

## THE APPLICATION OF THE PRECAUTIONARY PRINCIPLE IN PRACTICE

This overview of the role played by the precautionary principle in international trade law, European law and national law compares how precautionary considerations have been applied in the fields of pesticide regulation and the regulation of base stations for mobile telephones in Sweden, the UK and the USA. A number of problems in the current application of the precautionary principle are identified and discussed. For example, it is shown that a firm reliance on a wide and open-ended precautionary principle may lead to problems with the consistency, fore-seeablility, effectiveness and efficiency of measures intended to reduce environmental or health risks. It is suggested that the precautionary principle indeed may be an important tool but in order to be acceptable it must be coupled with strong requirements on the performance of risk assessments, cost–benefit analyses and risk trade-off analyses.

JOAKIM ZANDER is currently responsible for the free movement of goods and services at the European Free Trade Association (EFTA) Surveillance Authority in Brussels. He has previously worked as a legal officer in DG Enterprise of the European Commission and as a political assistant in the European Parliament. He holds a PhD in Law from Maastricht University, the Netherlands, and a Master of Laws Degree (juris kandidat) from Uppsala University, Sweden.



# THE APPLICATION OF THE PRECAUTIONARY PRINCIPLE IN PRACTICE

**Comparative Dimensions** 

JOAKIM ZANDER





#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521768535

© Joakim Zander 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data Zander, Joakim.

The application of the precautionary principle in practice : comparative dimensions / Joakim Zander.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-0-521-76853-5

1. Police power. 2. Precautionary principle. 3. Risk. I. Title.  $K3289.Z36\ 2010$  344.04'6-dc22

2010021887

ISBN 978-0-521-76853-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Liisa and Milla



#### CONTENTS

Acknowledgements page x **Abbreviations** xii *Table of Cases* xvInternational Court of Justice and other International Tribunals XV WTO Appellate Body Reports WTO Panel Reports European Union xvi United Kingdom xvii xviii United States of America Sweden XX Table of Legislation xxi Other sources xxi EU Legislation and Soft Law xxiii Treaties xxiii Regulations xxiii Directives xxiii Decisions xxiv Communications of the Commission Other Swedish Legislation, preparatory work, etc. xxvi Legislative Acts xxvi Decrees xxvi Preparatory Works xxvi Other xxvii United Kingdom xxviii Legislative Acts xxviii Regulations and Orders xxviii Other xxviii *United States of America* XXX Legislative Acts XXX

vii



viii

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-0-521-76853-5 — The Application of the Precautionary Principle in Practice Joakim Zander Frontmatter More Information

	CONTENTS			
	Executive Orders xxx			
	Other xxx			
1	Introduction 1			
2	Risk and uncertainty: basic concepts and tools for the			
	application of the precautionary principle 8			
	2.1 Introduction 8			
	2.2 Fundamental concepts 9			
	2.3 Striking a balance in risk regulation 17			
	2.4 Attempts at defining the precautionary principle 26			
	2.5 Conclusion 31			
3	The precautionary principle in international law 33			
	3.1 Introduction 33			
	3.2 International environmental law 34			
	3.3 WTO law 39			
	3.4 Conclusion 72			
4	4 The precautionary principle in EU law 76			
	4.1 Introduction 76			
	4.2 Treaties, legislation and soft law 78			
	4.3 EU case law 103			
	4.4 Conclusions 148			
5	The precautionary principle in Sweden 152			
	5.1 The development and status of the precautionary principle in			
	Sweden 152			
	5.2 Swedish pesticide regulation 176			
	5.3 Swedish regulation of base stations 198			
6	The precautionary principle in the United Kingdom			
	6.1 The development and status of the precautionary principle in the			
	United Kingdom 215			
	6.2 UK pesticides regulation 233			
	6.3 UK regulation of base stations 250			
7	The precautionary principle in the United States 267			
	7.1 The development and status of the precautionary principle in the			
	United States 267			
	7.2 US pesticides regulation 296			
	7.3 US regulation of base stations 309			



CONTENTS ix

8	Conclusions		327
	8 1	International	law

8.2 EU law 330

8.3 The national legal systems 332

8.4 The different types of the precautionary principle 344

328

8.5 Which way forward? 346

Bibliography 349 Index 366



#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book has been long in the making and it would never have been completed, had I not enjoyed the company and assistance of a large number of people. Consequently, I would like to extend my gratitude to the entire Faculty of Law at Maastricht University, and all its members, for allowing me to carry out the research upon which this book is based and teach at the Faculty between 2003 and 2007. In particular, I would like to thank Professor Ellen Vos for providing supervision of the PhD thesis that formed the basis for this book. Furthermore, I would like to thank my colleagues at the Faculty for their friendship, endless hours of discussion, coffee, hot cocoa and ping-pong. In particular, I would like to mention the study group on risk and regulation, which supplied ample opportunity for the exploration of all angles of the field of risk regulation. Special thanks go to two students at Maastricht University; Anna Fink and Alain Lambert who provided excellent assistance with editing and translation. I would also like to thank Chris Engert in Florence, Italy, for carrying out the language editing of the book.

I would furthermore like to thank Professor Cass Sunstein, then at Chicago Law School, now Administrator of the Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs at the White House, and Professor Ragnar Löfstedt at King's Centre for Risk Management, King's College, London, for receiving me as a visiting researcher and taking the time to discuss the precautionary principle. In this context, I would like to thank The Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO) for making this possible by granting me the funds to spend time at Chicago Law School in the autumn of 2005.

I am also grateful for valuable comments provided by members of the PhD assessment committee appointed by Maastricht University and two anonymous reviewers. Obviously, every mistake, omission or blatant misunderstanding in the following pages is mine alone.

