

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76618-0 - Interpreting Newton: Critical Essays

Edited By Andrew Janiak and Eric Schliesser

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

INTERPRETING NEWTON

This collection of specially commissioned essays by leading scholars presents new research on Isaac Newton and his main philosophical interlocutors and critics. The essays analyze Newton's relation to his contemporaries, especially Barrow, Descartes, Leibniz, and Locke, and discuss the ways in which a broad range of figures, including Hume, MacLaurin, Maupertuis, and Kant, reacted to his thought. The wide range of topics discussed includes the laws of nature, the notion of force, the relation of mathematics to nature, Newton's argument for universal gravitation, his attitude toward philosophical empiricism, his use of "fluxions," his approach toward measurement problems, and his concept of absolute motion, together with new interpretations of Newton's matter theory. The volume concludes with an extended essay that analyzes the changes in physics wrought by Newton's *Principia*. A substantial introduction and bibliography provide essential reference guides.

ANDREW JANIAC is Creed C. Black Associate Professor of Philosophy at Duke University. He is the editor of *Newton: Philosophical Writings* (Cambridge, 2004) and author of *Newton as Philosopher* (Cambridge, 2008).

ERIC SCHLIESSER is BOF Research Professor, Philosophy and Moral Sciences at Ghent University. He has published widely on Newton, Huygens, and their eighteenth-century reception (especially by Hume and Adam Smith) as well as in philosophy of economics.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76618-0 - Interpreting Newton: Critical Essays

Edited By Andrew Janiak and Eric Schliesser

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76618-0 - Interpreting Newton: Critical Essays

Edited By Andrew Janiak and Eric Schliesser

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

INTERPRETING NEWTON

Critical Essays

Edited by

ANDREW JANIAC AND ERIC SCHLIESSER



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76618-0 - Interpreting Newton: Critical Essays

Edited By Andrew Janiak and Eric Schliesser

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521766180

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and
to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-76618-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to
in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

Notes on contributors page vii
Acknowledgements x

Introduction 1
ANDREW JANIAC AND ERIC SCHLIESSER

PART I **Newton and his contemporaries** 11

1 Newton’s law-constitutive approach to bodies: a response to
Descartes 13
KATHERINE BRADING

2 Leibniz, Newton and force 33
DANIEL GARBER

3 Locke’s qualified embrace of Newton’s *Principia* 48
MARY DOMSKI

4 What geometry postulates: Newton and Barrow on the relationship
of mathematics to nature 69
KATHERINE DUNLOP

PART II **Philosophical themes in Newton** 103

5 Cotes’s queries: Newton’s empiricism and conceptions of
matter 105
ZVI BIENER AND CHRIS SMEENK

6 Newton’s scientific method and the universal
law of gravitation 138
ORI BELKIND

7 Newton, Huygens, and Euler: empirical support for
laws of motion 169
WILLIAM HARPER

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-76618-0 - Interpreting Newton: Critical Essays
Edited By Andrew Janiak and Eric Schliesser
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

vi	CONTENTS	
8	What did Newton mean by ‘Absolute Motion’?	196
	NICK HUGGETT	
9	From velocities to fluxions	219
	MARCO PANZA	
	PART III The reception of Newton	255
10	Newton, Locke, and Hume	257
	GRACIELA DE PIERRIS	
11	Maupertuis on attraction as an inherent property of matter	280
	LISA DOWNING	
12	The Newtonian refutation of Spinoza: Newton’s Challenge and the Socratic Problem	299
	ERIC SCHLIESSER	
13	Dispositional explanations: Boyle’s problem, Newton’s solution, Hume’s response	320
	LYNN S. JOY	
14	Newton and Kant on absolute space: from theology to transcendental philosophy	342
	MICHAEL FRIEDMAN	
15	How Newton’s <i>Principia</i> changed physics	360
	GEORGE E. SMITH	
	References	396
	Index	419

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76618-0 - Interpreting Newton: Critical Essays

Edited By Andrew Janiak and Eric Schliesser

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

ORI BELKIND is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Richmond. He is the author of *Physical Systems: Conceptual Pathways between Spacetime and Matter* (forthcoming), and has also published on Leibniz and Newton.

ZVI BIENER is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Cincinnati. He works primarily on early modern conceptions of the unity of science and the large-scale structure of fields of knowledge, and has published on Galileo, Descartes, and Newton.

KATHERINE BRADING is William J. and Dorothy K. O'Neill Collegiate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame. In addition to writing on seventeenth-century natural philosophy, she has published on symmetry in modern physics and on the history of early twentieth-century physics.

GRACIELA DE PIERRIS is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Stanford University. She has published widely in historical topics in epistemology, especially Locke, Hume, and Kant. She has also written on Frege, Wittgenstein, and Quine.

MARY DOMSKI is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of New Mexico. She has published widely on early modern natural philosophy and mathematics as well as on Kant. She is the co-editor of *Discourse on a New Method: Reinvigorating the Marriage of History and Philosophy of Science* (2010).

LISA DOWNING is Professor of Philosophy at Ohio State University. She has published widely on Locke, mechanist conceptions of body and their justification, debates surrounding gravity/attraction, and changing views of scientific explanation in the early modern period.

