and phenomenology, theory of knowledge, metaphysics and ontology, value theory, and natural theology. It also offers a critical evaluation of Brentano's significance in his historical context, and of his impact on contemporary philosophy in both the analytic and the continental traditions.

DALE JACQUETTE is Professor of Philosophy at The Pennsylvania State University. His recent books include *David Hume's Critique of Infinity* (2001), *Symbolic Logic* (2001) and *Ontology* (2002).

## OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS

- AQUINAS *Edited by* NORMAN KRETZMANN *and*  
 ELEONORE STUMP
- HANNAH ARENDT *Edited by* DANA VILLA
- ARISTOTLE *Edited by* JONATHAN BARNES
- AUGUSTINE *Edited by* ELEONORE STUMP *and*  
 NORMAN KRETZMANN
- BACON *Edited by* MARKKU PELTONEN
- SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR *Edited by* CLAUDIA CARD
- DARWIN *Edited by* JONATHAN HODGE *and*  
 GREGORY RADICK
- DESCARTES *Edited by* JOHN COTTINGHAM
- DUNS SCOTUS *Edited by* THOMAS WILLIAMS
- EARLY GREEK PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* A. A. LONG
- FEMINISM IN PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* MIRANDA  
 FRICKER *and* JENNIFER HORNSBY
- FOUCAULT *Edited by* GARY GUTTING
- FREUD *Edited by* JEROME NEU
- GALILEO *Edited by* PETER MACHAMER
- GERMAN IDEALISM *Edited by* KARL AMERIKS
- GREEK AND ROMAN PHILOSOPHY *Edited by*  
 DAVID SEDLEY
- HABERMAS *Edited by* STEPHEN K. WHITE
- HEGEL *Edited by* FREDERICK BEISER
- HEIDEGGER *Edited by* CHARLES GUIGNON
- HOBBS *Edited by* TOM SORELL
- HUME *Edited by* DAVID FATE NORTON
- HUSSERL *Edited by* BARRY SMITH *and* DAVID  
 WOODRUFF SMITH
- WILLIAM JAMES *Edited by* RUTH ANNA PUTNAM
- KANT *Edited by* PAUL GUYER
- KIERKEGAARD *Edited by* ALASTAIR HANNAY *and*  
 GORDON MARINO
- LEIBNIZ *Edited by* NICHOLAS JOLLEY
- LEVINAS *Edited by* SIMON CRITCHLEY *and* ROBERT  
 BERNASCONI
- LOCKE *Edited by* VERE CHAPPELL
- MALEBRANCHE *Edited by* STEVEN NADLER
- MARX *Edited by* TERRELL CARVER

MEDIEVAL JEWISH PHILOSOPHY *Edited by*  
DANIEL H. FRANK *and* OLIVER LEAMAN  
MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* A. S. McGRADE  
MILL *Edited by* JOHN SKORUPSKI  
NEWTON *Edited by* I. BERNARD COHEN *and*  
GEORGE E. SMITH  
NIETZSCHE *Edited by* BERND MAGNUS *and*  
KATHLEEN HIGGINS  
OCKHAM *Edited by* PAUL VINCENT SPADE  
PASCAL *Edited by* NICHOLAS HAMMOND  
PLATO *Edited by* RICHARD KRAUT  
PLOTINUS *Edited by* LLOYD P. GERSON  
RAWLS *Edited by* SAMUEL FREEMAN  
ROUSSEAU *Edited by* PATRICK RILEY  
BERTRAND RUSSELL *Edited by* NICHOLAS GRIFFIN  
SARTRE *Edited by* CHRISTINA HOWELLS  
SCHOPENHAUER *Edited by* CHRISTOPHER JANAWAY  
THE SCOTTISH ENLIGHTENMENT *Edited by*  
ALEXANDER BROADIE  
SPINOZA *Edited by* DON GARRETT  
THE STOICS *Edited by* BRAD INWOOD  
WITTGENSTEIN *Edited by* HANS SLUGA *and* DAVID  
STERN

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-0-521-80980-1 — The Cambridge Companion to Brentano  
Edited by Dale Jacquette  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*The Cambridge Companion to*  
**BRENTANO**

---

Edited by Dale Jacquette  
*The Pennsylvania State University*



Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
 978-0-521-80980-1 — The Cambridge Companion to Brentano  
 Edited by Dale Jacquette  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India  
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521809801](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521809801)

© Cambridge University Press 2004

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

The Cambridge companion to Brentano / edited by Dale Jacquette.

p. cm. — (Cambridge companions to philosophy)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 80980 0 ISBN 0 521 00765 8 (pbk.)