On the very eve of the completion of this book, the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union finally entered into force on 1



#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

хi

December 2009. Although it did not bring about any substantive changes with regard to the subject matter of this book, it did introduce that greatest of joys for any European lawyer: a change in the numbering of the treaty articles. Throughout this book I have thus sought to refer to the current numbering of the articles as they appear in the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union. Where I have considered it relevant for the understanding of the text, I have kept the old numbering in brackets following the current reference.

Finally, and above and beyond everything else, I would like to thank my wife, Liisa, for putting up with me during the years I have been working on this book. I think that we can both agree that it is not at a moment too soon that this particular train has reached its final destination.



#### ABBREVIATIONS

AB Appellate Body

ACP Advisory Committee on Pesticides

AGNIR Advisory Group on Non-Ionising Radiation
AIDS Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome

ALARA as low as reasonably possible

ANSI American National Standards Institute
AOEL acceptable operator exposure level
APA Administrative Procedure Act in the USA
BSE Bovine spongiform encephalopathy

BST Bovine Somatotrophin

CAP Common Agrigultural Policy

CBA cost-benefit analysis
CEA cost-effectiveness analysis
CFC chlorofluorocarbons
CFI Court of First Instance

CITES Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species

COM Committee on Mutagenicity of Chemicals in Food, Consumer Products

and the Environment (UK)

COPR Control of Pesticides Regulations

CRA comparative risk analysis

CVMP Committee for Veterinary Medicinal Products

DDT dichloro-diphenyl-trichloroethane

 $DecaBDE \qquad decabromodiphenyl\ ether$ 

DEFRA Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs in the UK

DNA deoxyribonucleic acid

DSB Dispute Settlement Body of the WTO
DSU Dispute Settlement Understanding (WTO)
EAP Environmental Action Programme

EBCD ethylenebisdithiocarbamate
EC European Community
ECJ European Court of Justice

EEC European Economic Community
EFTA European Free Trade Association

xii



ABBREVIATIONS XIII

EOP Executive Office of the President of the USA
EPA United States Environmental Protection Agency

EU European Union

FACA Federal Advisory Committee Act in the USA

FAQ frequently asked questions

FCC Federal Communications Commission
FDA Food and Drug Administration in the USA
FDCA Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act in the USA
FEPA Food and Environment Protection Act

FIFRA Federal Insecticide, Fungicide and Rodenticide Act in the USA

FQPA Food Quality Protection Act in the USA

GAO United States Government Accountability Office

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

GM genetically modified

GMO genetically modified organisms HCFCs hydrochlorofluorocarbons

HEW United States Department of Health, Education, and Welfare

HPA Health Protection Agency

HSE Health and Safety Executive in the UK

ICJ International Court of Justice

ICNIRP International Commission for Non-Ionising Radiation Protection IEEE Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers in the USA IEGMP Independent Expert Group on Mobile Phones in the UK ILGRA Interdepartmental Liaison Group on Risk Assessment

ITLOS International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

KemI Kemikalieinspektionen (Swedish Chemicals Agency)

LPAs Local Planning Authorities in the UK Miljöbalken The Swedish Environmental Code

MOX metal oxide

MRL maximum residue level

NCRP National Council on Radiation Protection and Measurement

NEPA National Environmental Policy Act in the USA

NIOSH National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health in the USA

nimby not in my back yard

NJA Nytt Juridiskt Arkiv (Publication containing judgments from the

Swedish Supreme Court)

NRPB National Radiation Protection Board in the UK
OET Office of Engineering and Technology in the USA
OIRA Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs in the USA

OMB Office of Management and Budget in the USA

OSHA Occupational Safety and Health Administration in the USA

PAN Pesticide Action Network



xiv ABBREVIATIONS

PBDE polybrominated diphenyl ethers

PBL Plan- och bygglagen (Swedish Planning and Building Act)
PIC Rotterdam Convention for Prior Informed Consent

PPPR Plant Protection Products Regulation
PSD United States Pesticide Safety Directorate

PVC polyvinyl chloride

QUALYs Quality Adjusted Life Years

RCHSA Radiation Control for Health and Safety Act in the USA REACH Registration, Evaluation, Authorisation and Restriction of

Chemicals

Regeringsformen The Swedish Constitution

Regeringsrätten Swedish Supreme Administrative Court

RIA Regulatory Impact Assessments

RoHS Restriction of Hazardous Substances Directive

SAP Scientific Advisory Panel in the USA

SAR specific absorbtion rate

SCAN Scientific Committee on Animal Nutrition

SEA The Single European Act

SPS WTO Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and

Phytosanitary Measures

SSI Statens Strålskyddsinstitut (formerly named Swedish

National Radiation Protection Authority)

SSL Strålskyddslagen (Swedish Radiation Protection Act)
SSM Statens Strålsäkerhetsmyndighet (Swedish Radiation Safety

Authority)

statliga myndigheter Swedish system of independent governmental authorities

TBT Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade

TETRA terrestrial trunked radio

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

UK United Kingdom

UNCLOS United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea

US United States (of America)
USA United States of America
WTA willingness to accept
WTO World Trade Organisation

WTP willingness to pay



#### TABLE OF CASES

#### International Court of Justice and other International Tribunals

Gabcikovo-Nagymaros Project (Hungry/Slovakia), Judgment, ICJ Reports 1997.

Request for an Examination of the Situation in Accordance with Paragraph 63 of the

Court's Judgement of 20 December 1974 in the Nuclear Tests (New Zealand v. France),

ICJ Reports 1995 (French Nuclear Tests II).

The MOX Plant Case (Ireland v. UK), (Provisional measures), (ITLOS), Order of 3 December 2001.

