

Cambridge University Press  
0521790085 - Political Parties, Games and Redistribution  
Rosa Mulé  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## POLITICAL PARTIES, GAMES AND REDISTRIBUTION

This book explores the impact of political parties on income redistribution policy in liberal democracies. Rosa Mulé illustrates how public policy on inequality is influenced by strategic interactions among party leaders, rather than responses to social constituencies. Using game theory in detailed case studies of intraparty conflicts, Mulé evaluates her findings against a broad range of theories – political business cycle, median convergence, ‘shrinking middle class’ and demographic movements. She analyses trends in income inequality in selected OECD countries since the 1970s and provides in-depth examinations of Canada, Australia, Britain and the United States. Her methodology effectively blends sophisticated quantitative techniques with qualitative, analytic narratives. In evaluating both the impact of intraparty cohesion and ideology on redistributive policy, and trends in income inequality, this book brings a unique perspective to those interested in the study of public policy and political parties.

ROSA MULÉ is Lecturer in Comparative Politics and Research Methods at the University of Warwick.

Cambridge University Press  
0521790085 - Political Parties, Games and Redistribution  
Rosa Mule  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# POLITICAL PARTIES, GAMES AND REDISTRIBUTION

ROSA MULÉ

*University of Warwick*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
0521790085 - Political Parties, Games and Redistribution  
Rosa Mule  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE  
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK      [www.cup.cam.ac.uk](http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk)  
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA      [www.cup.org](http://www.cup.org)  
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia  
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain

© Rosa Mulé 2001

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without  
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2001

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeset in Baskerville 11/12.5 pt [vN]

*A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library*

ISBN 0 521 79008 5 hardback  
ISBN 0 521 79358 0 paperback

Cambridge University Press  
0521790085 - Political Parties, Games and Redistribution  
Rosa Mule  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

*To my mother and to the memory of my father*

Contents

|                                                                                                             |                |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|
| <i>List of figures</i>                                                                                      | <i>page</i> ix |
| <i>List of tables</i>                                                                                       | xi             |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>                                                                                      | xiii           |
| Introduction                                                                                                | I              |
| Welfare state expansion and retrenchment                                                                    | 4              |
| The argument of this book                                                                                   | 11             |
| Comparative strategy                                                                                        | 14             |
| The Luxembourg Income Study                                                                                 | 24             |
| The structure of the book                                                                                   | 27             |
| 1 Political parties, games and income redistribution                                                        | 32             |
| Traditional redistributive games: median voter, political business cycle and partisan model                 | 33             |
| Advances in the theory of party politics                                                                    | 35             |
| Party goals: trade-offs and priorities                                                                      | 38             |
| Party competition: arithmetical particularism and Director's Law                                            | 40             |
| Party organisation: pivotal players, strategic disagreement, sequential elections and correlated strategies | 42             |
| Conclusion: political slack and redistributive policies                                                     | 49             |
| 2 Opposition effects, blackmail and u-turns under Pierre Elliot Trudeau                                     | 52             |
| Political background                                                                                        | 52             |
| Social cleavages and redistribution                                                                         | 54             |
| Electoral incentives for redistribution                                                                     | 58             |
| The New Liberals and expansionary policies                                                                  | 61             |
| Why the guaranteed annual income proposal failed                                                            | 62             |
| The NDP challenge and the 1971 unemployment scheme                                                          | 66             |
| The blackmail game                                                                                          | 68             |
| The u-turn                                                                                                  | 71             |
| Income inequality: demography, markets and income transfers                                                 | 74             |
| Conclusions                                                                                                 | 81             |

|      |                                                                                               |     |
|------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| viii | <i>Contents</i>                                                                               |     |
| 3    | The arithmetics of politics under Margaret Thatcher                                           | 82  |
|      | Political background                                                                          | 82  |
|      | Electoral incentives for redistribution                                                       | 89  |
|      | Explicit games and the antiegalitarian crusade                                                | 95  |
|      | Sequential elections                                                                          | 97  |
|      | Breaking the internal alliance on social security policies                                    | 105 |
|      | Income inequality: demography, markets and income transfers                                   | 107 |
|      | Conclusions                                                                                   | 113 |
| 4    | Right-wing ascendancy, pivotal players and asymmetric power under Bob Hawke                   | 116 |
|      | Political background                                                                          | 116 |
|      | Electoral incentives for redistribution                                                       | 122 |
|      | Political renewal shapes social policies                                                      | 128 |
|      | The Centre-Left as a pivotal player in redistributive games                                   | 132 |
|      | Two-stage game over redistributive policies                                                   | 136 |
|      | The acquiescence of trade unions: consensus or imbalance?                                     | 140 |
|      | Asymmetric bargaining and social security reforms                                             | 143 |
|      | Income inequality: demography, markets and transfer policies                                  | 145 |
|      | Conclusions                                                                                   | 155 |
| 5    | The demise of the federal social safety net under Clinton                                     | 158 |
|      | Political background                                                                          | 158 |
|      | The evolution of policies towards low-income groups: electoral and institutional determinants | 162 |
|      | Strategic disagreement and the stalemate of welfare reform, 1992–1994                         | 167 |
|      | The Paternalistic-Deterrence game                                                             | 169 |
|      | ‘Deserving and undeserving poor’                                                              | 176 |
|      | Conclusions                                                                                   | 179 |
| 6    | Conclusions                                                                                   | 181 |
|      | Comparative analysis                                                                          | 181 |
|      | The redistributive logic in liberal democracies                                               | 182 |
|      | Distributive elites, institutional context and opposition effects                             | 185 |
|      | Comparing redistributive games                                                                | 191 |
|      | Reassessing the party–policy link                                                             | 196 |
|      | The future of redistribution                                                                  | 201 |
|      | <i>Technical addendum</i>                                                                     | 205 |
|      | <i>Bibliography</i>                                                                           | 213 |
|      | <i>Index</i>                                                                                  | 244 |

