

# INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 123



## Volumes published under the title:

# ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES

```
Vol. 1 (1919-22)
                       Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, K.C.,
                         and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
Vol. 2 (1923-24)
Vol. 3 (1925-26)
                      Edited by Arnold D. McNair, C.B.E., LL.D.,
                         and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D.
Vol. 4 (1927-28)
Vol. 5 (1929-30)
Vol. 6 (1931-32)
Vol. 7 (1933-34)
Vol. 8 (1935-37)
Vol. 9 (1938-40)
Vol. 10 (1941-42)
                      Edited by H. Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A.
Vol. 11 (1919-42)
Vol. 12 (1943-45)
Vol. 13 (1946)
Vol. 14 (1947)
Vol. 15 (1948)
Vol. 16 (1949)
```

Volumes published under the title:

# INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

```
Vol. 17 (1950)
Vol. 18 (1951)
Vol. 19 (1952)
Vol. 20 (1953)
                      Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
                        F.B.A.
Vol. 21 (1954)
Vol. 22 (1955)
Vol. 23 (1956)
Vol. 24 (1957)
                      Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
                        F.B.A., and E. Lauterpacht
Vol. 25 (1958-I)
                      Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
Vol. 26 (1958-II)
Vols. 27—68 and Consolidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1—35 and 36—45
                      Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.
Vols. 69—123 and Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and
                         Treaties to Vols. 1-80 and Vols. 81-100
                      Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, C.B.E., Q.C.,
                         and C. J. Greenwood, C.M.G., Q.C.
```



# Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law University of Cambridge

# INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

# VOLUME 123

# Edited by

# SIR ELIHU LAUTERPACHT, CBE QC

Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge Bencher of Gray's Inn

# C. J. GREENWOOD, CMG QC

Professor of International Law London School of Economics and Political Science

and

## A. G. OPPENHEIMER

Associate Editor: Civil Law Jurisdictions
Fellow of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge





# PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Sir Elihu Lauterpacht 2003

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Baskerville Monotype 11/11.5 pt. System LATEX 2<sub>E</sub> [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 80776 X (hardback)



# **CONTENTS**

	Page
Preface	vii
Editorial Note	ix
Table of Cases (alphabetical)	xiii
Table of Cases (according to courts and countries)	xv
DIGEST (main headings)	xvii
Digest of Cases Reported in Volume 123	xix
Table of Treaties	xxix
Reports of Cases	1
Index	613



# PREFACE

The present volume, the first to appear in 2003, contains decisions of the European Court of Human Rights, including its decision on admissibility in Banković v. Belgium and Others (concerning the NATO military operations against the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia) and decisions on the merits in three important cases concerning the relationship between the international law of State immunity and the European Convention on Human Rights: Al-Adsani v. United Kingdom, Fogarty v. United Kingdom and McElhinney v. Ireland. It also includes the judgment of the International Court of Justice on the jurisdiction of the Court in the Fisheries Jurisdiction Case (Spain v. Canada) and decisions of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights. Also reported are cases from Canada, England and Trinidad and Tobago. The cases from England include the decision of March 2002 concerning detainees in Guantanamo Bay, Regina (Abbasi and Juma) v. Secretary of State for the Foreign and Commonwealth Office and Secretary of State for the Home Department. The decision of the Court of Appeal in these proceedings was given while the volume was in press and will appear in a later volume of the International Law Reports.

Many people, to all of whom the Editors are most grateful, have worked on this volume. Ms Susan Breau, LL M, Lecturer in Law, Queen's University, Belfast, prepared the summary of the Fisheries Jurisdiction Case. Ms Karen Lee, MA, Fellow of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, prepared the Canadian decision and the English decision in Bancoult, the Tables of Cases and Digest and performed invaluable work in seeing the volume through the press. Ms Catriona Vine, LLM, prepared the summary of the cases from Trinidad while Dr Jenny Kuper prepared the summary of Carranza. Miss Maureen MacGlashan, CMG, compiled the Table of Treaties and the Index. Mrs Diane Ilott checked the copy. Mr Adrian Lee read the proofs. Miss Shelley Brereton provided secretarial assistance. We are also most grateful to Mr Philip Sales for supplying the decisions in Abbasi and Suresh.

Finally, we would like to extend our thanks to all the others who have worked to complete this volume, particularly our publishers, Cambridge University Press, and typesetters, TechBooks, and their staff.

E. LAUTERPACHT

LAUTERPACHT RESEARCH CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW, UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

C. J. GREENWOOD

LAW DEPARTMENT, LONDON SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS AND POLITICAL SCIENCE

September 2002

vii



# EDITORIAL NOTE

The International Law Reports endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the Reports will include cases which bear on the exception of "political offences" or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

#### DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

The Reports seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or ad hoc arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of the European Communities). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

Human rights cases. The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the Reports to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the Reports will continue to publish most decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as "views" of the United Nations Committee on Human Rights. Decisions of national courts on the application of conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human rights law or a matter of wider interest to public international lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

International arbitrations. The Reports of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public



x

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-80776-0 - International Law Reports, Volume 123 Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht, C. J. Greenwood and A. G. Oppenheimer Frontmatter More information

#### EDITORIAL NOTE

international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these *Reports* are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see Yearbook Commercial Arbitration (ed. Pieter Sanders, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration)). But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, force majeure) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

# DECISIONS OF NATIONAL TRIBUNALS

A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

# EDITORIAL TREATMENT OF MATERIALS

The basic policy of the Editors is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is no part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.

