

READING IN MEDIEVAL ST. GALL

Learning to read in medieval Germany meant learning to read and understand Latin as well as the pupils' own language. The teaching methods used in the medieval Abbey of St. Gall survive in the translations and commentaries of the monk, scholar and teacher Notker Labeo (*ca.* 950–1022). Notker's pedagogic method, although deeply rooted in classical and monastic traditions, demonstrates revolutionary innovations that include providing translations in the pupils' native German, supplying structural commentary in the form of simplified word order and punctuation, and furnishing special markers that helped readers to perform texts out loud. Anna Grotans examines this unique interplay between orality and literacy in Latin and Old High German, and illustrates her study with many examples from Notker's manuscripts. This study has much to contribute to our knowledge of medieval reading, and of the relationship between Latin and the vernacular in a variety of formal and informal contexts.

Anna Grotans is Associate Professor of German at The Ohio State University, where she teaches medieval Germanic Studies and has served as Associate Director of the Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies. She is co-editor of *The St. Gall Tractate: A Classroom Guide to Rhetorical Syntax* (1995) and *De Consolatione Philologiae* (2000), and has published in the fields of Old High German, medieval paleography and text editing.

Cambridge University Press
 0521803446 - Reading in Medieval St. Gall
 Anna A. Grotans
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge Studies in Palaeography and Codicology

FOUNDING EDITORS

Albinia de la Mare
 Rosamond McKitterick *Newnham College, University of Cambridge*

GENERAL EDITORS

David Ganz *King's College London*
 Teresa Webber *Trinity College, University of Cambridge*

This series has been established to further the study of manuscripts from the Middle Ages to the Renaissance. It includes books devoted to particular types of manuscripts, their production and circulation, to individual codices of outstanding importance, and to regions, periods, and scripts of especial interest to scholars. The series will be of interest not only to scholars and students of medieval literature and history, but also to theologians, art historians, and others working with manuscript sources.

ALREADY PUBLISHED

- Bernhard Bischoff, translated by Michael Gorman *Manuscripts and Libraries in the Age of Charlemagne*
- Richard Gameson *The Early Medieval Bible: Its Production, Decoration and Use*
- Nancy Netzer *Cultural Interplay in the Eighth Century: The Trier Gospels and the Making of a Scriptorium at Echternach*
- William Noel *The Harley Psalter*
- Charles F. Briggs *Giles of Rome's De regimine principum: Reading and Writing Politics at Court and University, c. 1275–c. 1525*
- Leslie Brubaker *Vision and Meaning in Ninth-Century Byzantium: Image as Exegesis in the Homilies of Gregory of Nazianzus*
- Francis Newton *The Scriptorium and Library at Monte Cassino, 1058–1105*
- Lisa Fagin Davis *The Gottschalk Antiphonary: Music and Liturgy in Twelfth-Century Lambach*
- Albert Derolez *The Palaeography of Gothic Manuscript Books: From the Twelfth to the Early Sixteenth Century*
- Alison I. Beach *Women as Scribes: Book Production and Monastic Reform in Twelfth-Century Bavaria*
- Yitzhak Hen and Rob Meens, editors *The Bobbio Missal: Liturgy and Religious Culture in Merovingian Gaul*
- Marica Tacconi *Cathedral and Civic Ritual in Late Medieval and Renaissance Florence: The Service Books of Santa Maria del Fiore*

Cambridge University Press
0521803446 - Reading in Medieval St. Gall
Anna A. Grotans
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

READING IN MEDIEVAL
ST. GALL

ANNA A. GROTANS



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 0521803446 - Reading in Medieval St. Gall
 Anna A. Grotans
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo
 Cambridge University Press
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
 Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521803441

© Anna A. Grotans 2006

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without
 the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Grotans, Anna A., 1961–

Reading in medieval St. Gall/Anna A. Grotans.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in palaeography and codicology; 13)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-80344-6 (hardback)

1. Latin language—Study and teaching—Switzerland—Saint Gall—History—To 1500.
2. Kloster St. Gallen.
3. Books and reading—Switzerland—Saint Gall—History—to 1500.
4. Notker, Labeo, ca. 950-1022—Knowledge—Language and Languages.
5. Notker, Labeo, ca. 950-1022—Knowledge—Education.
6. Saint Gall (Switzerland)—Intellectual life—To 1500.

