

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO  
MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY

*The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Philosophy* takes its readers into one of the most exciting periods in the history of philosophy. It spans a millennium of thought extending from Augustine to Thomas Aquinas and beyond. It includes not only the thinkers of the Latin West but also the profound contributions of Islamic and Jewish thinkers such as Avicenna and Maimonides. Leading specialists examine what it was like to do philosophy in the cultures and institutions of the Middle Ages and engage all the areas in which medieval philosophy flourished, including language and logic, the study of God and being, natural philosophy, human nature, morality, and politics. The text is supplemented with chronological charts, biographies of the major thinkers, and a guide to the transmission and translation of medieval texts. The volume will be invaluable for all who are interested in the philosophical thought of this period.

## OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS

- AQUINAS *Edited by* NORMAN KRETZMANN *and*  
 ELEONORE STUMP
- HANNAH ARENDT *Edited by* DANA VILLA
- ARISTOTLE *Edited by* JONATHAN BARNES
- AUGUSTINE *Edited by* ELEONORE STUMP *and*  
 NORMAN KRETZMANN
- BACON *Edited by* MARKKU PELTONEN
- SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR *Edited by* CLAUDIA CARD
- DARWIN *Edited by* JONATHAN HODGE *and*  
 GREGORY RADICK
- DESCARTES *Edited by* JOHN COTTINGHAM
- DUNS SCOTUS *Edited by* THOMAS WILLIAMS
- EARLY GREEK PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* A. A. LONG
- FEMINISM IN PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* MIRANDA  
 FRICKER *and* JENNIFER HORNSBY
- FOUCAULT *Edited by* GARY GUTTING
- FREUD *Edited by* JEROME NEU
- GADAMER *Edited by* ROBERT J. DOSTAL
- GALILEO *Edited by* PETER MACHAMER
- GERMAN IDEALISM *Edited by* KARL AMERIKS
- HABERMAS *Edited by* STEPHEN K. WHITE
- HEGEL *Edited by* FREDERICK BEISER
- HEIDEGGER *Edited by* CHARLES GUIGNON
- HOBBS *Edited by* TOM SORELL
- HUME *Edited by* DAVID FATE NORTON
- HUSSERL *Edited by* BARRY SMITH *and* DAVID  
 WOODRUFF SMITH
- WILLIAM JAMES *Edited by* RUTH ANNA PUTNAM
- KANT *Edited by* PAUL GUYER
- KIERKEGAARD *Edited by* ALASTAIR HANNAY *and*  
 GORDON MARINO
- LEIBNIZ *Edited by* NICHOLAS JOLLEY
- LEVINAS *Edited by* SIMON CRITCHLEY *and*  
 ROBERT BERNASCONI
- LOCKE *Edited by* VERE CHAPPELL
- MALEBRANCHE *Edited by* STEVEN NADLER
- MARX *Edited by* TERRELL CARVER
- MILL *Edited by* JOHN SKORUPSKI

NEWTON *Edited by* I. BERNARD COHEN *and*  
GEORGE E. SMITH  
NIETZSCHE *Edited by* BERND MAGNUS *and*  
KATHLEEN HIGGINS  
OCKHAM *Edited by* PAUL VINCENT SPADE  
PASCAL *Edited by* NICHOLAS HAMMOND  
PLATO *Edited by* RICHARD KRAUT  
PLOTINUS *Edited by* LLOYD P. GERSON  
ROUSSEAU *Edited by* PATRICK RILEY  
SARTRE *Edited by* CHRISTINA HOWELLS  
SCHOPENHAUER *Edited by* CHRISTOPHER JANAWAY  
THE SCOTTISH ENLIGHTENMENT *Edited by*  
ALEXANDER BROADIE  
SPINOZA *Edited by* DON GARRETT  
WITTGENSTEIN *Edited by* HANS SLUGA *and*  
DAVID STERN

Cambridge University Press  
0521806038 - The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Philosophy  
Edited by A. S. McGrade  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

*The Cambridge Companion to*  
**MEDIEVAL  
PHILOSOPHY**

---

*Edited by*  
A. S. McGrade



Cambridge University Press  
0521806038 - The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Philosophy  
Edited by A. S. McGrade  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE  
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK  
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain  
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa  
<http://www.cambridge.org>

© Cambridge University Press 2003

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without  
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*Typeface* Trump Medieval 10/13 pt.    *System* L<sup>A</sup>T<sub>E</sub>X 2<sub>ε</sub> [TB]

*A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library*

ISBN 0 521 80603 8 hardback  
ISBN 0 521 00063 7 paperback

The publisher has used its best endeavors to ensure that the URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.

