

WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

Dispute Settlement Reports

1997
Volume III

Pages 1-496

THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT REPORTS

The *Dispute Settlement Reports* of the World Trade Organization (the "WTO") include panel and Appellate Body reports, as well as arbitration awards, in disputes concerning the rights and obligations of WTO Members under the provisions of the *Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization*. The *Dispute Settlement Reports* are available in English, French and Spanish.

This volume may be cited as DSR 1997:III

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
European Communities - Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas, complaints by Ecuador, Guatemala, Honduras, Mexico and the United States (WT/DS27)	
Report of the Panel (Complaint by Ecuador).....	3

EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES - REGIME FOR THE IMPORTATION, SALE AND DISTRIBUTION OF BANANAS

(COMPLAINT BY ECUADOR)

Report of the Panel

WT/DS27/R/ECU

*Adopted by the Dispute Settlement Body on 25 September 1997
 as modified by the Appellate Body Report*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
I.	INTRODUCTION	11
	Terms of Reference	11
	Panel Composition	12
II.	PROCEDURAL ISSUES	12
	(a) Adequacy of the Consultations and Specificity of the Request for Panel Establishment	12
	(b) The Requirement of Legal Interest	19
	(c) Multiple Panel Reports	25
III.	FACTUAL ASPECTS	27
	(a) Banana Production and Trade	27
	(b) The EC's Common Organization of the Banana Market	28
	(i) Tariff Treatment	29
	(ii) Quantitative Aspects, Including Country Allocations	30
	(iii) Licensing Requirements	33
	(c) Trade Policy Developments Concerning Bananas	37
	(i) Disputes Relating to Bananas under the GATT ...	37
	(ii) Framework Agreement on Bananas	37
	(iii) Tariff Changes	38
	(iv) Lomé Waiver	38
	(v) Accession of Austria, Finland and Sweden to the EC	39
IV.	MAIN ARGUMENTS	39
	A. General	39
	B. Trade in Goods	41

Report of the Panel

	Page
1. General Overview of the Case.....	42
(a) Overview of the Claims Presented by the Complaining Parties	42
(i) Tariff Issues	42
(ii) Allocation Issues.....	42
(iii) Import Licensing Issues.....	43
(b) Overview of the Responses Presented by the European Communities	43
(i) Separate Regimes.....	44
(ii) GATT Schedules and Articles I and XIII in the Context of the Agreement on Agriculture	45
(iii) The Non-Applicability of the Agreement on Import Licensing Procedures to Tariff Quotas.....	46
(iv) The Non-Applicability of Articles III:4 and X of GATT to Border Measures	47
(v) The Lomé Waiver	47
2. Detailed Arguments.....	49
(a) Tariff Issues	49
(i) Tariff Preferences for Non- Traditional ACP Banana Imports.....	49
Arguments of the Complaining Parties.....	49
Arguments of the EC	50
The Lomé Waiver	51
Parties' Subsequent Arguments - Non-Traditional ACP Tariff Preferences.....	72
(ii) Third-Country Tariff Rates.....	76
(b) Allocation Issues.....	81
(i) General Allocations	81
Article XIII:2 of GATT	82
Arguments of the Complaining Parties	82
Arguments of the EC	90
Separate Regimes.....	91

	Page
GATT Schedules and Articles I and XIII in the Context of the Agreement on Agriculture	97
Parties' Arguments - Interpretive Issues	107
Article XIII:1 of GATT	129
Article I of GATT	130
The Lomé Waiver	132
(ii) Reallocation of Shortfalls	136
(c) Import Licensing Issues	139
(i) The Licensing Regime as a Whole	140
Arguments of the Complaining Parties	140
Arguments of the EC.....	144
The Non-Applicability of the Agreement on Import Licensing Procedures to Tariff Quotas.....	144
The Non-Applicability of Articles III:4 and X of GATT to Border Measures	148
Parties' Subsequent Arguments - the Licensing Regime as a Whole	151
Claims under the GATT	157
Claims under the Licensing Agreement	171
Claims under the Agreement on Agriculture	186
(ii) Operator Category Licence Allocation.....	189
Claims under the GATT	191
Claims under the Licensing Agreement	206
Claims under the Agreement on Trade Related Investment Measures	215
(iii) Activity Function Licence Allocation.....	222
Licence Distribution Issues	222
Claims under the GATT	224

Report of the Panel

	Page
Claims under the Licensing Agreement	230
Issues Concerning "over-filing" or "double-counting"	236
(iv) Export Certificates	241
Claims under the GATT	242
Claims under the Licensing Agreement	247
(v) Publication of Regulations and Timing of Licences	250
Claims under the GATT	251
Claims under the Licensing Agreement	256
(vi) Licences Provided to EC Banana Producers	259
(vii) Hurricane Licences	260
Claims under the GATT	261
Claims under the Licensing Agreement	264
C. General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS)	265
Introduction	265
Issues of Scope	271
(a) The Relationship Between the GATS and the Multilateral Agreements on Trade in Goods.....	271
(b) Standard of Discrimination under the MFN and National Treatment Obligations	276
(i) Measures Affecting Trade in Services - Articles I:1 and XXVIII(c).....	276
(ii) Measures Affecting Trade in Services - Article XVII:1	278
iii) Standard of Discrimination: Article II.....	282
(c) Wholesale Trade Services	285
Operator Category Licence Allocation	296
(a) Article XVII.....	296
(b) Article II	310
Activity Function Licence Allocation - Articles II and XVII	312
Hurricane Licences - Articles II and XVII.....	317

