

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76652-4 - Christian Responses to Roman Art and Architecture: The Second-Century Church
Amid the Spaces of Empire

Laura Salah Nasrallah

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CHRISTIAN RESPONSES TO ROMAN ART AND ARCHITECTURE

Laura Salah Nasrallah argues that early Christian literature addressed to Greeks and Romans is best understood when studied in tandem with the archaeological remains of Roman antiquity. She examines second-century Christianity by looking at the world in which Christians “lived and moved and had their being.” Early Christians were not divorced from the materiality of the world, nor did they always remain distant from the Greek culture of the time or the rhetoric of Roman power. Nasrallah demonstrates how early Christians took up themes of justice, piety, and even the question of whether humans could be gods. They did so in the midst of sculptures that conveyed visually that humans could be gods, monumental architecture that made claims about the justice and piety of the Roman imperial family, and ideas of geography that placed Greek or Roman ethnicity at the center of the known world.

Laura Salah Nasrallah is Associate Professor of New Testament and Early Christianity at Harvard Divinity School. She is the author of *An Ecstasy of Folly: Prophecy and Authority in Early Christianity* and co-editor of *Prejudice and Christian Beginnings: Investigating Race, Gender, and Ethnicity in Early Christian Studies* and *From Roman to Early Christian Thessalonikē: Studies in Religion and Archaeology*.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76652-4 - Christian Responses to Roman Art and Architecture: The Second-Century Church

Amid the Spaces of Empire

Laura Salah Nasrallah

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CHRISTIAN RESPONSES TO ROMAN ART AND ARCHITECTURE

THE SECOND-CENTURY CHURCH
AMID THE SPACES OF EMPIRE

LAURA SALAH NASRALLAH

Harvard University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-0-521-76652-4 - Christian Responses to Roman Art and Architecture: The Second-Century Church
 Amid the Spaces of Empire
 Laura Salah Nasrallah
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
 São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press
 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA
www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521766524

© Laura Salah Nasrallah 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Nasrallah, Laura Salah, 1969—
 Christian responses to Roman art and architecture : the second-century church amid the
 spaces of empire / Laura Salah Nasrallah.
 p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-76652-4 (hardback)

1. Church history — Primitive and early church, ca. 30-600. 2. Art, Roman.

3. Architecture, Roman. I. Title.

BR163.N37 2010

261.5'70937 — dc22 2009025688

ISBN 978-0-521-76652-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
 accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in
 this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is,
 or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76652-4 - Christian Responses to Roman Art and Architecture: The Second-Century Church
Amid the Spaces of Empire

Laura Salah Nasrallah

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

FOR MARC

CONTENTS

<i>List of Figures</i>	page xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xv
INTRODUCTION	I
Christian Apologists and the Second-Century Built Environment	3
Bringing Together Literature and Archaeological Remains	7
Chapter Overview	12
PART I: FRAMING THE QUESTION, FRAMING THE WORLD	
1 WHAT IS AN APOLOGY? CHRISTIAN APOLOGIES AND THE SO-CALLED SECOND SOPHISTIC	21
I. What Does It Mean to Apologize?	23
II. Addressing the Roman Emperors, Being Greek	28
Defining the So-Called Second Sophistic, 29 • Traveling to Olympia: Material Manifestations of Greek <i>Paideia</i> and Imperial Address, 30 • The Fountain of Regilla and Herodes Atticus, 35	
III. Apologetics and Christianness	44
Conclusions	48
2 WHAT IS THE SPACE OF THE ROMAN EMPIRE? MAPPING, BODIES, AND KNOWLEDGE IN THE ROMAN WORLD	51
I. Traveling Men: Lucian, Tatian, and Justin	56
Lucian, 59 • Tatian, 65 • Justin, 71	
II. The Sebasteion in Aphrodisias	76
Conclusions	83

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76652-4 - Christian Responses to Roman Art and Architecture: The Second-Century Church
Amid the Spaces of Empire

