

### Religious Minorities in Iran

Eliz Sanasarian's book explores the political and ideological relationship between non-Muslim religious minorities in Iran and the state during the formative years of the Islamic Republic to the present day. Her analysis is based on a detailed examination of the history and experiences of the Armenians, Assyrians, Chaldeans, Jews, Zoroastrians, Bahais, and Iranian Christian converts, and describes how these communities have responded to state policies regarding minorities. Many of her findings are derived from personal interviews with members of these communities as well as careful analysis of primary documents. While the book is essentially an empirical study, it also highlights more general questions associated with exclusion and marginalization and the role of the state in defining these boundaries. This is an important and original book which will make a significant contribution to the literature on minorities.

Eliz Sanasarian is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Southern California. Her previous publications include The Women's Rights Movement in Iran: Mutiny, Appeasement, and Repression from 1900 to Khomeini (1982).



Cambridge Middle East Studies 13

Editorial Board
Charles Tripp (general editor)
Israel Gershoni Roger Owen Yezid Sayigh

Cambridge Middle East Studies has been established to publish books on the nineteenth- and twentieth-century Middle East and North Africa. The aim of the series is to provide new and original interpretations of aspects of Middle Eastern societies and their histories. To achieve disciplinary diversity, books will be solicited from authors writing in a wide range of fields including history, sociology, anthropology, political science and political economy. The emphasis will be on producing books offering an original approach along theoretical and empirical lines. The series is intended for students and academics, but the more accessible and wide-ranging studies will also appeal to the interested general reader.

A list of books in the series can be found after the index.



# Religious Minorities in Iran

Eliz Sanasarian

University of Southern California





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Eliz Sanasarian 2000

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000 Reprinted 2002

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeset in Plantin 10/12 pt in QuarkXPress<sup>TM</sup> [SE]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Sanasarian, Eliz.

Religious minorities in Iran / Eliz Sanasarian. p. cm. – (Cambridge Middle East studies 13) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0 521 77073 4 (hb)

- 1. Religious minorities Iran. 2. Religion and state Iran.
- 3. Religious tolerance Iran. 4. Iran Politics and government 1979–1997. 5. Religion Iran. I. Title. II. Series. BL2270S26 2000 305.6′0955–dc21 99-32293 CIP

ISBN 0521770734 hardback



Dedicated to my students



It is not good to feel that one's own religion alone is true and all others are false. God is one only, and not two. Different people call on Him by different names: some as Allah, some as God, and others as Krishna, Siva, and Brahman . . . Opinions are but paths. Each religion is only a path leading to God, as rivers come from different directions and ultimately become one in the one ocean.

Sri Ramakrishna, The Gospel of Sri Ramakrishna, 8th edn. (1992), pp. 264-65.



### Contents

Ll	st of wustrations	page 1x	
Li	ist of tables	X	
Pr	xi		
A	Acknowledgments		
Notes on transliteration and bibliography		xvii	
_	Glossary		
U,	ussury	xviii	
In	troduction: an overview of politics and society	1	
	Defining groups	1	
	Conceptualizing this study	3	
	Iran: an introduction	8	
	A brief survey of Iranian politics	14	
	The Islamic Republic	17	
	Islam and Ahl al-Ketab	19	
	Regime ideologues: the core mentalité	24	
	Research on non-Muslim religious minorities	30	
1	Ethnic anatomy and politics of non-Muslim minorities	34	
	The Armenians	34	
	The Assyrians and Chaldeans	40	
	Missionary activities	43	
	The Jews	44	
	The Zoroastrians	48	
	The Bahais	50	
	Comparative dynamics	54	
2	The Assembly of Experts: debut in the year of destiny	58	
	Interactions between the non-Muslim and Muslim deputies	64	
	Conclusion	71	
3	Policy sphere of recognized religious minorities	73	
_	Religion	74	
	Education	74 76	
	Communal life	84	
	Communa me	04	



viii	Contents	
	The first and the second Majlis: 1980–88	93
	Two distinguishing features	100
4	Distinctions and designations as policy output	106
	The severity of treatment of the Jews	110
	The persecution of Bahais	114
	The troubled path of nonethnic Christian groups	123
	Particularities as the end product	127
	Limitations and the legal domain	129
5	Prevalent responses of recognized religious minorities	136
	Similar responses	136
	Responses unique to each group	147
	The meaning of the response	152
Co	Conclusion: the perils of marginality	
	The perils	161
No	tes	164
Bibliography		209 225
ına	Index	



