Laura Salah Nasrallah argues that early Christian literature addressed to Greeks and Romans is best understood when studied in tandem with the archaeological remains of Roman antiquity. She examines second-century Christianity by looking at the world in which Christians “lived and moved and had their being.” Early Christians were not divorced from the materiality of the world, nor did they always remain distant from the Greek culture of the time or the rhetoric of Roman power. Nasrallah demonstrates how early Christians took up themes of justice, piety, and even the question of whether humans could be gods. They did so in the midst of sculptures that conveyed visually that humans could be gods, monumental architecture that made claims about the justice and piety of the Roman imperial family, and ideas of geography that placed Greek or Roman ethnicity at the center of the known world.

Laura Salah Nasrallah is Associate Professor of New Testament and Early Christianity at Harvard Divinity School. She is the author of *An Ecstasy of Folly: Prophecy and Authority in Early Christianity* and co-editor of *Prejudice and Christian Beginnings: Investigating Race, Gender, and Ethnicity in Early Christian Studies* and *From Roman to Early Christian Thessalonike: Studies in Religion and Archeology.*
CHRISTIAN RESPONSES TO ROMAN ART AND ARCHITECTURE

THE SECOND-CENTURY CHURCH AMID THE SPACES OF EMPIRE

LAURA SALAH NASRALLAH
Harvard University
FOR MARC
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Figures</th>
<th>page xi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## INTRODUCTION

- Christian Apologists and the Second-Century Built Environment  
  - Chapter Overview  
  - Bringing Together Literature and Archaeological Remains  
  - Christian Apologists and the Second-Century Built Environment  
  - Chapter Overview  
  - Bringing Together Literature and Archaeological Remains  

## PART I: FRAMING THE QUESTION, FRAMING THE WORLD

### 1 WHAT IS AN APOLOGY? CHRISTIAN APOLOGIES AND THE SO-CALLED SECOND SOPHISTIC

- I. What Does It Mean to Apologize?  
  - Defining the So-Called Second Sophistic  
  - Traveling to Olympia: Material Manifestations of Greek Paidia and Imperial Address  
  - The Fountain of Regilla and Herodes Atticus  
- II. Addressing the Roman Emperors, Being Greek  
  - Lucian  
  - Tatian  
  - Justin  
- III. Apologetics and Christianness  
- Conclusions  

### 2 WHAT IS THE SPACE OF THE ROMAN EMPIRE? MAPPING, BODIES, AND KNOWLEDGE IN THE ROMAN WORLD

- I. Traveling Men: Lucian, Tatian, and Justin  
  - Lucian  
  - Tatian  
  - Justin  
- II. The Sebastion in Aphrodisias  
- Conclusions
PART II: INTO THE CITIES

3 WHAT INFORMS THE GEOGRAPHICAL IMAGINATION: THE ACTS OF THE APOSTLES AND GREEK CITIES UNDER ROME 87
   I. Placing Acts 90
   II. The Panhellenion 96
      Hadrian, Ethnicity, and True Religion, 101 • What Has Athens To Do with Rome?, 103
   III. Traveling Back to Acts 104
   Conclusions 117

4 WHAT IS JUSTICE? WHAT IS PIETY? WHAT IS PAIDEIA? JUSTIN, THE FORUM OF TRAJAN IN ROME, AND A CRISIS OF MIMĒSIS 119
   I. The Column of Trajan 123
   II. Justin’s Apologies 130
      Names and Deeds: Justin Introduces Himself, the Emperors, and the Mock Court, 132 • On the Name, 137 • The Name and Speech-Acts, 140 • A Higher Court, 142 • Mimēsis, Images, and Daimones, 144 • Sameness and Difference, 148
   III. Justice, Piety, and Paideia in the Forum of Trajan 154
      The Forum’s Surroundings, 155 • Moving through the Forum of Trajan, 156 • War and the “Temple of Peace,” 161
   Conclusions 164

PART III: HUMAN BODIES AND THE IMAGE(S) OF GOD(S)

5 HOW DO YOU KNOW GOD? ATHENAGORAS ON NAMES AND IMAGES 171
   I. “This Golden One, This Herakles, This God”: Commodus and Herakles 174
      The Ambivalence of Herakles, 176 • Commodus as Herakles, 180 • A Proliferation of Signs, 183
   II. Athenagoras 186
CONTENTS

Athenagoras’s Argument: The Proemium, 191 • Grammar and Theology, 194 • Atheism and Piety “in the presence of philosopher-kings,” 198 • The Material Gods, 201
Conclusions 211