Laura Salah Nasrallah

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii CONTENTS

PART II: INTO THE CITIES

- 3 WHAT INFORMS THE GEOGRAPHICAL IMAGINATION? THE ACTS OF THE APOSTLES AND GREEK CITIES UNDER ROME 87
- I. Placing Acts 90
- II. The Panhellenion 96
- Hadrian, Ethnicity, and True Religion, 101 • What Has Athens To Do with Rome?, 103
- III. Traveling Back to Acts 104
- Acts 2, 107 • Paul in Lystra and Athens: Confusing Humans and Gods, 110 • Paul in Thessalonikē and Philippi: Sedition against Rome?, 116
- Conclusions 117
- 4 WHAT IS JUSTICE? WHAT IS PIETY? WHAT IS *PAIDEIA*? JUSTIN, THE FORUM OF TRAJAN IN ROME, AND A CRISIS OF *MIMĒSIS* 119
- I. The Column of Trajan 123
- II. Justin's *Apologies* 130
- Names and Deeds: Justin Introduces Himself, the Emperors, and the Mock Court, 132 • On the Name, 137 • The Name and Speech-Acts, 140 • A Higher Court, 142 • *Mimēsis*, Images, and *Daimones*, 144 • Sameness and Difference, 148
- III. Justice, Piety, and *Paideia* in the Forum of Trajan 154
- The Forum's Surroundings, 155 • Moving through the Forum of Trajan, 156 • War and the "Temple of Peace," 161
- Conclusions 164

PART III: HUMAN BODIES AND THE IMAGE(S)
OF GOD(S)

- 5 HOW DO YOU KNOW GOD? ATHENAGORAS ON NAMES AND IMAGES 171
- I. "This Golden One, This Herakles, This God": Commodus and Herakles 174
- The Ambivalence of Herakles, 176 • Commodus as Herakles, 180 • A Proliferation of Signs, 183
- II. Athenagoras 186

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76652-4 - Christian Responses to Roman Art and Architecture: The Second-Century Church
Amid the Spaces of Empire

Laura Salah Nasrallah

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CONTENTS

ix

Athenagoras's Argument: The <i>Proemium</i> , 191 • Grammar and Theology, 194 • Atheism and Piety "in the presence of philosopher-kings," 198 • The Material Gods, 201	
Conclusions	211
6 WHAT DO WE LEARN WHEN WE LOOK? (PART I) IMAGES, DESIRE, AND TATIAN'S <i>TO THE GREEKS</i>	213
I. What an Image Does	218
The Origins of Images, 221 • What You See and What You Get: Theorizing Vision, 225 • Images and the Theological Imagination: Cicero, Dio, and Maximus of Tyre, 229	
II. Tatian, Spectacle, and Connoisseurship	236
Tatian at the Theater, 240 • Tatian's Grand Tour, 241	
Conclusions	246
7 WHAT DO WE LEARN WHEN WE LOOK? (PART II) APHRODITE AND CLEMENT OF ALEXANDRIA	249
I. The Knidian Aphrodite and Her Afterlife	251
Aphrodite at Knidos, 254 • Pseudo-Lucian and the Knidia, 258 • The Knidia and the Ancient Gaze, 261 • The Knidia and Roman Portraits, 263	
II. Clement of Alexandria	268
Alexandria, the Mad, Hybrid, Spectacular City, 269 • Introducing Clement's <i>Exhortation</i> , 272	
III. "They Say a Girl Loved an Image": The <i>Exhortation</i> on Statues, Piety, and Desire	277
Clement on the Knidian Aphrodite, 280 • Stories of the Gods: The Pornographic Venus and Mars, 284	
Conclusions	293
EPILOGUE	296
<i>Bibliography</i>	303
<i>Index Locorum</i>	323
<i>Index</i>	329

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76652-4 - Christian Responses to Roman Art and Architecture: The Second-Century Church