### Illustrations

1,2	Demonstration by Iranian Jews on the occasion of the page	102
	Israeli air raids in Lebanon, Tehran, 1980 (Rahmat	
	Rahimian).	
3	National Spiritual Assembly of the Bahais of Iran, 1981. The	117
	photograph shows the entire membership of the 1980 National	
	Assembly (arrested and disappeared in 1980 and presumed	
	dead), six members of the 1981 National Assembly (nine were	
	elected and eight of them were arrested and secretly executed	
	on 27 December 1981), and several other Bahais (National	
	Spiritual Assembly of the Bahais of the United States).	
4,5	Destruction of the House of Bab in Shiraz. One of the most	118
	holy sites in the Bahai world, it was destroyed by Revolutionary	
	Guards in 1979 and razed by the government in May 1981	
	(National Spiritual Assembly of the Bahais of the United	
	States).	
6	Tateos Mikaelian, senior pastor of St. John's Armenian	126
	Evangelical Church in Tehran and president of the Council	
	of Evangelical Ministers, assassinated in 1994.	
7,8	Religious leadership of recognized religious minorities, their	141
	Majlis deputies, and community members in celebrations	
	marking the establishment of the Islamic Republic, Roodaki	
	Auditorium, Tehran, 1981 and 1982 (Rahmat Rahimian).	
9	Armenian demonstrations commemorating the 24 April 1915	149
	genocide of the Armenians by the Ottoman Turkish	
	government in Tehran, 1992.	



### **Tables**

1	Distinguishing features of Muslim ethnic groups	page 10
2	Ethnic anatomy of non-Muslim minorities	36
3	Recognized religious minority (RRM) representatives in the first	st 96
	Majlis, 1980–84	
4	Recognized religious minority (RRM) representatives in the	97
	second Majlis, 1984–88	

X



### Preface

The genesis of this book goes back to an incident at the University of California, Berkeley, in April 1986. I was lecturing on women's political participation in the Islamic Republic of Iran at the Center for Middle Eastern Studies when I noticed a young woman who was leaning against the door listening with great intensity. In the audience were three women in their fifties who were whispering uninterruptedly and were clearly disturbed by something. During the question-and-answer period, one of them expressed her displeasure with me. My comments had appeared to her as a defense of the Islamic government; she severely criticized the clerical regime and Ayatollah Khomeini. Seeing her difficulty in communicating in English, I asked her to speak in Persian; she refused. She was determined to prove to the audience that I was a backer of the Islamic forces in Iran. Her strong pro-monarchical sentiments were not lost on anyone; in those days facing this kind of misreading of one's talk was a common occurrence. I would have forgotten the incident except for what happened next.

When the lecture was over, the young woman who had been leaning against the door approached me. "Do you remember me?," she asked. I did not. "We entered Pahlavi [Shiraz] University together. We were classmates. Even then you were always with the Muslims. You never learn." I was intrigued. Later, surrounded by Iranian students, most with some leftist affiliation, we sat for coffee. Her anger burst out: "I read your book [referring to my first book on Iranian women]. What is this attraction you feel for these prejudiced people? Why should you as an Armenian write about them? Haven't they harmed and offended us enough?" Bewildered, I asked if she was an Armenian. "I am an Assyrian. For them, all of us are the same. We are those dirty Christians. I left Iran a long time ago determined to have no communication with Iranians. Then, today, I came to hear you, thinking perhaps things have changed. Maybe now that so many of the expatriates have experienced oppression at the hands of fundamentalists their biases have disappeared. Maybe those who have fled Khomeini are more civilized. But I was wrong; they will never change.

