

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-80216-1 - The Return of Cultural Treasures: Third Edition

Jeanette Greenfield

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The return of cultural treasures to their homelands has become the subject of heated public debate in recent years, highlighted by the controversial case of the so-called Elgin Marbles. In this important and pioneering work, Jeanette Greenfield analyses and discusses the historical, legal and political issues surrounding many similar cases, involving not only art treasures but also palaeontological and ethnographic materials, such as those belonging to the Australian Aborigine, the American Indian and the Greenland Inuit (Eskimo). The exploits of 'collectors' such as Aurel Stein and André Malraux are recounted. Dr Greenfield sheds new light on the Marbles debate, with surprising revelations about their removal and about Lord Elgin's role in the matter. She discusses another highly significant case, that of the Icelandic manuscripts, the return of which set an international precedent. This is the first full account in English of the long and colourful campaign for their return from Denmark. Greenfield goes on to trace the museum and legal developments in North America, especially in the light of the widespread plunder of Mesoamerican archaeological finds, and the practice of Canada and the United States as a progressive model for cultural return. She concludes with some possible solutions to this difficult and emotive issue.

The second revised edition brought the story up to date, with a new chapter on art treasures and museums in Russia after the break-up of the Soviet Union. A further chapter considered the claims against the Vatican for the return of Hebrew manuscripts, and the saga of the Dead Sea Scrolls.

The third revised edition completes the story of the Parthenon (Elgin) Marbles and the Icelandic saga manuscripts. The chapter on the art market deals with new issues related to art, archaeology and palaeontology, including dinosaurs. There are three additional chapters: 'Plunder' deals with European and Far Eastern spoils of war, stolen museum artefacts from Iraq and Afghanistan, antiquities smuggled from China, and disputes concerning famous paintings stolen by the Nazis; 'The First People' considers native rights of retrieval to relics and bones in America, Canada, Africa and Australia; 'Ground Zero' discusses the deliberate destruction of art such as occurred in Germany during the Hitler era and in China during the Cultural Revolution. It gives an account of the loss of the Bamiyan buddhas in Afghanistan and important art collections in New York on 9/11.

New cases define the on-going legal, political ethical and aesthetic debate about plunder, provenance, ownership, curating and return. Attention is drawn to the digitization of documentary material and hence the possibility of global repatriation. Some examples of this are projects at Cornell University, the Arnamagnaeian and Árni Magnússon Institutes, the Danish Royal Library and the British Library. The Internet facilitates shared knowledge and linked sites. Laser technology makes perfect copies possible. 'Virtual' reconstruction raises the prospect of the 'restoration' of lost sites.

Dealing with every aspect of who owns the past, *The Return of Cultural Treasures* is essential reading for anyone concerned with cultural property. This is an extremely readable account with more than 130 striking illustrations. The select bibliography, including related web sites, makes this an enduring reference work. The interdisciplinary approach makes it accessible to a wide range of readers interested in cultural heritage, archaeology and anthropology, museums, art history, the art market and international law.



Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-80216-1 - The Return of Cultural Treasures: Third Edition
Jeanette Greenfield
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

THE RETURN OF CULTURAL TREASURES

Third edition

JEANETTE GREENFIELD



Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-80216-1 - The Return of Cultural Treasures: Third Edition
Jeanette Greenfield
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo
Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK
Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521802161

© Cambridge University Press 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1989
Second edition 1996
Reprinted 1999
Third edition 2007

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-80216-1 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or
third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of illustrations</i>	<i>page</i> vi
<i>Preface to the first edition</i>	xiii
<i>Preface to the second edition</i>	xv
<i>Preface to the third edition</i>	xvii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xix
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xxii
Introduction by Magnus Magnusson	
1. The Icelandic manuscripts	13
2. The Elgin Marbles debate	41
3. British and other European practice	97
4. Some British cases	116
5. American and Canadian practice	154
6. Russia and the former Soviet Union	183
7. The Hebrew manuscripts	206
8. International and regional regulation	222
9. Art theft and the art market	238
10. Plunder	263
11. The First People	300
12. Ground zero	343
13. Homecomings: real and virtual	364
<i>Notes</i>	444
<i>List of appendices in microfiche in first edition (1989)</i>	470
<i>List of additional documents referred to</i>	472
<i>Select bibliography</i>	474
<i>Selected web sites</i>	485
<i>Index</i>	487

Illustrations

Frontispiece: The Benin Expedition (*The Sphere* magazine cover, 24 April 1897; *The Illustrated London News* Picture Library)