## CONTENTS

<i>Notes on contributors</i>	<i>page xi</i>
<i>Preface</i>	xv
<i>Abbreviations and forms of reference</i>	xvii
Introduction A. S. MCGRADE	I
Entry points	2
Otherness	3
What is medieval philosophy?	4
Going further	7
A final image: medieval philosophy and freedom	8
I Medieval philosophy in context	IO
STEVEN P. MARRONE	
Emergence of medieval philosophy in the late Roman Empire	II
Monastic discipline and scholarship	16
Islam	19
The rise of the West and the reemergence of philosophy	21
Rationalization in society: politics, religion, and educational institutions	28
Aristotle and thirteenth-century scholasticism	32
The contested fourteenth century	36
The place of authority in medieval thought	40
Philosophical sources	43
Genres	43
vii	

## viii Contents

2	Two medieval ideas: eternity and hierarchy	51
	JOHN MARENBOON AND D. E. LUSCOMBE	
	Eternity	51
	Hierarchy	60
3	Language and logic	73
	E. J. ASHWORTH	
	Sources and developments	73
	The purpose and nature of language and logic	77
	Signification, conventional and mental language	81
	Paronymy and analogy	85
	Reference: supposition theory	90
	Truth and paradox	92
	Inference and paradox	93
4	Philosophy in Islam	97
	THÉRÈSE-ANNE DRUART	
	Philosophy, religion, and culture	100
	Psychology and metaphysics	108
	Ethics	113
5	Jewish philosophy	121
	IDIT DOBBS-WEINSTEIN	
	The roots of knowledge – Saadiah Gaon	122
	Universal hylomorphism – Ibn Gabirol	126
	The limits of reason – Moses Maimonides	128
	A purer Aristotelianism – Gersonides	137
	Jewish–Christian interactions	141
6	Metaphysics: God and being	147
	STEPHEN P. MENN	
	Physical and metaphysical proofs of God	147
	Avicenna’s argument and some challenges to it	150
	Essence and existence	154
	Only one necessary being?	157

Contents	ix
Challenges to essence–existence composition	158
Challenges about God and <i>esse</i>	160
Univocity, equivocality, analogy	162
7 Creation and nature	171
EDITH DUDLEY SYLLA	
Creation	173
Nature as epiphany: natural philosophy through the twelfth century	174
Astronomy and astrology	177
Scholastic natural philosophy	179
Interactions of natural philosophy and theology	187
8 Natures: the problem of universals	196
GYULA KLIMA	
Exemplarist realism: universals as divine reasons	196
Common natures, singular existents, active minds	201
Common terms, singular natures	204
9 Human nature	208
ROBERT PASNAU	
Mind and body and soul	208
Cognition	213
Will, passion, and action	221
Freedom and immortality	224
10 The moral life	231
BONNIE KENT	
Augustine and classical ethics	232
Happiness and morality	235
Evil, badness, vice, and sin	243
Virtues, theological and other	246
11 Ultimate goods: happiness, friendship, and bliss	254
JAMES McEVOY	
Augustine and the universal desire for happiness	255



x	Contents	
	Boethius: philosophy has its consolations	259
	Thomas Aquinas	261
	Happiness in the intellectual life	266
	Theories of friendship	271
	Happiness and peace at the end of history: Joachim of Fiore	273
12	Political philosophy	276
	ANNABEL S. BRETT	
	The one true city	278
	Reason, nature, and the human good	280
	Election and consent	285
	Hierarchy and grace	288
	History, autonomy, and rights	290
	Conclusion	295
13	Medieval philosophy in later thought	300
	P. J. FITZPATRICK AND JOHN HALDANE	
	The Renaissance and seventeenth century	300
	Current engagements	316
14	Transmission and translation	328
	THOMAS WILLIAMS	
	Channels of transmission	329
	Three case studies	334
	Translating medieval philosophy	338
	Pairs and snares	341
	A word of encouragement	343
	<i>Chronology of philosophers and major events</i>	347
	<i>Biographies of major medieval philosophers</i>	350
	<i>Bibliography</i>	360
	<i>Index</i>	398

## NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

E. J. ASHWORTH is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Waterloo, Canada. She is the author of *Language and Logic in the Post-Medieval Period* and of numerous articles on medieval and early modern language and logic. She has edited the *Tractatus de obligationibus* of Paul of Venice's *Logica magna*. She was editor of the Renaissance section of the *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy* and continues as editor of the on-line version.

ANNABEL S. BRETT is Lecturer in History at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of Gonville and Caius College. Her work in medieval and early modern political thought includes *Liberty, Right and Nature: Individual Rights in Later Scholastic Thought* and an edition of Ockham's *On the Power of Emperors and Princes*. She is now preparing a translation of Marsilius of Padua's *Defender of Peace*.

IDIT DOBBS-WEINSTEIN is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Vanderbilt University. She is the author of *Maimonides and St. Thomas on the Limits of Reason* and an audio book, *Moses Maimonides and Medieval Jewish Philosophy*, as well as many articles on medieval Jewish philosophy, with a special interest in its relations to medieval Islamic and Christian thought and to the philosophy of Spinoza.

THÉRÈSE-ANNE DRUART is Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Center for Medieval and Byzantine Studies at the Catholic University of America. Her recent publications include "The Human Soul's Individuation and its Survival After the Body's Death: Avicenna on the Causal Relation Between Body and Soul." She is

xii Notes on contributors

preparing a section on metaphysics for *The Cambridge Companion to Arabic Philosophy* and will be directing a continuing bibliography in medieval Islamic philosophy, theology, and the sciences for the Société Internationale des Sciences et de la Philosophie Arabe et Islamique.

P. J. FITZPATRICK is Emeritus Reader in Philosophy at the University of Durham. His writings include *Birth Regulation and Catholic Belief*, *Apologia pro Charles Kingsley*, and *In Breaking of Bread: The Eucharist and Ritual*.

JOHN HALDANE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of St. Andrews, where he is also Senior Fellow of the Centre for Ethics, Philosophy and Public Affairs. He is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Edinburgh and the Royal Society of Arts. Besides editing and coediting several collections of essays, he has written numerous articles on the history of philosophy, philosophy of mind, metaphysics, and moral philosophy, and is coauthor of *Atheism and Theism* in the Blackwell Great Debates in Philosophy series. He will be Gifford Lecturer in Natural Theology at the University of Aberdeen in 2003/4.

BONNIE KENT is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Irvine. Since publishing *Virtues of the Will* she has worked especially on issues of motivation in medieval moral psychology. Her recent essays include "Habits and Virtues," in S. Pope, ed., *The Ethics of Aquinas*, and "Rethinking Moral Dispositions," in T. Williams, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Scotus*.

GYULA KLIMA is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Fordham University. He is the author of *Ars artium: Essays in Philosophical Semantics Medieval and Modern* and numerous articles on medieval logic and metaphysics. He has translated John Buridan's *Summulae de dialectica* and is currently working on a monograph on Buridan's logic and metaphysics.

D. E. LUSCOMBE is a Fellow of the British Academy and Research Professor of Medieval History at the University of Sheffield. He is the author of *The School of Peter Abelard*, *Peter Abelard's Ethics*, *Medieval Thought*, and many articles on Abelard and on medieval

conceptions of hierarchy. He is joint editor, with J. Riley-Smith, of parts 1 and 2 of volume IV of *The New Cambridge Medieval History* (forthcoming) and is currently completing an edition of the *Letters of Peter Abelard and Heloise*.

