Migration, Refugee Policy, and State Building in Postcommunist Europe

Why do similar postcommunist states respond differently to refugees, with some being more receptive than others? Why do some states privilege certain refugee groups whereas other states do not? This book presents a theory to account for this puzzle, and it centers on the role of the politics of nation building and of the office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). A key finding of the book is that when the boundaries of a nation are contested (and thus there is no consensus on which group should receive preferential treatment in state policies), a political space for a receptive and nondiscriminatory refugee policy opens up. The book speaks to the broader questions of how nationalism matters after communism, and under what conditions and through what mechanisms international actors can influence domestic policies. The analysis is based on extensive primary research the author conducted in four languages in the Czech Republic, Poland, Russia, and Ukraine.

Oxana Shevel is an assistant professor of political science at Tufts University. She is an associate at the Davis Center for Russian and Eurasian Studies and the Ukrainian Research Institute at Harvard University. She is also a member of the Program on New Approaches to Research and Security in Eurasia (PONARS) and of the EUDO Citizenship expert group as a country expert on Ukraine. Her research focuses on comparative politics of the postcommunist region, especially on issues of nation and state building, the politics of citizenship and migration, and the influence of international institutions on domestic politics. Her work has appeared in *Comparative Politics, East European Politics and Societies, Europe-Asia Studies*, and *Slavic Review*. 
For Jorge and Sofia
Migration, Refugee Policy, and State Building in Postcommunist Europe

OXANA SHEVEL

Tufts University
Contents

List of Figures and Tables  
page vi

Acknowledgments  
ix

List of Abbreviations  
xiii

Note on Transliteration  
 xv

1. Postcommunism, Nationalism, and Refugees  
1

2. Refugees and Refugee Politics in Postcommunist States  
19

3. The Russian Federation  
73

4. Ukraine  
134

5. The Czech Republic  
194

6. Poland  
227

7. Conclusion  
268

Index  
279
Figures and Tables

FIGURES

2.1. Domestic Politics Model of Postcommunist Refugee Policy page 66
2.2. A Model of Refugee Policy in Two Types of Postcommunist States 72

TABLES

2.1. Refugees and Others of Concern to the UNHCR: Europe and the World 20
2.2. Annual Asylum Applications in West European and Select Postcommunist Countries, 1992–2010 21
2.3. Democracy, Economy, and Refugees in Postcommunist States 22
2.4. Types of Nontraditional Refugees in the Postcommunist Region 25
2.6. Migration from the Former Soviet Republics to and from Russia and Ukraine, 1992–2009 29
2.7. Developing-World Asylum Seekers Registered by the UNHCR in Russia and Ukraine, 1992–2003 35
2.8. Asylum Seekers and Refugees in the Czech Republic and Poland, 1990–2010 44
2.9. Main Countries of Origin of Asylum Seekers and Recognized Refugees in the Czech Republic and Poland, 1990–2010 45
2.10. Contestation over National Identity 56
3.1. Characteristics That Are Necessary for a Russian 83
Figures and Tables

3.2. What Is Your Attitude to the Idea of “Russia for the Russians”? 84
3.3. What Does the Slogan “Russia for the Russians” Mean? 84
3.5. Migrants from the Former Soviet Republics Recognized as Refugees and Forced Migrants in Russia, 1992–2009 102
4.2. Self-Identification of Ukrainians and Russians in Ukraine 141
4.3. Regional Variations in Self-Identification in Ukraine 142
4.4. Regional Variations in Support of Joining the Russian-Belarusian Union 142
4.5. Official Nation in Ukrainian Citizenship Law since 1991 144
4.6. Naturalization Requirements for Those Belonging to the Official Nation 145
4.8. Defining “Foreign Ukrainians” 154
4.10. Refugee Recognition Rate in Ukraine, 1996–2007 165
Acknowledgments

The idea for this book originated from an internship at the UNHCR office in Ukraine I had as a graduate student. Observing the efforts of the UNHCR to have the Ukrainian government adopt and implement measures that would extend protection to refugees as required by the 1951 Geneva Convention sparked an interest in the process of refugee policy formation in the post-communist region and international influences on this process. Turning this interest into a dissertation, and its subsequent transformation into this book, would not have been possible without the support and guidance along the way of many teachers, friends, colleagues, and research-supporting organizations.