1. <i>Flateyjarbók</i> . Saga of St Olaf	<i>page</i> 14
2. <i>Flateyjarbók</i> . <i>Grœnlendinga Saga</i> (Jónas Kristjánsson; Stofnun Árna Magnússonar, Reykjavík)	15
3. <i>Codex Regius</i> : the <i>Edda</i>	16
4. Arrival of manuscripts at Reykjavík Harbour, 21 April 1971	18
5. Handing over the manuscripts from Denmark to Iceland	19
6. Page from <i>Gráskinna</i> (Stofnun Árna Magnússonar, Reykjavík)	37
7. The Parthenon (photograph by Alfred Eisenstadt, Time Life, New York)	42
8. Plan of the western part of the Acropolis as it existed at the end of the fifth century BC	43
9. ‘Pillars of the Parthenon’ (photograph by Edward Steichen, 1921, Museum of Modern Art, New York; reproduced by permission of Joanna Steichen)	44
10. Drawing of Parthenon by French artist Jacques Carrey in 1676: details of pediment, west (left side)	45
11. Drawing of Parthenon by French artist Jacques Carrey in 1676: details of pediment, west (right side)	45
12. Drawing of Parthenon by French artist Jacques Carrey in 1676: details of pediment, east (left side)	46
13. Drawing of Parthenon by French artist Jacques Carrey in 1676: details of pediment, east (right side) (Jacques Carrey drawings 10–13 preserved in the Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris)	46
14. A view of the east end of the Parthenon showing the position of pediments, metopes and frieze	47
15. Parthenon Marbles, North frieze, Slabs XXXV–XXXVIII	48
16. Parthenon Marbles, North frieze, Slab XLII	49
17. Parthenon Marbles, east pediment	50

	<i>Illustrations</i>	vii
18. Parthenon Marbles, east pediment, Horse of Selene (photographs 15–18 by David Finn and reproduced with his permission)	52	
19. The Duveen Gallery (reproduced by permission of the Trustees of the British Museum)	60	
20. JAK cartoon portraying British Museum Trustees besieged by Melina Mercouri (reproduced with kind permission of the <i>Evening Standard</i>)	69	
21. The pediments. Drawings of the reconstruction in Basel by Ernst Berger, combining extant fragments with Carrey's drawings – west and east	72	
22. Slabs of frieze separated in London and Athens (photograph by and courtesy of Socratis Mavrommatis)	91	
23. The Acropolis restoration (photograph by and courtesy of Socratis Mavrommatis)	95	
24. Tomb poles from Melville Island (Vatican Ethnological Museum)	101	
25. Totemistic emblem on stone, dingo (Vatican Ethnological Museum)	102	
26. Totemistic emblem on stone, emu (Vatican Ethnological Museum)	102	
27. Totemistic emblem on stone, snake (Vatican Ethnological Museum) (photographs 24–7 by Fiona McDougall)	102	
28. Relief of Kumasi (<i>The Sphere</i> , 21 July 1900; <i>The Illustrated London News</i> Picture Library)	120	
29. Ashanti gold mask (reproduced by permission of the Trustees of the Wallace Collection)	121	
30. Benin punitive expedition, 1897 (Pitt-Rivers Museum, Oxford)	123	
31. Benin punitive expedition, 1897 (photograph by expedition member Rear Admiral Mearsham, 1897)	124	
32. Collection of plaques deposited in British Museum (<i>The Illustrated London News</i> , October 1897)	126	
33. Benin plaque: tattooed boys with necklaces (reproduced by permission of the Trustees of the British Museum)	127	
34. Benin plaques: crocodile catching fish, and warrior bearing sword (reproduced by permission of the Trustees of the British Museum)	128	
35. Ranjit Singh's throne (Victoria and Albert Museum)	132	
36. (A) Diagram of the Buddhist caves at Tunhuang (B) Ancient scrolls from Tunhuang grotto 17 (photograph by Sir Aurel Stein) (C) Old Chinese manuscripts and block prints from walled-up Temple Library of 'Thousand Buddhas' site (<i>Ruins of Desert Cathay</i> , 1912)	138	
37. The Taranaki panels (National Museum of New Zealand, Wellington)	143	