Southern Bluefin Tuna Cases (New Zealand v. Japan; Australia v. Japan (Joined Cases)), ITLOS, Order of August 27 1999.

#### World Trade Organisation (WTO) Appellate Body Reports

- Report of the Appellate Body, US Continued Suspension of Obligations in the EC-Hormones Dispute, WT/DS320/AB/R (*EC-Hormones II*).
- Report of the Appellate Body. Japan Measures Affecting Agricultural Products. WT/ DS76/AB/R (*Japan Agricultural Products II*).
- Report of the Appellate Body. Japan Measures Affecting the Importation of Apples. WT/DS245/AB/R (*Japan-Apples*).
- Report of the Appellate Body, EC Sardines. Appellate Body Report, European Communities Trade Description of Sardines, WT/DS231/AB/R (*EC-Sardines*).
- Report of the Appellate Body, Australia Measures Affecting the Importation of Salmon WT/DS18/AB/R (*Australia-Salmon*).
- Report of the Appellate Body, European Communities Measures Affecting Asbestos and Asbestos-Containing Products. WT/DS135/AB/R (EC-Asbestos).
- Report of the Appellate Body. United States Measure Affecting Imports of Woven Wool Shirts and Blouses From India. WT/DS33/AB/R (*US-Wool Shirts and Blouses*)
- Report of the Appellate Body, EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products WT/ DS26/AB/R (*EC-Hormones I*).



xvi

#### TABLE OF CASES

#### **WTO Panel Reports**

Panel Report, European Communities - Measures Affecting the Approval and Marketing of Biotech Products, WT/DS291/R, WT/DS292/R WT/DS293/R (EC-Approval and Marketing of Biotech Products).

Panel Report, EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones) (US) WT/DS26/R (*EC-Hormones I (US)*).

Panel Report, EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones) (Canada), WT/DS48/R (*EC-Hormones I (Canada*)).

Panel Report, European Communities - Measures Affecting the Approval and Marketing of Biotech Products, WT/DS291/R, WT/DS292/R WT/DS293/R (*EC-Biotech Products*).

Panel Report, Japan – Measures Affecting the Importation of Apples, WT/DS245/R (*Japan-Apples*).

Panel Report, US-Continued Suspension of Obligations in the EC Hormones Dispute, WT/DS320/R (*Continued Suspension of Obligations-EC Hormones (EC-Hormones II*)).

#### **European Union**

#### European Court of Justice (ECJ)

Case 120/78 Rewe v. Bundesmonopolverwaltung ('Cassis de Dijon') [1979] ECR 649.

Case 174/82 Sandoz BV [1983] ECR 2445.

Case 227/82 Van Bennekom [1983] ECR 3883.

Case 94/83 Heijn [1984] ECR 3263.

Case 97/83 Melkunie [1984] ECR 2367.

Case 240/83 Waste Oils [1985] ECR 531.

Case 54/85 Mirepoix [1986] ECR 1067.

Case 178/84 Commission v. Germany (Reinhieitsgebot) [1987] ECR 1227.

Case 331/88 Fedesa and others [1990] ECR I-4023.

Case C-405/92 Etablissement Armand Mondiet SA v. Amement Ijslais SARL [1993] I-6133.

Case C-320/93 Ortscheit [1994] ECR I-5243.

Case C-157/94 Commission v. Netherlands [1997] ECR I-5699.

Cases C-157/96 The Queen v. Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, ex parte National Farmers' Union et al. [1998] ECR I-2211.

Case C-180/96 United Kingdom v. Commission [1998] ECR I-2265 (BSE).

Case C-341/95 Gianni Bettati v. Safety Hi-Tech [1998] ECR I-4335.

Case C-120/97 Upjohn [1999] ECR I-223.

Case C-6/99 Association Greenpeace France and Others v. Ministere de l'Agriculture et de la Pêche and Others [2000] ECR I-1651.

Case C-473/98 Kemikalieinspektionen v. Toolex [2000] ECR I-5681.



#### TABLE OF CASES

xvii

Case C-248/99, France v. Monsanto [2002] ECR I-1.

Case C-3/00 Denmark v. Commission [2003] ECR I-02643.

Case C-192/01 Commission v. Denmark [2003] ECR I-9693.

Case C-236/01 Monsanto Agricoltura Italia and Others [2003] ECR I-8105.

Case 512/99 Germany v. Commission [2003] ECR I-00845.

Case C-24/00 Commission v. France [2004] ECR I-1277.

C-41/02 Commission v. Netherlands [2004] ECR I-11375.

C-210/03 Swedish Match AB and Swedish Match AB UK Ltd v. Secretary of State for Health [2004] ECR I-11893.

Cases C-434/02 Arnold André GmbH & Co. KG v. Landrat des Kresies Herford [2004] ECR I-11825.

Case 132/03 Codacons and Federconsumatori [2005] ECR I-4167.

Joined Cases C-15/06 and C-295/06 *European Parliament* v. *Commission*, judgment of 1 April 2008 (not yet reported).

Case C-110/05 Commission v. Italy, judgment of 10 February 2009 (not yet reported).

Case 142/05 Mickelsson and Roos, judgment of 4 June 2009 (not yet reported).

Case C-42/07, *Liga Portuguesa de Futebol Profissional Bwin*, judgment of 8 October 2009 (not yet reported).

#### Court of the First Instance (CFI)

Case T-120/96 Lilly Industries v. Commission [1998] ECR II-2571.

Case T-199/96 Laboratoires pharmaceutiques Bergaderm SA and Goupil v. Commission [1998] ECR II-2805.

Case T-112/97 Monsanto v. Commission [1999] ECR II-1277.

Case T-74/00 Artegodan [2000] II-04945.