#### Presentation of Materials

The material in this volume is of two kinds, material reproduced photographically and material which has been freshly set for this volume.

Material photographically reproduced. This consists exclusively of reports originally printed in the English language. The material can usually be recognized by the differences between its type-style and the Baskerville type otherwise used in these *Reports*. The source of the material is identified by the reference to the "Report" in square brackets at the end of the



#### EDITORIAL NOTE

хi

case. Where more than one citation is given, the report used is the first one listed. The bold type figures in square brackets in the inner margin of each page refer to the pagination of the original report.

Other material. The remaining material in the volume has been typeset for this volume. This includes all material specially translated into English for these Reports as well as some material in English which in its original form was not suitable for photo-reproduction. The source of all such material is indicated by the reference to the "Report" in square brackets at the end of the case. The language of the original decision is also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body of the text indicate the pagination of the original report.

## **Notes**

Footnotes. Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

Other notes. References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

#### DIGEST OF CASES

With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the *Reports* are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at p. xvii.

#### CONSOLIDATED INDEX AND TABLES

A Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 1-80 was published in two volumes in 1990 and 1991. A further volume containing the Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 81-100 was published in 1996. A Consolidated Index, a Consolidated Tables of Cases and a Consolidated Table of Treaties for volumes 1-120 will be published in the near future.



# TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

#### ALPHABETICAL

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

Abbasi and Juma Case 599 Al-Adsani v. United Kingdom (Application No 35763/97) (Merits) 24

Bancoult Case 555

Banković v. Belgium and Others (Application No 52207/99) (Admissibility) 94 Briggs v. Baptiste and Others 536

Carranza v. Argentina (Case 10.087) 139 Coard and Others v. United States of America (Case 10.951) 156

MV Estai (José Pereira E Hijos SA and Davila Gonzalez v. Attorney-General of Canada) 482, 507 (note)

Fisheries Jurisdiction Case (Spain v. Canada) (Jurisdiction) 189. See also José Pereira E Hijos SA and Davila Gonzalez v. Attorney-General of Canada (MV Estai)

Fogarty v. United Kingdom (Application No 37112/97) (Merits) 53

José Pereira E Hijos SA and Davila Gonzalez v. Attorney-General of Canada (MV Estai) 482, 507 (note). See also Fisheries Jurisdiction Case (Spain v. Canada) (Jurisdiction) Matthews v. United Kingdom (Application No 24833/94) (Merits) 1

McElhinney v. Ireland (Application No 31253/96) (Merits) 73

Pereira (José) E Hijos SA and Davila Gonzalez v. Attorney-General of Canada (MV Estai) 482, 507 (note)

R (Abbasi and Juma) v. Secretary of State for the Foreign and Commonwealth Office and Secretary of State for the Home Department 599

R (Bancoult) v. Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs and Another 555

R (Suresh and Manickavasagam) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department 593

Salas and Others v. United States of America (Case 10.573) 117

Spain v. Canada (Fisheries Jurisdiction Case) (Jurisdiction) 189

Suresh and Manickavasagam Case 593

Thomas and Another v. Baptiste and Others 508



# TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

# ARRANGED ACCORDING TO COURTS AND TRIBUNALS (INTERNATIONAL CASES) AND COUNTRIES (MUNICIPAL CASES)

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

## I. DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

European Court of Human Rights

1999

Matthews v. United Kingdom (Application No 24833/94) (Merits) 1

2001

Al-Adsani v. United Kingdom (Application No 35763/97) (Merits) 24

Banković v. Belgium and Others (Application No 52207/99) (Admissibility) 94 Fogarty v. United Kingdom (Application

No 37112/97) (Merits) 53 McElhinney v. Ireland (Application No 31253/96) (Merits) 73 Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

1993

Salas and Others v. United States of America (Case 10.573) 117

1997

Carranza v. Argentina (Case 10.087) 139

1999

Coard and Others v. United States of America (Case 10.951) 156

International Court of Justice

1998

Fisheries Jurisdiction Case (Spain v. Canada) (Jurisdiction) 189

# II. DECISIONS OF MUNICIPAL COURTS

Canada

1996

José Pereira E Hijos SA and Davila Gonzalez v. Attorney-General of Canada 482

2000

José Pereira E Hijos SA and Davila Gonzalez v. Attorney-General of Canada 507 (note)

Trinidad and Tobago

1999

Briggs v. Baptiste and Others 536. Thomas and Another v. Baptiste and Others 508 United Kingdom, England

2000

Regina (Bancoult) v. Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs and Another 555

2001

Regina (Suresh and Manickavasagam) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department 593

2002

Regina (Abbasi and Juma) v. Secretary of State for the Foreign and Commonwealth Office and Secretary of State for the Home Department 599



# DIGEST OF CASES

# List of Main Headings

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics. For a guide to the Digest, see the Editorial Note at p. xi.)

