

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-79322-3 - Theories of Case  
Miriam Butt  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Theories of Case

Case, a system which marks the relationships between words in a sentence, is fundamental to every language. Looking at how different theories of syntax have accounted for the distribution of case across languages, this accessible textbook introduces the various approaches to case that have been proposed in modern linguistics. Clearly organised into topics, it provides beginning students with a solid understanding of the ideas behind the development of theories of case. For the more advanced reader, it presents theories that have been formulated about the interaction between case morphology, argument structure, grammatical relations and semantics, and offers a detailed cross-theoretical discussion of how these are motivated. Each chapter contains practical exercises, encouraging students to engage with the ideas discussed. Drawing on data from a wide range of languages and pooling together a variety of perspectives, *Theories of Case* is essential reading for all those studying this important area of linguistics.

MIRIAM BUTT is Professor of Theoretical and Computational Linguistics at the University of Konstanz. She has authored, co-authored and co-edited a variety of books on morphosyntax, semantics, historical linguistics and computational linguistics, including *The Structure of Complex Predicates in Urdu*, *A Grammar Writer's Cookbook*, *Theoretical Perspectives on Word Order Issues*, and *The Projection of Arguments*, as well as *Time over Matter*, *Argument Realization*, and *Nominals: Inside and Out*.

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-79322-3 - Theories of Case  
Miriam Butt  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE TEXTBOOKS IN LINGUISTICS

*General editors:* P. AUSTIN, J. BRESNAN, B. COMRIE, S. CRAIN, W. DRESSLER, C. EWEN,  
R. LASS, D. LIGHTFOOT, K. RICE, I. ROBERTS, S. ROMAINE, N. V. SMITH.

Theories of Case

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-79322-3 - Theories of Case  
 Miriam Butt  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

*In this series:*

- R.M. KEMPSON *Semantic Theory*  
 T. BYNON *Historical Linguistics*  
 J. ALLWOOD, L.-G. ANDERSON and Ö. DAHL *Logic in Linguistics*  
 D.B. FRY *The Physics of Speech*  
 R.A. HUDSON *Sociolinguistics* Second Edition  
 A.J. ELLIOT *Child Language*  
 P.H. MATTHEWS *Syntax*  
 A. RADFORD *Transformational Syntax*  
 L. BAUER *English Word-Formation*  
 S.C. LEVINSON *Pragmatics*  
 G. BROWN and G. YULE *Discourse Analysis*  
 R. HUDDLESTON *Introduction to the Grammar of English*  
 R. LASS *Phonology*  
 B. COMRIE *Tense*  
 W. KLEIN *Second Language Acquisition*  
 A.J. WOODS, P. FLETCHER and A. HUGHES *Statistics in Language Studies*  
 D.A. CRUSE *Lexical Semantics*  
 A. RADFORD *Transformational Grammar*  
 M. GARMAN *Psycholinguistics*  
 C.G. CORBETT *Gender*  
 H.J. GIEGERICH *English Phonology*  
 R. CANN *Formal Semantics*  
 J. LAVER *Principles of Phonetics*  
 F.R. PALMER *Grammatical Roles and Relations*  
 M.A. JONES *Foundations of French Syntax*  
 A. RADFORD *Syntactic Theory and the Structure of English: A Minimalist Approach*  
 R.D. VAN VALIN, JR and R.J. LAPOLLA *Syntax: Structure, Meaning and Function*  
 A. DURANTI *Linguistic Anthropology*  
 A. CRUTTENDEN *Intonation* Second Edition  
 J.K. CHAMBERS and P. TRUDGILL *Dialectology* Second Edition  
 C. LYONS *Definiteness*  
 R. KAGER *Optimality Theory*  
 J.A. HOLM *An Introduction to Pidgins and Creoles*  
 C.G. CORBETT *Number*  
 C.J. EWEN and H. VAN DER HULST *The Phonological Structure of Words*  
 F.R. PALMER *Mood and Modality* Second Edition  
 B.J. BLAKE *Case* Second Edition  
 E. GUSSMAN *Phonology: Analysis and Theory*  
 M. YIP *Tone*  
 W. CROFT *Typology and Universals* Second Edition  
 F. COULMAS *Writing Systems: An Introduction to their Linguistic Analysis*  
 P.J. HOPPER and E.C. TRAUOGOTT *Grammaticalization* Second Edition  
 L. WHITE *Second Language Acquisition and Universal Grammar*  
 I. PLAG *Word-Formation in English*  
 W. CROFT and A. CRUSE *Cognitive Linguistics*  
 A. SIEWIERSKA *Person*  
 A. RADFORD *Minimalist Syntax: Exploring the Structure of English*  
 D. BÜRING *Binding Theory*  
 M. BUTT *Theories of Case*  
 N. HORNSTEIN, J. NUNES and K. GROHMANN *Understanding Minimalism*  
 B.C. LUST *Child Language: Acquisition and Growth*