Case T-13/99 Pfizer Animal Health SA v. Council of the European Union [2002] ECR II-03305.

Case T-70/99 Alpharma Inc. v. Council of the European Union [2002] ECR II-3495.

Case T-177/02 Malagutti-Vezinhet v. Commission [2004] ECR II-827.

Joined Cases T-366/03 and T-235/04 Austria v. Commission [2005] ECR II-4005.

Case T-229/04 Sweden v. Commission, [2007] ECR II-2437.

#### European Free Trade Association (EFTA) Court

Case E-3/00 EFTA Surveillance Authority v. Norway [2000–2001] EFTA Court Reports.

#### **United Kingdom**

Alfred McAlpine Homes (North) Ltd. v. Secretary of State for the Environment and Another, Queen's Bench Division (Crown Office List), 5 April 1993.



xviii

#### TABLE OF CASES

- Alfred McAlpine Homes (North) Ltd. v. Secretary of State for the Environment and Another, Court of Appeal (Civil Division), 3 November 1994.
- Associated Provincial Picture Houses Ltd v. Wednesbury Corporation [1948] 1 KB 223. Gateshead MBC v. Secretary of State for the Environment, 1 P.L.R., 85, 1994.
- Leatch v. Director-General of National Parks & Wildlife Service and Shoalhaven City Council [1993] NSWLEC 191 (23 November 1993) (Land and Environment Court of New South Wales) (No. 10376 of 1993).
- Newport CBC v. Secretary of State for Wales, J.P.L., 377, 1998.
- *Phillips v. First Secretary of State and others*, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court) [2003] EWHC 2415.
- The Queen on the Application of Amvac Chemical UK Limited v. Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, Secretary of State for Transport, Local Government and Regions, Food Standards Agency, High Court of Justice, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court) 3 December 2001, 2001 WL 1479891.
- Re Cullen, Queen's Bench Division, NIQB 9, 14 February 2005.
- R. (on the application of S) v. Brent LBC [2002] E.W.C.A Civ 693; [2002] E.L.R., 556.
- R. v. *Derbyshire Country Council, ex parte Murray*, Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court), 6 October 2000.
- R. v. Environment Agency ex parte Turnbull, Queen's Bench Division (Crown Office List), CO/4848/99, 12 January 2000.
- R. v. Minister for Agriculture ex parte Inquinosa International, Queen's Bench Division (Crown Office List), 17 January 2000.
- R. v. Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food ex parte British Agrochemicals Association Ltd., English Court of Appeal (Civil Division), 9 November 2001, [2002] 1 C.M.L.R., 8.
- R. v. Secretary of State for Defence, ex parte Smith (Queen's Bench Division) (1996) 2 WLR 305 B 517.
- R. v. Secretary of State for Trade and Industry ex parte Duddridge and Others, Queen's Bench Division (Crown Office List), The Independent, 4 October 1994.
- R. v. *Tandridge D.C. and another, ex parte Al-Fayed,* Queen's Bench Division (Crown Office List) 79 P / C.R., 227, [1999] J.P.L., 825, [1999] 1 P.L.R., 104, *The Times* 28 January 1999, CO/3665/97, 14 January 1999.
- *T-Mobile (UK) Ltd* v. *First Secretary of State*, Court of Appeal (Civil Division), [2005] Env. L.R. 18, C2 and C3.
- Trevett v. Secretary of State for Transport Local Government and the Regions and Others [2002] E.W.H.C. Admin 2696, 25 November 2002.

#### **United States of America**

Associated Fisheries of Maine, Inc. v. Daley, (1st Cir. 1997) 127 F.3d 104. AT&T Wireless PCS, Inc. v. City Council of Virginia Beach, (4th Cir. 1998) 155 F.3d 423. Baltimore Gas and Electric Co. v. Natural Resources Defence Council, 462 U.S. 87 (1983).



#### TABLE OF CASES

xix

Banal v. Freeport-McMoran, Inc. (5th Cir. 1999) 197 F 3d 161.

*Industrial Union Department, AFL-CIO* v. *American Petroleum Institute et al.* 448 U.S. 607 (1980).

Cellular Phone Task Force et al., v. FCC, (2d Cir. 2000) 205 F.3d 82.

Cellular Telephone Co. v. The Town Board of Oyster Bay, (2nd Cir 1999) 166 F.3d 490.

Certified Color Manufacturers Association et al. v. David Mathews, Secretary of the Department of HEW et al., (D.C. Cir. 1976) 465 F.2d 528.

Chevron USA, Inc. v. Natural Resources Defence Council, 467 U.S. 87 (1984).

Ciba-Geigy Corp. v. EPA, (5th Cir. 1989) 874 F.2d 277.

Corrosion Proof Fittings v. EPA, (5th Cir. 1991) 247 F.2d 12-1.

Daubert v. Merrel Dow Pharmaceuticals, 509 U.S. 579 (1993).

The Dow Chemical Company v. William D. Ruckelshaus, Administrator Environmental Protection Agency Defendant-Appellant, (8th Circuit 1973) 477 F.2d 1317.

EDF v. EPA, (D.C. Circuit 1976) 548 F.2d 998.

EDF v. EPA, (D.C. Circuit 1972) 465 F.2d 528.

EDF v. Ruckelshaus, (D.C. Circuit, 1971) 439 F.2d 584.

EI DuPont de Nemours and Co. v. Train, (4th Cir. 1976) 541 F.2d 1018.

Environmental Defence Fund v. EPA, (D.C. Cir. 1972) 465 F.2d 528.

Ethyl Corp. v. EPA, (D.C. Cir. 1979) 598 F.22d 91.

Fletcher v. Bealey 28 Ch.D. 688-700.