I. Title. II. Series.

PA2067.K58G76 2006 470'.71'049472—DC22

2005018816

ISBN-13 978-0-521-80344-1 hardback

ISBN-10 0-521-80344-6 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
0521803446 - Reading in Medieval St. Gall
Anna A. Grotans
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

*Avis carissimis, Helenae,
Antoniae, et Milae*

Contents

List of plates	<i>page</i> ix
Acknowledgments	xi
List of abbreviations	xiii
Manuscript punctuation and other symbols	xv
<i>Introduction</i>	
1 <i>Medieval reading</i>	15
Literacy and orality	15
<i>Grammatica</i> and the classical past	23
The monastic “present”	28
Legibility and comprehension	33
Reading and writing German	39
2 <i>Education at St. Gall</i>	49
The St. Gall “schools,” pupils and teachers	53
Teaching methods and curriculum	67
Primary education	71
Secondary education	76
Tenth-century curricular changes	79
Reading Notker’s texts	91
The readers of Notker’s texts	101
3 <i>Language use and choice</i>	111
Diglossia	112
Ekkehard IV on language	121
Languages of instruction	131
The “natural method”	132
The “eclectic method”	138
Code-switching and Notker’s mixed prose	145

Contents

4	The St. Gall Tractate	155
	Tenth-century <i>lectio</i>	158
	Structural analysis	161
	Circumstances of action	161
	The <i>ordo naturalis</i>	164
	Sentence movement	173
	Performance analysis	179
5	Discretio <i>in the classroom</i>	199
	Simplified word order	200
	Syntactical punctuation	223
	Performance cues and markers	226
	Verbal performance cues	228
	Graphic performance markers	235
6	Accentus	249
	Notker's accentuation "system"	250
	The "rules"	253
	Exceptions to the "rules"	254
	Sloppy scribes or shifting system?	261
	Traditions of accentuation	267
	The Latin context	267
	Vernacular accentuation	275
	<i>Accentus</i> applied to reading in Notker's texts	277
7	<i>Spelling for reading</i>	285
	Writing German	285
	Notker's " <i>Anlautgesetz</i> "	288
	Classical and medieval <i>orthographia</i> and pronunciation	293
	Alcuin's spelling reform	297
	Notker's German spelling	300
	Reading from written texts	302
	The " <i>Anlautgesetz</i> " applied	307
	Bibliography	311
	Index of manuscripts	355
	General index	357

Plates

- | | |
|--|-----------------|
| 1. Latin/OHG grammatical terminology, St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 556, p. 401. Reproduced by permission of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek. | <i>page</i> 141 |
| 2. Syntactical glosses to Boethius, <i>De consolatione Philosophiae</i> , I, m6. St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 844, p. 33. Reproduced by permission of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek. | 208 |
| 3. An example of syntactical punctuation from Notker's translation/commentary of the Latin <i>De interpretatione</i> (<i>Ni</i> 4). St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 818, p. 144. Reproduced by permission of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek. | 227 |
| 4. Interlinear verbal performance cues in Notker's translation/commentary of Martianus Capella, <i>De nuptiis Philologiae et Mercurii</i> (<i>Nc</i> 80, 2ff.). St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 872, p. 80. Reproduced by permission of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek. | 230 |
| 5. Marginal structural commentary in the hand of Ekkehard IV. The text is Eugypsius' <i>Thesaurus</i> to Augustine. St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 176, p. 55. Reproduced by permission of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek. | 234 |
| 6. Graphic performance markers in Notker's translation/commentary of Martianus Capella, <i>De nuptiis Philologiae et Mercurii</i> (<i>Nc</i> 154). St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 872, p. 154. Reproduced by permission of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek. | 279 |
| 7. Correction of the "Anlautgesetz" in the copy of Notker's translation/commentary of Boethius, <i>De consolatione</i> , III, m9 (<i>Nb</i> 149) in Zurich, Zentralbibliothek MS C121, f. 50r. Reproduced by permission of the Zurich Zentralbibliothek. | 303 |

Plates

8. Correction of the “Anlautgesetz” in the copy of Notker’s translation/commentary of Boethius, *De consolatione Philosophiae* in St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, MS 825, p. 206 (*Nb* 206).
Reproduced by permission of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek.

304

Acknowledgments

I am indebted to many friends and colleagues for their assistance, support, and encouragement throughout the course of this project. I owe a special debt of gratitude to my doctoral advisor and mentor, Evelyn S. Firchow, who first introduced me to Notker Labeo and has for many years encouraged and supported my research. Many a summer I spent with her in the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek and her summer cabin at “Fircoves,” discussing, debating, sharing and learning. Her guidance and friendship have been invaluable. Harold Anderson, Frank Coulson and David Porter offered their expert advice with difficult Latin and paleographical questions and provided valuable insights into early medieval pedagogy and glossing techniques. Frank Coulson, Nicholas Howe, Neil Jacobs, Hartwig Mayer, and Harry Vredeveld read parts of this study at various stages of its progress and offered helpful suggestions and comments. Conversations with Kathryn Corl, Rebecca Haidt, Nikolaus Henkel, Andrea and Wernfried Hofmeister, C. Stephen Jaeger, Christopher A. Jones, Anneli Luhtula, Haruko Momma, Malcolm Parkes, Harald Saller, Beat von Scarpatetti, Karl Schmuki, and Carin Ruff were insightful and encouraging. A special thanks to Ernst Hellgardt and the medievalists at the University of Munich for their support during my research year there. I would also like to thank Maartje Scheltens, Assistant Literature Editor, and Rosamond McKitterick, David Ganz and particularly Tessa Webber, my series editors at Cambridge University Press, through whose patience and expert criticism this book has been much improved. Thanks to Debby Banham for her expert copy-editing.