хi



#### xii Preface

Never. Did you know what the three women said after your talk? They said it was all the fault of the good shah. He was so kind-hearted that he spoiled [rudad] our religious minorities. These Armenians, Jews, Zoroastrians, and Bahais conspired against him; they brought Khomeini to power. They destroyed our nation, and this one [referring to me] is a Khomeini agent. You see; they never change. Why aren't you as disgusted as I am?"

The brash young leftist idealists sitting around us were silent. I do not recall my response, but I do recall the feeling that she was not listening. I never saw or heard from her again but her words consumed me with curiosity. The ludicrous notion she attributed to the other women, that religious minorities were responsible for overthrowing the shah's regime and the founding of a Shii Muslim clerical-led state, raised many questions in my mind, eventually leading to the present work.

This book attempts to answer two questions: (1) what has been the overall policy of the theocratic Islamic state toward its non-Muslim religious minorities? And (2), how have the minorities dealt with state intrusion into their lives? Although there are small numbers of Hindus, Sikhs, Sabeans, and others in Iran, the focus of this investigation is on major non-Muslim religious minorities: Armenians, Assyrians, Chaldeans, Jews, Zoroastrians, Bahais, and Iranian Christian converts. Specifically, this study identifies the main ethnoreligious components, the history of official policy, possible variance in theocratic state policies, and the response of minorities.

The conceptual focus of the study is on the first decade of the Islamic Republic (1979–89); however, events and developments pertaining to 1989–98 are covered either in chapters or in the conclusion. The study focuses on 1979–89 for three main reasons: (1) state definition of Islamic ideology is the strongest during this time period and becomes more differentiated and obscured after Ayatollah Khomeini's death in 1989; (2) with some exceptions the legal, social, and political position of recognized non-Muslim minorities after going through a major upheaval in the early 1980s is routinized by the mid- to late 1980s; and (3) the fall of communism and the formation of post-Soviet states introduce new nuances which, along with domestic strife, further complicate the political scene. Of course, several developments in the 1990s are covered but only when they directly relate to the main points of the text.

It would have been easier but intellectually less challenging to focus only on one community and trace their trials and tribulations in greater detail. The designation "non-Muslim" had a special place in the belief structure of the Shii revolutionary ideologues, and no single community could shed light on the intensity and variance of the meaning and practice



Preface xiii

of state ideology. In addition, important differences in culture and history of the non-Muslim communities colored their varying reactions to state intrusion.

This study utilizes a variety of sources including personal interviews, primary sources, and documents obtained during a field trip to Iran in 1992, theological writings of religious leaders and various publications in Iran dealing with non-Muslim minority rights, thousands of pages of documents published by the government such as the proceedings of the Assembly of Experts and the Majlis, published interviews with leaders of religious minorities and Islamic authorities, and a myriad of media accounts of events verified in personal interviews by members and leaders of the non-Muslim communities. Periodicals published by non-Muslim minorities have also been used, albeit with caution, such as Alik (Wave) in Armenian, and Cheesta (Knowledge and Awareness) published by a Zoroastrian press in Persian. These publications have tried to introduce their communities' religion, tradition, and culture. They are message-givers to their communities and to the state, and also reflect the agenda preferences of editors or groups within religious minorities whom they represent.