1. Brentano, Franz Clemens, 1838–1917. 2. Philosophy, Austrian – 19th century. 3. Philosophy, Austrian – 20th century. I. Title: Brentano.

II. Jacquette, Dale. III. Series.

B3212.Z7C35 2004

193 – dc21 2003053215

ISBN 978-0-521-80980-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-0-521-80980-1 — The Cambridge Companion to Brentano  
Edited by Dale Jacquette  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*Vera philosophiae methodus nulla alia nisi scientiae naturalis est.*  
— Franz Brentano, 1866

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-0-521-80980-1 — The Cambridge Companion to Brentano  
Edited by Dale Jacquette  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*To the memory of Roderick M. Chisholm*

CONTENTS

	<i>List of contributors</i>	<i>page</i> xiii
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
	<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xviii
	<i>Chronology</i>	xx
I	Introduction: Brentano’s philosophy DALE JACQUETTE	I
2	Brentano’s relation to Aristotle ROLF GEORGE AND GLEN KOEHN	20
3	Judging correctly: Brentano and the reform of elementary logic PETER SIMONS	45
4	Brentano on the mind KEVIN MULLIGAN	66
5	Brentano’s concept of intentionality DALE JACQUETTE	98
6	Reflections on intentionality JOSEPH MARGOLIS	131
7	Brentano’s epistemology LINDA L. McALISTER	149
8	Brentano on judgment and truth CHARLES PARSONS	168



xii	Contents	
9	Brentano's ontology: from conceptualism to reism	197
	ARKADIUSZ CHRUDZIMSKI AND BARRY SMITH	
10	Brentano's value theory: beauty, goodness, and the concept of correct emotion	220
	WILHELM BAUMGARTNER AND LYNN PASQUERELLA	
11	Brentano on religion and natural theology	237
	SUSAN F. KRANTZ GABRIEL	
12	Brentano and Husserl	255
	ROBIN D. ROLLINGER	
13	Brentano's impact on twentieth-century philosophy	277
	KARL SCHUHMANN	
	<i>Bibliography</i>	298
	<i>Index</i>	316

## CONTRIBUTORS

WILHELM BAUMGARTNER is Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Franz Brentano Forschung at the University of Würzburg, Germany. He is the editor of *Brentano Studien: Internationales Jahrbuch der Franz Brentano Forschung*, and the author of numerous articles on Brentano, his school, and on philosophy in the phenomenological tradition. He has edited, together with Roderick M. Chisholm, Brentano's *Deskriptive Psychologie*, and has assisted with several translations of works by Brentano into Polish, Slovenian, Italian, and Romanian. He is currently Chairman of the Internationale Franz Brentano Gesellschaft ([www.franz-brentano.de](http://www.franz-brentano.de)), and as Director of the Brentano Forschung preserves the Brentano *Nachlaß* to make it available for research. Baumgartner is currently preparing Brentano's *Lectures on Metaphysics* and *Scientific Correspondence* for publication.

ARKADIUSZ CHRUDZIMSKI is research assistant at the University of Salzburg, Austria, and assistant professor at the University of Zielona Góra, Poland. He is the author of *Die Erkenntnistheorie von Roman Ingarden* and *Intentionalitätstheorie beim frühen Brentano*, in addition to articles on ontology, epistemology, phenomenology and Austrian philosophy.

ROLF GEORGE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Waterloo, Canada, where he has taught since 1966. His publications include English translations of Brentano's work on Aristotle, *On the Several Senses of Being in Aristotle*, *The Psychology of Aristotle*, and, with Roderick M. Chisholm, *Aristotle and his World View*. He also edited Brentano's Aristotelian manuscripts, *Über Aristoteles*. He is

xiv List of contributors

the author of articles on a variety of topics including logic, Austrian philosophy, eighteenth-century philosophy and distributive justice.

DALE JACQUETTE is Professor of Philosophy at The Pennsylvania State University. He is the author of articles on logic, metaphysics, philosophy of mind, and Wittgenstein, and has recently published *Philosophy of Mind*, *Meinongian Logic: the Semantics of Existence and Nonexistence*, *Wittgenstein's Thought in Transition*, *David Hume's Critique of Infinity*, *Symbolic Logic*, *On Boole*, and *Ontology*, and edited a collection on *Schopenhauer, Philosophy, and the Arts* and the *Blackwell Companion to Philosophical Logic*. He is currently editor of *American Philosophical Quarterly*.