I am indebted to the late Peter Ochsenbein and the late Werner Vogler, who opened for me the doors of the St. Gall Stiftsbibliothek and Stiftsarchiv and were always willing to help me with materials and queries; Cornel Dora, Ruedi Widmer and the staff at the “Stibi” gave not only their support but also friendship. Thanks also go to the following libraries and directors for extending their research courtesies: the Zurich Zentralbibliothek, in particular Christoph Eggenberger and Marlis Stähli, the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek in Munich, the Deutsche Staatsbibliothek

Acknowledgments

in Berlin, and the Vatican Film Library at St. Louis University, in particular the late Charles Ermatinger.

For research support I am grateful to the Council for International Exchange of Scholars for a Fulbright Research Grant, the National Endowment for the Humanities, the Mellon Foundation, the College of Humanities and the Department of Germanic Languages and Literatures at The Ohio State University.

Finally, I want to express my deepest gratitude to many friends, both here and abroad, who have supported me throughout this project: Ingrida Cazars, Jutta Groll, Peter, Katti and Bonzi Firchow, Peter and Beatrice Kalberer, Henriette Mäurer, Theresa Rabitsch, Jenny Shimp, Judith and Meinrad Unteregger, and Dorothea Waitz. The members of my family, in particular my parents John and Ilze Grotans, have been unfailing in their support and encouragement. This book is dedicated to my grandmothers, who did not live to see its completion.

Abbreviations

CCCC	Corpus Christi College, Cambridge
CCCM	<i>Corpus Christianorum. Continuatio Mediaevalis</i>
CCM	<i>Corpus Consuetudinum Monasticarum</i>
CCSL	<i>Corpus Christianorum Series Latina</i>
CSEL	<i>Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum</i>
DA	<i>Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittelalters</i>
GL	<i>Grammatici Latini</i>
JEGP	<i>Journal of English and Germanic Philology</i>
MGH	<i>Monumenta Germaniae Historica</i>
Cap	<i>Capitularia</i>
Conc	<i>Concilia</i>
Epist	<i>Epistolae</i>
Poet	<i>Poetae</i>
SS	<i>Scriptores (in folio)</i>
SRGSch	<i>Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi</i>
SRM	<i>Scriptores rerum Merovingicarum</i>
MLN	<i>Modern Language Notes</i>
MLR	<i>Modern Language Review</i>
Nb	Notker Labeo, <i>De consolatione Philosophiae</i>
Nc	Notker Labeo, <i>De nuptiis Philologiae et Mercurii</i>
Ncom	Notker Labeo, <i>Computus</i>
NcL	<i>Latinus</i> volume to <i>Nc</i>
Ndef	Notker Labeo, <i>De definitione</i>
Ndia	Notker Labeo, <i>De dialectica</i>
Ndis	Notker Labeo, <i>Distributio</i>
Ni	Notker Labeo, <i>De interpretatione</i>
Nk	Notker Labeo, <i>De categoriis</i>

Abbreviations

NkS	Notker Labeo, <i>Die kleineren Schriften</i>
NkSL	<i>Latinus</i> volume to <i>NkS</i>
Nl	Notker Labeo, <i>De partibus logicae</i>
Nm	Notker Labeo, <i>De musica</i>
Np	Notker Labeo, <i>Psalter</i>
Nr	Notker Labeo, <i>De arte rhetorica</i>
Ns	Notker Labeo, <i>De syllogismis</i>
OE	Old English
OHG	Old High German
PBB	<i>Beiträge zur deutschen Sprache und Literatur</i>
PL	<i>Patrologia Latina</i>
SGT	Notker Labeo, <i>St. Gall Tractate</i>
ZfdA	<i>Zeitschrift für deutsches Altertum</i>
ZfdPh	<i>Zeitschrift für deutsche Philologie</i>

Manuscript punctuation and other symbols

When citing texts from manuscripts, I follow the punctuation practice adopted by the ATB edition of Notker Labeo's works. The *subdistinctio/media distinctio*, a point on the line or slightly above the line, is represented by a period with a space before and after (e.g., "Subdistinctio est . punctus ad imam litteram"). A *distinctio finalis*, a high point above the line, is represented by a period with no preceding space (e.g., "Haec sententia est plena."). The *punctus interrogativus* <•~> is rendered with the modern punctuation mark <?> in text passages. Other punctuation and symbols used in this study are:

- ↗ = *punctus elevatus*
- ; = *punctus versus*
- ⊣ or •⊢ = *punctus (circum)flexus*
- ~ = *punctus interrogativus*
- | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| + | ⋮ | } | = "heavy pointing" used at the end of paragraph |
| ⋮ | ⋮ | | |
| ⋮ | ⋮ | | |
| ⋮ | ⋮ | | |