Amid the Spaces of Empire

Laura Salah Nasrallah

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

LIST OF FIGURES

- | | |
|--|---------|
| 1. Olympia: Plan of city center, Roman period. Courtesy of Fortress Press and Helmut Koester (<i>Cities of Paul: Images and Interpretations from the Harvard New Testament Archaeology Project</i>). © The President and Fellows of Harvard College. All Rights Reserved. | page 32 |
| 2. Claudius as Zeus/Jupiter from the Metroon. Olympia Museum. Courtesy of Fortress Press and Helmut Koester (<i>Cities of Paul: Images and Interpretations from the Harvard New Testament Archaeology Project</i>). © The President and Fellows of Harvard College. All Rights Reserved. | 36 |
| 3. Claudius as Jupiter. Museo Pio Clementino, Vatican Museums, Vatican State. Scala/Art Resource, NY. | 37 |
| 4. Reconstruction of the Fountain of Regilla and Herodes Atticus. Reconstruction by Renate Bol, <i>Das Statuenprogramm des Herodes-Atticus-Nymphaeum</i> . By permission of Renate Bol. | 40 |
| 5. Bull with dedicatory inscription. Olympia Museum. Courtesy of Fortress Press and Helmut Koester (<i>Cities of Paul: Images and Interpretations from the Harvard New Testament Archaeology Project</i>). © The President and Fellows of Harvard College. All Rights Reserved. | 42 |
| 6. Hadrian with <i>patera</i> . Olympia Museum. Courtesy of Fortress Press and Helmut Koester (<i>Cities of Paul: Images and Interpretations from the Harvard New Testament Archaeology Project</i>). © The President and Fellows of Harvard College. All Rights Reserved. | 43 |
| 7. Plan of Sebasteion, Aphrodisias. By permission of R. R. R. Smith (“The Imperial Reliefs from the Sebasteion at Aphrodisias”). | 77 |
| 8. Sketch of Sebasteion, Aphrodisias. By permission of R. R. R. Smith (“The Imperial Reliefs from the Sebasteion at Aphrodisias”). | 78 |
| 9. Augustus by land and sea. Relief from the Sebasteion, Aphrodisias. New York University Excavations at Aphrodisias. | 79 |
| 10. Claudius subduing Britannia. Relief from the Sebasteion, Aphrodisias. New York University Excavations at Aphrodisias. | 81 |
| 11. Emperor with Roman people or Senate. Relief from the Sebasteion at Aphrodisias. New York University Excavations at Aphrodisias. | 82 |
| 12. Map of Paul’s travels, according to Acts, and the cities of the Panhellenion. Figure courtesy of Daniel Hawkins, Nan Hutton, | |

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76652-4 - Christian Responses to Roman Art and Architecture: The Second-Century Church
Amid the Spaces of Empire

Laura Salah Nasrallah

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

- Mikael Haxby, and the staff of Information Technology Services at Harvard Divinity School, and modeled on Spawforth and Walker, "Panhellenion. I," 80 fig. 1. 98
13. View of the Column of Trajan, Rome. DAIR 67.913. 124
14. Reconstruction of Forum of Trajan, Rome. By permission of J. E. Packer. 126
15. Roman soldiers proffer severed heads of Dacians to the Emperor Trajan. Relief from Column of Trajan, Rome. DAIR 41.1455. 128
16. Adventus and sacrifice scene, part 1. Relief from Column of Trajan, Rome. DAIR 89.558. 129
17. Adventus and sacrifice scene, part 2. Relief from Column of Trajan, Rome. DAIR 89.559. 129
18. Apotheosis of Titus. Arch of Titus, Rome. DAIR 79.2393. 153
19. The central arch of the main gate into the Forum of Trajan. Aureus, reverse. By permission of J. E. Packer. 157
20. Dacian captives. In re-use on the Arch of Constantine, Rome, Italy. Art Resource, NY. 158
21. Restored view. The Forum of Trajan, Rome. By permission of J. E. Packer. 159
22. Forum of Trajan. East-west section reconstruction. By permission of J. E. Packer. 160
23. Man as Herakles. Palazzo Barberini, Rome. DAIR 77.1730. 177
24. Half-length portrait of Emperor Commodus as Herakles. Excavated on the Esquiline in Rome, 1874. Musei Capitolini, Rome, Italy. Erich Lessing/Art Resource, NY. 182
25. Triumph Scene. Relief from the Arch of Marcus Aurelius. Palazzo dei Conservatori, Rome, Italy. Nimatallah/Art Resource, NY. 185
26. Capitoline Venus (front). Musei Capitolini, Rome, Italy. Alinari/Art Resource, NY. 256
27. Capitoline Venus (back). Musei Capitolini, Rome, Italy. Scala/Art Resource, NY. 257
28. Campo Iemeni Venus. British Museum, London. © The Trustees of the British Museum. 259
29. Roman woman as Aphrodite/Venus. Copenhagen, Ny Carlsberg Glyptotek. 264
30. Roman woman as Aphrodite/Venus. Museo Pio Clementine, Vatican Museums, Vatican State. Scala/Art Resource, NY. 265
31. Roman man and woman as Mars and Venus. Originally found in the Isola Sacra. Musei Capitolini, Rome. Mai 1385.15959. Forschungsarchiv für Antike Plastik, Köln. 289
32. Roman man and woman as Mars and Venus. Originally found in Ostia, now at the Museo Nazionale Romana (Terme di Diocleziano), Rome, Italy. Scala/Ministero per i Beni e le Attività culturali/Art Resource, NY. 291