Air | International Tribunals

Aliens Jurisdiction

Arbitration Lakes and Landlocked Seas

Canals Nationality

Claims Recognition

Comity Relationship of International Law and

Conciliation Municipal Law

Consular Relations Reprisals and Countermeasures

Damages Rivers

Diplomatic Relations Sea

Economics, Trade and Finance Sources of International Law

Environment Space

Expropriation State Immunity

Extradition State Responsibility

Governments State Succession

Human Rights States

International Court of Justice Territory

International Criminal Law Treaties

International Organizations War and Armed Conflict

xvii



# DÍGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 123

	Page
Consular Relations	
Protection of nationals—Applicable law—Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963—Whether superseding bilateral convention between United Kingdom and United States of America—Right of consular access—Whether United Kingdom entitled to consular access to British citizen detained by United States authorities at Guantanamo Bay—Right to legal representation—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court)	
Regina (Abbasi and Juma) v. Secretary of State for the Foreign and Commonwealth Office and Secretary of State for the Home Department	599
Diplomatic Relations	
Locally employed staff—Recruitment—Whether sending State entitled to State immunity in proceedings alleging sex discrimination in relation to recruitment—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)	
Fogarty v. United Kingdom (Application No 37112/97) (Merits)	53
Environment	
Maritime environment—Fisheries conservation—Limit of conservation measures—Compatibility with regime of the high seas—International Court of Justice	
Fisheries Jurisdiction Case (Spain v. Canada) (Jurisdiction)	189
Human Rights	
Access to courts—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1)—State immunity—Relationship between State immunity and human rights—Whether assertion of immunity by defendant State a violation of Convention—Whether assertion of immunity bringing plaintiff within jurisdiction of defendant State—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 1—Whether grant of immunity by forum State a violation of Convention—Nature of action against defendant State—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)	
McElhinney v. Ireland (Application No 31253/96) (Merits)	73

xix



хx

#### DIGEST OF CASES

# Human Rights (cont.)

Constitutional guarantees—Right not to be deprived of life except by due process of law—Prohibition of imposition of cruel and unusual treatment or punishment—Death penalty for murder—Whether executions should be stayed—Whether constitutional right to have petitions to Inter-American Commission on Human Rights heard before execution of death penalty—Whether death penalty rendered unconstitutional by inhuman conditions—Whether pre-trial delay unlawful—Trinidad and Tobago Constitution, Sections 4(a) and 5(2)(b)—Trinidad and Tobago, Judicial Committee of the Privy Council

Thomas and Another v. Baptiste and Others

508

Democratic elections—Right to elect members of legislature— European Convention on Human Rights, First Protocol, Article 3— European Parliament—Whether a legislature for these purposes— Residents of Gibraltar excluded from electorate for European Parliament—Whether a violation of Article 3—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Matthews v. United Kingdom (Application No 24833/94) (Merits)

1

Fair trial—Right to judicial protection—De facto military government removing judge by unconstitutional decree—Petitioner applying for nullification of decree under subsequent de jure regime—Argentinian courts declaring case unjusticiable—Whether courts' refusal to adjudicate violating American Convention on Human Rights, 1969, Articles 8 and 25—Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

Carranza v. Argentina (Case 10.087)

139

International machinery for protection of human rights—American Convention on Human Rights, 1969—Inter-American Court of Human Rights—Jurisdiction—Effect of provisional orders—When Court becomes functus officio—Inter-American Commission on Human Rights—Whether decisions binding—Trinidad and Tobago, Judicial Committee of the Privy Council

Briggs v. Baptiste and Others

536

Nature and scope of human rights treaties—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950—Article 1—Duty of parties to secure the rights and freedoms under the Convention to persons within their jurisdiction—Extent of jurisdiction—Persons outside the territory of a Contracting State—Whether within its jurisdiction—Interpretation of the Convention—Requirement that Convention be interpreted in accordance with international law—Convention



#### DIGEST OF CASES

xxi

as part of the system of international law—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Banković v. Belgium and Others (Application No 52207/99) (Admissibility)

94

Protection in time of armed conflict—Relationship between human rights and international humanitarian law—Right to life—Bombardment of target in foreign State during armed conflict—Whether capable of amounting to violation of the right to life—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 2—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Banković v. Belgium and Others (Application No 52207/99) (Admissibility)

94

Right to life—Fair trial—Detention pending trial—Sentence of death—Whether repeated reading of sentence to defendant unlawful—Whether execution of defendant when international tribunal has ordered that execution be stayed unlawful—Trinidad and Tobago, Judicial Committee of the Privy Council

Briggs v. Baptiste and Others

536

Scope of application of human rights treaties—Requirement that victim be within the jurisdiction of the State—Sri Lankan national detained in Canada—Likelihood of removal to Sri Lanka—Alleged risk of torture in Sri Lanka—Mother resident in the United Kingdom—Whether United Kingdom minister under duty to make representations to Canada—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Articles 1, 3 and 8—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court)

Regina (Suresh and Manickavasagam) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department