FTC v. Standard Oil Co., 449 U.S. 232 (1980).

Gulf South Insulation v. Consumer Product Safety Commission, (5th Cir. 1983) 701 F.2d 1137.

Illinois RSA No. 3, Inc. v. County of Peoria, 963 F. Supp. 732, (C.D.Ill. 1997).

*Industrial Union Department, AFL-CIO* v. *American Petroleum Institute*, 448 U.S. 607 (1980).

Lead Indus. Ass'n, Inc. v. EPA, (D.C. Cir., 1976) 647 F.2d 1130.

Lee v. Reilly (9th Cir. 1992) 968 F. 2d 985.

Love v. Thomas, (9th Cir. 1988) 858 F.2d 1347.

Marsh v. Oregon Natural Resources Council 490 U.S. 332 (1989).

Massachusetts v. EPA, 127 U.S. 1438 (2007).

*Midwater Trawlers Cooperative* v. *Department of Commerce*, (9th Cir. 2002) 282 F.3d 710.

Motor Vehicle Manufacturers Association v. State Farm Mutual Auto Insurance, Co, 463 U.S. 29 (1983).

National Coalition Against the Misuse of Pesticides et al v. EPA, (D.C. Cir. 1989) 867 F.2d 636.

National Mining Association v. Babbitt, 172 F.3d 906 (D.C. Cir. 1999).

Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc. v. United States Nuclear Regulatory Comm'n, (D.C. Cir. 1976) 547 F.2d 633.

Omnipoint Communications Inc. v. The City of White Plains, (2nd Cir. 2005) 430 F.3d.

Petersburg Cellular Partnership v. Boards of Supervisors of Nottoway County, (4th Cir. 2000) 205 F.3d 688.



 $\mathbf{x}\mathbf{x}$ 

#### TABLE OF CASES

Public Citizen v. Young, (D.C. Cir. 1987) 831 F.2d 1008.

Reserve Mining Co. v. EPA, (8th Cir. 1975) 514 F.2d 492.

Sierra Club v. Costle, (D.C. Cir. 1981) 657 F.2d 298.

Sierra Club v. Marita, (7th Cir. 1995) 46 F.3d 606.

Sprint Spectrum L.P. v. Mills, (2nd Cir. 2002) 283 F.3d 404.

Southwestern Bell Mobile Sys. v. Todd, (1st Cir. 2001) 244 F.3d 51.

Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA) v. Hill, 437 U.S. 153 (1978).

Texas Oil & Gas Ass'n v. EPA, (5th Cir. 1998) 161 F.3d 923.

Vermont Yankee Nuclear Power Corp. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, 435 U.S. 519 (1978).

#### Sweden

Judgment of the Supreme Court in NJA 2004 s. 590.

Judgment of the Supreme Court in NJA 2006 s. 310.

Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court in case RÅ 1996 Ref. 51.

Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court in RÅ 1998 Ref. 56.

Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court in RÅ 1999 Ref. 76.

Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court in Case no. 3635–1999 delivered on 14 October 1999 (not reported in RA).

Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court in Case no. 3650–1999 delivered on 14 October 1999, summarised in RÅ 1999 note 217.

Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court in RÅ 2001 note 6.

Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court in Case no. 1163–2001 delivered on 12 July 2001 (not reported in RÅ).

Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court in RÅ 2003 Ref. 43.

Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court in RÅ 2004 Ref. 14.

Judgment of the Supreme Administrative Court in RÅ 2005 Ref. 2, 6, 7.

Judgment of the Environmental Court of Appeal of 30 March 2005 in case no. M 9408–03 (not reported in MÖD).

Judgment of the Environmental Court of Appeal of 12 May 2005, case no. M 3225–04 (not reported in MÖD).

Judgment of the Environmental Court of Appeal of 12 October 2005 in case no. M 7485-04 (MÖD 2005:55).

Judgment of he Environmental Court at Växjö Tingsrätt of 14 February 2002, case no. M 13/99.

Judgment of Östersunds Tingsrätt of 12 January 2005, case no. M 3123-04.

Judgement of Växjö Tingsrätt of 3 October 2005, case no. M 390-05.



#### TABLE OF LEGISLATION

#### Other Sources

#### **International Agreements**

African Convention on the Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources, Algiers,

The 1985 Convention for the Protection of the Ozone Layer: on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer, Vienna 1985.

The Agreement for the Implementation of the Provisions of the 1982 UNCLOS
Relating to the Conservation and Management of Straddling Fish Stocks and Highly
Migratory Fish Stocks, New York 1995

The Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage, Paris 1972.

The Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora, Washington DC 1973.

The Convention on the Ban on Import into Africa and the Control of Transboundary Movement and Management of Hazardous Wastes Within Africa, Bamako 1991.

The Convention on the Prior Informed Consent Procedure for Certain Hazardous Chemicals and Pesticides in International Trade. Rotterdam, 1998.

The Convention on Wetlands, Ramsar 1971.

General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade, Geneva 1947.

The Protocol to the 1992 Convention on Biological Diversity on Biosafety, Cartagena de Indias 2000.

The Protocol to the 1992 Framework Convention on Climate Change, Kyoto 1997.

The United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, Montego Bay 1982.

The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, New York 1992.

WTO Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade (TBT Agreement), Marrakesh 1994.

WTO Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures (SPS Agreement), Marrakesh 1994.

WTO Dispute Settlement Understanding, Marrakesh 1994.

xxi



xxii

#### TABLE OF LEGISLATION

#### International Resolutions, Declarations and Guidelines

Codex Alimentarius Commission, Procedureal Manual, 15th edition.

Declaration of the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development, Rio de Ianeiro 1992.

Declaration of the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment, Stockholm 1972.