6 WHAT DO WE LEARN WHEN WE LOOK? (PART I) IMAGES, DESIRE, AND TATIAN’S TO THE GREEKS 213
I. What an Image Does 218
The Origins of Images, 221 • What You See and What You Get: Theorizing Vision, 225 • Images and the Theological Imagination: Cicero, Dio, and Maximus of Tyre, 229
II. Tatian, Spectacle, and Connoisseurship 236
Tatian at the Theater, 240 • Tatian’s Grand Tour, 241
Conclusions 246

7 WHAT DO WE LEARN WHEN WE LOOK? (PART II) APHRODITE AND CLEMENT OF ALEXANDRIA 249
I. The Knidian Aphrodite and Her Afterlife 251
Aphrodite at Knidos, 254 • Pseudo-Lucian and the Knidia, 258 • The Knidia and the Ancient Gaze, 261 • The Knidia and Roman Portraits, 263
II. Clement of Alexandria 268
Alexandria, the Mad, Hybrid, Spectacular City, 269 • Introducing Clement’s Exhortation, 272
III. “They Say a Girl Loved an Image”: The Exhortation on Statues, Piety, and Desire 277
Clement on the Knidian Aphrodite, 280 • Stories of the Gods: The Pornographic Venus and Mars, 284
Conclusions 293

EPILOGUE 296

Bibliography 303
Index Lecorum 323
Index 329

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org
LIST OF FIGURES


11. Imperator with Roman people or Senate. Relief from the Sebastieon at Aphrodisias. New York University Excavations at Aphrodisias.

12. Map of Paul's travels, according to Acts, and the cities of the Panhellenion. Figure courtesy of Daniel Hawkins, Nan Hutton,
LIST OF FIGURES


15. Roman soldiers proffer severed heads of Dacians to the Emperor Trajan. Relief from Column of Trajan, Rome. DAIR 41.1455.

16. Adventus and sacrifice scene, part 1. Relief from Column of Trajan, Rome. DAIR 89.558.

17. Adventus and sacrifice scene, part 2. Relief from Column of Trajan, Rome. DAIR 89.559.


23. Man as Herakles. Palazzo Barberini, Rome. DAIR 77.1730.


29. Roman woman as Aphrodite/Venus. Copenhagen, Ny Carlsberg Glyptotek.


32. Roman man and woman as Mars and Venus. Originally found in Ostia, now at the Museo Nazionale Romana (Terme di Diocleziano), Rome, Italy. Scala/Ministero per i Beni e le Attivita culturali/Art Resource, NY.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

MANY INSTITUTIONS AND INDIVIDUALS HAVE MADE THIS PROJECT POSSIBLE AND my pursuit of it a joy. I am grateful for American Association of University Women and Lilly Faculty Fellowships. My dean at Harvard Divinity School, William Graham, has generously supported my work. I have been grateful for invitations to test ideas at the Pappas Patristic Institute of Holy Cross/Hellenic College, Furman University, Williams College, and the “Women, Gender, and Religion Forum” at Harvard Divinity School, as well as in various conferences: “Revelation, Literature, and Community” (Princeton University), “Sanctified Violence in Ancient Mediterranean Religions” (University of Minnesota), and “Beyond Eden” (Istituto Svizzero Roma).

Harvard Theological Review and the Journal of Biblical Literature kindly allowed me to include revised versions of articles published in their journals, which have become Chapters 2 and 3, respectively. I am grateful to scholars who permitted use of plans and images under their control: Renate Bol, James Packer, and R. R. R. Smith. Neil Elliot and Joshua Messner of Fortress Press kindly provided images for several photographs and plans in Chapter 1. Dr. Martha Ronk and Omnidawn Press allowed use of lines from her poem, “In a Landscape of Having to Repeat.” Andreas Geißler, Daria Lanzuolo, and Jonas Ryborg went out of their way to help me to find and receive images.