593

Scope of application of human rights treaties—Whether obligations of State under human rights treaty confined to legal space of that State—Whether extending to detainees held by another State—Detainees' rights—Legal representation—Questioning of suspects—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court)

Regina (Abbasi and Juma) v. Secretary of State for the Foreign and Commonwealth Office and Secretary of State for the Home Department

599

Scope of human rights treaties—Application to international organization—Responsibility of Member States of organization—European Community—Treaties establishing the Community—Unanimous decision of Member States—Whether imputable to Member States—Whether capable of engaging responsibility of



xxii

# DIGEST OF CASES

# Human Rights (cont.)

Member States under human rights treaties—Provisions on elections to, and powers of, the European Parliament—Whether acts of the Community or the Member States—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Matthews v. United Kingdom (Application No 24833/94) (Merits)

Scope of human rights treaties—Protection in time of armed conflict—Relationship between human rights law and international humanitarian law—Civilians detained by adverse party during armed conflict—Detention allegedly contrary to human rights instrument—Whether human rights instrument incorporating standards of international humanitarian law—Conditions of detention—Right to have legality of detention determined by tribunal without delay—Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

Coard and Others v. United States of America (Case 10.951)

156

1

Scope of human rights treaties—Protection in time of armed conflict—Relationship between human rights law and international humanitarian law—Civilians injured by adverse party during armed conflict—Whether human rights instrument incorporating standards of international humanitarian law—Right to life—Right to respect for person and property—Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

Salas and Others v. United States of America (Case 10.573)

117

Self-determination—Colony—Separation of islands from colony and constitution as separate territory—Establishment of military base on territory pursuant to agreement with foreign State—Removal of civilian population from territory—England, Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division

Regina (Bancoult) v. Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs and Another

555

State immunity—Civil proceedings against foreign State for sex discrimination in relation to employment at embassy—Courts of forum State holding defendant State immune—Whether recognition of immunity involving a violation of right of access to courts—Whether discriminatory—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Articles 6 and 14—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Fogarty v. United Kingdom (Application No 37112/97) (Merits)

53

Torture—Nature of rule prohibiting torture—Whether a rule of *jus cogens*—Consequences of prohibition—Whether "trumping" other rules of international law—State immunity—Civil proceedings



#### DIGEST OF CASES

xxiii

against foreign State for torture—Courts of forum State holding defendant State immune—Whether recognition of immunity a violation of prohibition of torture—Whether a violation of right of access to courts—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Articles 3, 6 and 13—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Al-Adsani v. United Kingdom (Application No 35763/97) (Merits)

24

# International Court of Justice

Jurisdiction—Optional Clause—Statute of the Court, Article 36(2)—Declaration accepting jurisdiction of the Court—Reservations—Right of State making declaration to define scope of acceptance of jurisdiction—Whether reservations to be construed restrictively—Distinction between substantive law and rules governing jurisdiction of the Court—Principles to be applied in interpretation of declaration and reservations—Intention of State making declaration—Principle of good faith—International Court of Justice

Fisheries Jurisdiction Case (Spain v. Canada) (Jurisdiction)

189

Procedure—Preliminary objections—Whether objection possessing an exclusively preliminary character—Duty of the Court in dealing with preliminary objections—International Court of Justice

Fisheries Jurisdiction Case (Spain v. Canada) (Jurisdiction)

189

# International Organizations

Responsibility of Member States—European Community—Provisions on elections to, and powers of, the European Parliament—Whether acts of the Community or the Member States—Whether capable of constituting violation by State of its human rights obligations—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Matthews v. United Kingdom (Application No 24833/94) (Merits)

1

#### **International Tribunals**

Inter-American Commission on Human Rights—Jurisdiction—State not party to American Convention on Human Rights, 1969—Statute of the Commission nevertheless conferring mandate to enforce American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man, 1948—Relevance of other treaties and rules of law—Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

Coard and Others v. United States of America (Case 10.951)



xxiv

#### DIGEST OF CASES

# International Tribunals (cont.)

Inter-American Commission on Human Rights—Jurisdiction—State not party to American Convention on Human Rights, 1969—Statute of the Commission nevertheless conferring mandate to enforce American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man, 1948—Relevance of other treaties and rules of law—Domestic remedies rule—Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

Salas and Others v. United States of America (Case 10.573)

117

Provisional measures—Whether binding—Whether enforceable in municipal law—Inter-American Court of Human Rights—Trinidad and Tobago, Judicial Committee of the Privy Council

Briggs v. Baptiste and Others

536

# Jurisdiction

Concept of jurisdiction in international law—Jurisdiction primarily territorial—Circumstances in which jurisdiction of State extends beyond its borders—Whether persons affected by military action taken by one State in the territory of another fall within the jurisdiction of the former State—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Banković v. Belgium and Others (Application No 52207/99) (Admissibility)

94

# Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law

In general—Justiciability of international obligations before municipal courts—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court)

Regina (Suresh and Manickavasagam) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department

593

In general—Whether rights arising between States on plane of international law enforceable in municipal courts—Treaties—Whether forming part of United Kingdom law—Geneva Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War, 1949—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950—Consular conventions—Justiciability—Whether courts of one State entitled to determine rights and obligations of another State under international agreements—Whether decisions regarding foreign policy subject to judicial review—England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court)