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76652-4 - Christian Responses to Roman Art and Architecture: The Second-Century Church

Amid the Spaces of Empire

Laura Salah Nasrallah

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

MANY INSTITUTIONS AND INDIVIDUALS HAVE MADE THIS PROJECT POSSIBLE AND my pursuit of it a joy. I am grateful for American Association of University Women and Lilly Faculty Fellowships. My dean at Harvard Divinity School, William Graham, has generously supported my work. I have been grateful for invitations to test ideas at the Pappas Patristic Institute of Holy Cross/Hellenic College, Furman University, Williams College, and the “Women, Gender, and Religion Forum” at Harvard Divinity School, as well as in various conferences: “Revelation, Literature, and Community” (Princeton University), “Sanctified Violence in Ancient Mediterranean Religions” (University of Minnesota), and “Beyond Eden” (Istituto Svizzero Roma).

Harvard Theological Review and the *Journal of Biblical Literature* kindly allowed me to include revised versions of articles published in their journals, which have become Chapters 2 and 3, respectively. I am grateful to scholars who permitted use of plans and images under their control: Renate Bol, James Packer, and R. R. R. Smith. Neil Elliot and Joshua Messner of Fortress Press kindly provided images for several photographs and plans in Chapter 1. Dr. Martha Ronk and Omnidawn Press allowed use of lines from her poem, “In a Landscape of Having to Repeat.” Andreas Geißler, Daria Lanzuolo, and Jonas Ryborg went out of their way to help me to find and receive images.

Many have helped me along the way with this book and deserve thanks; I hesitate to list them because I will undoubtedly forget some generosityes. This book would not have come about without the help of Andrew Beck, James Dunn, Beatrice Rehl, and Jason Przybylski at Cambridge University Press. At Harvard, Felicia Share, as well as Daniel Hawkins and his staff, made it possible for me to get the book to press. I am grateful to my research assistants Arminta Fox, David Jorgensen, Jeffrey Keiser, Matt Ketchum, David Mihalyfy, Margot Stevenson, Robyn Walsh, and, most of all, Thomas Christopher Hoklotubbe, Michal Beth Dinkler, and Rebekah Junkermeier. Learning often happens more happily in community than alone, and I have enjoyed discussions with students in my 2005–2006 seminar on Apologetic Literature and my 2008 course Early Christianity in the Roman Empire.

Many colleagues, friends, and even strangers have sacrificed their time to read my work or to help me. All the errors that remain are mine. Anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press have contributed greatly to the project by their meticulous and encouraging comments. For reading or advice I am thankful to François Bovon, Joan Branham, Ann Braude, Cavan Conannon, Alexandra Cuffel, Michal Beth Dinkler, Carol Duncan, Yaron Eliav, David Frankfurter, Chris Frilingos, Caroline Johnson Hodge, Amy Hollywood, Karen King, Helmut Koester, Jon Levenson, AnneMarie Luijendijk, Amy Lyford, David Gordon Mitten, Kimberly Patton, Shelly Rambo, Fatima Sadiqi, Jonathan Schofer, Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza, and Larry Wills. I am honored by Natalie Boymel Kampen's and Herbert Kessler's generosity in reading portions of the manuscript.

