

WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

Dispute Settlement Reports

1999
Volume VI

Pages 2095-2556

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-0-521-80325-0 — Dispute Settlement Reports 1999
Edited by World Trade Organization
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521803250

© World Trade Organization, 2002. Material in this report may be reproduced, provided the source is acknowledged.

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2002

French edition and Spanish edition paperbacks of this title are both available directly from WTO Publications, World Trade Organization, Centre William Rappard, 154 rue de Lausanne, CH-1211 Geneva 21, Switzerland <http://www.wto.org>

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-80325-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT REPORTS

The *Dispute Settlement Reports* of the World Trade Organization (the "WTO") include panel and Appellate Body reports, as well as arbitration awards, in disputes concerning the rights and obligations of WTO Members under the provisions of the *Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization*. The *Dispute Settlement Reports* are available in English, French and Spanish. Starting with 1999, the first volume of each year contains a cumulative index of published disputes.

This volume may be cited as DSR 1999:VI

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
Canada - Measures Affecting the Importation of Milk and the Exportation of Dairy Products (WT/DS103)	
Report of the Panel	2097
Turkey - Restrictions on Imports of Textile and Clothing Products (WT/DS34)	
Report of the Appellate Body	2345
Report of the Panel	2363

CANADA - MEASURES AFFECTING THE IMPORTATION OF MILK AND THE EXPORTATION OF DAIRY PRODUCTS

Report of the Panel

WT/DS103/R

WT/DS113/R

*Adopted by the Dispute Settlement Body
 on 27 October 1999
 as modified by the Appellate Body Report*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	2103
II. FACTUAL ASPECTS	2105
A. The Canadian Dairy Sector	2105
1. General	2105
2. Components of the Canadian Dairy Policy	2106
3. The Canadian Dairy Commission (the "CDC")	2107
4. Provincial Milk Marketing Boards	2109
5. The NMMP	2109
6. The CMSMC and the MSQ.	2110
B. The Canadian Special Milk Classes Scheme	2111
1. Background	2111
2. The Special Classes	2112
3. In-Quota Milk and Over-Quota Milk	2113
4. The Price of Milk to the Processor	2114
(a) Other Classes (Classes 1 - 4)	2114
(b) Class 5 (Special Classes)	2114
5. Returns to Producers from Exports	2115
(a) General	2115
(b) In-Quota Exports	2116
(c) Over-Quota Exports	2116
6. Pooling	2117
C. Canada's Tariff-Rate Quota on Fluid Milk and Cream	2121

 Report of the Panel

	Page
III. CLAIMS OF THE PARTIES	2121
A. Exportation of Dairy Products	2121
1. Product Coverage and Period of Time	2121
2. Nature of Measure	2122
3. Agreement on Agriculture	2122
(a) Article 1(e).....	2122
(b) Article 9.1(a) and (c).....	2123
(c) Article 3.3 and Article 8.....	2123
(d) Article 10	2123
4. Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures ("SCM Agreement")	2123
(a) Article 1 and Paragraph (d) of the Illustrative List of Export Subsidies in Annex I.....	2123
(b) Article 3	2124
B. Importation of Milk	2124
1. Article II of GATT 1994 and the Agreement on Import Licensing Procedures	2124
C. Recommendations Requested by the Parties	2124
IV. ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES.....	2125
A. Exportation of Dairy Products	2125
1. Nature of Canada's Special Milk Classes Scheme	2125
(a) Outline	2125
(b) The Authority and Role of the Canadian Dairy Commission (CDC).....	2125
(c) Government Involvement.....	2139
(d) Producers' Involvement.....	2150
(e) In- and Over-quota Milk and the Producers' Choice.....	2158
2. "Export Subsidy" - the Interpretive Context	2169
(a) The SCM Agreement and the Agreement on Agriculture	2169
(b) The Relevance of the Vienna Convention and Negotiating History	2174
3. The Agreement on Agriculture	2182
(a) Outline	2182