Regina (Abbasi and Juma) v. Secretary of State for the Foreign and Commonwealth Office and Secretary of State for the Home Department



#### DIGEST OF CASES

xxv

Treaties—American Convention on Human Rights, 1969—Convention not incorporated into the law of Trinidad and Tobago—Extent to which courts of Trinidad and Tobago entitled or required to give effect to Convention—Effect in municipal law of decision of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights—Trinidad and Tobago, Judicial Committee of the Privy Council

#### Briggs v. Baptiste and Others

536

Treaties—American Convention on Human Rights, 1969—Relevance—Convention not incorporated into law of Trinidad and Tobago—Government of Trinidad and Tobago ratifying Convention—Convention permitting access to Inter-American Commission on Human Rights—Whether Government's instructions prescribing time limits for applications to Commission lawful—Whether execution of death penalty before determination by Commission infringing constitutional right of due process—Trinidad and Tobago, Judicial Committee of the Privy Council

## Thomas and Another v. Baptiste and Others

508

Whether international law having precedence over Canadian law—Relevance of international treaties or conventions—Plaintiffs challenging validity of Coastal Fisheries Protection Regulations as amended on 3 March 1995—Whether necessary to plead specific treaties—Whether references to piracy in pleadings to be struck out—Canada, Federal Court, Trial Division

José Pereira E Hijos SA and Davila Gonzalez v. Attorney-General of Canada

482

#### Sea

Fisheries—North Atlantic Fishery Organization Conservation Area ("NAFO zone")—Canada claiming that Spanish vessels exceeding fishing quotas for turbot in NAFO zone—Coastal Fisheries Protection Regulations as amended on 3 March 1995—Officers of Canadian Government arresting and detaining Spanish fishing vessel *Estai* and its master—Plaintiffs bringing action for damages—Defendant objecting to plaintiffs' allegations as relating to, *inter alia*, international law—Canada, Federal Court, Trial Division

José Pereira E Hijos SA and Davila Gonzalez v. Attorney-General of Canada

482

High seas—Jurisdiction—Fisheries—Conservation measures—Arrest of Spanish vessel by Canada outside Canadian waters—Legality—Whether dispute falling within jurisdiction of International Court of Justice—International Court of Justice

Fisheries Jurisdiction Case (Spain v. Canada) (Jurisdiction)



xxvi

#### DIGEST OF CASES

# **State Immunity**

Jurisdiction—Employment—Proceedings for sex discrimination by applicant for employment at embassy barred by State immunity—Whether contrary to human rights—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Fogarty v. United Kingdom (Application No 37112/97) (Merits)

53

Jurisdiction—Exceptions to immunity—Whether international law denies immunity in cases of torture—Distinction between civil and criminal proceedings—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Al-Adsani v. United Kingdom (Application No 35763/97) (Merits)

24

Jurisdiction—Human rights—Whether State immunity incompatible with right of access to courts—Reciprocity—European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1)—Tort exception to immunity—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

McElhinney v. Ireland (Application No 31253/96) (Merits)

73

# Territory

Colonies — Governance — Principle of self-determination — Creation of new British colony—British Indian Ocean Territory—British Indian Ocean Territory Order 1965—Immigration Ordinance 1971—Decision to remove population of territory—Decision motivated by establishment of military base—Whether conducive to peace, order and good government of the territory—Whether Ordinance and underlying policy lawful—England, Divisional Court, Queen's Bench Division

Regina (Bancoult) v. Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs and Another

555

#### **Treaties**

Interpretation—Human rights treaty—Interpretation as a living instrument—European Convention on Human Rights—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Matthews v. United Kingdom (Application No 24833/94) (Merits)

1

Interpretation—Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969, Articles 31 and 32—Applicability to interpretation of the European Convention on Human Rights, 1950—Ordinary meaning of words used—Subsequent practice—Relevance of travaux préparatoires—Convention as a living instrument—European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Banković v. Belgium and Others (Application No 52207/99) (Admissibility)



# DIGEST OF CASES xxvii **War and Armed Conflict** Law applicable to armed conflict—Human rights law— Relationship with international humanitarian law-European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber) Banković v. Belgium and Others (Application No 52207/99) (Admissibility) 94 Law applicable to armed conflict—Human rights law— Relationship with international humanitarian law—International armed conflict-Grenada, 1983-Detention of civilian prisoners-Geneva Convention No IV, 1949—Inter-American Commission on Human Rights Coard and Others v. United States of America (Case 10.951) 156 Law applicable to armed conflict—Human rights law— Relationship with international humanitarian law-International armed conflict-Panama, 1989-Geneva Convention No IV, 1949—Inter-American Commission on Human Rights Salas and Others v. United States of America (Case 10.573) 117 Prisoners of war-Terrorism-Geneva Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War, 1949—Whether applicable to terrorist suspects detained by United States of America after capture in Afghanistan-England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court) Regina (Abbasi and Juma) v. Secretary of State for the Foreign and 599 Commonwealth Office and Secretary of State for the Home Department



# TABLE OF TREATIES

This table contains a list, in chronological order according to the date of signature, of the treaties referred to in the decisions printed in the present volume. It has not been possible to draw a helpful distinction between treaties judicially considered and treaties which are merely cited.