I would like to thank Timothy Colton for his mentorship and kindness over the years, and for encouraging me to place postcommunist refugee politics within the broader context of postcommunist transition. Yoshiko Herrera has been both a dear friend and a great mentor who read multiple versions of the book in its entirety and provided extensive helpful comments. I thank Lisa Martin for the careful reading of multiple drafts of this book when it was still a dissertation and for helping me distill and sharpen my theoretical arguments. Insightful discussions with Robert Bates and Grzegorz Ekiert and their probing questions also helped me clarify my arguments and eventually master the empirical details that at times felt overwhelming.

Many friends and colleagues read and commented in detail on specific chapters, often on multiple chapters and more than once, and provided generous comments and good advice. To them all I am deeply grateful. In particular I thank Rawi Abdelal, Jessica Allina-Pisano, Dominique Arel, David Art, Margarita Balmaceda, Liliana Botcheva-Andonova, Jim Clem, Keith Darden, Martin Dimitrov, Gerald Easter, Dmitry Gorenburg, Kelly Greenhill, Anna Grzymala-Busse, Elise Guiliano, Henry Hale, Anna Kicinger, Mark Kramer, Pauline Jones Luong, Maria Popova, Mikhail Pryadilnikov, Blair Ruble, Peter Rutland, Tom Simons, Marcela Skalková, Timothy Snyder, Dariusz Stola, Natalia Tsvetkova, Joshua Tucker, Lucan Way, and Jason Wittenberg. I also thank two anonymous reviewers of the manuscript for
Acknowledgments

Cambridge University Press for their detailed and helpful comments. I hope I have put their advice to good use.

Successful fieldwork was a crucial component of this project. For assistance and guidance with field research in the Czech Republic, Poland, Russia, Ukraine, and Switzerland, I am much obliged to many individuals who generously shared their time and knowledge with me. I am very grateful to all my interviewees, almost 130 people in total, who took time to talk to me (some on several occasions) and who often supplied me with written materials and new contacts. My special thanks go to József Györke and Christoph Bierwirth of the UNHCR Kyiv office for giving me the original opportunity to intern at the UNHCR – an experience that set me on a journey that culminated in this book – and for welcoming me back as a researcher and for putting in a good word for me at other UNHCR offices. Radhouane Nouicer, Larry Bottinick, and Marcela Skalková at the UNHCR Prague helped make the Czech part of my research a success. Jakub Boratyński, Luigi Cabrini, Chris Mahr, and Wojciech Trojan made it possible in Warsaw, and Adriano Silvestri and Olga Chernishova did the same in Moscow. For their time, advice, and assistance during field research I would also like to thank Svetlana Gannushkina, Dorota Górśka, Oksana Kisliatsa, Oksana Kiyashko, Edward Krzemień, Olena Malynov'ska, Bohdan Nahajlo, Dmitrii Pletchko, Alina Polikarpova, Natalia Prokopchuk, Viktoria Rodovnichenko, Dariusz Stola, Valentyna Subotenko, Pavel Tychtl, and Il'mi Umerov. I am also very thankful to refugees who spoke to me for sharing their stories. They have been a constant reminder of a human story behind my scholarly pursuit, a reminder that “refugee policy” affects real people, often in dramatic and life-altering ways.

Research for this study was generously supported over the years by numerous organizations, for which I am deeply grateful: the Davis Center for Russian and Eurasian Studies, the Institute for the Study of World Politics, the Harvard Ukrainian Research Institute, the MacArthur Transnational Security Program, the Mellon Foundation, the Mellon-MIT Inter-University Program on NGOs and Forced Migration, the Program for the Study of Germany and Europe of the Minda de Ginzburg Center for European Studies, Purdue University, Tufts University, and the Weatherhead Center for International Affairs at Harvard. The Davis Center for Russian and Eurasian Studies and the Harvard Ukrainian Research Institute also provided welcoming institutional homes during the writing stage of this project, made especially welcoming by Lisbeth Tarlow and Lubomyr Hajda. The Davis Center community, and especially participants of the Postcommunist Politics and Economics Workshop, has been an unfailing source of intellectual stimulation and support over the years. The Department of Political Science at Tufts University has become a wonderful new home for me in recent years, and I thank my colleagues in the department for making it such a friendly, productive, and engaging place to work.