	Page
(b) Article 9.1(a).....	2183
(i) The Meaning of "direct subsidies, including payments-in-kind"	2183
(ii) The Meaning of the Term "direct"	2189
(c) Article 9:1(c).....	2190
(i) The Meaning of the Term "payment"	2190
(ii) Financed by Virtue of Governmental Action.....	2205
(d) Article 10	2208
(i) Outline.....	2208
(ii) "Export subsidy" within the Meaning of Article 10	2209
(iii) "Circumvention".....	2211
(iv) Article 10.3 - the Burden of Proof.....	2218
(e) Other Relevant Provisions of the Agreement on Agriculture	2220
(i) Article 8 and 3.3.....	2220
4. Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures ("SCM Agreement")	2220
(a) Outline	2220
(b) Article 1	2222
(i) Article 1.1(a)(1) - Financial Contribution	2222
(ii) Article 1.1(a)(2) - Income or Price Support in the Sense of Article XVI of GATT 1994.....	2231
(iii) Article 1.1(b) - "Benefit".....	2239
(c) Paragraph (d) of the Illustrative List of Export Subsidies	2244
(i) Outline.....	2244
(ii) Government Mandated.....	2246
(iii) Terms or Conditions more Favourable	2248
(iv) Terms and Conditions more Favorable than those Commercially Available	2249
(d) Article 3	2263

Report of the Panel

	Page
5. Protected Markets and Export Subsidies	2263
B. Importation of Milk	2268
1. Outline	2268
2. Article II:1 of GATT 1994.....	2269
3. Article 3 of the Agreement on Import Licensing Procedures	2285
V. SUMMARY OF THIRD PARTY SUBMISSIONS.....	2287
A. Australia	2287
1. Introduction	2287
2. Discussion.....	2288
(a) Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the SCM Agreement.....	2288
(b) Classes 5(d) and (e) under the Special Milk Classes Scheme Constitute Export Subsidies.....	2289
(c) Export Subsidies under Article 9.1 of the Agreement on Agriculture.....	2290
(i) "Provision by Governments or their Agencies"	2290
(ii) "Direct Subsidies, Including Payments- in-Kind".....	2290
(d) Article 3 of the Agreement on Agriculture	2291
(e) Article 10 of the Agreement on Agriculture	2291
(f) Article 3 of the SCM Agreement	2291
B. Japan.....	2292
1. Introduction	2292
2. Legal Arguments.....	2292
(a) Canada's Special Milk Classes Scheme Provided an Export Subsidy within the Meaning of Article 9.1(c) of the Agreement on Agriculture	2292
(b) By Operating the Special Milk Class System, Canada Circumvented or Threatened to Circumvent its Export Subsidy Commitments	2293
(c) Canada was Requested to Bring the Measures at Issue into Conformity with the Agreement on Agriculture.	2294

	Canada - Milk
	Page
VI. INTERIM REVIEW	2294
VII. FINDINGS.....	2295
A. Claims of the Parties.....	2295
1. The Special Milk Classes Scheme	2295
2. The Tariff-Rate Quota for Fluid Milk	2296
3. Other Claims Raised in the Requests for this Panel.....	2297
B. The Special Milk Classes Scheme	2297
1. Summary of Claims and Arguments of the Parties	2297
(a) New Zealand and the United States	2297
(b) Canada	2298
2. The Panel's Decision of 16 December 1998	2298
3. The Agreements Referred to and the Sequence in which the Panel will Address the Claims.....	2300
(a) The Agreement on Agriculture and the SCM Agreement.....	2300
(b) The Agreement on Agriculture.....	2301
(i) General Outline	2301
(ii) The Specific Provisions Relied upon by the Parties	2303
4. Burden of Proof as a Consequence of Article 10.3 of the Agreement on Agriculture.....	2303
5. Article 9.1(a) of the Agreement on Agriculture	2304
(a) "direct subsidies, including payments-in-kind"	2305
(i) General Criteria	2305
(ii) Milk Sales under Special Milk Classes 5(d) and (e): the Provision of Milk for the Processing of Dairy Products for Export at a Lower Price	2306
(iii) Milk Sales under Special Milk Classes 5(d) and (e): the Provision of Milk for the Processing of Dairy Products for Export by the CDC with an Assured Margin for the Processor	2310
(iv) Concluding Remarks on the Payment in Kind Offered to Processors/ Exporters	2311