My kind friends and great encouragers Melanie Johnson-DeBaufre and Michael Puett spent many patient hours listening and reading as I tried out various versions of the book. I am grateful. For long conversations and the willingness to read many versions of various chapters, I also thank Denise Kimber Buell, Shelly Matthews, and Andrew Jacobs. Their scholarly imprints are everywhere on this book, and all these friendships leaven my days and late working nights. I am grateful for a tremendous scholarly community – one that is incisive and kind.

My family's generosity, patience, kind sacrifice, and love have sustained me through this project and much more: Mother Pelagia, Salah and Nancy Nasrallah, and August Muench-Nasrallah make work possible and life joyful.

In the midst of this project, my small son asked me nearly every night at dinner: "Mama, how is your book?" He has offered to write for me and has kindly left on my desk many folded books of his own, scribbled pages, and heart-filled drawing on the backs of my drafts. His sweetness and preternatural maturity, and the laughter that his younger sister Beata brings to us, are sustaining joys. I work always conscious of the absence of my mother and brother. This book is dedicated to the memory of my sweet brother Marc, and to my son, his namesake.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76652-4 - Christian Responses to Roman Art and Architecture: The Second-Century Church
Amid the Spaces of Empire

Laura Salah Nasrallah

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviations of ancient titles generally follow the third edition of the *Oxford Classical Dictionary*. They are also further detailed in the Index Locorum.

AA	<i>Archäologischer Anzeiger</i>
AJA	<i>American Journal of Archaeology</i>
ANF	<i>Ante-Nicene Fathers: The Writings of the Fathers Down to 325 A.D.</i> , edited by Alexander Roberts et al. Reprint. Hendrickson: Peabody, 1995
ANRW	Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt
<i>Bib. Int.</i>	<i>Biblical Interpretation</i>
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum Series Latina
CH	<i>Church History</i>
CR	<i>The Classical Review</i>
DAI	Deutsches Archäologisches Institut
DAIR	Deutsches Archäologisches Institut Rom
FAT	Forschungen zum Alten Testament
GCS	Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller
<i>Hesp.</i>	<i>Hesperia: Journal of the American School of Classical Studies at Athens</i>
HSCP	<i>Harvard Studies in Classical Philology</i>
HTR	<i>Harvard Theological Review</i>
HTS	Harvard Theological Studies
IG	<i>Inscriptiones Graecae</i>
JAAR	<i>Journal of the American Academy of Religion</i>
JBL	<i>Journal of Biblical Literature</i>
J ECS	<i>Journal of Early Christian Studies</i>
JEH	<i>Journal of Ecclesiastical History</i>
JHS	<i>The Journal of Hellenistic Studies</i>
JRA	<i>Journal of Roman Archaeology</i>
JRS	<i>Journal of Roman Studies</i>
JTS	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i>
Lampe	Lampe, <i>A Patristic Lexicon</i>
LCL	Loeb Classical Library

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76652-4 - Christian Responses to Roman Art and Architecture: The Second-Century Church
Amid the Spaces of Empire

Laura Salah Nasrallah

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xvi ABBREVIATIONS

LIMC	<i>Lexicon iconographicum mythologiae classicae</i> . 8 vols. in 16. Zürich: Artemis, 1981–2009
LSJ	Liddell-Scott-Jones, <i>A Greek-English Lexicon</i>
OED	<i>Oxford English Dictionary</i>
Rend	<i>Rendiconti</i>
RömMitt	<i>Mitteilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts: Römische Abteilung</i>
RSV	Revised Standard Version
SBL	Society of Biblical Literature
SC	Sources chrétiennes
<i>Stud. Theol.</i>	<i>Studia Theologica</i>
SVF	Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta
<i>Theol. Jahr.</i>	<i>Theologische Jahrbücher</i>
TLG	<i>Thesaurus Linguae Graecae</i>
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
VC	<i>Vigiliae Christianiae</i>