I am also very grateful to Cambridge University Press, in particular to Lewis Bateman, for believing in this project and for patiently guiding me.
Acknowledgments

through the revisions process. I am thankful to the Journal of Comparative Politics, East European Politics and Societies, Johns Hopkins University Press, and Taylor and Francis, for permission to use materials they previously published.¹

For friendship and good cheer during the years when this book was being researched and written I thank especially Antonia Antonucci, Christoph Bierwirth, Larry Bottinick, Ted Brader, Chris Brooke, Tanya and Yulia Burmistenko, Rosa Da Costa, Michael Ferguson, Nora Hampl, Sabine Kloss-Tullius, Inga Milner, Maria Popova, Jane Rosenzweig, Vlada Tkach, and Josh Tucker.

Last but not least, special thanks are due to my family. With love and gratitude I dedicate this book to my husband, Jorge Luis Montana, and to our daughter Sofia. Jorge has been totally supportive at the most critical moments in the book-writing process, and this book would not have seen the light of day without him. Sofia has been a bundle of joy and an inspiration. And she nudged the book along, if only a little, by asking if today is the last day mama is working on the book. My life journey from Soviet Ukraine to Harvard and subsequently to an academic career in the United States would not have been possible without my immediate and extended family in Ukraine. Love, support, and guidance of my parents, Svilana and Serhiy Shevel, and grandparents, Heorhiy and Larysa Shevel and Yevgenia Safonova, shaped the formative years of my life and ultimately made this project possible. For welcoming me back home in recent years, I thank every member of the stupendous Shevel clan, particularly my aunt Larysa Bilyk and my cousin Vova Bilyk. I am especially grateful to my late father, Serhiy Shevel, for sparking my interests in academia and research, encouraging me to aim higher, and always believing in me. He was an inspiration and a role model in more ways than one and I miss him dearly.

Abbreviations

CAHAR  Ad Hoc Committee of Experts on the Legal Aspects of Territorial Asylum, Refugees, and Stateless Persons of the Council of Europe
CEAS  Common European Asylum System
CIS  Commonwealth of Independent States
ČSSD  Czech Social Democratic Party
ECHR  European Court of Human Rights
EU  The European Union
FAO  United Nations Food and Agriculture Organization
FDPs  Formerly Deported Peoples
FMS  Federal Migration Service (the Russian Federation)
FSU  Former Soviet Union
IDPs  Internally Displaced Persons
IOM  International Organization for Migration
IOs  International Organizations
IR  International Relations
IRPs  Involuntarily Relocating Persons
JHA  Justice and Home Affairs
KDU-ČSL  Christian Democratic Union – Czech Peoples Party (the Czech Republic)
KSČM  Communist Party of Bohemia and Moravia (the Czech Republic)
LDPR  Liberal Democratic Party of Russia
MOI  Ministry of Interior
MP  Member of Parliament
NIS  Newly Independent States
ODA  Civic Democratic Alliance (the Czech Republic)
ODS  Civic Democratic Party (the Czech Republic)
OSCE  Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe
PHA  Phare Horizontal Program of Asylum
PiS  Law and Justice Party (Poland)
Abbreviations

PO  Civic Platform (Poland)
PRC  Polish Red Cross
PSL  Polish Peasant Party
RMS  Regional Migration Services (Ukraine)
RSFSR  Russian Soviet Federal Socialist Republic
SCNM  State Committee for Nationalities and Migration (Ukraine)
SCNR  State Committee for Nationalities and Religions (Ukraine)
SDPU(o)  Social Democratic Party of Ukraine (united) (Ukraine)
SLD  Democratic Left Alliance (Poland)
SOZE  Society of Citizens Assisting Emigrants (Czech Republic)
SSR  Soviet Socialist Republic
UNHCR  United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UP  Labor Union party (Poland)
USSR  Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
UW  Freedom Union party (Poland)
ZHP  Polish Scouting and Guiding Association
Note on Transliteration

Russian- and Ukrainian-language material is transliterated here using the Library of Congress system with the following exceptions:

- Common spelling is employed for words or names that widely appear in English-language media (e.g. Chechnya not Chechnia, Yeltsin not Iel'tsyn)
- Y is used at the beginning of soft vowels (ya, ye, yu) that are first capital letters in words (e.g. Yushchenko not Iushchenko)
- Where people’s names are used by a person him- or herself in western publications, the names are rendered as in the existing transliteration (e.g. Palyanitsa not Palianytsia)