

Cambridge University Press

0521780233 - Making Moral Sense: Beyond Habermas and Gauthier

Logi Gunnarsson

Index

[More information](#)*Index*

- action
 - making sense of, 184–185
 - strategic, 99, 114, 125
- agreement, *see* bargain; contractarianism:
 - Gauthier's; current situation; discourse ethics; and agreement; initial situation
- Anscombe, G. E. M., 45n
- Apel, Karl-Otto, 202n, 222, 262
 - see also* contingency of morality; Habermas, Jürgen: and Apel; justification: transcendental-pragmatic; substantive approach: and Apel and Kuhlmann
- arbitrariness problem, 146, 156–157
- Archimedean point, 6n
- argumentation, *see* discourse
- argumentative strategy of this work, 46–47, 171–172, 177–178, 182–191, 195–196, 195n, 210
 - see also* bootstrapping problem: solution to; changing the subject
- asset, common, *see* endowments, natural: bargain about the use of
- autonomy, 149–151
- Badhwar, Neera K., 140n
- Baier, Annette, 199n
- bargain
 - in Gauthier's initial situation, 64, 71, 78
 - in the pure utility maximizer's initial situation, 72–73, 78
 - see also* current situation; initial situation; renegotiations argument
- basic choice problem
 - defined, 4–5
 - and Gauthier, 54–55
 - and justice, 54–55
 - and the substantive approach, 165
- benefit, 255–256
- Benhabib, Seyla, 119n
- Blackburn, Simon, 38n, 148n, 158n
- bootstrapping problem, 40–42, 164–166
 - defined, 44
 - solution to, 192–195
- Brink, David O., 231n
- categorical force of morality
 - according to Habermas, 16n, 88, 97, 97n, 170
 - the problem of, 11, 29–30
 - and rationalism, 11, 16n, 167–170
 - and the substantive approach, 167–170
- changing the subject, 139–140, 187–188, 202, 240–241
- circularity objection, *see* bootstrapping problem
- coercion, 55, 67–70, 72, 76–77
- coherence, *see* reflective equilibrium: and coherence
- coherentism, 234
 - defined, 231
 - and Habermas, 107–108
- common sense, 241–242
- communication, undistorted, 92
- concept
 - metaphysical, 189–191
 - thick evaluative, 152
- consciousness, false, 55, 67–70, 130n
- consequentialism, 49n
- contingency of morality, 264–265
- contractarianism, 7, 232, 242
 - Gauthier's, 57–65
 - Rawls', 58–59
 - see also* bargain; current situation; initial situation
- contradiction, *see* self-contradiction, pragmatic
- controversiality problem, 145–146
 - defined, 44
 - solution to, 157–160, 163n, 213–214