JAMES MCEVOY is Dean of the Faculty of Philosophy at the National University of Ireland at Maynooth. His special interests in medieval philosophy include Scottus Eriugena, Thomas Gallan, Robert Grosseteste, and the theme of friendship. He is the author of *Robert Grosseteste* (2002) and of two volumes on theories of friendship in antiquity and in the Christian era, *Sagesses de l'amitié* (1997 and 2002). He is a contributor to the edition of Grosseteste's unedited works and is preparing a book on friendship and associated concepts in the history of philosophy.

A. S. MCGRADE is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy, the University of Connecticut, and the author of *The Political Thought of William of Ockham*. He has edited, with John Kilcullen, two volumes of Ockham's political writings and, with John Kilcullen and Matthew Kempshall, volume II of *Cambridge Translations of Medieval Philosophical Texts* (on ethics and political philosophy).

JOHN MARENBO is Fellow and Director of Studies in the History of Philosophy, Trinity College, University of Cambridge. He is the author of a two-volume history of medieval philosophy; *The Philosophy of Peter Abelard; Aristotelian Logic, Platonism, and the Context of Early Medieval Philosophy in the West*; and *Boethius*. He is now at work on a new introduction to medieval philosophy (to replace his earlier history) and a study of medieval views of pagans (especially ancient ones).

STEVEN P. MARRONE is Professor of History at Tufts University. His studies of thirteenth-century epistemology include many articles and three monographs, *William of Auvergne and Robert Grosseteste: New Ideas of Truth in the Early Thirteenth Century*, *Truth and Scientific Knowledge in the Thought of Henry of Ghent*, and *The Light of Thy Countenance: Science and Knowledge of God in the Thirteenth Century*.

xiv Notes on contributors

STEPHEN P. MENN is Associate Professor of Philosophy at McGill University and works on ancient and medieval philosophy and the history of mathematics. He is the author of *Plato on God as Nous* and *Descartes and Augustine*. He is completing a book manuscript on *The Aim and the Argument of Aristotle's Metaphysics* and is working with Calvin Normore on a book about nominalism and realism.

ROBERT PASNAU is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Colorado and the author of *Theories of Cognition in the Later Middle Ages* and *Thomas Aquinas on Human Nature. A Philosophical Study of Summa Theologiae 1a 75–89*, as well as numerous articles and reviews on topics in late medieval epistemology. He has edited Aquinas's commentary on Aristotle's *De anima* and volume III of *Cambridge Translations of Medieval Philosophical Texts*, on mind and knowledge. He is general editor of the Hackett Aquinas Project, a series of translations, with commentary, of Aquinas's central philosophical texts, and has contributed to that series a volume on Aquinas's treatise on human nature.

EDITH DUDLEY SYLLA is Professor of History at North Carolina State University. She has written extensively on fourteenth-century natural philosophy, especially the work of the Oxford Calculators. She is currently working on Walter Burley's physics and on the origins of mathematical probability, particularly in the work of Jacob Bernoulli. Her forthcoming publications include "Business Ethics, Commercial Mathematics, and the Origins of Mathematical Probability" and, with A. Maierù, a short biography of Anneliese Maier.

THOMAS WILLIAMS is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Iowa. He has translated works by Augustine and Anselm and is now preparing volume v of *Cambridge Translations of Medieval Philosophical Texts*, on philosophical theology. His work on Duns Scotus includes "A Most Methodical Lover? On Scotus's Arbitrary Creator" and the editing of *The Cambridge Companion to Duns Scotus*.

## PREFACE

This book presents one of the most exciting periods in the history of philosophy, a millennium of thought extending from Augustine to Wyclif in the Latin West, from al-Kindi to Ibn Rushd in Islam, and in medieval Jewish communities from Ibn Gabirol to Gersonides. As a Companion, the volume seeks to do more than present authoritative information *about* its subject. The contributors aim to take their readers as far as possible *into* medieval philosophy. I explain in the introduction how we hope to achieve this. For now it will be enough to say that we do not assume any prior knowledge of medieval philosophy or the languages in which it was written. We expect that most readers will have had some exposure to contemporary philosophy, but we welcome and hope to assist interested nonphilosophers as well. The volume is meant to be useful in medieval philosophy courses at all levels, but we also have very much in mind those who are approaching medieval philosophy on their own, without access to specialists in the field. We will be delighted if our efforts incite a degree of student agitation for more medieval courses in mainly modernist philosophy departments and if we encourage teachers who skipped or were deprived of the Middle Ages in their own training to offer such courses. It could be a liberating experience for all concerned.

