THE ECONOMICS OF FRANCHISING

This book describes in much detail both how and why franchising works. It also analyzes the economic tensions that contribute to conflict in the franchisor– franchisee relationship. The treatment includes a great deal of empirical evidence on franchising, its importance in various segments of the economy, the terms of franchise contracts, and what we know about how all of these have evolved over time, especially in the U.S. market. A good many myths are dispelled in the process. The economic analysis of the franchisor–franchisee relationship begins with the observation that for franchisors, franchising is a contractual alternative to vertical integration. Subsequently, the tensions that arise between a franchisor and its franchisees, who in fact are owners of independent businesses, are examined in turn. In particular, the authors discuss issues related to product quality control, tying arrangements, pricing, location and territories, advertising, and termination and renewals.

Roger D. Blair is Huber Hurst Professor in the Department of Economics at the University of Florida, where he has served on the faculty since 1970. He teaches courses in antitrust economics, law and economics, and the economics of sports. Professor Blair has published 165 articles, primarily in economics journals and law reviews, and has contributed numerous chapters to books. He has served as an antitrust consultant to the U.S. Department of Justice; the Federal Trade Commission; the attorneys general of Arizona, California, Florida, Missouri, Oregon, and Washington; and numerous corporations. The books he has coauthored include *Antitrust Economics, Law and Economics, and Fortical Integration and Control, Monopsony: Antitrust Law and Economics, and Integration Cambridge University Press, Intellectual Property: Economics and Legal Dimensions of Rights and Remedies, with Thomas F. Cotter.*

Francine Lafontaine is Professor of Business Economics and Public Policy at the Stephen M. Ross School of Business at the University of Michigan and Professor of Economics, Department of Economics, University of Michigan. Since joining the faculty at Michigan in 1991, Professor Lafontaine has primarily taught applied microeconomics to MBA students, along with elective courses on firm strategy and antitrust and on the economics of franchising. She has published numerous scholarly articles on franchising in top journals in her field, including the *Journal of Political Economy*, the *RAND Journal of Economics*, the *Journal of Law and Economics*, as well as in marketing and entrepreneurship journals. Professor Lafontaine is widely recognized as a world expert on the subject of franchising and, as such, has acted as consultant to various companies and Federal Trade Commission.

The Economics of Franchising

ROGER D. BLAIR

University of Florida

FRANCINE LAFONTAINE

University of Michigan



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521772524 - The Economics of Franchising Roger D. Blair and Francine Lafontaine Frontmatter More information

> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

> > Cambridge University Press 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521772525

© Roger D. Blair and Francine Lafontaine 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Blair, Roger D. The economics of franchising / Roger D. Blair, Francine Lafontaine. p. cm. Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0-521-77252-4 (alk. paper) 1. Franchises (Retail trade) I. Lafontaine, Francine. II. Title. HF5429.23.B53 2004 381'.13 – dc22 2004055147

> ISBN-13 978-0-521-77252-5 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-77252-4 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this book and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

> To my parents, Jacques and Thérèse, who would have been proud, and my family, Robert and Colette, for always being there for me.

To the memory of my parents, Duncan and Eleanor Blair, who gave me so much.

Contents

Preface			<i>page</i> xi
1	Introduction		
	1.1	What Is a Franchise?	3
	1.2	Traditional and Business-Format Franchising	5
	1.3	In Which Industries Do We Find Franchising?	8
	1.4	Plan of Study	18
2	Fou	20	
	2.1	Growth: Fact and Fancy	21
	2.2	,	34
	2.3	The Size Distribution of Franchised Chains	46
	2.4	Multi-Unit Franchisees	49
	2.5	Conclusion	52
3	Frai	54	
	3.1	Introduction	54
	3.2	Franchise Fees	56
	3.3	Royalty Rates	62
		Advertising Fees	69
	3.5	Non-Monetary Contract Clauses	78
	3.6	Some Final Thoughts and Comments	79
4	Frai	82	
	4.1	Introduction	82
	4.2	Dual Distribution or Partial Vertical Integration	
		in Franchising	83
	4.3		94
	4.4	-	107
	4.5	Conclusion	116

viii

Cambridge University Press 0521772524 - The Economics of Franchising Roger D. Blair and Francine Lafontaine Frontmatter More information