Cambridge University Press

0521780233 - Making Moral Sense: Beyond Habermas and Gauthier

Logi Gunnarsson

Index

[More information](#)*Index*

- criticism
 - cross-cultural, *see* cross-cultural criticism
 - of self, *see* self-assessment
 - see also* evaluation of others
- cross-cultural criticism, 4
 - and neutrality, 215–218, 218n, 222–224
 - Rorty on, 218–224
 - and the substantive approach, 222–223
- cruelty, 153–154, 197–198, 202–207, 222
 - to animals, 209
 - Rorty on, 218, 223
- current situation, 58–59, 63–69, 71, 79–81, 83–84
 - see also* utility maximizer
- Dancy, Jonathan, 250n
- deliberation
 - subjectivist interpretation of, 24–28, 141–144, 147–148
 - see also* evaluation; substantive reasons
- dependence thesis, 248–251
 - criticism of, 252–257
 - statement of, 248
- desire, 23–24, 172, 174–182
 - second-order, 144
 - see also* evaluation: weak
- discourse, 212–213
 - Habermas' understanding of, 86–87
 - legal, 90
 - moral, *see* moral discourse
 - philosophical, 112
 - presuppositions of, *see* presuppositions
 - rational/ideal, 15–16, 87
 - see also* SD-discourse; WD-discourse
- discourse ethics
 - and agreement, 89–90, 92, 94–95
 - see also* discourse; discourse principle; Habermas, Jürgen; Habermas' democracy principle; Habermas' principle of universalization
- discourse principle, 102
 - statement of, 87–88, 110
 - strong version of, 95–97
 - weak version of, 94–97
- discourse theory, 232, 242
- distinctions, qualitative, 173
- endowments, natural
 - bargain about the use of, 72–73, 75, 78
 - defined, 71n
- ethnocentrism, the problem of, 201
 - defined, 98
 - Habermas' solution to, 98–99, 110–111, 120–123
- ethnocentrism, 218–224
 - vs. relativism, 218, 220
- evaluation
 - of others, *see* evaluation of others
 - strong, 132, 134–138, 172–182
 - substantive, 132, 134–138, 143, 144–146, 239–240
 - weak, 132, 172–182
 - see also* substantive reasons
- evaluation of others, 129–130, 197–214
 - and enforcement, 210–212
 - see also* cross-cultural criticism
- exploitation, 69–70, 72–73, 75, 82
 - and identity, 81
 - and moral intuitions, 54–55
 - and non-tuistic preferences, 62
 - and substantive reasons, 160–161
- external reasons, 23–25, 33–35, 38–39, 167
 - criteria for, 230–231, 232n, 236–242
 - see also* substantivism: metaphysical
 - objection to
- facts, evaluative, 35n
- fallibility, 106–107, 265n
- false self-assessment
 - Gauthier's test for 130–131, 134, 138–141, 145–146, 160–163
 - and justice, 160–163
 - the problem of, 130
 - and substantive reasons, 145–147, 159–166
- formal/substantive, distinction between, 20–21, 230–231
 - see also* justification: formal; substantive
- justification; substantive reasons
- formalism, 20
 - criticism of, 236–242
 - defined, 230
 - foundationalist vs. non-foundationalist, 48
 - inter-subjectivist vs. subjectivist, 48
 - see also* coherentism; formal/substantive, distinction between; Kantian ethics; proceduralism; reflective equilibrium theory
- foundationalism
 - epistemic, 243
 - as a theory offering non-moral justifications, 48

Cambridge University Press

0521780233 - Making Moral Sense: Beyond Habermas and Gauthier

Logi Gunnarsson

Index

[More information](#)*Index*

- frameworks, 173–176
- Gauthier, David, 7, 215n
 on agency, 77–79, 80, 82–83
 and the categorical force of morality, 11
 and the moral skeptic, 12–14, 19–20
 as a rationalist, 9–10, 12–13, 19–20, 55, 58–60
 and the rationality of morality, 10–12, 17–20, 54–55, 58–63
 and Rawls, 7, 58–59
 on reflective equilibrium, 7
 as a subjectivist, 10, 55–57, 134, 138–141
 see also basic choice problem: and Gauthier; contractarianism: Gauthier's; current situation; false self-assessment: Gauthier's test for; Gauthier's non-moral justification; initial situation; moral alternatives problem: Gauthier's solution to; rationality: Gauthier's conception of; renegotiations argument: Gauthier's; utility maximizer: Gauthier's; value
- Gauthier's non-moral justification, 9–12, 58–70, 73, 77
 criticism of, 71–85, 138–141, 158–163
- Gert, Bernard, 248–249, 248n, 250n, 252–255, 257n
- Gewirth, Alan, 8n
- goals, epistemic, 244–246
- Goodman, Nelson, 233
- Habermas, Jürgen, 7, 201n
 and Apel, 14n, 16n, 17n, 101n, 262–265
 as an empiricist, 262–263
 on hypothetical reconstructions, 106–107
 and Kuhlmann, 14n, 16n, 17n, 101n, 262–265
 and the moral skeptic, 16–20, 99–104, 100n, 106–107, 110
 as a rationalist, 17–20, 99–108
 and the rationality of morality, 16–17, 98–99, 102–104
 and Rawls, 7, 91, 95–97
 on reflective equilibrium, 7, 105
 on up-justification, 14n, 262–265
 on the validity of legal norms, 88, 90
 on the validity of moral norms, 88, 90, 93–94
 see also categorical force of morality: according to Habermas; coherentism: and Habermas; contingency of morality; discourse: Habermas' understanding of; discourse: rational/ideal; discourse ethics; ethnocentricity, the problem of; fallibility; Habermas' democracy principle; Habermas' principle of universalization; impartiality: according to Habermas; justification: transcendental-pragmatic; justification: universal-pragmatic; moral alternatives problem: Habermas' solution to; rationalism: indirect discourse-ethical; rationalism: weak vs. strong; reason, communicative; relativism, moral: and Habermas; substantive approach: and Habermas; validity, universal
- Habermas' democracy principle, 95n
- Habermas' moral principle, *see* Habermas' principle of universalization
- Habermas' principle of universalization, 102
 criticism of derivation of, 110–125
 derivation of, 97–106, 109–112, 120–123
 first formulation of derivation of, 109–110
 interpretation of, 89–90
 premises of derivation of, 101–106, 114–119, 121
 Rehg's formulation of derivation of, 123–125
 second formulation of derivation of, 120–123
 statement of, 88–89, 109
- Hare, R. M., 232n
- harm, 255–256
- humanity, 181–182, 189–190
- identification, *see* identity
- identity, 180
 and exploitation, 81
 Outsider's concept of, 176–177
 and self-assessment, 133–138
 Taylor's concept of, 174–176, 175n, 183–184, 186–187
- impartiality, 113–114
 according to Habermas, 88
- impossibility arguments, 171–172, 177–178, 183
 see also Taylor's impossibility thesis