In the case of bilateral treaties, the names of the parties are given in alphabetical order. Multilateral treaties are referred to by the name by which they are believed commonly to be known. References to the texts of treaties have been supplied, including wherever possible at least one reference to a text in the English language. The full titles of the abbreviated references will be found in the list of Abbreviations printed in the volume containing the Consolidated Tables to Vols 1-80.

Feb. 16/ July 2	Cuba-USA, Agreement for the Lease to the USA of Lands in Cuba for Coaling and Naval Stations (34 Martens NRG, 2nd ser. 338; 1 US Treaties 360; 96 BFSP 546; 192 CTS 429)
<b>1911</b> July 7	Great Britain, Japan, Russia, USA, Convention respecting Measures for the Preservation and Protection of Fur Seals in the North Pacific Ocean (214 CTS 80)237
<b>1919</b> June 28	Covenant of the League of Nations (1 Hudson 1; 112 BFSP 13; 13 AJIL (1919) Supp. 128, 361; UKTS 4 (1919); 3 US Treaties 3331; 11 Martens NRG, 3rd ser. 331; 225 CTS 195; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 1)  Art. 15(8)
<b>1920</b> Dec. 16	Statute of the Permanent Court of International Justice (PCIJ, Series D, No 1 (2nd edn), 7; 1 Hudson 530; 6 LNTS 380)  Art. 59
1923	Canada-USA, Convention for the Preservation of the Halibut Fisheries of the North Pacific Ocean
<b>1928</b> Sept. 26	General Act for the Pacific Settlement of International Disputes (Revised 28 April 1949) (93 LNTS 343; 4 Hudson 2529; UKTS 32 (1931), Cmd 3930; 130 BFSP 878)
1930	Canada-USA, Convention for the Preservation of the Halibut Fisheries of the North Pacific Ocean and Bering Sea
	Convention for the Protection of Sockeye Salmon Fisheries237
<b>1945</b> June 26	Charter of the United Nations (9 Hudson 327; UKTS 67 (1946), Cmd 7015; 145 BFSP 805; USTS 993; 1 Peaslee 1288; 59 Stat 1031; 1 UNTS 16; 39 AJIL (1945) Supp. 190; JOF 13 January 1946;

xxix



> TABLE OF TREATIES XXX 3 Bevans 1153; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 8 (amended version)) Chapter I Art. 2(4)......120, 225, 469, 475 Chapter VII Årt. 51 ...... 120 Chapter XVI Statute of the International Court of Justice (9 Hudson 510; UKTS 67 (1946), Cmd 7015; USTS 993; 145 BFSP 832; 1 Peaslee 1322; 3 Bevans 1179; CanTS 7 (1945); 39 AJIL (1945) Supp. 215n; JOF 13 January 1946; 59 Stat 1031) Chapter I Chapter II Art. 36(2) . . . 197, 200, 211, 212-17, 236, 242-3, 245-50, 251-67, 317, 324, 332-3, 375-89, 429, 474, 481 Art. 36(6) . . . . . 227, 230, 244, 254-6, 283-4, 317, 367, 374, 390-1, 463 Chapter III Art. 40 ..... 274 Art. 53 ...... 332-3, 369 Art. 56......373-4 Art. 59.......480-1 Art. 60......480-1 Art. 61......480-1 1946 Dec. 2 International Convention for the Regulation of Whaling (161 UNTS 72; UKTS 5 (1949), Cmd 7604 and UKTS 68 (1959), Cmnd 849; 146 BFSP 521; TIAS 1849, 62 Stat (2) 1716; 4 Bevans 248; ATS 18 (1948); CanTS 54 (1946); SATS 6 (1949); JOF 7 January 1949; 7 Ruster 3495; 4 Churchill 1418; Kiss 67)......238 1948 Charter of the Organization of American States (Bogotá Charter) (119 Apr. 30 UNTS 3; 152 BFSP 51; TIAS 2361; 2 UST 2394; 18 Dept State Bull. (1948) 666; 46 AJIL (1952) Supp. 43; 1 Peaslee 1182; PAUTS 1; PAULTS 23) Art. 18.......119, 132 Art. 111......123, 133-4 1949 Feb. 8/9 International Convention for the Northwest Atlantic Fisheries (157 UNTS 157)......221, 238