*Figures*

|     |                                                                                                        |                |
|-----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|
| 1.1 | Reduction in the Gini coefficient induced by cash transfers and direct taxes in nine Western countries | <i>page</i> 10 |
| 2.1 | Average value of income component as a percentage of average gross income: Canada, 1971                | 56             |
| 2.2 | Income share of population deciles: Canada, 1971–1981                                                  | 59             |
| 2.3 | The blackmail game: Canada, 1972–1974                                                                  | 70             |
| 2.4 | Proportion of the population in different market income classes: Canada, 1971–1981                     | 78             |
| 2.5 | Percent of female household heads below or above different poverty lines: Canada, 1971–1981            | 80             |
| 3.1 | Income share of population deciles: United Kingdom, 1974–1991                                          | 89             |
| 3.2 | Proportion of the population in different market income classes: United Kingdom, 1974–1991             | 111            |
| 4.1 | Income share of population deciles: Australia, 1981/82–1989/90                                         | 125            |
| 4.2 | Two-stage redistributive game in the ALP                                                               | 137            |
| 4.3 | Pensioners' poverty rates: Australia, 1981/82–1985/86                                                  | 146            |
| 4.4 | Family poverty rates: Australia, 1981/82–1985/86                                                       | 147            |
| 4.5 | Proportion of the population in different market income classes: Australia, 1981/82–1993/94            | 153            |
| 5.1 | Credit claiming game                                                                                   | 174            |

Tables

|     |                                                                                                                                                                      |               |
|-----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------|
| 1.1 | Trends in income inequality in nine Western countries                                                                                                                | <i>page</i> 3 |
| 1.2 | Average value of income components as a percentage of average gross income in nine Western countries                                                                 | 8             |
| 2.1 | Liberal conventions of 1948, 1958, 1968                                                                                                                              | 63            |
| 2.2 | Percentages of votes and seats in Canadian federal elections, 1968–1979                                                                                              | 68            |
| 2.3 | Trends in income inequality: Canada, 1971–1987                                                                                                                       | 74            |
| 2.4 | Population decile share of post-tax–post-transfer income and adjusted post-tax–post-transfer income: Canada, 1971–1981                                               | 75            |
| 2.5 | The contribution of changes in within- and between-age-group components to the trend in total inequality: Canada, 1971–1987 (adjusted post-tax–post-transfer income) | 76            |
| 2.6 | The contribution of changes in within- and between-household types to the trend in total inequality: Canada, 1971–1987 (adjusted post-tax–post-transfer income)      | 77            |
| 2.7 | Gini coefficient (per cent) for selected income definitions: Canada, 1971–1987                                                                                       | 79            |
| 3.1 | Estimated numbers receiving social security benefits: United Kingdom, 1977/78–1985/86                                                                                | 85            |
| 3.2 | Trends in income inequality in the United Kingdom, 1974–1991                                                                                                         | 107           |
| 3.3 | Quintile income share: United Kingdom, 1974–1991                                                                                                                     | 108           |
| 3.4 | Contribution of changes in within- and between-age groups to the trend in total inequality: United Kingdom, 1974–1991 (adjusted post-tax–post-transfer income)       | 109           |
| 3.5 | Contribution of changes in within- and between-household types to the trend in total inequality: United Kingdom, 1974–1991 (adjusted post-tax–post-transfer income)  | 110           |
| 3.6 | Gini coefficient (per cent) for selected income definitions: United Kingdom, 1974–1991                                                                               | 112           |