Cambridge University Press

0521780233 - Making Moral Sense: Beyond Habermas and Gauthier

Logi Gunnarsson

Index

[More information](#)*Index*

- improvement
 - and neutrality, 194–195, 216–219
 - Rorty on, 218–221
 - substantive approach's account of, 148–151, 158–159, 219–221
- initial situation
 - Gauthier's, 58–59, 62–65, 71, 75, 81–82
 - and identification, 79–81
 - the pure utility maximizer's, 71–73, 75, 78, 81–82
 - see also* utility maximizer
- integration, intrapersonal vs. interpersonal, 82–85
- intelligibility, 177–178, 180–187, 213n
- interests
 - long-term, 11–12
 - universalizable, 88, 90, 93–94, 93n
- internal reasons model
 - non-subjectivist interpretation of, 28–29
 - subjectivist interpretation of, 26–28
 - see also* reasons: internal
- inter-subjectivist rationalism, 17–20, 48
 - criticism of, 197–212
 - see also* Habermas, Jürgen: as a rationalist; Habermas' principle of universalization: criticism of; rationalistic ideal of justification
- justice
 - vs. personal ideals, 84, 160–163
 - sense of, 53–54
 - see also* moral alternatives problem: and justice
- justification
 - comparative, 44, 46–47, 195n
 - complete, 154–157
 - empirical, 8n, 37–42
 - first-order practical, 205–206
 - formal, 5–6, 10, 18–21, 230–233, 235–238
 - moral/ethical, *see* reasons: moral/ethical of morality, *see* non-moral justification of morality
 - partial, 153–157
 - pragmatic, 188–189
 - rationalistic, *see* rationalism
 - rationalistic ideal of, *see* rationalistic ideal of justification
 - substantive, *see* substantive justification
 - transcendental-pragmatic, 14, 14n, 262–265
 - universal-pragmatic, 14n, 14–17, 99–100, 116–119, 213, 213n, 262–265
 - see also* reasons
- Kantian ethics, 232, 242n
- kidney transplantation example, 112–113
- Kohlberg's developmental psychology, 107
- Korsgaard, Christine M., 208n
- Kuhlmann, Wolfgang, 202n
 - on Habermas, 262–263
 - see also* contingency of morality; Habermas, Jürgen: and Kuhlmann; substantive approach: and Apel and Kuhlmann
- liberal vs. communitarian, 162
- life, a good, 47, 162n
 - see also* meaning of life
- list-substantivism, 49–50, 248–250, 258
 - criticism of, 252–257
 - defined, 247–248
 - see also* dependence thesis; list thesis
- list thesis, 248–250
 - statement of, 248
- Löw-Beer, Martin, 174
- MacIntyre, Alastair, 222n
- Mackie, J. L., 35n
- making sense of our lives, 183–187, 189–191
 - two aspects of, 185–187, 190–191
 - see also* action: making sense of; intelligibility; meaning of life
- Martin, Judith, 155n
- McDowell, John
 - and the bootstrapping problem, 40–42
 - on earning truth, 36–42
 - on ethical reasons, 36–39
 - on external reasons, 33–35, 45
 - and subjectivism, 45
- meaning of life, 149–151, 158–160, 162–163, 177–178, 185–191, 216–217
- moral/non-moral, distinction between, 20–21
 - see also* non-moral justification of morality
- moral alternatives problem
 - defined, 4–5
 - Gauthier's solution to, 57–65, 67–70, 73, 138–141