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-79322-3 - Theories of Case  
Miriam Butt  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# Theories of Case

MIRIAM BUTT

*Universität Konstanz*



Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-79322-3 - Theories of Case  
Miriam Butt  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521797313](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521797313)

© Miriam Butt 2006

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library*

ISBN-13 978-0-521-79322-3 hardback  
ISBN-10 0-521-79322-X hardback  
ISBN-13 978-0-521-79731-3 paperback  
ISBN-10 0-521-79731-4 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

---

# Contents

<b>Acknowledgements</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>Abbreviations</b>	<b>xiii</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Overview	1
1.2 What is Case?	3
1.2.1 Head vs. Dependent Marking	5
1.2.2 Is Everything Case? — Persian <i>ezafe</i>	6
1.2.3 Adverbial Case	6
1.2.4 Case and Finiteness	7
1.2.5 Nominal Case	8
1.2.6 Case Stacking	9
1.3 Levels of Abstractness	11
<b>2 Foundational Perspectives</b>	<b>12</b>
2.1 Introduction	12
2.2 The Greek and Roman Tradition	13
2.3 The Indian Tradition	15
2.4 The Arabic Tradition	18
2.5 Exercises	21
<b>3 Grammatical Relations</b>	<b>23</b>
3.1 The Structure of Sentences	23
3.2 Transformational Grammar, Case and the Passive	24
3.3 Relational Grammar	26

viii	THEORIES OF CASE	
3.4	The Notion of Grammatical Relations	28
3.5	Case Grammar and Thematic Roles	29
3.6	Core Ideas of Relational Grammar	33
	3.6.1 The Passive Revisited	33
	3.6.2 Case in Relational Grammar	36
3.7	The Unaccusative Hypothesis	38
3.8	The Universal Alignment Hypothesis	42
3.9	Summary	44
3.10	Exercises	44
<b>4</b>	<b>Structural Case</b>	<b>46</b>
4.1	The Structural View of Grammatical Relations	46
4.2	The Basic Architecture	46
4.3	Thematic Roles	48
4.4	Category Neutral Representations: $X'$ -Syntax	51
4.5	The VP-internal subject hypothesis	53
4.6	Case and Agreement	55
4.7	D-Structure, $\theta$ -Theory, and Structural Case	55
	4.7.1 Unaccusatives and Unergatives	60
	4.7.2 Passivization	64
4.8	Structural vs. Inherent or Quirky Case	67
4.9	Taking Stock	71
4.10	Minimalism	73
	4.10.1 Phases, Merge and Features	73
	4.10.2 External Arguments	75
	4.10.3 Lexical Conceptual Structure	77
	4.10.4 Unergatives, Unaccusatives and Passives	79
4.11	English Double Objects	83
4.12	Discussion	87
4.13	Exercises	89
<b>5</b>	<b>Linking Theories</b>	<b>91</b>
5.1	Introduction	91
5.2	Representation of Predicate-Argument Structure	92
5.3	Lexical Decomposition and Linking	94
5.4	Proto-Roles	98
5.5	Kiparsky's Linking Theory	100

5.5.1	Semantic Form and Thematic Roles	101
5.5.2	The Feature System	103
5.5.3	Linking by Case, Position and Agreement	107
5.5.4	Passives, Unaccusatives and Unergatives	109
5.6	Lexical Decomposition Grammar	111
5.6.1	Basic Analyses	113
5.6.2	Unergatives, Unaccusatives and Semantics	114
5.6.3	Quirky Case	116
5.7	Lexical-Functional Grammar	117
5.7.1	LFG Basics	117
5.7.2	Argument Structure and Thematic Roles	122
5.7.3	Quirky Case and Early Association Principles	123
5.7.4	The Introduction of Explicit Features	126
5.7.5	Standard LFG Mapping Theory	127
5.7.6	Argument Alternations	131
5.7.7	Incorporation of Proto-Roles	135
5.8	Case Stacking	138
5.9	An Interactive Model of Case	142
5.9.1	Linking	144
5.9.2	Structural Case	145
5.9.3	Quirky Case	146
5.9.4	Semantic Case	146
5.10	Discussion	149
5.11	Exercises	150
<b>6</b>	<b>The Ergative Dragon</b>	<b>153</b>
6.1	Fighting Dragons	153
6.2	The Terminology	154
6.2.1	Torres Straits and the Agentive Nominative	154
6.2.2	A Misunderstanding with Georgian	156
6.3	Case Systems	158
6.4	Syntactic vs. Morphological Ergativity	161
6.5	Approaches to Morphological Ergativity	165
6.5.1	The Ergative as an Inherent Case	165
6.5.2	The Ergative as a Structural Case	169
6.5.3	Linking theories revisited and more types of ergativity	173
6.6	Split Ergativity	175
6.7	Acquisition Issues	176