	TABLE OF TREATIES	xxxi
Apr. 4	North Atlantic Treaty (34 UNTS 243; UKTS 56 (1949), Cmd 7789; TIAS 1964; 63 Stat 2241; 4 Bevans 828)	99
Aug. 12	Geneva Conventions Relative to the Protection of the Victims of International Armed Conflicts (75 UNTS 31; UKTS 39 (1958), Cmd 550; 157 BFSP 229; 6 UST 3114; TIAS 3362; ATS 21 (1958))         Art. 1       102, 10         Art. 2       13         Art. 3       120,	2, 171
Aug. 12	Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War (Geneva Convention III) (75 UNTS 135; 157 BFSP 284; UKTS 39 (1958); TIAS 3364; 6 UST 3316; Roberts and Guelff, Documents on the Laws of War, 3rd edn 243)	7, 604 3 n. 18 3 n. 18 4, 609
Aug. 12	Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War (Geneva Convention IV) (75 UNTS 287; 157 BFSP 355; UKTS 39 (1958), Cmd 550; TIAS 3365; 6 UST 3516; Roberts and Guelff, Documents on the Laws of War, 3rd edn 299)	174 187 4 n. 21 4 n. 21 5 n. 23 4 n. 21 187-8 188 4 n. 21
1950 Nov. 4	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (213 UNTS 221; UKTS 71 (1953), Cmd 8969;	
	156 BFSP 915; ETS 5; 45 AJIL (1951) Supp. 24; 1 Peaslee 354; 2  Vert A 20; 1 HRR 65; JOF 4 May 1974; 1 EYB 316; 1974 RTAF 28) <sup>1</sup> Art. 1	597-8 597-8 11, 20 3 5, 111

<sup>1</sup> For cases after 1998, see the revised Convention at 1 November 1998.

<sup>©</sup> Cambridge University Press



xxxii	TABLE OF TREATIES
	A . 07/0)
	Art. 27(3)
	Art. 32(1)
	Art. 43
	Art. 44
	Art. 46
	Art. 47
	Art. 48
	Art. 63
	First Protocol (20 March 1952) (213 UNTS 262; 159 BFSP 355;
	UKTS 46 (1954), Cmd 9221; ETS 9; Blackstone's International Law
	Documents, 5th edn 53)
	Art. 193
	Art. 3
	Art. 4
	Eleventh Protocol (11 May 1994) (ETS 155)
	Art. 5(2)
	Art. 5(5)4
1957	
Feb. 9	Canada, Japan, USSR, USA, Interim Convention on the Conservation
	of North Pacific Fur Seals (314 UNTS 105)238
Mar. 25	Treaty Establishing the European Economic Community (Treaty of
	Rôme) (163 BFSP 206; 4 ÉYB (1956) 412; 298 UNTS 11; UKTS
	15 (1979), Cmnd 7480; JOF 2 February 1958; 1958 RTAF 5; 12
	Vert A 134) <sup>2</sup>
	Art. 69
	Art. 8A(2)
	Art. 49
	Art. 54(2)
	Art. 57(2)
	Art. 66
	Art. 75(1)
	Art. 99
	Art. 100
	Art. 100A(1)
	Art. 130D
	Arts. 130L-130K
	Art. 130S
	Art. 137
	Art. 138(3)
	Art. 138B
	Art. 144
	Art. 158
	Art. 189
	Art. 189B
	Art. 189C
	Art. 203
	Art. 203(8)
	Art. 206
	Art. 227(4)

 $<sup>^{2}</sup>$  Including the amendments introduced by the Treaty on European Union (Maastricht Treaty) (7 February 1992).



	TABLE OF TREATIES	xxxiii
<b>1958</b> Apr. 29	Geneva Convention on Fishing and Conservation of the Living Re-	
	sources of the High Seas (559 UNTS 285; UKTS 39 (1966), Čmnd 3028; 17 UST 138; TIAS 5969; ATS 12 (1963); JOF 24 December 1970; 1970 RTAF 119; 52 AJIL (1958) 851; 53 ILS 213; 1 Churchill 353)	
	Art. 1	222 460
Apr. 29	Geneva Convention on the High Seas (450 UNTS 82; UKTS 5 (1963), Cmnd 1929; 13 UST 2312; 53 ILS 226; TIAS 5200; ATS 12 (1963); 43 Vert A 5; 52 AJIL (1958) Supp. 842) Art. 6	483
1959		
Jan. 20	North-East Atlantic Fisheries Convention (486 UNTS 157) (as amended 4 June 1974 (99 <i>ILR</i> 235))	238
1001		
<b>1961</b> Apr. 18	Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations (500 UNTS 95; UKTS 19 (1965), Cmnd 2565; 55 AJIL (1961) 1064; 98 JDI 711; 23 UST 3227; 1971 RTAF 32; TIAS 7502; JOF 17 April 1971; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 76)  Art. 1.	50
	Art. 3.	
1963		
Apr. 24	Vienna Convention on Consular Relations (596 UNTS 261; UKTS 14 (1973), Cmnd 5219; 21 UST 77; 3 IndJIL 221; 57 AJIL (1963) 993; TIAS 6820; 1963 UNJYB 109; JOF 18 April 1971; 1971 RTAF 34; 40 Vert A 542)	
	Art. 36	
	Art. 36(1)(c)	
1966	.,	
May 14	Convention for Conservation of Atlantic Tunas (673 UNTS 63; 6 ILM (1967) 293)	
Dec. 16	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (UN Doc. A/Res. 2200 (XXI); UKTS 6 (1977), Cmnd 6702; JOF 30 June 1981; 50 Vert A 683; 6 ILM (1967) 368; 1966 UNJYB 178; 1966 YBHR 442; 30 ZaöRV 365; Brownlie I, 270; 999 UNTS 171; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 94)	-7, 115
	Art. 7	527-32



