

LIVING TOGETHER AND CHRISTIAN ETHICS

Living Together and Christian Ethics is the first positive, in-depth study of cohabitation outside marriage from a mainstream Christian theological perspective. The book retrieves the traditions of betrothal from the Bible and church history, and shows how these can transform Christian attitudes to living together before marriage. A crucial distinction is made between prenuptial cohabitation where marriage is intended, and non-nuptial cohabitation where it is avoided. Since betrothal was widely understood as a real beginning of marriage, the book argues for a complete pastoral, theological and liturgical renewal that reclaims the riches of forgotten Christian marital traditions and redeploys them in conveying the good news of the faith to women and men who are not yet married. The book takes issue with theologians who marginalize marriage, and suggests that the recognition of marital values can act as a helpful bridge between Christian teaching and people who are not formally married.

ADRIAN THATCHER is Professor of Applied Theology at the Centre for Theology and Philosophy, College of St Mark and St John, Plymouth. His books include *Truly a Person*, *Truly God* (1990), *Liberating Sex: A Christian Sexual Theology* (1993), *People of Passion: What the Churches Teach about Sex* (with Elizabeth Stuart, 1997), and *Marriage after Modernity: Christian Marriage in Postmodern Times* (1999). He has also published numerous journal articles and reviews.



NEW STUDIES IN CHRISTIAN ETHICS

General Editor: Robin Gill
Editorial Board: Stephen R. L. Clark, Stanley Hauerwas, Robin W. Lovin

Christian ethics has increasingly assumed a central place within academic theology. At the same time the growing power and ambiguity of modern science and the rising dissatisfaction within the social sciences about claims to value-neutrality have prompted renewed interest in ethics within the secular academic world. There is, therefore, a need for studies in Christian ethics which, as well as being concerned with the relevance of Christian ethics to the present day secular debate, are well informed about parallel discussions in recent philosophy, science or social science. *New Studies in Christian Ethics* aims to provide books that do this at the highest intellectual level and demonstrate that Christian ethics can make a distinctive contribution to this debate – either in moral substance or in terms of underlying moral justifications.

New Studies in Christian Ethics

Titles published in the series:

- 1. Rights and Christian Ethics Kieran Cronin
- 2. Biblical Interpretation and Christian Ethics Ian McDonald
- 3. Power and Christian Ethics James Mackey
- 4. Plurality and Christian Ethics Ian S. Markham
- 5. Moral Action and Christian Ethics Jean Porter
- 6. Responsibility and Christian Ethics William Schweiker
- 7. Justice and Christian Ethics E. Clinton Gardner
- 8. Feminism and Christian Ethics Susan Parsons
- 9. Sex, Gender and Christian Ethics Lisa Sowle Cahill
- 10. The Environment and Christian Ethics Michael Northcott
- 11. Concepts of Person and Christian Ethics Stanely Rudman
- 12. Priorities and Christian Ethics Garth Hallett
- 13. Community, Liberalism and Christian Ethics David Fergusson
- 14. The Market Economy and Christian Ethics Peter Sedgwick
- 15. Churchgoing and Christian Ethics Robin Gill
- 16. Inequality and Christian Ethics Douglas Hicks
- 17. Biology and Christian Ethics Stephen Clark
- 18. Altruism and Christian Ethics Colin Grant
- 19. The Public Forum and Christian Ethics Robert Gascoigne
- 20. Evil and Christian Ethics Gordon Graham
- 21. Living Together and Christian Ethics Adrian Thatcher



LIVING TOGETHER AND CHRISTIAN ETHICS

ADRIAN THATCHER

College of St Mark and St John, Plymouth





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, VIC 3166, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Adrian Thatcher 2002

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Baskerville Monotype 11/12.5 pt. System LATEX 28 [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

ISBN 0 521 80204 0 hardback ISBN 0 521 00955 3 paperback



Contents

General editor's preface Acknowledgments		page ix xii
\mathbf{P}^{A}	ART I LIVING TOGETHER AS A THEOLOGICAL PROBLEM	
I	A guide to living together	3
2	Living together: a preliminary theological analysis	39
3	Testing the betrothal solution	76
	ART 2 AN EXERCISE IN RETRIEVAL: BRINGING BACK ETROTHAL	
4	The Bible and betrothal	119
5	Evidence from liturgy and law	151
6	Whatever happened to betrothal?	182
PA	ART 3 EXTENDING THE MARITAL NORM	
7	Betrothal, consent and consummation	211
8	The sacramental beginning of marriage	237
9	Extending the marital norm	264
Appendix: A Rite of Betrothal before Marriage Bibliography Index		276 280 295

vii



General editor's preface

This book is the twenty-first in the series New Studies in Christian Ethics. It returns to a crucial issue discussed earlier in the series in Lisa Cahill's well-received *Sex*, *Gender and Christian Ethics* – namely, how to understand Christian marriage today in a way that is both sensitive to contemporary changes in sexuality and faithful to Christian theology and tradition. Cahill writes as a modern Catholic, whereas Thatcher writes as a modern Anglican, yet they have much in common in the methods and approaches they use and in the conclusions they reach. Both authors clearly identify with Don Browning's Family, Religion and Culture project at the University of Chicago, and in particular with its central aim to defend faithful marriage in a pluralistic world (not least as the best environment for nurturing children), albeit from a liberal theological perspective.