The book first presents an overview of Iranian society and politics, explains the conceptual framework, and discusses the religious ideologues' views of non-Muslims. Chapter 1 introduces each main non-Muslim religious minority and explores the group's historical, social, and political segmentation from Muslim ethnic groups. Chapter 2 focuses on the drafting of the Islamic constitution and discussions held in the Assembly of Experts (Majlis-e Khebregan) in 1979. Accommodative and critical positions taken by deputies on the status of the non-Muslim population and the significance of the final outcome is analyzed. By focusing on four arenas of state-minority interaction - religion, education, communal life, and political representation – chapter 3 identifies several state policies vis-à-vis the Armenians, the Assyrians/Chaldeans, the Jews, and the Zoroastrians. Chapter 4 uses a psychological framework of ethnic conflict in order to explain the severity of the treatment of the Jews, the persecution of the Bahais, and the troubled Iranian converts to Christianity. Chapter 5 addresses minority responses to local governments and state policies. It distinguishes between similar and dissimilar responses, demonstrating that, in changing circumstances, marginal groups continue to act within the framework of a learned cultural tradition. In conclusion, this study takes on a larger issue: what are the perils of marginality in the Islamic Republic, and what is a fair assessment of marginality for an individual and a collectivity?



### Acknowledgments

Completion of this book has been a lonely and painstaking process. The acute sensitivity of the subject, lack of sufficient resources, hesitancy and fear of the religious minorities, misinformation and false rumors emanating from Iranian officials and their opponents, my own personal affection for the religion of Islam (as distinct from outrageous acts which have been committed in its name throughout history), and a conscious effort to be fair to the country in which I was born contributed to a cautious and slow evolution of this work. Under these circumstances any assistance (major or minor) was deeply appreciated.

First, I would like to extend my gratitude to the countless members of religious minorities inside and outside Iran who confided in me, answered my questions, and provided me with documents and evidence. They cover a wide range of people and professions, from the poor wandering Bahai farmer who had lost all yet adamantly clung to his holy book, to children who recalled their experiences, to those leaders and community activists who welcomed me. All have asked to remain anonymous.

I am deeply grateful to Ervand Abrahamian, Shahrough Akhavi, and Houchang Chehabi for reading this manuscript in its entirety and offering helpful comments for improvement. Special thanks to Shahrough Akhavi for his meticulous conceptual and editorial work on this book. Thanks also to Lois Beck who read two chapters of the first draft. I appreciate the work of the anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press whose comments markedly enhanced the quality of the work. Marigold Acland, the Middle East Studies editor, deserves credit for patiently guiding this manuscript to its final destination. I would also like to thank Karen Anderson Howes for her inestimable help in editing this manuscript; her painstaking precision and care gave the book a new life.

I have benefited from the ideas and advice of the following people: Janet Afary, Aida Avanessian, George A. Bournoutian, Cosroe Chaqueri, Shirin Ebadi, Archbishop Yohannan Issayi, Edward Joseph, Mehrangiz

xiv



#### Acknowledgments

XV

Kar, Firuz Kazemzadeh, Farhang Mehr, David Menashri, Eden Naby, Fariar Nikbakht, Floreeda Safiri, Nadera Shalhoub, and Sorour Soroudi. To all goes my whole-hearted gratitude. Of course, the perspectives and points of view expressed in this book are entirely my own.

Many individuals and institutions have aided my research: the National Spiritual Assembly of the Bahais of the United States; Iranian Christians International, Inc.; the California Zoroastrian Center; the Zoryan Institute for Contemporary Armenian Research and Documentation; Harvard University's Widener Library Middle East Collection, especially the librarians John Emerson, Alice Chucri Deyab, and their wonderful staff; Habib Ladjevardi for the use of the Iranian Oral History Collection; David Hirsch, Middle East bibliographer at the University of California, Los Angeles; and Janice Wood Hanks of the Von Kleinsmid Library at the University of Southern California (USC).

My research was funded by a small grant from USC's Faculty Research and Innovation Fund for 1988–89. I am indebted to former dean William Spitzer for his strong support and to former dean C. Sylvester Whitaker whose encouragement persuaded me not to give up on this project. Thanks to Michael Preston, a previous chair of my department, for granting me two administrative leaves to continue my work uninterrupted.

Most of the research on primary sources was undertaken as a visiting scholar at Harvard University Center for Middle Eastern Studies. The Ethnic Politics seminar organized by Karl W. Deutsch and Dov Ronen helped develop my ideas and the core framework for the book. My thanks to both of them, particularly Dov Ronen who offered me many fantastic ideas.