xxxiv	TABLE OF TREATIES
Dec. 30	UK-USA, Exchange of Notes concerning the Availability for Defence Purposes of the British Indian Ocean Territory (Cmnd 3231)562
1969	
May 23	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (UKTS 58 (1980), Cmnd 7964; 1969 UNJYB 140; 63 AJIL (1969) 875; 8 ILM (1969) 679; 9 IndJIL 288; 29 ZaöRV 711; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 122)
	Art. 27
	Art. 31(1)
	Art. 31(3)(c)
	Art. 44
Nov. 22	American Convention on Human Rights (PAULTS 36; 9 ILM (1970) 673; 65 AJIL (1971) 679; Blackstone's International Law Documents,
	5th edn 141)
	Art. 1
	Art. 1(1)
	Art. 3(1)
	Art. 4(1)
	Art. 5
	Art. 7(5)
	Art. 7(6)
	Art. 8140, 141, 143-4, 151-2, 153, 156, 542
	Art. 11140, 143
	Art. 23(1)(c)140, 143
	Art. 25
	Art. 25(1)
	Art. 27
	Art. 29
	Art. 46
	Art. 46(1)
	Art. 46(1)(a)
	Art. 46(1)(a)-(d)
	Art. 46(2)
	Art. 47
	Art. 50
	Art. 51(1)
	Art. 62(1)
	Art. 62(3)546-7, 552
	Art. 63(2)
1972	
May 16	European Convention on State Immunity (Basle) (UKTS 74 (1979), Cmnd 7742; 11 ILM (1972) 470; 66 AJIL (1972) 923; ETS 74; 20 EYB (1972) 299; Blackstone's <i>International Law Documents</i> , 5th edn
	168)



	TABLE OF TREATIES	xxxv
	Art. 5. Art. 7. Art. 11	63 0, 83, 89 83, 89-90
<b>1973</b> Sept. 13	Denmark, Finland, German Democratic Republic, Federal Republic Germany, Sweden, USSR, Convention on Fishing and Conservation of the Living Resources in the Baltic Sea and the Belts (12 ILI (1973) 1291)  Art. 1	a- M 221-2
<b>1977</b> June 8	Protocol additional to the Geneva Convention Relative to the Prote tion of Civilian Persons in Time of War (Geneva Convention IV (Protocol I) (relating to the Protection of Victims of Internation Armed Conflicts) (1125 UNTS 3; 16 ILM (1977) 1391; 85 RGDI 223; Misc 19 (1977), Cmnd 6927; Roberts and Guelff, Documents the Laws of War, 3rd edn 419)  Art. 45  Art. 51  Art. 52(1)  Art. 57  Art. 75	V) al IP on132604120120, 132
Sept. 7	Panama Canal Treaty with annex, agreed minute and related letter (UKTS 11 (1983), Cmnd 8833; 16 ILM (1977) 1022; TIAS 1003 Art. VII(2) Art. VIII Agreement implementing Article IV (33 UST 307; 1280 UNT Art. 20(8)	0) 124 121 ΓS 201)
1978 Oct. 24	Convention on Future Multilateral Cooperation in the Northwest  Atlantic Fisheries (Misc 9 (1979), Cmnd 7569)  Art. I(2)	338, 436 234-5 234, 436 294 295 295 295 295 295 295 295 295 295 295



> TABLE OF TREATIES xxxvi 1982 Convention on the Law of the Sea (21 ILM (1982) 1261; Misc 11 (1983), Dec. 10 Part V Art. 62(4)......221, 294, 457, 458 Art. 73 ...... 453 Part VI Art. 76 ...... 395 Part VII, Section 1 Art. 89......357, 458 Art. 110.......459, 468 Art. 111.......459, 468 1984 Dec. 10 UN Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment (UKTS 107 (1991), Cm 1775; 1465 UNTS 85; 23 ILM (1984) 1027; 24 ILM (1985) 535; 6 EHRR 259; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 322) .......... 34-5 Part I 1992 Feb. 7 Treaty on European Union (Maastricht Treaty) (EC 3 (1992), Cmnd



### TABLE OF TREATIES xxxvii 1993 Nov. 24 Agreement to Promote Compliance with International Conservation and Management Measures by Fishing Vessels on the High Seas 1995 Canada-European Community, Agreed Minute on the Conservation Apr. 20 and Management of Fish Stocks (34 ILM (1995) 1260) .......... 205-7, 208, 227-8, 241 Aug. 4 Agreement for the Implementation of the Provisions of the UN Convention on the Law of the Sea (1982) Relating to the Conservation and Management of Straddling Fish Stocks and Highly Migratory Fish Stocks (34 ILM (1995) 1542; Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 309; Doc. A/Conf.164/37)......222, 239, 325-6, 450, 472 1998 Nov. 1 European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1950) as amended by Protocol 11, effective as of 1 November 1998 (Blackstone's International Law Documents, 5th edn 43) Art. 15 ...... 93, 104, 105, 107, 110 Art. 53.......93