The International Commission on Non-Ionizing Radiation Protection, Guidelines for Limiting Exposure to Time-Varying Electric, Magnetic, and Electromagnetic Fields (up to 300 GHz) (ICNIRP Guidelines). Available at: www.icnirp.de/documents/emfgdl.pdf (accessed 1 March 2010).

International Commission on Non-Ionizing Radiation Protection (ICNIRP) Standing Committee on Epidemiology. Epidemiology of Health Effects of Radiofrequency Exposure. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 112:7 (December 2004).

Ministerial Declaration on Sustainable Development in the ECE Region, Bergen 1990. The United Nations General Assembly Resolution 37/7 and Annex: World Charter for Nature, 28 October 1982.



#### EU LEGISLATION AND SOFT LAW

#### **Treaties**

- Consolidated Version of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, OJ 2008 (115/47).
- Consolidated Versions of the Treaty on the European Union and of the Treaty Establishing the European Community, OJ 2002 C 325/1.

#### Regulations

- Council Regulation (EEC) No 2377/90 of 26 June 1990 laying down a Community procedure for the establishment of maximum residue limits for veterinary medicinal products in foodstuffs of animal origin, OJ 1990 L 224/1.
- Council Regulation 2821/98/EC amending, as regards the withdrawal of the authorization of certain antibiotics, Directive 70/524/EEC concerning additives in feedingstuffs (1998) OJ L351/4.
- Regulation (EC) No. 178/2002 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 28 January 2002 laying down the general principles and requirements of food law, establishing the European Food Safety Authority and laying down procedures in matters of food safety, OJ 2002 L 31/1.
- Regulation (EC) No. 1829/2003 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 September 2003 on genetically modified food and feed, OJ 2003 L 268/1.
- Regulation (EC) No. 1907/2006 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 December 2006 concerning the Registration, Evaluation, Authorisation and Restriction of Chemicals (REACH), establishing a European Chemicals Agency, OJ 2006 L 396/1.

#### **Directives**

- Directive 65/65/EEC of 26 January 1965 on the approximation of provisions laid down by Law, Regulation or Administrative Action relating to proprietary medicinal products, OJ 1965 L 22/369.
- Directive 67/548/EEC of 27 June 1967 on the Approximation of the Laws, Regulations, and Administrative Provisions of the Member States Relating to

xxiii



#### xxiv

#### EU LEGISLATION AND SOFT LAW

the Classification, Packaging, and Labelling of Dangerous Substances, OJ 1967 L 196/1.

- Directive 70/524/EEC of 23 November 1970 concerning additives in feeding-stuffs, OJ 1970 L 270/1.
- Directive 75/319/EEC of 20 May 1975 on the approximation of provisions laid down by Law, Regulation or Administrative Action relating to proprietary medicinal products, OJ 1975 L 147/13.
- Directive 75/442/EEC of 15 July 1975 on waste, OJ 1975 L 194/39.
- Directive 79/409/EEC of 2 April 1979 on the conservation of wild birds, OJ 1979 L 103.
- Directive 79/831/EEC of 18 September 1979, amending for the sixth time Directive 67/548/EEC on the approximation of the laws, regulations and administrative provisions relating to the classification, packaging and labelling of dangerous substances, OJ 1979 L 259/10.
- Directive 90/219/EEC of 23 April 1990 on the contained use of genetically modified micro-organisms, OJ 1990/L 117/1
- Directive 90/220 of 23 April 1990 on the deliberate release into the environment of genetically modified organisms, OJ 1990, L 117/15.
- Directive 90/220/EEC of 23 April 1990 on the deliberate release into the environment of genetically modified organisms, OJ L 117/15.
- Directive 91/414/EC of 15 July 1991 concerning the placing of plant protection products on the market, OJ L 230/1.
- Directive 94/67 of 16 December 1994 on the incineration of hazardous waste, OJ 1994 L 365/34.
- Directive 96/51/EC of 23 July 1996, amending Directive 70/524/EEC concerning additives in feeding-stuffs (1996) OJ L235/39.
- Directive 96/61 of 24 September 1996 on integrated pollution prevention and control, OI 1996 L 137/20.
- Directive 2001/18/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 12 March 2001 on the deliberate release into the environment of genetically modified organisms and repealing Council Directive 90/220/EEC, OJ L 106/1.

#### Decisions

- Council Decision 90/218/EEC of 25 April 1990 concerning the administration of Bovine Somatotrophin (BST) OJ L 116/1.
- Council Decision 94/936 of 20 December 1994 amending Decision 90/218/EEC concerning the placing on the market and administration of bovine somatotrophin, OL L 366/19.
- Council Decision 96/239/EC of 27 March 1996 on emergency measures to protect against bovine spongiform encephalopathy OJ 1996 L 078/9.
- Council Decision 1999/468 of 28 June 1999 laying down the procedures for the exercise of implementing powers conferred on the Commission OJ 1999 L 184/23.



#### EU LEGISLATION AND SOFT LAW

XXV

#### Communications of the Commission

- Communication of the Commission on Consumer Health and Food Safety, COM/97/83/Final.
- Communication from the Commission on the Precautionary Principle, COM 2000/1/ Final.
- Communication from the Commission of June 2002 on Impact Assessment, COM/2002/726, adopted 5 June 2002.
- Communication from the Commission to the Council and the European Parliament, of 16 March 2005, Better Regulation for Growth and Jobs in the European Union, COM/2005/97 L, Final.