 Report of the Panel

		Page
	(b) Provided "by governments or their Agencies"	2311
	(i) The provision of Milk under Classes 5(d) and (e) is not Financed by Governmental Funds but by Milk Producers either Collectively (in-quota) or Individually (over-quota)	2311
	(ii) The Degree of Government Involvement Required for there to be a "provision by governments or their agencies" under Article 9.1(a)	2312
	(iii) How Milk for Export is Made Available under Classes 5(d) and (e)	2313
	Sales of Milk for Export under Class 5(d)	2313
	Sales of Milk for Export under Class 5(e)	2313
	(iv) The Extent to which Canada's Governments or their Agencies are Involved in the Making Available of Milk under Classes 5(d) and (e)	2314
	Canada's Governments and their Agencies	2314
	The Concrete Government Involvement in Making Milk Available under Classes 5(d) and (e)	2318
	(v) The Panel's Finding on whether the Milk is Provided by Governments or their Agencies	2319
	(c) The Panel's Finding under Article 9.1(a)	2320
6.	Article 9.1(c) of the Agreement on Agriculture	2320
	(a) "payments on the export of an agricultural product"	2320
	(b) Payments "financed by virtue of governmental action"	2325
	Additional Considerations with Respect to Sales of In-Quota Milk	2327
	Additional Considerations with Respect to Sales of Over-Quota Milk	2328

	Page
(c) The Panel's Finding under Article 9.1(c).....	2329
7. Article 3.3 of the Agreement on Agriculture	2329
8. Article 10 of the Agreement on Agriculture	2330
(a) The Two Elements under Article 10.1	2332
(b) An "other" Export Subsidy under Article 10.1	2333
9. Article 8 of the Agreement on Agriculture	2337
10. Article 3 of the SCM Agreement	2337
C. The Tariff-Rate Quota for Fluid Milk	2339
1. Facts and Claims of the Parties	2339
2. Article II:1(b) of GATT 1994	2340
3. The Licensing Agreement	2343
VIII. CONCLUSIONS	2344

I. INTRODUCTION

1.1 This proceeding has been initiated by two complaining parties, the United States and New Zealand.

1.2 In a communication dated 8 October 1997 (WT/DS103/1), the United States requested consultations with Canada in accordance with Article 4 of the Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes ("DSU"), pursuant to Article XXII:1 of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994 ("GATT 1994"), Article 19 of the Agreement on Agriculture, Article 30 of the Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Duties ("the SCM Agreement") and Article 6 of the Agreement on Import Licensing Procedures with respect to export subsidies of Canada on dairy products and the administration by Canada of its tariff-rate quota for fluid milk and cream. The United States and Canada held consultations in Geneva on 19 November 1997 but these consultations did not result in a resolution of the dispute.

1.3 On 29 December 1997 New Zealand requested consultations with Canada pursuant to Article 4 of the DSU, under Article 19 of the Agreement on Agriculture and Article XXII:1 of the GATT 1994 with regard to Canada's Special Milk Classes Scheme. New Zealand and Canada held consultations on 28 January 1998 but these consultations did not result in a resolution of the dispute.

1.4 On 2 February 1998, the United States (WT/DS103/4) and on 12 March 1998, New Zealand (WT/DS113/4), each requested the establishment of a panel with standard terms of reference.

1.5 In its request, the United States claims that:

- (a) "The Government of Canada is providing subsidies, and in particular export subsidies, on dairy products through its national and provincial pricing arrangements for milk and other dairy products without regard to the export subsidy reduction and other WTO commitments undertaken by Canada. Specifically, the Government of Canada established and maintains a system of special milk classes through which it maintains high domestic prices, promotes import substitution, and