Adrian Thatcher has already established a reputation for thoughtful writing in this area with his books *Liberating Sex* (1993) and *Marriage after Modernity* (1999). He has also shown in his Christology book *Truly A Person*, *Truly God* (1990) that he is a creative and innovative theologian. Both of these characteristics are present in the two different levels at which *Living Together and Christian Ethics* can be read.

At the first level this is a well-informed book about marriage and sexuality in the modern world. The first chapter shows that Thatcher has read carefully the most recent empirical information about the changing patterns that are occurring throughout the western world. Increasing cohabitation before or without marriage and the phenomenon of children born in a familial context outside marriage are now widespread. The Family, Religion and



X

Cambridge University Press 0521802040 - Living Together and Christian Ethics Adrian Thatcher Frontmatter More information

General editor's preface

Culture project has been instrumental in mapping these changing patterns and alerting people to some of their negative consequences. There is now clear evidence that some academics and informed journalists are beginning to take notice. Adrian Thatcher, however, adds to the debate by highlighting crucial consequential differences between prenuptial cohabitation and non-nuptial cohabitation. It is non-nuptial cohabitation that is damaging both for those who cohabit and for any children that they may have. The experience of those who cohabit with the clear intention of getting married later differs little from those who marry without first cohabiting. Thatcher argues that this difference is crucial for Christian ethics, but has been largely ignored by others.

At the second level this is a book which argues specifically for the reintroduction of betrothal within churches. Here Adrian Thatcher offers a scholarly account of the history and later eclipse of betrothal within Christian churches and a sustained argument for its reintroduction today. He believes that this could be an important way of encouraging and sustaining those couples intending to live together as a prelude to a later marriage service. Unlike some others who have discussed this possibility, Thatcher argues that marriage itself is a process and that a liturgically celebrated betrothal could become a significant symbol of the beginning of that process. This twin perspective of championing the reintroduction of betrothal and of seeing betrothal as already part of the process of marriage then gives Thatcher a filter for reviewing critically a wide variety of church reports in this area. As a result the book offers genuinely new insights and admirably fulfils the two key aims of the series – namely to promote monographs in Christian ethics which engage centrally with the present secular moral debate at the highest possible intellectual level and, secondly, to encourage contributors to demonstrate that Christian ethics can make a distinctive contribution to this debate.

Unsurprisingly there are still questions that remain about Thatcher's radical suggestions about betrothal. As he admits himself, the history of betrothal (with children as young as seven being betrothed) has not always been attractive. It has been strongly associated at times with notions of children as property, of patriarchy and of social control. At other times it was associated with sexual laxity and confusion about marital status. It remains



General editor's preface

xi

to be seen whether it can be reintroduced into churches without being sullied by these earlier associations. Thatcher believes that betrothal would help churches to distinguish more carefully between, say, faithful and committed cohabitation as part of the process of marriage and faithless promiscuity. He makes an important point here. Conservative Christian approaches to sexuality (which predominate in official church reports) tend to condemn *all* nonmarital, and especially homosexual, sexual intercourse without distinction. As a result most young people (heterosexual as well as homosexual, and Christian as well as non-Christian) and many divorced older people are simply condemned. But the question remains of whether or not Thatcher's suggestions about betrothal will be able to convince conservative Christians to be more discriminating.

Whatever the answer to this question, Adrian Thatcher has written a thoughtful and clearly argued book on an important issue which I am delighted to welcome to the series.

ROBIN GILL



Acknowledgments

This book could not have been written without support from many people. I thank Kevin Taylor of Cambridge University Press for his enthusiasm and support for the project when it was no more than a proposal. The College of St Mark and St John is a productive place for theological research, and I am grateful for the support from my colleagues in the Centre for Theology and Philosophy (especially during my research leave in 1999), from the Principal, Dean of Faculty and Committee for Research, and from the staff in the College library. I am particularly grateful to Professor Don Browning for hosting my research visit to the University of Chicago, home of the Family, Religion and Culture project which he directs, and for his kindness in arranging many fruitful contacts while I was there. I am grateful to friends who have read parts of the text and commented helpfully on them. The Revd Dr Duncan Dormor and Prof. Michael Lawler were especially helpful. I received valuable feedback also from Prof. Herbert Anderson, Prof. Don Browning, Dr Jack Dominian, the Revd Greg Forster, Dr David Horrell, Dr Will Large and the Right Revd Dr Kenneth Stevenson. I thank the Revd Canon Reg Harcus for allowing me to include his betrothal rite, in use in his parish church, as an appendix. I am grateful for the very positive responses I have received over the last few years to the main ideas and theses of this book, many from students past and present. They convinced me this book had to be written. I thank Caroline Major for preparing the final version of the manuscript. Most of all, I owe a huge debt of thanks to Grace Thatcher for her support throughout the long writing of the book.