	Page
Export Certificates - Articles II and XVII	318
V. ARGUMENTS PRESENTED BY THIRD PARTIES	321
ACP Third Parties	321
Introduction	321
Preliminary Matters	325
The Lomé Convention and the Lomé Waiver	328
Article I of GATT	333
Article XIII of GATT	336
Article X of GATT and the Licensing Agreement	337
The GATS	338
Conclusion	341
Canada	341
The Relationship Between Trade in Goods and Trade in Services	341
The Lomé Waiver	342
Conclusion	344
Colombia, Costa Rica, Nicaragua and Venezuela	344
Introduction	344
Principal Legal Arguments	345
Subsidiary Legal Arguments	349
Conclusions	356
India	357
The Lomé Convention and the Lomé Waiver	357
Conclusion	358
Japan	358
Non-Applicability of the Agreement on Import Licensing Procedures to Tariff Quota Systems	359
Conclusion	359
The Philippines	360
Preliminary Arguments	360
Specific Legal Arguments	361
Conclusion	363
VI. INTERIM REVIEW	363
VII. FINDINGS	365
A. Organizational Issues	366
1. Participation of Third Parties	366
2. Presence of Private Lawyers	368

Report of the Panel

	Page
B. Preliminary Issues	369
1. Adequacy of the Consultations.....	370
2. Specificity of the Request for Panel Establishment.....	371
(a) Article 6.2 and the Request for Establishment of the Panel	371
(b) The Arguments of the Parties	372
(c) Analysis of the Article 6.2 Claim	373
(i) Ordinary Meaning of Treaty Terms	374
(ii) Context.....	376
(iii) Object and Purpose	377
(iv) Past Practice	378
(v) Cure.....	380
3. Requirement of Legal Interest	381
4. Number of Panel Reports	383
C. Substantive Issues.....	385
1. The EC Market for Bananas: Article XIII of GATT	386
(a) Article XIII	387
(i) Separate regimes	391
(ii) Members with a Substantial Interest	393
(iii) Members without a Substantial Interest ...	395
(iv) New Members.....	396
(v) Other Arguments.....	397
(b) The Allocation of Tariff Quota Shares to ACP Countries: the Lomé Waiver	398
(i) Preferential Treatment Required by the Lomé Convention	399
(ii) Application of the Lomé Waiver to the EC's Article XIII Obligations	401
(c) The Allocation of Tariff Quota Shares to BFA Countries.....	404
(i) Inclusion of the BFA Tariff Quota Shares in the EC Schedule	404
(ii) Agreement on Agriculture	408
(d) Tariff Quota Share Allocations and Article I:1	411
2. Tariff Issues	411

	Page
3. The EC Banana Import Licensing Procedures	412
(a) General Issues	413
(i) Scope of the Licensing Agreement	413
(ii) GATT 1994 and the Annex 1A Agreements	417
(iii) Separate Regimes	418
(iv) Examination of the Licensing Claims	419
(b) Operator Categories	419
(i) Article III:4 of GATT	420
(ii) Article 2 of the TRIMs Agreement	426
(iii) Article I of GATT	427
(iv) Application of the Lomé Waiver to the EC's Article I Obligations	431
(v) Article X:3(a) of GATT	436
(vi) Other Claims	436
(c) Activity Functions	437
(i) Article III:4 of GATT	437
(ii) Article I:1 of GATT	437
(iii) Article X:3(a) of GATT	438
(iv) Other Claims	441
(d) BFA Export Certificates	441
(i) Article I:1 of GATT	442
(ii) Other Claims	444
(e) Hurricane Licences	445
(i) Article III:4 of GATT	446
(ii) Article I:1 of GATT	446
(iii) Application of the Lomé Waiver	446
(iv) Article 1.3 of the Licensing Agreement ...	446
(v) Other Claims	446
(f) Other Claims	446
(i) General	446
(ii) Article 1.2 of the Licensing Agreement ...	447
4. The EC Banana Import Licensing Procedures and the GATS	448
(a) Introduction	448

Report of the Panel

	Page
(b) General Issues	449
(i) Measures Affecting Trade in Services	449
(ii) Wholesale Trade Services	453
(iii) Modes of Supply	455
(iv) The Scope of the Article II Obligation	457
(v) The Scope of the Article XVII Commitment	460
(vi) Effective Date of GATS Obligations	461
(vii) Claims by Mexico	462
(c) Operator Categories	462
(i) Article XVII of GATS	462
(ii) Article II of GATS	473
(d) Activity Functions	476
(i) Article XVII of GATS	476
(ii) Article II of GATS	481
(e) Export Certificates	481
(i) Article XVII of GATS	482
(ii) Article II of GATS	483
(f) Hurricane Licences	485
(i) Article XVII of GATS	485
(ii) Article II of GATS	487
5. Nullification or Impairment	488
D. Summary of Findings	488
1. Preliminary Issues	489
2. The EC Market for Bananas: Article XIII of GATT	489
3. Tariff Issues	490
4. The EC Banana Import Licensing Procedures	490
5. The EC Banana Import Licensing Procedures and the GATS	492
VIII. FINAL REMARKS	493
IX. CONCLUSIONS	494
ATTACHMENT	495