Although the bulk of the typing and technical work is my own, Jody Battles's typing of tables was invaluable. My students have been my true comrades-in-arms: Talin Der-Grigorian, Taline Ekmekjian, Andrea Kannike, Corinna Polk, Mikhael Reider, and Suren Stepanyan. I am deeply grateful for Avi Davidi's diligent and meticulous assistance and his dedication to this book; he was a godsend. My husband Sheldon Kamieniecki has read countless drafts of this book; I am indebted to his affectionate support. My sister Mary lovingly shared my trepidations on a daily basis and made this project her own. No words have yet been invented to express my indebtedness to the Yoga Center of California for teaching me that life flows from the innermost recesses of our soul. Without this knowledge I would have not survived the intense pretentiousness, lack of principles, petty competition, and extreme hypocrisy permeating academic life.

During my visit to Iran in 1992, no one impressed me more than



#### xvi Acknowledgments

Reverend Tateos Mikaelian. Courageously and openly he shared information with me, and I was convinced then that I had been on the right track all along. In the conclusion of our last meeting I invited him to visit me in United States; with a smile he replied: "I shall never leave this place." He was assassinated in 1994. Reverend, you live in my heart and this is for you.



# Notes on transliteration and bibliography

All Persian, Armenian, and Arabic words have been translated parenthetically in the text. The transliteration adopted for Persian and Armenian words follows a simple system. All diacritical marks with a few exceptions have been omitted. The exceptions apply to quotations and published sources. After consultation of more than a dozen published works, it was clear that no unified system of transliteration for Persian words exists. Since this is a work in social sciences, therefore, every effort has been made to keep the transliteration clear and concise by preserving uniformity, applying the Persian pronunciation of words as often as possible, and maintaining the common usage of words. Discrepancies in transliteration may appear in cases such as the usage q or gh (q has been the norm here), or Abd-al-Baha instead of Abdol Baha, the version used for most such names. Translations are my own unless otherwise indicated.

The bibliography, as is customary, contains every work cited in the notes. However, since the articles from print and broadcast media sources are numerous and are fully cited in the notes, only a listing of the sources themselves appears in the bibliography.

xvii



# Glossary

Ahl al-Dhimma Protected People in Islamic communities

Ahl al-Ketab People of the Book, referring to Jews, Christians,

and Zoroastrians (in Iran)

ajam non-Arab people

Dar al-Harb the territory controlled by the non-Muslims

where non-Islamic laws govern

Dar al-Islam the territory where Muslim authorities are in

charge and enforce Islamic laws

Ershad guidance, direction; in this book, it refers to the

Vezarat-e Farhang va Ershad-e Islami (the Ministry of Culture and Islamic Guidance)

faqih an expert in fiqh, jurisprudent

fergeh sect

fiqh Islamic jurisprudence

hadith tradition, a saying attributed to the Prophet

Mohammad

haram religiously prohibited hejab Islamic headcover

jazieh special tax paid by the non-Muslims to Muslim

rulers

kafir infidel, nonbeliever, non-Muslim

Majlis Assembly or parliament; full form: Majlis-e

Shoraye Islami, the Islamic Consultative

Assembly

Majlis-e Khebregan Assembly of Experts

Marja-e Taqlid the highest rank among the Shii clergy, the

Source of Emulation

millet religious administration of the Ottoman Empire

designed for the non-Muslim ethnoreligious communities giving them autonomy in religious affairs, certain administrative matters, and the judicial arena; this system predates Islam, but was

xviii



Glossary xix

given a religious coloring with the advent of Islam and the Ottomans designed it as an

administrative model

najess impure, unclean

nejasat being impure, impurity Pasdaran Revolutionary Guards

qesas retribution, law of retaliation, revenge for

homicide

shariah religious law of Islam

ulama plural of alim, the learned men (clergy) of

religious law of Islam

Velayat-e Faqih "the government belongs to those who know

Islamic jurisprudence," the rule of the supreme

jurist or top theologian