- | | |
|--|-----|
| 38. London (Pathur) Śivapuram Natarāja (photograph courtesy of the Indian High Commission, London) | 149 |
| 39. Mayan stela: Jimbal Stela 1, Tikal project, 1965, Guatemala (photographs by Christopher Jones and Joya Hairs) | 157 |
| 40. Mayan stela: Machaquila Stela 2, in the Hollinshead case (photograph by Ian Graham) | 160 |
| 41. Tlingit Whale House, 1895 (Winter and Pond Collection, Alaska State Library) | 175 |
| 42. Speyer collection of Canadian Indian Ethnography: pipe bowl | 178 |
| 43. Speyer collection of Canadian Indian Ethnography: mittens | 178 |
| 44. Speyer collection of Canadian Indian Ethnography: moccasins | 178 |
| 45. Speyer collection of Canadian Indian Ethnography: saddle | 178 |
| 46. Speyer collection of Canadian Indian Ethnography: container | 178 |
| 47. Speyer collection of Canadian Indian Ethnography: pouch (photographs 42–7 courtesy of National Museums of Canada) | 178 |
| 48. Smuggled Russian icons (photograph by Alexander Zemlianchenko) The Associated Press Ltd (1993) | 184 |
| 49. The Amber Room restoration awaits the last two panels (photograph by Yuri Kozyrev) | 187 |
| 50. Cézanne's <i>Bathers</i> , <i>Vanity Fair</i> , collection of the Hermitage | 191 |
| 51. Schliemann's Treasure of Troy, terracotta | 198 |
| 52. Schliemann's Treasure of Troy, jewellery (photographs 51–2 <i>The Illustrated London News</i> , 5 January 1878) | 199 |
| 53. Schliemann's treasure exhibited in St Petersburg (EPA/photograph by Anatoly Maltsev) | 200 |
| 54. Fabergé egg (Getty Images, photograph by Yuri Kabodnov, Getty Images/AFP) | 204 |
| 55. Canon of Medicine of Avicenna, Book 1 (Foto Roncaglia, Biblioteca Universitaria, Bologna) | 208 |
| 56. Page from Sefer ha Terumah, twelfth century (reproduced by permission of Dr Manfred Lehmann) | 211 |
| 57. Copper Scroll | 218 |
| 58. Cutting the Copper Scroll at Manchester University (photographs 57–8 The Manchester Museum, by permission of the Estate of John Allegro) | 219 |
| 59. Four bronze horses of San Marco | 239 |
| 60. Museum paintings in a cave at Merkers, 1945 | 241 |
| 61. Edouard Manet's <i>Wintergarden</i> in a cave at Merkers, 1945 | 242 |
| 62. SS loot, Merkers, 1945 | 243 |
| 63. Florentine art treasures returned, 1945 | 244 |
| 64. Fanfare in Piazza della Signoria on return of Florentine treasures (photographs 59–64 courtesy of the National Archives, Washington) | 245 |

<i>Illustrations</i>	ix
65. Bronze tiger, Summer Palace (Yuanmingyuan), Beijing (Sotheby's Picture Library)	255
66. Bronze ox, Summer Palace (Yuanmingyuan) Beijing (Christie's Picture Library)	256
67. Bronze monkey, Summer Palace (Yuanmingyuan) Beijing (Christie's Picture Library)	256
68. Warka White Lady, Baghdad Museum	265
69. Sacred Vase of Warka, Baghdad Museum	266
70. Waving looters at Isin, Iraq (photograph by and courtesy of Professor John Russell)	268
71. <i>Portrait of Adele Bloch-Bauer</i> (Klimt) (photograph Rudi Blaha, Associated Press)	284
72. <i>Portrait of Dr Gachet</i> (Van Gogh) (Christie's Picture Library)	288
73. <i>View of Krumau</i> (Schiele) (Sotheby's Picture Library)	294
74. Boomerang and corroboree tree, Victoria (<i>The Age</i> , Melbourne)	301
75. The 'extinct' Tasmanian aborigines (<i>The Illustrated London News</i> , September 1924)	303
76. Dja Dja Wurrung bark etchings (Fairfax Photographs, photograph by Craig Abraham)	306
77. Mjoeberg's bone collections from Australia (Getty Images/AFP, photograph by Sven Nackstrand)	311
78. Lakota ghost shirt (photograph by Jeff Mitchell, Reuters)	313
79. Long Wolf returns home to Dakota (NI Syndication, <i>The Times</i> , photograph by Eddie Mulholland)	317
80. Haisla pole to be returned to Canada from Sweden (Ethnographic Museum, Stockholm)	319
81. 'Broken Hill Man', skull (Zambia) (reproduced by permission of the Trustees of the British Museum)	339
82. <i>Double Check</i> , John Seward Johnson (Magnum Photographs, photograph by Susan Meiselas)	345
83. <i>The Three Shades</i> , Rodin from the <i>Gates of Hell</i> (Cantor Fitzgerald Collection)	346
84. Ruined Rodin figure from the group <i>The Three Shades</i> (Associated Press, photograph by Kathy Willens)	346
85. Bamiyan buddha (photograph Network Photographs)	348
86. Destruction of Bamiyan buddhas (CNN Photographs, Getty Images)	349
87. Ecuadorian objects returned from Italy, 1983	370
88. Display of Ecuadorian objects returned from Italy (photographs Museo Arqueologico y Galerias de Arte del Banco Central del Ecuador, Quito)	370
89. Toltec engraved disc of jadeite returned to Mexico from the Peabody Museum, Harvard (Peabody Museum of Archaeology and Ethnology, Harvard University; photograph by Hillel Burger)	372