|      |                                                                                                                                                                      |     |
|------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| xii  | <i>List of tables</i>                                                                                                                                                |     |
| 3.7  | Cumulative percentage of the unemployed and total population below three different poverty lines: United Kingdom, 1974–1986                                          | 112 |
| 4.1  | Trends in the number of social security beneficiaries: Australia, 1980–1996                                                                                          | 120 |
| 4.2  | ALP state-branch membership, 1978–1986                                                                                                                               | 134 |
| 4.3  | ALP national factions: voting power expressed as a percentage of total members                                                                                       | 135 |
| 4.4  | Preference ordering of Labor factions with respect to income redistribution                                                                                          | 136 |
| 4.5  | Trade union density rates and collective bargaining coverage rates in selected OECD countries                                                                        | 142 |
| 4.6  | The preferences of ALP and ACTU                                                                                                                                      | 143 |
| 4.7  | Trends in income inequality in Australia, 1981/82–1993/94                                                                                                            | 148 |
| 4.8  | Quintile income share: Australia, 1981/82–1993/94                                                                                                                    | 149 |
| 4.9  | Contributions of changes in within- and between-age-groups to the trend in total inequality: Australia, 1981/82–1993/94 (adjusted post-tax–post-transfer income)     | 150 |
| 4.10 | Contribution of changes in within- and between-household types to the trend in total inequality: Australia, 1981/82–1993/94 (adjusted post-tax–post-transfer income) | 151 |
| 4.11 | Proportion of the population with gross and net adjusted household income below different poverty lines: Australia, 1981/82–1989/90                                  | 152 |
| 4.12 | Gini coefficient (per cent) for selected adjusted income definitions: Australia, 1981/82–1993/94                                                                     | 154 |
| 5.1  | Income share of population deciles in the United States, 1974–1994                                                                                                   | 161 |
| 5.2  | Paternalistic-Deterrence game                                                                                                                                        | 172 |
| 5.3  | Trends in income inequality in the United States, 1974–1994                                                                                                          | 177 |
| 5.4  | Poverty rates for one-parent families and for the elderly: United States, 1974–1994                                                                                  | 178 |
| 6.1  | Trends in income inequality in nine Western countries, 1970s–1990s                                                                                                   | 202 |
| 6.2  | Income inequality before and after transfer income in nine Western countries, 1980s–1990s                                                                            | 203 |
| A.1  | Ranking of ten OECD countries according to the bottom sensitive Theil index                                                                                          | 210 |
| A.2  | Ranking of ten OECD countries according to the middle-sensitive Gini coefficient                                                                                     | 211 |
| A.3  | Ranking of ten OECD countries according to the top sensitive coefficient of variation                                                                                | 212 |

## *Acknowledgments*

This book has received a great deal of help. The intellectual support began with Angelo Panebianco, my mentor at Bologna University, who persuaded me to embark on this project. Anthony B. Atkinson and Frank Cowell provided the stimulus for studying income inequality and redistributive issues during my graduate years at the London School of Economics and Political Science.

I owe a special debt to Cristina Pitassi, now at UNIDO, Vienna, for helping me to come to grips with the daunting techniques of modern economics literature. Without her generous help and unflagging patience my transition from an undergraduate degree in politics and history to a postgraduate degree in economics would have most certainly failed. Athena Economides uncluttered my prose and her humour made much of the hard work fun.

There are many others who have contributed enormously. Patrick Dunleavy and Brendan O'Leary supervised an earlier draft that turned into my doctoral dissertation at the LSE. They helped me get the project off the ground and provided a unique blend of challenge, stimuli and support. Some people offered feedback for individual chapters or discussed with me the core ideas of those chapters: Jens Alber, Jim Bulpitt†, John Cairn, Dhammika Dharmapala, Roger Duclaud-Williams, Peter John, Carol Johnson, James Jupp, Paul King, Ian McAllister, Deborah Mitchell, Ines Molinaro, Michael Moran, Rodolfo Vergara and Alan Ware. I have also benefited from the comments and practical help of the participants to the Income Distribution Workshop, STICERD, between 1991 and 1994, especially Andrea Brandolini, Julie Litchfield, Magda Mercader and Stefano Toso. I thank the team of the Luxembourg Income Study for technical support.

Chapter 3 was presented at the International Political Science Association in Seoul, 1997 and at the European Forum, European University Institute, Florence, 1999; and Chapter 4 was delivered to the Depart-

mental Research Seminar of the Political Science Program, Research School of Social Sciences, Australian National University in May 1998. I would like to thank the participants for their critical advice. I also wish to thank my colleagues at the University of Warwick for undertaking my administrative duties while I was on leave to finish this book.

Financial support from the Italian Department of Education, and the Centro Nazionale delle Ricerche is gratefully acknowledged. Extra financial resources were provided by the Research and Development Fund and the Centre for the Study of Globalisation and Regionalization, both at the University of Warwick, and the British Academy. The final version of the manuscript was written in the spring of 1998 while I was a Visiting Fellow at the Political Science Program, Research School of Social Sciences, Australian National University

John Haslam, commissioning editor at Cambridge University Press, encouraged me to rewrite the final draft. I am grateful for the constructive comments of the three referees of Cambridge University Press who provided their initial comments anonymously but two of them, Ian McAllister and Deborah Mitchell, later waived their anonymity and I am able to thank them personally. The title is a combination of suggestions from the Press Syndicate and Deborah Mitchell.