GLEN KOEHN is Adjunct Associate Professor at the University of Maryland, University College. He has taught at South Korean universities, and has had longstanding interests in both Brentano and Aristotle. His recent paper on Aristotelian ethics, "Human Goodness and the Golden Mean," appeared in the *Journal of Value Inquiry*.

SUSAN F. KRANTZ GABRIEL is Professor of Philosophy at St. Anselm College, New Hampshire. She is editor and translator of the English edition of Brentano's lectures on natural theology, *On the Existence of God*, and author of *Refuting Peter Singer's Ethical Theory: The Importance of Human Dignity*, as well as articles on Brentano and other subjects.

JOSEPH MARGOLIS is Laura H. Carnell Professor of Philosophy at Temple University, Philadelphia. He has published widely in a variety of specialties. His most recent books include: *Selves and Other Texts* and *Reinventing Pragmatism: American Philosophy at the End of the Twentieth Century*. He has recently completed *The Unraveling of Scientism* and *The Advantages of a Second-Best Morality*.

LINDA L. MCALISTER is Professor Emerita at the University of South Florida. She has taught at San Diego State University, Brooklyn College, the CUNY Graduate Center, and UCLA. Her dissertation was on Brentano's ethics and she was subsequently engaged by the Franz Brentano Foundation to prepare the English edition of Brentano's *Psychologie vom empirischen Standpunkt*. After publishing other works on Brentano she turned her attention to feminist philosophy. She edited *Hypatia: a Journal of Feminist Philosophy*

## List of contributors

xv

for several years and she is editor of *Hypatia's Daughters*, a collection of articles about women in the history of philosophy.

KEVIN MULLIGAN is Professor of Analytic Philosophy at the University of Geneva, Switzerland. He has recently edited (with J.-P. Cometti) *La Philosophie autrichienne de Bolzano à Musil: histoire et actualité*, and (with B. Baertschi) *Les Nationalismes*, and is the author of numerous articles on ontology, perception, emotions and values, Wittgenstein and Austro-German philosophies of mind.

CHARLES PARSONS is Edgar Pierce Professor of Philosophy at Harvard University. He has written on logic, philosophy of logic and mathematics, Kant, Husserl, Gödel, and other figures. He is co-editor of volumes III–V of the *Collected Works* of Kurt Gödel and author of *Mathematics in Philosophy* and *Mathematical Thought and its Objects*.

LYNN PASQUERELLA is Professor of Philosophy and Chair of the Institutional Review Board at the University of Rhode Island. She is a Fellow in the John Hazen White Sr. Center for Ethics and Public Service, a past recipient of the University of Rhode Island's Teaching Excellence Award, and has published extensively in the areas of medical ethics, theoretical and applied ethics, public policy, and the philosophy of law.

ROBIN D. ROLLINGER is assistant to the Husserl Archives in Louvain, Belgium. He is the author of two books, *Meinong and Husserl on Abstraction and Universals* and *Husserl's Position in the School of Brentano*, as well as various articles on phenomenology and its background in nineteenth- and early twentieth-century philosophy, psychology, and logic. He is editor of a volume of writings from Husserl's literary remains on transcendental idealism, to appear in the *Husserliana* series, and is currently editing a volume of writings from Husserl's extensive literary remains on the theory of judgment for the *Husserliana*.

KARL SCHUHMANN was Professor of History of Post-Medieval Philosophy at Utrecht University in The Netherlands. In addition to numerous articles on Renaissance philosophy and seventeenth-century mechanism, especially Hobbes, he published many articles

xvi List of contributors

on the Brentano school. He was editor of Husserl's *Ideen I*, and, together with Elisabeth Schuhmann, of Husserl's *Briefwechsel*. In 1984, with J. N. Mohanty, he founded the journal *Husserl Studies*. His books include *Die Fundamentalbetrachtung der Phänomenologie*, *Husserl-Chronik*, and *Husserls Staatsphilosophie*.

PETER SIMONS is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Leeds, UK. He is the author of two books: *Parts* and *Philosophy and Logic in Central Europe from Bolzano to Tarski*, as well as over 150 articles, including several on Brentano. His interests include metaphysics, logic, the history of Austrian and Polish philosophy and logic, the philosophy of mathematics, and the application of ontology to engineering and business. He is currently Director of the Franz Brentano Foundation.