x	<i>Illustrations</i>	
90.	Prajñāpāramitā statue returned to Indonesia from the Netherlands (National Museum of Ethnology, Leiden)	373
91.	Canoe prow returned to Solomon Islands by Australia (Trustees of the Australian Museum)	375
92.	'Missing Links' exhibition: stirrup vessel in form of fish boat	378
93.	'Missing Links' exhibition: gold masks and beaten gold ornaments	378
94.	'Missing Links' exhibition: stirrup vessel – frogs	378
95.	'Missing Links' exhibition: stirrup vessel – heads	378
96.	'Missing Links' exhibition: silver vases and chrysolite beads (photographs 92–6 courtesy of the Embassy of Peru, Washington DC)	378
97.	Segesser II, painting from the New World (photograph by Arthur Taylor; reproduced by permission of the Museum of New Mexico, the Palace of the Governors)	379
98.	Warrior bird mural returned to Mexico (M. H. de Young Memorial Museum, the Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco)	380
99.	Mary Leakey delivering <i>Proconsul africanus</i> to London from Kenya (photograph from British Airways Press Library)	381
100.	Return of Nefertari to Egypt (EMPICS, photograph by Andrew Parsons)	382
101.	Campeche temple facade returned by Metropolitan Museum of Art to Mexico (reproduced with permission of Joseph Veach Noble)	384
102.	Śivapuram Natarāja statue returned to India from Norton Simon Museum, Pasadena (Norton Simon Museum, Pasadena; photograph by Lee Boltin)	386
103.	Aztec codex (Tonalamatl Aubin) taken from Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris to Mexico (photograph Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris)	388
104.	Tyrannicides group (Archaeological Museum, Naples, 'Fotografia della Soprintendenza Archeologica della Province de Napoli e Casserta–Napoli')	389
105.	André Malraux (photograph from Roger-Viollet, Paris, from the Albert Harlingue collection)	393
106.	Page from 1924 <i>L'Impartial</i> , Saigon, showing bas-reliefs from Bantea-Srei (Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris, Annexe de Versailles)	394
107.	Cambodia, riverbed bas-reliefs, Kbal Spean (photograph by Caroline Gluck)	397
108.	Cambodia, riverbed bas-reliefs, Kbal Spean (photograph by Caroline Gluck)	397
109.	Part of the Hooper collection purchased by the Museum of Tahiti and the Islands: pillow	400
110.	Hooper Collection: breast ornament	400
111.	Hooper Collection: adze	400

	<i>Illustrations</i>	xi
112. Hooper Collection: breadfruit splitter		400
113. Hooper Collection: bark cloth beaters		400
114. Hooper Collection: fan (photographs 109–14 courtesy of Musée de Tahiti et des Îles, Christie's London, A. C. Cooper Ltd)		400
115. Neo-Sumerian Ur-Ningirsu statue joined together by the Louvre and Metropolitan Museum (courtesy of the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York)		402
116. Ur-Ningirsu: head (courtesy of the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York)		403
117. Ur-Ningirsu: body (Louvre Museum, Paris, Musées Nationaux)		403
118. Mahler manuscript (Sotheby's Picture Library)		405
119. Assyrian sculpture (Canford School)		407
120. Mexican stone rattlesnake, stored by British Museum (photograph by James Mortimer)		413
121. Papua New Guinea masks, stored by British Museum (photograph by James Mortimer)		414
122. 'Looty' the Pekingese dog taken from Summer Palace (<i>Illustrated London News</i> , 15 June 1861)		415
123. Missing Dorak treasure (<i>The Illustrated London News</i> , Supplement, 28 November 1959)		416
124. Missing Peking Man (photograph by A. Singer; reproduced by permission of the Department of Library Services, American Museum of Natural History, New York)		418
125. Missing Peking Man reconstruction (reproduced by permission of the Department of Library Services, American Museum of Natural History, New York)		418
126. Sphinx Ptolemy XII Auletes, marine find at Alexandria (NI Syndication, <i>The Times</i> , photograph by Gill Allen)		421
127. Objects from the alleged Croesus gold, otherwise known as the Lydian Hoard (photographs courtesy of Metropolitan Museum, New York: bowl, Mrs Charles S. Payson Gift, 1966 (66.11.21); wine jug, Rogers Fund, 1966 (66.11.23))		422
128. Chagall, <i>Study for Over Vitebsk</i> (photograph Associated Press The Jewish Museum)		425
129. Dinosaur, <i>Tyrannosaurus rex</i> 'Sue' (Getty Images/EPA, Photograph by Stan Honda)		426
130. Australian minister hands dinosaur eggs back to China (Fairfax Photographs, photograph by Pat Scala)		429
131. Dorset dinosaur fossil, <i>Scelidosaurus</i> , UK (photograph Les W. Wilson, with kind permission of David Sole)		430
132. <i>Guernica</i> by Picasso returned to the Prado Museum by the Museum of Modern Art, New York (Prado Museum; DACS, Design and Artists Copyright Society Limited)		432