x	THEORIES OF CASE	
6.8	Historical Issues	179
6.9	Summary	183
6.10	Exercises	184
<b>7</b>	<b>The Semantics of Case</b>	<b>188</b>
7.1	Localist Theories	188
7.2	Agency vs. Experience	189
7.3	Object Alternations	191
7.4	Subject Alternations	197
7.5	Discussion	199
7.6	Exercises	200
<b>8</b>	<b>More Theories Great and Small</b>	<b>202</b>
8.1	Role and Reference Grammar	202
8.1.1	Basic Linking	205
8.1.2	Ditransitives and Dative Subjects	208
8.1.3	Ergatives	211
8.2	Optimality Theory	212
8.2.1	OT Basics	213
8.2.2	Structural Case Revisited	216
8.2.3	Harmonic Alignment	220
8.3	Discussion	224
8.4	Exercises	226
	<b>Language Index</b>	<b>250</b>
	<b>Subject Index</b>	<b>252</b>

---

## Acknowledgements

This book is dedicated to Andrea Levitt and Anette Herskovits. They were my first linguistics teachers and were very bemused to discover that I had gone on to do syntax. Nevertheless, they set me on my current path and I would like to thank them for it.

This book has been with me for several years now, though for most of these years, it played more of a passive role than it deserved. This was partly due to the fact that it accompanied me to UMIST, Manchester in 2002, and then back to the University of Konstanz in 2003. This book is thus an English/German hybrid and I would like to thank both the Department of Linguistics at Konstanz and the Centre for Computational Linguistics at UMIST for providing a supportive and interesting working environment.

Thanks are also in order to a host of people, whose input and encouragement ultimately made this book possible. I would like to thank David Lightfoot and Paul Kiparsky for proposing that I take on this project and thus getting the ball rolling. At CUP, I would like to thank three editors for many helpful and cooperative exchanges. Andrew Winnard was the editor in charge when the ideas for the content of the book first took shape. Helen Barton is the editor who managed to impose deadlines politely, but firmly, and see the book to its completion. And, finally, the end production of the book was overseen by Annie Lovett in a very competent and professional manner. It was a pleasure to work with all of them.

David Adger, Judith Aissen, Mohamed Badawi, Josef Bayer, Ashwini Deo, Wilhelm Geuder, Helen de Hoop, Georg Kaiser, Ingrid Kaufmann, Tracy Holloway King, Paul Kiparsky, Carmen Kelling, Aditi Lahiri, Beth Levin, Andrej Malchukov, Judith Meinschäfer, Mahinnaz Mirdehghan, Rachel Nordlinger, Frans Plank, Gillian Ramchand, Christoph Schwarze, Peter Sells, Peter Svenonius, Robert D. Van Valin Jr., Connie de Vos, Björn Wiemer, Beate Wolke, Irene Wolke and Dieter Wunderlich have all given generously of their time,

providing me with invaluable information, comments, feedback and criticism. Their input has helped shape the book from a gangly adolescent into something more mature. Thanks go to Katrin Schuhmann for careful proofreading and help with the index. Thanks also go to CUP, who had the manuscript proofread even more carefully. All remaining errors, misrepresentations and omissions are entirely my own responsibility.

Carmen Kelling in particular has been one of my most faithful and reliable readers. Ingrid Kaufmann had to put up with late-night discussions and complaints almost every day and managed to turn my musings into useful material that I could incorporate the next day. Special thanks are also due to Rajesh Bhatt, who visited during the last week of production and good-naturedly put up with late night discussions of case. Zhila Shah provided much needed moral sustenance during my stay in Lahore. Finally, very special thanks go to the Tequila Club, which is a truly most excellent institution!

---

## Abbreviations

-	morpheme boundary	Part	Partitive
=	clitic boundary	Pass	Passive
Abl	Ablative	Past	Past
Abs	Absolutive	PastP	Past Participle
Acc	Accusative	Perf	Perfect
All	Allative	PerfP	Perfect Participle
Aor	Aorist	Pl	Plural
Asp	Aspect	Pres	Present
Caus	Causative	Prop	Propriative
Dat	Dative	Ptcpl	Participle
Decl	Declarative	Purp	Purposive
Dem	Demonstrative	REC PAST	Recent Past
Des	Desiderative	SB	Subject
Dir	Direct (case)	Sg	Singular
Erg	Ergative	SUBJ	Subject
F	Feminine	Subj	Subject
Gd	Gerund	Tns	Tense
Gen	Genitive	Top	Topic
Imp	Imperative	TR	Transitive
Impf	Imperfect	VN	Verbal Noun
IND	Indicative		
Inf	Infinitive		
Inst	Instrumental		
INTR	Intransitive		
Loc	Locative		
M	Masculine		
N	Neuter		
Nfut	Nonfuture		
Nom	Nominative		
OAgr	Object Agreement		
Obj	Object		