Cambridge University Press

0521780233 - Making Moral Sense: Beyond Habermas and Gauthier

Logi Gunnarsson

Index

[More information](#)*Index*

- Habermas' solution to, 98–99, 110–111
- and justice, 54–55, 68–69
- substantive approach's solution to, 164–165
- moral demands, enforcement of, *see*
 - substantive reasons: and the enforcement of moral demands
- moral discourse
 - the aim of, 88
 - justification of moral norms in, 93–95, 102
 - the participants in, 88, 90
 - real vs. hypothetical, 91–93, 95–96
 - rules of, 92–93, 102
 - and universalizable interests, 93n
- moral intuitions
 - and exploitation, 54–55
 - and rationalism, 8, 16–17, 44, 104–107
- moral norms, *see* Habermas, Jürgen: on the validity of moral norms; moral discourse: justification of moral norms in
- morality
 - contingency of, *see* contingency of morality
 - justificatory crisis of, 3–8, 29–32, 43–44, 166, 260–261
- motivation, 33n
- motivational set, subjective
 - and deliberation, *see* deliberation: subjectivist interpretation of explicated, 23–24
- negotiations, *see* bargain; renegotiations argument
- neutrality, *see* cross-cultural criticism: and neutrality; improvement: and neutrality
- non-moral justification of morality, 18–20
 - defined, 5
 - formal, 5–6, 49, 61–62
 - Gauthier's, *see* Gauthier's non-moral justification
 - Habermas', *see* Habermas' principle of universalization: derivation of the need for, 5–6, 31–32, 34–35, 45–46, 166, 224–225, 257–261
 - substantive, 49, 257–260
 - see also* inter-subjectivist rationalism; moral/non-moral, distinction between; rationalism; rationalistic ideal of justification; subjectivist rationalism
- non-tuists, 62
- Nozick, Robert, 13
- objection
 - agency, 77–81
 - manna from heaven, 81–82
 - metaphysical, *see* substantivism: metaphysical objection to
 - normativity, 73–75
 - separateness of persons, 82–85
 - taking advantage, 76–77
- obligation, moral, 169–170
- O'Neill, Onora, 232n
- Outsider, the, 173–183, 186–190
- overridingness, 4–5n, 11–12, 166, 168–169, 250–251
- particularism, moral, 250n, 251n
- particularist substantivism, 49–50
 - argument for, 252–257
 - explicated, 249–251
- paternalism, 212
- perspectives, taking up of, 89–90, 112–113
- practical reasons and philosophical method, *see* argumentative strategy of this work; substantive reasons: practical argument in favor of employing
- preference, 55–56
- presuppositions
 - pragmatic, 14–15
 - of rational discourse, 15–17, 86–87, 99–102, 262–265
- Prichard, H. A., 207n
- problem of priority, 165–166
 - defined, 4n
 - see also* overridingness
- proceduralism, 242
 - defined, 231
- progress, *see* improvement
- projectivism, 38n
- proviso, the Lockean, 64, 64n, 71, 75, 76–77
- Putnam, Hilary, 220
- rational desire theory, 232, 242
- rationalism, 6–7, 13–14, 18–20
 - the attraction of, 5–6, 8, 31, 34–35, 43–46, 130–131, 146–147
 - defined, 13
 - direct discourse-ethical, 198–200
 - indirect discourse-ethical, 198, 200–208
 - inter-subjectivist, *see* inter-subjectivist rationalism