133. London Bridge, sold to Texas, 1968 (photograph by Tom Hanley)	433
134. <i>The Scream</i> (Nasjonalgalleriet, Oslo)	435
135. The <i>Mona Lisa</i> examined by French officials (reproduced by permission of Range/Bettman Pictures)	436
136. Postcard of <i>Mona Lisa</i> (Milan 1913)	437
137. Manuscript of Archimedes Principle (Associated Press, photograph by Lefteris Pitarakis)	438
138. Virtual site – Jerusalem Archaeological Park (web page)	440
139. British paintings hidden from wartime bombing (photograph, the National Gallery)	442

Preface to the first edition

A visit in 1980 to the caves of Tunhuang, China, denuded of their scrolls and Buddhist manuscripts by Aurel Stein over seventy years earlier; a book of essays by Magnus Magnusson, one of which described the elation in the 1970s at the return of Iceland's greatest national treasures, the medieval saga manuscripts; the unending debate over the *cause célèbre* of cultural return cases, the Elgin Marbles; fascination with the magic of archaeology; curiosity about ethnology and the museum and art collecting phenomenon; international chagrin over the unresolved claims and contentions of cultural return; historic and contemporary resolutions to this dilemma; and the perspectives of international law. These are the main threads woven into the fabric of this book.

But despite its title this is not a book about emptying the great museums of the world of their many treasures. 'Return' is part of a wider movement of cultural treasures and need not only mean restitution in the sense of reparation for wrongful taking. It may also refer to other kinds of restoration, reinstatement, and even rejuvenation and reunification. Inevitably museums are often central to this issue. What emerges is that objects 'migrate' sometimes legitimately and sometimes not. There are historical, political, legal, material and aesthetic considerations which govern this. A congruent feature of war, colonialism, missionary and archaeological expeditions and other cataclysmic events has been the transportation of art treasures on a global scale. Sometimes objects have also been peacefully and uncontroversially collected and bought. Such movements are a fascinating reflector of human history. Hardly a nation or tribe has remained untouched by this experience. All manner of individuals have participated, from common looters to men who attained high rank and office. The route of objects has sometimes been no less colourful and dramatic than that of the persons who initiated their journey.

There is a distinction to be made between historically removed treasures and the contemporary illicit traffic in art objects. The issue of return should be determined on the criteria of the means of acquisition and the nature of the object. This book makes out a case primarily on historic and aesthetic grounds, but within a legal framework, for the return of certain kinds of objects. It points out that such 'returns' have taken place under different guises in the past and that it is by no means a novel occurrence setting into motion unacceptable precedents. The role to be played by the scholars and conservators in the great institutions in

this course of action is not to be underestimated. A purely politicized view of the locations of cultural treasures can be shown to be quite futile, as evidenced by the many instances of wasteful returns resulting only in the reappearance of the same treasures on the international art market. A legalistic approach can be applied as leverage in obtaining returns or stemming the illicit flow of art treasures. The United States especially has followed that course of action, whereas the United Kingdom has no such approach. European institutions remain conservative while the Oceanic countries, such as Australia and New Zealand, take a more liberal view.

The issue of cultural return remains a perennial one which arouses passions and emotive argument, often because it is connected more with a restitution aspect than any other, and connected too with the existential dilemma of identity. There are cynical and material aspects, but the issue also has something to do with the charisma of objects and their language, or semiology. They represent creativity, continuity, and concreteness in the face of what is evanescent.

On the whole it has to be said that there is in this matter no magnanimity without duress, no voluntary codes applied voluntarily, no easy restoration of loaned materials recalled, no internationally accepted code of practice, no simple formulas to resolve cultural return.

There is a romantic, educative, inspirational aspect to museums. But there is another. It serves us well to remember that the Prague Museum of Judaica, which contains an unparalleled collection, was established by the Nazis and called the 'museum of an extinct race'. The Tasmanian Aboriginal Centre in 1985, seeking the return of the human remains of their people, were informed by the National History Museum of Vienna that the Tasmanian aborigines are 'extinct'.