KATHERINE DUNLOP is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Brown University. She is primarily interested in theories of exact science and of perception, especially in Kant. Her research extends to Kant's early modern predecessors

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76618-0 - Interpreting Newton: Critical Essays

Edited By Andrew Janiak and Eric Schliesser

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

and to the reception of his views (and theirs) in twentieth-century analytic philosophy.

MICHAEL FRIEDMAN is Frederick P. Rehms Family Professor of Humanities at Stanford University. He is the author of *Foundations of Space-Time Theories: Relativistic Physics and Philosophy of Science* (1983), *Kant and the Exact Sciences* (1992), *Reconsidering Logical Positivism* (Cambridge, 1999), *A Parting of the Ways: Carnap, Cassirer, and Heidegger* (2000), and *Dynamics of Reason: The 1999 Kant Lectures at Stanford University* (2001).

DANIEL GARBER is Stuart Professor of Philosophy at Princeton University. He is the author of *Descartes' Metaphysical Physics* (1992), *Descartes Embodied* (2001), and *Leibniz: Body, Substance, Monad* (2009).

WILLIAM HARPER is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Western Ontario. He has published widely in philosophy of science, including decision theory, Kant, and Newton. He is the author of *Isaac Newton's Scientific Method: Turning Data into Evidence about Gravity and Cosmology* (forthcoming).

NICHOLAS HUGGETT is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Illinois at Chicago. He has edited *Space from Zeno to Einstein* (1999) and co-authored *Physics Meets Philosophy at the Planck Scale* (Cambridge, 2001). His most recent book is *Everywhere and Everywhen* (2010).

ANDREW JANIAK is Creed C. Black Associate Professor of Philosophy at Duke University. He is the editor of *Newton: Philosophical Writings* (Cambridge, 2004) and author of *Newton as Philosopher* (Cambridge, 2008). His most recent article is "Substance and Action in Descartes and Newton," *The Monist* 93 (October 2010). He writes on early modern natural philosophy and on Kant.

LYNN JOY is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame and Fellow of the Reilly Center for Science, Technology, and Values. Her publications include *Gassendi the Atomist: Advocate of History in an Age of Science* and "Scientific Explanation from Formal Causes to Laws of Nature," in *The Cambridge History of Early Modern Science*. She is currently working on a study of the concept of dispositions in contemporary philosophy of mind, entitled *Dispositions and Intentionality in the Humean Tradition*.

MARCO PANZA is Research Director in History and Philosophy of Sciences, Institut d'Histoire et de Philosophie des Sciences et des Techniques, UMR 8590 of the CNRS and the University of Paris 1. He has published widely in the history and philosophy of mathematics, and is the author of *Isaac Newton*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76618-0 - Interpreting Newton: Critical Essays

Edited By Andrew Janiak and Eric Schliesser

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

ix

(2003), *Newton et l'origine de l'analyse, 1664–1666* (2005), *Nombres. Eléments de mathématiques pour philosophes* (2007).

ERIC SCHLIESSER is BOF Research Professor of Philosophy at Ghent University. He has published widely on Newton, Huygens, and their eighteenth-century reception (especially Hume and Adam Smith) as well as in philosophy of economics. He is the co-editor of the forthcoming *Oxford Handbook on Isaac Newton*.

CHRIS SMEENK is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Western Ontario. He has published on the philosophy and history of modern cosmology and has co-authored works on Newton with Zvi Biener, George Smith, and Eric Schliesser.

GEORGE SMITH is Professor of Philosophy at Tufts University. His research has focused heavily on the development of evidence in the exact sciences with special emphasis on Newton's *Principia* and its aftermath. He is the co-editor of the *Cambridge Companion to Newton* (2002) and of the forthcoming *Oxford Handbook on Isaac Newton*.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76618-0 - Interpreting Newton: Critical Essays

Edited By Andrew Janiak and Eric Schliesser

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I wish to thank the contributors to this volume for their outstanding work and impressive patience. I would also like to thank Hilary Gaskin for supporting this project from its inception, and for her wise counsel, as always. Finally, and perhaps most importantly, I thank my co-editor, Eric Schliesser, for seeing the manuscript through its many transformations over the past few years. Eric, I still owe you a drink!

Andrew Janiak

This volume would not have been possible without the generosity shown toward me by Syracuse University, Leiden University, Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (which supported me with a four year grant to study Newton and his impact on philosophy), and Ghent University. Along the way I incurred many debts of gratitude toward flexible Deans and Department Chairs, especially the late Stewart Thau and Cathy Newton at Syracuse, Pauline Kleingeld at Leiden, and Freddy Mortier as well as Erik Weber at Ghent. I am grateful to all the contributors to this volume for sharing such wonderful work with Andrew and me; they are terrific philosophers and scholars as well as an inspiring intellectual community. I thank the folk at Cambridge, especially Hilary Gaskin, for believing in this project. Andrew, you are a swell, selfless editor, and you owe me a drink! Finally, my share of this volume is dedicated in love to Sarit and our Avi.

Eric Schliesser

The idea of a volume was born at a workshop on “Newton and/as Philosophy” hosted at Leiden University in the Summer of 2007. Half the papers collected here were presented there.

Andrew Janiak and Eric Schliesser