Cambridge University Press

0521780233 - Making Moral Sense: Beyond Habermas and Gauthier

Logi Gunnarsson

Index

[More information](#)*Index*

- rationalism (*cont.*)
 subjectivist, *see* subjectivist rationalism
 weak vs. strong, 104–108
see also categorical force of morality; and rationalism; Gauthier's non-moral justification of morality; Habermas' non-moral justification of morality; Habermas' principle of universalization: criticism of derivation of; Habermas' principle of universalization: derivation of; moral intuitions: and rationalism
- rationalistic ideal of justification, 31–32, 46
 criticism of, 139–141, 157–159, 164–166, 197–212, 216–218, 224–225
- rationality
 formal, 18–20
 Gauthier's conception of, 9–12, 55–57, 180n
 Hobbesian vs. Kantian conception of, 6–7
 instrumental, 10–11
 and lists, *see* list-substantivism
 of persons, 33–34, 46
see also formalism; rationality of morality; reasoning; reasons
- rationality of morality, 31–32
 and evaluation of others, 4, 129–130, 215–218, 224–225
 and false self-assessment, 3–4, 129–130, 164–166
 the problem of, 4–5, 10–11, 16–17, 30, 201
see also basic choice problem; Gauthier, David: and the rationality of morality; Habermas, Jürgen: and the rationality of morality; moral alternatives problem; problem of priority
- Rawls, John, 7, 238n
 and the original position, 58–59, 91, 95–97
 and political theory, 223
see also contractarianism: Rawls'; Gauthier, David: and Rawls; Habermas, Jürgen: and Rawls; reflective equilibrium: and Rawls; Rorty: on Rawls
- reality, 35n
 absolute conception of, 42
 conceptually unmediated contact with, 39–40, 42
 independent of human sentiments, 37–39
- reason, communicative, 17–18
 reason-giving force of substantive considerations, 204–207, 253–257
- reasoning
 constrained instrumental vs. straightforward instrumental, 11–12
 strategic, 89
see also deliberation; rationality; reasons; utility maximization: constrained; utility maximization: direct
- reasons
 basic, 49, 248–249
 empirical, 41–42
 epistemically speaking vs. reasons one really has, 229–230, 243–246
 external, *see* external reasons
 internal, 23–29
 metaphysical, 190–191
 moral/ethical, 36–39, 41–42, 164–170
 practical, *see* practical reasons and philosophical method
 substantive, *see* substantive reasons
see also false self-assessment; justification; rationality; reasoning; self-assessment; value: instrumental; value: necessary instrumental
- reflective equilibrium, 7–8
 and coherence, 232, 234
 and considered judgments, 233–235, 237
 narrow, 233–234
 radical vs. conservative, 244n
 and Rawls, 58–59, 233, 234n
 wide, 233–235
- reflective equilibrium theory
 constitutive vs. evidential interpretation of, 238
 criticism of formal, 236–239, 242
 defined, 232
 and epistemic goals, 244–246, 251n
 formal, 235–236
 individualistic, 236–238
 social, 236, 239
 substantive, 235–236
- Rehg, William, 123–125
- relativism, moral
 and Habermas, 263–264
 and the substantive approach, 264
see also cross-cultural criticism; ethnocentrism
- relevance, invariable, 259–260
 and banality, 254–255, 256n