The contributors to this volume have shown great public spirit and enthusiasm for medieval philosophy in setting aside more specialized research in order to make the whole subject accessible to others – not an easy assignment, but, they have found, a rewarding one. I am grateful for their counsel regarding my part in the volume and for their patience and good humor in adjusting their work to suit

xvi Preface

the common good (most often by cutting out fine material for which there simply is not room). I am happy to thank the reviewers of an early prospectus for this Companion for highly effective criticism and the following for advice and information given along the way: Donald Baxter, Stephen Lahey, Miri Rubin, Paul V. Spade, Eleonore Stump, John Wippel, and Jack Zupko. My debts to Professor B. J. McGrade are easily borne but boundless. Individual contributors wish to acknowledge the advice or inspiration of Julie Allen, Paul Freedman, Ester Macedo, Mrs C. M. L. Smith, and Katherine Tachau. Final thanks are due to the editorial and production staff of Cambridge University Press, and especially to Hilary Gaskin, who has supported and judiciously overseen the volume from start to finish.

A. S. McGrade

## ABBREVIATIONS AND FORMS OF REFERENCE

For works cited with a number in square brackets (e.g., Kretzmann [41]), a full reference is given in the bibliography.

a.	article
ad	reply to (ad 1: reply to first objection)
CCAq	<i>The Cambridge Companion to Thomas Aquinas</i> , ed. N. Kretzmann and E. Stump (Cambridge, 1993)
CCAug	<i>The Cambridge Companion to Augustine</i> , ed. E. Stump and N. Kretzmann (Cambridge, 2001)
CCOck	<i>The Cambridge Companion to Ockham</i> , ed. P. V. Spade (Cambridge, 1999)
CCScot	<i>The Cambridge Companion to Duns Scotus</i> , ed. T. Williams (Cambridge, 2003)
CH12	<i>A History of Twelfth-Century Western Philosophy</i> , ed. P. Dronke (Cambridge, 1988)
CHLMP	<i>The Cambridge History of Later Medieval Philosophy</i> , ed. N. Kretzmann <i>et al.</i> (Cambridge, 1982)
CT I–III	<i>The Cambridge Translations of Medieval Philosophical Texts</i> I <i>Logic and the Philosophy of Language</i> , ed. N. Kretzmann and E. Stump (Cambridge, 1988) II <i>Ethics and Political Philosophy</i> , ed. A. S. McGrade, J. Kilcullen, and M. Kempshall (Cambridge, 2001) III <i>Mind and Knowledge</i> , ed. R. Pasnau (Cambridge, 2002)



xviii Abbreviations and forms of reference

d.	distinction (in textual references)
obj.	objection
<i>Ordinatio</i>	The text of some or all of a <i>Sentences</i> commentary put in order for publication by the author, in contrast with a <i>reportatio</i>
<i>PG</i>	<i>Patrologia graeca</i> , ed. J. P. Migne, 162 vols. (Paris, 1857–66) (Greek text with Latin translation)
<i>PL</i>	<i>Patrologia latina</i> , ed. J. P. Migne, 221 vols. (Paris, 1844–64)
q.	question
q. disp.	disputed question
quodl.	quodlibet
<i>Reportatio</i>	The “reported” form of some or all of a <i>Sentences</i> commentary (see p. 330)
<i>ScG</i>	Thomas Aquinas, <i>Summa contra Gentiles</i>
<i>Sent.</i>	Peter Lombard, <i>Sententiae in IV libris distinctae</i> (Four Books of Sentences), 2 vols. (Grottaferrata, 1971–81) or commentary thereon (see p. 28)
<i>ST</i>	Thomas Aquinas, <i>Summa theologiae</i> : references are to the four parts – I, IaIIae (first part of the second part), IIaIIae (second part of the second part), and III
un.	unique (e.g., where a question has only one article)