This book deliberately crosses 'territories' in more than one sense in order to understand a phenomenon which has been debated for hundreds of years and to appreciate the real worth of the objects fought over. Sometimes enlightened co-operation emerges and the result can be a noble one, as in the case of the Icelandic manuscripts returned from Denmark. In the words of Iceland's Literary Nobel Laureate, Halldór Laxness, without the sagas Iceland would have remained 'as just another Danish island'.

JEANETTE GREENFIELD

Preface to the second edition

Since this book was first published at the end of 1989 the world has seen momentous political change, such as the extinction of Soviet communism and South African apartheid. There has also been widespread catastrophic human displacement in Europe and Africa and more barbarian destruction and cultural loss especially in Eastern Europe – notably in the Ukraine, the former Czechoslovakia and the former Yugoslavia. So many new states have been created in addition to a reunited Germany that cartographers have temporarily abdicated. The emergence of Russia and its new accessibility through the ending of the Soviet State have generated more questions than answers about many missing treasures, both Russian and foreign, and there are also new challenges to its national cultural monuments. Cultural iconography changes with lost ideology, and the former worth of things evaporates. Now massive sculptural monuments to former Soviet icons have been pulled from their plinths and lie broken in the dust like Shelley's 'Ozymandias', irrespective of their aesthetic merit. The sometimes Orwellian demands of the state as the true guardian of cultural heritage are still made against the individual. Thus, Olga Ivinskaya, the model for Lara in the book *Dr Zhivago*, could not retrieve the love letters she wrote so many decades ago to the Russian Nobel prize winner Boris Pasternak. Once confiscated as inimical to the state they are now retained as its cultural property. The uphill task of making cultural progress in this area seems Sisyphean.

Yet ideas about past wrongs, cultural completeness and the rights of indigenous peoples continued to be reappraised. Cultural angst is being re-evaluated, and this now permeates contemporary thought. Cultural raiders are always at work. Theft is pandemic. But clarity of provenance can no longer be ignored. For instance, the Vatican has now established formal relations with the Jewish state of Israel; but the Papal role over hundreds of years in the collection and destruction of Hebrew manuscripts is being questioned. Elsewhere, focused efforts have resulted in some largely unexpected cultural returns such as that of the Lydian Hoard (Croesus gold) from the Metropolitan Museum in New York to Turkey, and the return of many human relics to Australian Aborigines, Greenland Eskimos, and North

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-80216-1 - The Return of Cultural Treasures: Third Edition
Jeanette Greenfield
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

xvi

Preface to the second edition

American Indians. The Sisyphean boulder of cultural meaning has been rolled forward.

JEANETTE GREENFIELD

1994

Preface to the third edition

After the Cold War ended in the 1990s other dangers emerged. Shakespeare's Julius Caesar proclaimed 'Cry havoc and let slip the dogs of war'. The havoc of fire, sword and famine have been let loose again, from the terror attack on 9/11 (2001) in New York to the wars in Afghanistan and Iraq and Africa. The deliberate destruction of the Bamiyan buddhas in Afghanistan was a prelude to the descent into archaeological and museum plunder and murder. Crimes of intolerance and natural catastrophes have rendered the certainties of cultural preservation more fragile. The beginning of the third millennium was thus marked by the need to reconsider the issues of cultural war and of recovery and salvage.

The hallmark of the advances made since the second edition of this book has been the heightened awareness of the rights of indigenous peoples to the restoration of their cultural heritage through the retrieval of their relics and bones. It is recognized that the deliberate removal of cultural treasures from vulnerable aboriginal peoples was intended to obliterate their cultural identity. A dedicated Museum of the American Indian has been established in Washington. Australia has successfully persuaded a number of institutions in the United Kingdom to return aboriginal bones. Sweden has been at the forefront of enlightened indigenous returns to Australia and Canada. The Glasgow Council and Kelvingrove Museum returned a Lakota ghost shirt to the Sioux Indians and the South Dakota Museum. In America important legal decisions have been made to prescribe the correct balance between Native American rights to bones and artefacts and the rights of archaeologists to scientific research.

More than fifty years after the Second World War the continued right of the individual to collect and own art, contrary to earlier Nazi laws, and the right to restitution for misappropriation, has been internationally recognized. Museums have had to review globally the legitimacy of their holdings. In particular American courts have recognized descendants' claims to Nazi-plundered art as human rights issues connected to genocide and hence without time limit. Many famous paintings, such as the Gustav Klimt *Portrait of Adele Bloch-Bauer* in the Altmann case, or Egon Schiele's *View of Kramau*, have been sought. They have served as a poignant reminder of the lives of the family owners whose stories have become part of the life of the paintings.