Cambridge University Press

0521780233 - Making Moral Sense: Beyond Habermas and Gauthier

Logi Gunnarsson

Index

[More information](#)*Index*

- defined, 249
- and humor, 253–256
- and pain, 249–251
- and pleasure, 253, 253n
- renegotiations argument
 - Gauthier's, 65–68
 - the pure utility maximizer's, 70–73, 75
- Rescher, Nicholas, 189n
- respect, 115, 117–118
- retardation, 82n, 200
- revision, 47, 146–147, 148, 171–172, 183, 187–189
 - see also* improvement
- rights, 112–113, 115, 118–119
- Rorty, Richard, 222n, 224n
 - on Rawls, 223
 - see also* cross-cultural criticism: Rorty on; cruelty: Rorty on; ethnocentrism; improvement: Rorty on; torture: Rorty on
- rudeness, 153–157, 164
- skeptic, moral, 16–20, 99–104, 116–119, 199–200, 265
 - and the categorical force of morality, 167–169
 - defined, 12–13
 - see also* Gauthier, David: and the moral skeptic; Habermas, Jürgen: and the moral skeptic
- science, *see* truth: scientific
- SD-discourse, 95–97, 122
- self, two-layer model of, 134, 142n
 - criticism of, 134–137
- self-assessment, 129–130, 132–138
 - see also* false self-assessment
- self-contradiction, pragmatic, 15
- self-understanding
 - assertive, 134–138, 140–141, 143
 - non-assertive, 133–134
- situation
 - current, *see* current situation
 - initial, *see* initial situation
- spot, blind, 194–195, 217–218
- stability, 66–67
- state of nature, *see* initial situation
- status quo, 68–69
- subjective reasons, 147–148
 - defined, 29
 - see also* subjectivism
- subjectivism, 21–22
 - criticism of, 131–132, 138–151, 158–159
 - defined, 27–28
 - and the justificatory crisis of morality, 29–30
 - subjectivist rationalism, 9–10, 17–20, 48
 - criticism of, 139–141, 157–159, 164–166, 187–188
 - see also* Gauthier's non-moral justification; subjectivism: criticism of
- substantive approach, 48
 - and Apel and Kuhlmann, 264–265
 - argument for, 47, 138–145, 158–159, 162–163, 171–172, 186–191, 197–212, 216–218
- defined, 20
- and Habermas, 264–265
- see also* categorical force of morality: and the substantive approach; contingency of morality; cross-cultural criticism: and the substantive approach; evaluation: substantive; substantive justification; substantive reasons; substantivism
- substantive concept
 - application of, 155, 155n
 - intrinsic appeal of, 154–155
 - justification of the use of, 154–159, 193, 204–208
- substantive justification
 - connective element of, 154–156, 193, 204–207
 - intrinsic element of, 154–157, 193, 204–208
 - and the problem of arbitrariness, 156–157
 - and the problem of controversy, 157–160
- substantive reasons, 21, 147, 152–157, 239–240
 - defined, 29
 - distortion of, 198–206, 259–261
 - and dogmatism, 212–213, 218n
 - and the enforcement of moral demands, 210–212
- practical argument in favor of
 - employing, 47, 147–151, 158–159, 162–163, 171–172, 177–178, 180–183, 186–191, 216–217, 239–242
 - see also* evaluation: substantive; exploitation: and substantive reasons; false self-assessment: and substantive reasons; particularist substantivism:

Cambridge University Press

0521780233 - Making Moral Sense: Beyond Habermas and Gauthier

Logi Gunnarsson

Index

[More information](#)*Index*

- substantive reasons (*cont.*)
 - argument for; reason-giving force of
 - substantive considerations; substantive justification
- substantivism, 20, 230–231
 - argument for, 47, 138–145, 147–151, 158–159, 162–163, 171–172, 177–178, 180–183, 186–191, 216–217, 239–242
 - defined, 29
 - foundationalist vs. non-foundationalist, 48–50
 - metaphysical objection to, 34–40
 - particularist, *see* particularist substantivism
 - see also* evaluation: substantive; list-substantivism; substantive justification; substantive reasons
- Taylor, Charles, 132n, 136n, 195n
 - see also* evaluation: strong; evaluation: weak; identity: Taylor's concept of; Taylor's impossibility thesis
- Taylor's impossibility thesis, 183–186
 - criticism of, 174–182
 - statement of, 173
- torture, 197–204, 209–212
 - Rorty on, 203
- transcendental-pragmatics, *see* justification: transcendental-pragmatic
- truth, 191
 - earning, 36–42
 - ethical, 41–42
 - scientific, 41–42
- unconditionality of morality, *see* categorical force of morality
- universal-pragmatics, *see* justification: universal-pragmatic
- utilitarianism, 94–95, 112–119, 123, 125
- utility maximization, 55–56
 - constrained, 65–67
 - direct, 66
 - see also* rationality: Gauthier's conception of; reasoning: constrained instrumental vs. straightforward instrumental
- utility maximizer
 - Gauthier's, 77–78
 - the pure, 71–73
- validity, universal, 98, 102, 105–106, 264–265
 - see also* cross-cultural criticism; Habermas, Jürgen: on the validity of legal norms; Habermas: on the validity of moral norms
- valuation, 35n
- value
 - Gauthier's conception of, 57
 - instrumental, 9–10
 - necessary instrumental, 9–12, 59–64
- Wallace, R. Jay, 33n, 150n, 191n, 204n
- WD-discourse, 94–97, 122
- Wiggins, David, 44n
- Williams, Bernard, 189n
 - on internal reasons, 23–28
 - and self-understanding, 141n, 142, 144–145