#### Other

- Bulletin EC 6–1990, Conclusions of the Presidency, Point 1.14 and Annex II. EU Bulletin 12–2000, Chapter 10 Community institutions, point 1.4.75.
- Conclusions of the Presidency, European Council at Nice 7–10 December 2000, Annex III, Point 1. Available at: www.europarl.europa.eu/summits/nice1\_en.htm (accessed 1 March 2010).
- Council Recommendation 1999/519/EC of 12 July 1999 on the limitation of exposure of the general public to electromagnetic fields (0 Hz to 300 GHz), OJ 1999 L 199/59.
- Declaration of the Council of the European Communities and of the Representatives of the Governments of the Member States, meeting in the Council on the Programme of action of the European Communities on the Environment, OJ 1973, C 112/1.
- Impact Assessment Guidelines, SEC/2005/791 adopted 15 June 2005.
- Opinion of the Scientific Committee on Plants on Specific Questions from the Commission Regarding the Evaluation of Paraquat in the Context of Council Directive 91/414/EEC, SCP/PARAQ/002-Final, 16 January 2002.
- Short Report of the Meeting of the Standing Committee on the Food Chain and Animal Health (Phytopharmaceuticals Section) held on 3 October 2003 in Brussels. SCFA 4/2003. p. 2. Available at: http://ec.europa.eu/food/committees/regulatory/scfcah/phytopharmaceuticals/summary16\_en.pdf (accessed 1 March 2010).
- Resolution of the Council and Representatives of the Governments of the Member States, meeting within the Council on the continuation and implementation of an EC policy and action programme on the environment (1987–1992), OJ 1987, C328/1.
- Review report for the active substance paraquat, 3 October 2003, SANCO/10382/2002–final. Available at: http://ec.europa.eu/food/plant/protection/evaluation/existactive/list\_paraquat.pdf (accessed 1 March 2010).



### SWEDISH LEGISLATION, PREPARATORY WORK, AND SO ON

#### **Legislative Acts**

Miljöskyddslag (SFS 1969:387).

Förvaltningsprocesslag (SFS 1971:291).

Arbetsmiljölag (SFS 1977:1160).

Förvaltningslag (SFS 1986:223).

Plan- och Bygglag (SFS 1987:10).

Lag (SFS 1988:205) om rättsprövning av vissa förvaltningsbeslut.

Strålskyddslagen (SFS 1988:220).

Lag (SFS 1991:639) om förhandsgranskning av biologiska bekämpningsmedel.

Kommunallagen (SFS 1991:900).

Lag (SFS 1998: 808) om införande av miljöbalken.

#### **Decrees**

Förordning (SFS 1985:643) med instruktion för kemikalieinspektionen.

Förordning (SFS 1985:836).om bekämpningsmedel (SFS 1985:836).

Förordning (SFS 1988:295) med instruktion för Statens strålskyddsinsititut.

Förordning (SFS 1988:525) med instruktion för Kemikalieinspektionen

Förordning (SFS 2006:524) med instruktion för Statens strålskyddsinstitut.

Verksförordning (SFS 1995:1322) med instruktion för Statens strålkskyddsinstitut.

Förordning (SFS 1998:947) om bekämpningsmedel.

Förordning (SFS 2006:1010) om växtskyddsmedel.

#### **Preparatory Works**

Proposition 1969:28.

Proposition 1973:17.

Proposition 1987/88:69.

Proposition 1994/95:230.

Proposition 1997/98:45.

Proposition 2000/01:130.

xxvi



#### SWEDISH LEGISLATION, AND SO ON

xxvii

SOU 1996:103 Del 1. Miljöbalken: En skärpt och samordnad miljölagstiftning för en hållbar utveckling.

SOU 1996:103 Miljöbalken – Del 1. Miljöbalken: En skärpt och samordnad miljölagstiftning för en hållbar utveckling.

#### Other

Interview with case handler at the Swedish Ministry of the Environment, 8 September 2004.

Interview with officials at KemI, 9 September 2004.

KemI Memo (P. Bergkvist), PM inför beslut om fortsatt godkännande för EBDC-medel. 9 November 1994 (not published, but available from the author).

KemI Memo (P. Bergkvist), Yttrande over kompletterand material från Rohm and Haas och Elf Atochem Agri angående överklagandena av Kemikalieinspektionens beslut den 9 november 1994 i fråga om bekämpningsmedel innehållande EBDC, 23 August 1995 (not published, but available from the author).

Kommentarer till Statens strålskyddsinstituts allmänna råd (SSI FS 2003:3) om begränsning av allmänhetens exponering för elektromagnetiska fält. Available at: www.ssi.se/forfattning/pdf/2002\_3Komment.pdf (accessed 1 March 2010).

Kommentarer till Statens strålskyddsinstituts allmänna råd (SSI FS 2003:3) om begränsning av allmänhetens exponering för elektromagnetiska fält.

Myndigheternas försiktighetsprincip om lågfrekventa electriska och magnetiska fälten vägledning för beslutsfattare. Available at: www.av.se/dokument/publikationer/adi/adi\_477.pdf (accessed 1 March 2010).

Statement by Swedish Foreign Office official Anders Kruse, quoted in Swedish daily newspaper *Svenska Dagbladet*, 24 August 2004. Available at: www.svd.se/dynamiskt/inrikes/did 8027374.asp (accessed 1 March 2010).

Statens strålskyddsinstituts föreskrift (SSI FS 2002:3), Allmänna råd om begränsning av allmänhetens exponering för elektromagnetiska fält (General Advice on Limiting the Public's Exposure to Electromagnetic Fields (hereinafter the General Advice).

Översiktsplan 2003 Nyköpings kommun – Kommunens vilja och ambition, 50 and 88. Available at: www.nykoping.se/op2003/pdf/huvud.pdf (accessed 1 March 2010).



#### UNITED KINGDOM

#### Legislative Acts

Health and Safety at Work etc. Act 1974. Food and Environment Protection Act 1985. Environment Act 1995. Health Protection Agency Act 2004.