As a major art market destination America has set the benchmark in establishing bilateral arrangements with archaeologically rich countries to prevent

contemporary illicit export. However the old question of wartime-acquired ‘trophy’ art has not been resolved between Russia and Germany because of the arguments over mutual repatriation. Some prominent museums have resisted the notion of the return of historically removed objects by espousing a concept of the ‘universal museum’. This contrasts with the desire of countries such as China, which will take any steps necessary to retrieve its cultural heritage irrespective of when it was lost.

The matter of return is now a widely accepted heritage issue. The international practice of cultural rescue, restitution and return by many means and for different reasons has evolved. The Internet facilitates the creation of data bases and the tracking of stolen objects. The prospect of global reunification and repatriation through digitization projects such as those involving the Danish Royal Library, Cornell University, the British Library, the Arnamagnaean and Árni Magnússon Institutes and others has broadened the concept of ‘return’. The new technologies have made possible collaborative preservation projects such as that between the Mellon Foundation and the Tunhuang Institute. Virtual reconstructions of objects and sites such as Jerusalem mean that the greatest cultural treasures may be preserved and so ‘returned’ in perpetuity to the mind’s eye.

Nazi genocide, the Cultural Revolution in China, and the 9/11 attack on New York in 2001 reveal how crimes against people connect to crimes against art. Einstein once said ‘He who cherishes the values of culture cannot fail to be a pacifist.’ When the Iraq war erupted in 2003 the concerns of international scholars who petitioned the United Nations and UNESCO for the preservation of archaeological sites and museum collections of world importance were ignored. The deliberate destruction of art of recognized stature is held in America to be an offence against the artist. Such acts ought to be viewed as crimes against the artist and civilization, and wherever they occur they are the storm warning.

JEANETTE GREENFIELD
2005

Acknowledgements

I am indebted to the late Glyn Daniel, Emeritus Disney Professor of Archaeology, University of Cambridge, who read the original draft and whose comments and observations were illuminating.

I also wish to express my indebtedness to the many individuals and institutions who directly or indirectly contributed to the content of the first edition of this book, and in particular: Jónas Kristjánsson, Director of the Manuscript Institute, Reykjavík, and Magnus Magnusson, broadcaster, for assisting me with access to the Icelandic and Danish materials, and for their invaluable corrections and advice concerning the account of the return of the Icelandic manuscripts; Sir David Wilson, Director of the British Museum, and Janet Wallace, archivist at the British Museum, for access to, and assistance with, documents relating to the Elgin Marbles and the Benin collection; Harry Prasad, archivist at the Museum of Mankind, for access to the archives; David Lance of the National Museum of Australia, and Michael Mansell of the Aboriginal Legal Service, Hobart, for furnishing significant additional information on the matter of aboriginal relics; David Collison, film producer, for access to preparation materials for the BBC *Tribal Eye* series; Susie Wong, London, for assistance on Chinese and other Asian source materials; Peter Thompson of the Press Office, Greek Embassy, London, for providing detailed information about the Parthenon and the Greek case; Geraldine Norman, *The Times* saleroom correspondent, for permitting me to consult her in her area of expertise and in particular in relation to the art market map; Yudhisthir Raj Isar, Catherine André-Verdellon and Christine Wilkinson, Division of Cultural Heritage, UNESCO, Paris, and Claude Choquet, archive section, Division of Cultural Heritage, UNESCO, Paris, for assistance with obtaining all the relevant UNESCO documents and the UNESCO bibliography which appears on the fiche; Adrian Butler of the Council of Europe, Strasbourg, Press and Information Services, for assistance with obtaining Council of Europe documents; Ron Swerczek of the Washington Archives, for assistance in obtaining photographic copies of US documents; Mr Ashok Mehta, First Secretary for Trade, High Commission for India, London, for permitting me to have the transcript of the 1988 London Natarāja High Court case; David Finn, New York, Joseph Noble, New York, Christopher Jones, University of Pennsylvania, and Ian Graham, Harvard University, for generously contributing their photographs to the book; Luis Ponce, Alfonso Espinosa and Rosa Maria Wallach, Cultural