Many have helped me along the way with this book and deserve thanks; I hesitate to list them because I will undoubtedly forget some generosities. This book would not have come about without the help of Andrew Beck, James Dunn, Beatrice Rehl, and Jason Przybyski at Cambridge University Press. At Harvard, Felicia Share, as well as Daniel Hawkins and his staff, made it possible for me to get the book to press. I am grateful to my research assistants Arminta Fox, David Jorgensen, Jeffrey Keiser, Matt Ketchum, David Mihalyfy, Margot Stevenson, Robyn Walsh, and, of most all, Thomas Christopher Hoklotubbe, Michal Beth Dinkler, and Rebekah Junkermeier. Learning often happens more happily in community than alone, and I have enjoyed discussions with students in my 2005–2006 seminar on Apologetic Literature and my 2008 course Early Christianity in the Roman Empire.
Many colleagues, friends, and even strangers have sacrificed their time to read my work or to help me. All the errors that remain are mine. Anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press have contributed greatly to the project by their meticulous and encouraging comments. For reading or advice I am thankful to François Bovon, Joan Branham, Ann Braude, Cavan Concannon, Alexandra Cuffel, Michal Beth Dinkler, Carol Duncan, Yaron Eliav, David Frankfurter, Chris Frilingos, Caroline Johnson Hodge, Amy Hollywood, Karen King, Helmut Koester, Jon Levenson, AnneMarie Luijendijk, Amy Lyford, David Gordon Mitten, Kimberly Patton, Shelly Rambo, Fatima Sadiqi, Jonathan Schofer, Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza, and Larry Wills. I am honored by Natalie Boymel Kampen’s and Herbert Kessler’s generosity in reading portions of the manuscript.

My kind friends and great encouragers Melanie Johnson-DeBaufre and Michael Puett spent many patient hours listening and reading as I tried out various versions of the book. I am grateful. For long conversations and the willingness to read many versions of various chapters, I also thank Denise Kimber Buell, Shelly Matthews, and Andrew Jacobs. Their scholarly imprints are everywhere on this book, and all these friendships leave my days and late working nights. I am grateful for a tremendous scholarly community – one that is incisive and kind.

My family’s generosity, patience, kind sacrifice, and love have sustained me through this project and much more: Mother Pelagia, Salah and Nancy Nasrallah, and August Muench-Nasrallah make work possible and life joyful.

In the midst of this project, my small son asked me nearly every night at dinner: “Mama, how is your book?” He has offered to write for me and has kindly left on my desk many folded books of his own, scribbled pages, and heart-filled drawing on the backs of my drafts. His sweetness and preternatural maturity, and the laughter that his younger sister Beata brings to us, are sustaining joys. I work always conscious of the absence of my mother and brother. This book is dedicated to the memory of my sweet brother Marc, and to my son, his namesake.
### Abbreviations

Abbreviations of ancient titles generally follow the third edition of the *Oxford Classical Dictionary*. They are also further detailed in the Index Locorum.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AA</td>
<td>Archäologischer Anzeiger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJA</td>
<td>American Journal of Archaeology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANRW</td>
<td>Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bib. Int.</td>
<td>Biblical Interpretation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCSL</td>
<td>Corpus Christianorum Series Latina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Church History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CR</td>
<td>The Classical Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAI</td>
<td>Deutsches Archäologisches Institut</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAIR</td>
<td>Deutsches Archäologisches Institut Rom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAT</td>
<td>Forschungen zum Alten Testament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCS</td>
<td>Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hesp.</td>
<td>Hesperia: Journal of the American School of Classical Studies at Athens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSCP</td>
<td>Harvard Studies in Classical Philology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HTR</td>
<td>Harvard Theological Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HTS</td>
<td>Harvard Theological Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IG</td>
<td>Inscriptiones Graecae</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JAAR</td>
<td>Journal of the American Academy of Religion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JBL</td>
<td>Journal of Biblical Literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JECS</td>
<td>Journal of Early Christian Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JEH</td>
<td>Journal of Ecclesiastical History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JHS</td>
<td>The Journal of Hellenistic Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JRA</td>
<td>Journal of Roman Archaeology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JRS</td>
<td>Journal of Roman Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JTS</td>
<td>Journal of Theological Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lampe</td>
<td>Lampe, A Patristic Lexicon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCL</td>
<td>Loeb Classical Library</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSJ</td>
<td><em>A Greek-English Lexicon</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OED</td>
<td><em>Oxford English Dictionary</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rend</td>
<td><em>Rendiconti</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RömMitt</td>
<td><em>Mitteilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts: Römische Abteilung</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSV</td>
<td>Revised Standard Version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBL</td>
<td>Society of Biblical Literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Sources chrétiennes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stud. Theol.</td>
<td><em>Studia Theologica</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SVF</td>
<td><em>Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theol. Jahr.</td>
<td><em>Theologische Jahrbücher</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TLG</td>
<td><em>Thesaurus Linguae Graecae</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WUNT</td>
<td>Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td><em>Vigiliae Christianae</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>