BARRY SMITH is Julian Park Professor of Philosophy at State University of New York (SUNY), Buffalo, and Director of the Institute for Formal Ontology and Medical Information Science at the University of Leipzig, Germany. He is the author of *Austrian Philosophy: the Legacy of Franz Brentano*, and has translated Brentano's *Philosophical Investigations on Space, Time and the Continuum*. He has worked extensively in ontology and in the history of German-language philosophy, and his current research is focused on the applications of formal ontology in information science. He was recently awarded the Wolfgang Paul Prize of the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am grateful first and foremost to the authors for their excellent contributions to this volume of previously unpublished essays on the philosophy of Franz Clemens Brentano. I am indebted also to Hilary Gaskin, philosophy editor at Cambridge University Press, for her professional guidance of this project, and for cultivating an atmosphere of partnership with the press in the book's production. I acknowledge the Alexander von Humboldt-Stiftung for its generous assistance in sponsoring my research at the Franz Brentano Forschung, Julius-Maximilians-Universität, Würzburg, Germany, during my sabbatical leave from The Pennsylvania State University in 2000–1, when the planning and organization of the book was undertaken. I thank Tina (Traas) Jacquette for her love and marathon philosophical conversations. Reinhard Fabian of the Forschungsstelle und Dokumentationszentrum für österreichische Philosophie, Graz, Austria, provided the digital photograph of Brentano which appears on the book's cover, image-enhanced by Scott K. Templeton, to whom warmest thanks are also due. Finally, Karl Schuhmann, contributor to this volume and longtime Brentano scholar of distinction, passed away as this book was in preparation. He is warmly remembered as a philosopher, historian, exacting critic of many philosophical traditions, and admired friend.

Dale Jacquette

## ABBREVIATIONS

The following abbreviations are used throughout in referring to Brentano's most frequently consulted writings; publication details are given in the Bibliography.

### I ORIGINAL GERMAN TEXTS

ANR	<i>Die Abkehr vom Nichtrealen</i>
AW	<i>Aristoteles und seine Weltanschauung</i>
DG	<i>Vom Dasein Gottes</i>
DP-G	<i>Deskriptive Psychologie</i>
GA	<i>Grundzüge der Aesthetik</i>
GAE	<i>Grundlegung und Aufbau der Ethik</i>
HS	<i>Ad disputationem qua theses gratiosi philosophorum ordinis consensu et auctoritate pro impetranda venia docendi in alma universitate julio-maximiliana defendet</i> (25 Habilitationsschrift defense theses)
KL	<i>Kategorienlehre</i>
KPP	<i>Von der Klassifikation der psychischen Phänomene</i>
LRU	<i>Die Lehre vom richtigen Urteil</i>
MBS	<i>Von der mannigfachen Bedeutung des Seienden nach Aristoteles</i> (Dissertation)
MWO	<i>Meine letzten Wünsche für Österreich</i>
PA-G	<i>Die Psychologie des Aristoteles, insbesondere seine Lehre vom Nous Poietikos</i> (Habilitationsschrift)
PES-G	<i>Psychologie vom empirischen Standpunkt</i>
RP	<i>Religion und Philosophie</i>
RZK	<i>Philosophische Untersuchungen zu Raum, Zeit und Kontinuum</i>

List of abbreviations

xix

SNB	<i>Vom sinnlichen und noetischen Bewußtein: Psychologie vom empirischen Standpunkt III</i>
UA	<i>Über Aristoteles</i>
USE	<i>Vom Ursprung sittlicher Erkenntnis</i>
USP	<i>Untersuchungen zur Sinnespsychologie</i>
VE	<i>Versuch über die Erkenntnis</i>
VPP	<i>Die vier Phasen der Philosophie und ihr augenblicklicher Stand</i>
WE	<i>Wahrheit und Evidenz</i>
ZF	<i>Über die Zukunft der Philosophie</i>