Contents

			117	
5	Quality Control			
	5.1	Introduction	117	
	5.2	A Simple Model of Vertical Externalities	121	
	5.3	Contractual Efforts to Resolve Incentive Problems	125	
	5.4	Costs of Control	133	
	5.5	Observed Quality Differentials between Company and		
		Franchised Units	135	
	5.6	Conclusion	137	
6	Fran	chise Tying Contracts	139	
	6.1	Introduction	139	
	6.2	Antitrust Treatment of Tying Contracts in General	142	
	6.3	Application to Franchise Tying Contracts	144	
	6.4	The Kodak Decision and Its Progeny	150	
	6.5	Franchise Tying Cases After Kodak	152	
	6.6	Identifying Market Power After Kodak	156	
	6.7	Post-Contractual Opportunism	164	
	6.8	Evaluating Franchise Opportunities	166	
	6.9		168	
	6.10	Appendix: Vertical Integration and Tying Contracts	168	
7	Verti	cal Price Controls in Franchising	174	
	7.1	Introduction	174	
	7.2	0 1 0		
		in the United States	177	
	7.3	An Economic Analysis of Maximum Resale Price Restraints	182	
	7.4	/ 1	196	
	7.5	Conclusion	197	
	7.6	Appendix: Sales-Based Royalties and Demand Externalities	198	
8	Encroachment			
	8.1		202	
	8.2	8	204	
	8.3	7 1	222	
	8.4		231	
	8.5		233	
	8.6	Appendix: Carvel Corporation's Contract: Before and After	234	
9	Adve	Advertising and Promotion		
	9.1	Introduction	236	
	9.2	A Simple Model of Advertising as Information	237	
	9.3	The Effect of Scale Economies	244	
	9.4	Advertising as a Public Good in Franchised Chains	246	

		Contents	ix
	9.5	Advertising in Franchised Chains in Practice	250
	9.6	Franchisor-Franchisee Conflict	253
	9.7	Conclusion	257
10	Term	ination and Non-Renewal	258
	10.1	Introduction	258
	10.2	Franchise Contract Duration, Termination, and Renewal:	
		A Look at the Data	259
	10.3	The Role of Duration, Termination, and Non-Renewal	
		in Theory	264
	10.4	Termination and Non-Renewal: Legal Considerations	275
	10.5	Assessing Damages for Wrongful Termination	280
	10.6	Conclusion	290
11	Concluding Remarks		291
	11.1	Introduction	291
	11.2	A Summary	293
	11.3	International Franchising	297
	11.4	The Future	298
	11.5	Conclusion	300
Art	ticles, E	Books, and Other Publications	303
Ca	ses, Co	des, and Statutes	321
Ind	lex		325

Preface

Franchising has become a very visible part of the economic landscape in the United States. Its role in distributing products to customers in the rest of the world has also grown considerably over the last several decades. In this book, we describe what franchising is and how it works. In most situations, franchising works very well for franchisors, franchisees, and consumers alike, which is why it has grown to the extent that it has. Because it works well most of the time, we expect that franchising will continue to flourish in the world economy. At the same time, however, we know from economic principles that franchise relationships are by their very nature fraught with many difficulties arising essentially from differences between the needs and goals of the franchisors and those of the franchisees. Economists and management researchers have made significant progress in the last twenty or so years toward increasing our understanding of the sources of these problems. We highlight much of their work in this book.

We had many goals in writing this book. First, from a managerial perspective, we hope that an improved understanding of the basic sources of friction in franchise relationships will allow franchisors and franchisees alike to develop better ways of dealing with each other's concerns, either through the franchise contract itself or through other means of their choosing. Second, from a public policy perspective, we hope that jurisdictions considering various forms of regulation and control of franchise relationships will be better able to assess the validity and merit of the claims made by interested parties, and thus the cost and benefit of various forms of intervention. In particular, we explore the not-so-obvious consequences of many types of public policies. Finally, from an academic perspective, we want to provide researchers with a clearer understanding of franchising as an institutional framework. By doing so, we hope to foster more interest in the study of franchising itself and of contracts and organizations more generally.

xii

Preface

For past and continuing collaboration, we thank our colleagues, Sugato Bhattacharyya, Amanda K. Esquibel, James Fesmire, Jill Boylston Herndon, Arturs Kalnins, David L. Kaserman, Patrick J. Kaufmann, Scott E. Masten, Emmanuel Raynaud, Richard E. Romano, Kathryn L. Shaw, and Margaret E. Slade. We also thank Robert Picard for his expert data management and assistance throughout this project. We are also grateful to Anne Parmigiani for her careful proofing of the manuscript and to Colette Picard for proofing the tables. Our editor at Cambridge University Press, Scott Parris, also deserves a special thanks for his patience and continuing encouragement. Finally, we are grateful to the National Science Foundation (NSF), under grant SBR-9312083, and our respective institutions for their support.