Department of the Peruvian Embassy, Washington, Elizabeth Simpson of the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, Rosangela Adoum, Jefe de la Unidad Fondo Arqueologico, Ecuador, Sara Campbell and Cheryl Barton of the Norton Simon Museum, Pasadena, Dave Phillips, Palace of the Governors, Museum of New Mexico, and Charlene Androes of Stanford University Press for assistance in securing photographs contributed to the book; Professor Robert J. Sharer, University of Pennsylvania; Barbara Isaac, Peabody Museum, Harvard University; Chris Kirby, National Museums of Canada, Ottawa, for assistance in locating specific photographic material; Marie Claire Quiquemelle, Paris, for assistance in researching the André Malraux pictures; Hermione Waterfield, director of the Tribal Art Department, Christie's, London, for her expertise in locating the relevant photographs from the Hooper Collection; Neeta Mainee of Zaiwalla and Co. for providing the photograph of the London Nataraja; Elin Gerslund, Cambridge, for a detailed translation of the Danish legal cases and parliamentary debates; Inger Glahn, Danish Embassy, London, for assistance with Danish terms; Paul Kuek, Melbourne, for Figs. 8, 14 and 20 and all the map drawings; Anne Robinson, Oxford, for her expertise in typing the manuscript; Vera Madan, London, for computer-setting the index.

For this first edition my thanks to my editor at Cambridge University Press, Peter Richards.

For the second edition of this book, I would also like to add my thanks to Professor Elizabeth Simpson who chaired the international symposium 'The Spoils of War' at the Bard Graduate Center for Studies in the Decorative Arts, New York, 19–21 January 1995. This provided a memorable and stimulating discussion of postwar cultural recovery issues. The Russian–German dialogue in particular has partly informed the additional chapter on Russia.

I thank Manfred Lehmann of New York for allowing me access to primary materials for the additional chapter on Hebrew manuscripts, and for his comments and corrections.

I also thank Dr Jessica Kuper, my editor at the Cambridge University Press, Dr Anne Dunbar-Nobes for the meticulous copy-editing, and Magnus Magnusson for reading and correcting all of the new material for this edition.

Professor Ian Brownlie CBE, Oxford University once observed that this book was amongst other things a law book with pictures. In this third edition its international law aspect continues to owe much to him and the late Sir Robbie Jennings, Cambridge University.

For this edition of the book my thanks for permitting the use of their images go to Socratis Mavrommatis, Professor John Russell, Caroline Gluck, and Les Wilson. Also thanks to Sue Daly for locating the images in Sotheby's picture library and additional literature relating to the sale of the Mahler manuscript, and to Stella Calvert-Smith for locating the images in Christie's picture library.

Thanks to Professor Elizabeth Simpson, Bard Graduate Centre for Studies in the Decorative Arts, New York, for comments on the additional Near Eastern content; Nadia Tarzi of the Association for the Protection of Afghan Archaeology

Acknowledgements

xxi

for comments on the Afghanistan material; Maurice Davies, Deputy Director of the Museums Association for information about the work of the former (UK) Museums and Galleries Commission; Joanne Inciardi, Corporate Art Curator at Cantor Fitzgerald, New York, for information regarding the 9/11 (2001) losses; Ivan Boserup, Keeper of Manuscripts and Rare Books, the Royal Library, Copenhagen, for information regarding library digitization projects, and Dr Mathew Driscoll, Arnamagnaean Institute, University of Copenhagen, for the update on the digitization of the Árni Magnússon collection of Icelandic manuscripts; to Jongsok Kim, Senior Curator, National Folk Museum of Korea, Seoul, for sources relating to the Korean content; Professor Chung-wen Shih, George Washington University, for comments on the Cultural Revolution; and to Susie Wong MBE, London, for the sources and insights into the material relating to China.

For this third edition thanks to Frances Nugent for the expert copy editing, and production editors Jayne Aldhouse and Jodie Barnes.

I also thank Simon Whitmore and Sarah Parker, my editors at Cambridge University Press, and Magnus Magnusson KBE for reading and correcting all of the new material for this edition.

Abbreviations

All ER	<i>All England Law Reports</i>
Alta LR	<i>Alberta Law Reports</i>
EEC	European Economic Community
F.2d	<i>Federal Reporter 2d Series</i>
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICOM	International Council of Museums
ILR	International Law Reports
Interpol	International Criminal Police Organization
IOPA	International Organization for the Protection of Works of Art
<i>JHS</i>	<i>Journal of Hellenic Studies</i>
MR	Master of the Rolls
TLR	<i>Times Law Reports</i>
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNIDROIT	International Institute for the Unification of Private Law
UNTS	<i>United Nations Treaty Series</i>
USC	<i>United States Code</i>

ON THE UNESCO DOCUMENTS

CLT	Culture Section Series
CONF or C	Conference
CC	Culture and Communications (Section)
COM	Communications (Section)

TERMS RELATING TO INTERNATIONAL CONVENTIONS

Signature:	to sign and authenticate (prior to agreement becoming binding)
Ratification:	confirmation of previous act not formerly binding (done by state parliament or equivalent)
Accession:	absolute or conditional acceptance by one or several states of a treaty already concluded between other states