#### **Regulations and Orders**

Control of Pesticides Regulations, SI 1986/1510.

Control of Pesticides (Advisory Committee on Pesticides) Order 1985, SI No. 1985 No. 1516, 1517.

The Town and Country Planning Order 1995, Statutory Instrument 1995 No. 418.

The Management of Health and Safety at Work Regulations 1999.

Plant Protection Products Regulations 2005, SI 1435, s. 4, 5.

#### Other

Code of Best Practice on Mobile Phone Network Development, Office of the Deputy Prime Minister, 2002.

Guidelines for Environmental Risk Assessment and Management, HMSO 2000. Now updated and available at: www.defra.gov.uk/environment/quality/risk/eramguide/, Sections 3.2–3.5, 3.8, 8.2 (accessed 1 March 2010).

Ibbs Report: 'Improving Management in Government: The Next Steps', A Report to the Prime Minister. HMSO 1988.

Independent Export Group on Mobile Phones, *Mobile Phones and Health*, published on 11 May 2000 (The Stewart Report). Available at: www.iegmp.org.uk/index.htm (accessed 1 March 2010).

Mutagenicity of dichlorvos, COM statement COM/02/S2 – January 2002. Available at: www.advisorybodies.doh.gov.uk/com/dichlorvos.htm (accessed 1 March 2010).

National Radiation Protection Board, Restrictions on Human Exposure to Static and Time Varying Electromagnetic Fields and Radiation, Doc. NRPB, 4(5) 1993.

National Radiation Protection Board, Advice on the 1998 ICNIRP Guidelines for

xxviii



#### UNITED KINGDOM

xxix

- Limiting Exposure to Time-varying Electric, Magnetic and Electromagnetic Fields (up to 300 GHz), Doc. NRPB, Vol. 10, No. 2 1999.
- National Radiation Protection Board, *Advice on the 1998 ICNIRP guidelines for limiting exposure to time-varying electric, magnetic and electromagnetic fields (up to 300 GHz)*, Doc. NRPB Vol. 15, No. 2 2004. Available at: www.hpa.org.uk/web/HPAwebFile/HPAweb C/1194947415497 (accessed 1 March 2010).
- The Pesticides Safety Directorate's Framework Document. Available at: www.pesticides. gov.uk/corporate.asp?id=232 (accessed 1 March 2010).
- The Precautionary Principle: Policy and Application, Report of the Interdepartmental Liaison Group on Risk Assessment (ILGRA) Report. Available at:www.hse.gov.uk/aboutus/meetings/committees/ilgra/minrpt3.pdf (accessed 1 March 2010).
- Planning Policy Guidance 8 and Code of Best Practice on Mobile Phone Network Development, Office of the Deputy Prime Minister, 2002.
- White Paper, 'This Common Inheritance: Britain's Environmental Strategy', presented to Parliament, September 1990, HMSO, Cm 1200.



#### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

#### Legislative Acts

Administrative Procedure Act 1974, 5 U.S.C. 551 (APA).

The Clean Air Act 1970, 42 U.S.C. 7401.

Data Quality Act, Amendment to the Paperwork Reduction Act, 4 U.S.C. 3501.

Endangered Species Act 1973, 16 U.S.C.

Federal Advisory Committee Act, Public Law 92-463, 5 U.S.C. App. 1.

Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act 1958, 21 U.S.C. 348.

Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act 1996 (FFDCA), 21 U.S.C.

Federal Water Pollution Control Act (Clean Water Act), 33 U.S.C. 1251.

Food Quality Protection Act 1996 (FPQA), Pub L. 104.

The Fungicide, Insecticide, and Pesticide Act, 15 U.S.C., 2601.

National Environmental Protection Act, 42 U.S.C. 4321.

Radiation Control for Health and Safety Act 1968, 42 U.S.C. 263.

The Regulatory Improvement Act 1998, S. 981, 105th Congress, 627.

Telecommunications Act 1996, Pub. L. No. 104-104, 110 Stat. 56.

Toxic Substances Control Act, 7 U.S.C., 136.

#### **Executive Orders**

Executive Order No. 12,291, 3 C.F.R. 127(1982). Executive Order 12,866, 3 C.F.R. 638 (1994).

#### Other

Evaluating Compliance with FCC Guidelines for Human Exposure to Radiofrequency Electromagnetic Fields, OET Bulletin 65, Edition 97–01, August 1997.

Federal Advisory Committees Follow Requirements, but FCC Should Improve Its Process for Appointing Committee Members, Report to the Chairman, Committee on Government Reform, House of Representatives, General Accounting Office, GAO-05–36, 2004.

Office of Management and Budget, Guidelines for Ensuring and Maximizing the Quality, Objectivity, Utility, and Integrity of Information Disseminated by Federal

XXX



#### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

xxxi

- Agencies; Notice; Republication, Federal Register / Vol. 67, No. 36 / 22 February 2002.
- Office of Management and Budget, Regulatory Analysis, Circular A-4 To the Heads of Executive Agencies and Establishments, 17 September 2003.
- The Presidential/Congressional Commission on Risk Assessment and Risk Management, Risk Assessment and Risk Management in Regulatory Decision-making, Final Report Vol. 2, 1997, 2 and 3.
- Questions and Answers about Biological Effects and Potential Hazards of Radiofrequency Electromagnetic Fields, OET Bulletin 56, Fourth Edition, August 1999.
- Reorganization Plan No. 3 of 1970, Special Message from the President to the Congress About Reorganization Plans to Establish the Environmental Protection Agency and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, 9 July 1970. Available at: www.epa.gov/history/org/origins/rorg.htm (accessed 1 March 2010).