2 STANDARD ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS

AWV	<i>Aristotle and his World View</i>
DP-E	<i>Descriptive Psychology</i>
EG	<i>On the Existence of God: Lectures Given at the Universities of Würzburg and Vienna (1868–91)</i>
FCE	<i>The Foundation and Construction of Ethics</i>
KRW	<i>The Origin of the Knowledge of Right and Wrong</i>
PA-E	<i>The Psychology of Aristotle: in Particular his Doctrine of the Active Intellect</i>
PES-E	<i>Psychology from an Empirical Standpoint</i>
SNC	<i>Sensory and Noetic Consciousness: Psychology from an Empirical Standpoint III</i>
SSB	<i>On the Several Senses of Being in Aristotle</i>
STC	<i>Philosophical Investigations on Space, Time, and the Continuum</i>
TC	<i>The Theory of Categories</i>
TE	<i>The True and the Evident</i>



CHRONOLOGY

16 January 1838	Born, Franz Clemens Honoratus Hermann Brentano, in Marienberg am Rhein (near Boppard), Germany
1855–6	Studies at and graduates from the Aschaffener Gymnasium Studium der Philosophie am Lyzeum
1857–8	Attends Philosophische Fakultät der Universität München (Munich) (three semesters)
1858	Transfers to Bayerische-Julius-Maximilians-Universität, Würzburg, Germany (one semester); studies philosophy and theology; later in the year moves to Berlin and attends two semester lecture courses by Aristotelian scholar F. A. Trendelenburg in Berlin
1859–60	Studies medieval Aristotelian (Scholastic) philosophy at Münster Akademie
1862	Completes doctoral dissertation at the philosophische Fakultät Tübingen, <i>On the Manifold Sense of Being in Aristotle</i> ( <i>Von der mannigfachen Bedeutung des Seienden bei Aristoteles</i> ); publishes as first book; brief visit to Dominican monastery in Graz, Austria
1863	Begins theological studies in Munich
1864	Enters Theologisches Seminar at the Universität Würzburg; completes

## Chronology

xxi

	theological studies and preparation for priesthood
August 6, 1864	Ordained as Catholic priest
1865	Writes Habilitationsschrift in Philosophische Fakultät der Universität Würzburg on <i>The Psychology of Aristotle, in Particular his Doctrine of the Active Intellect</i> ( <i>Die Psychologie des Aristoteles, insbesondere seine Lehre vom Nous Poietikos</i> )
July 15, 1866	Gives public defense of twenty-five <i>Habilitationsschrift</i> theses in Würzburg; declares natural science to be the only correct method of philosophy
1866–70	Begins lecturing in philosophy at Würzburg; students during this period notably include Carl Stumpf, Anton Marty, Hermann Schell, Georg von Herling and Ernst Commer
1870	Embroided in controversy concerning papal infallibility, the outcome of which eventually causes him to give up the priesthood
1872	Appointed Professor Extraordinarius (promoted from Privatdozent) at Würzburg; travels to England and meets Herbert Spencer, Cardinal Newman, and William Robertson Smith; corresponds with John Stuart Mill; Mill dies before their anticipated meeting
April 11, 1873	Renounces holy orders over conscientious objections to doctrine of papal infallibility
January 22, 1874	Appointed Professor Ordinarius at the University of Vienna; students during this period notably include Franz Hillebrand, Edmund Husserl, Alexius Meinong, Alois Höfler, Christian von Ehrenfels, Thomas G. Masaryk, Josef Kreibitz, Emil Arleth, Kazimierz Twardowski, Alfred Berger, and

xxii      Chronology

	Baron von Pidoll; lectures also attended by Sigmund Freud
1874	Publishes masterwork <i>Psychology from an Empirical Standpoint</i> ( <i>Psychologie vom empirischen Standpunkt</i> )
1880	Renounces Austrian citizenship in order to marry as former priest, otherwise not recognized under Austrian law of the time; gives up Vienna professorship with the understanding that it will later be restored; afterward allowed to return to lecture at the University of Vienna only as Privatdozent (not permitted as such to supervise Ph.D. theses in philosophy); recovers former German citizenship
September 16, 1880	Marries Ida von Lieben
1888	Birth of son, Johannes Brentano
1894	Death of Ida
1895	Retires as Privatdozent from the University of Vienna; leaves Vienna in April; travels to Switzerland and settles in Florence, Italy; becomes Italian citizen
1897	Marries Emilie Rueprecht
1897–1911	Active period of publication and philosophical correspondence outside academia
May, 1915	Leaves Florence and moves to Zurich, Switzerland, when Italy enters World War I
March 17, 1917	Dies in Zurich and is buried in Sihlfeld Cemetery; later reinterred in family plot in Aschaffenburg, Germany