

## *Contents*

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page</i> xiii
<i>Preliminary note</i>	xvi
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xvii
<b>Introduction</b>	
I.1 Subject and structure of the dialogue	1
I.1.1 <i>The correctness of names</i>	1
I.1.2 <i>A map</i>	6
I.1.3 <i>Making sense of etymology</i>	11
I.2 The characters	14
I.2.1 <i>Cratylus</i>	14
I.2.2 <i>Hermogenes</i>	18
I.3 The date	19
I.3.1 <i>The dramatic date</i>	20
I.3.2 <i>The relative date</i>	20
I.4 The evidence for the text	21
<b>I Cratylus' naturalism (383a–384c)</b>	<b>23</b>
I.1 The thesis	23
I.1.1 <i>First approach to the thesis (383ab)</i>	23
I.1.2 <i>More details: Hermogenes' name (383b–384c)</i>	26
I.1.3 <i>The origin of natural names</i>	32
I.2 Before Cratylus	33
<b>2 Hermogenes' conventionalism (384c–386e)</b>	<b>37</b>
2.1 Convention and individual decision (384c–385b)	37
2.1.1 <i>First statement (384ce)</i>	37
2.1.2 <i>Public and private names (385ab)</i>	42
2.2 Truth and falsehood in sentences and names (385bd)	49
2.2.1 <i>True and false sentences (385b)</i>	49
2.2.2 <i>The parts of a sentence. True and false names (385cd)</i>	54
2.2.3 <i>Truth values and sentence structure</i>	59
2.2.4 <i>The passage's function in context</i>	62

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76347-9 - The Cratylus of Plato: A Commentary

Francesco Ademollo

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

viii

*Contents*

2.2.5	<i>Authenticity and position of the passage</i>	68
2.2.6	<i>Proclus' testimony</i>	70
2.3	Convention and individual decision: further details (385d)	72
2.4	Hermogenes and Protagoras (385e–386e)	76
2.4.1	<i>Man the measure of all things? (385e–386a)</i>	77
2.4.2	<i>The refutation of Protagoras – and of Euthydemus (386ad)</i>	81
2.4.3	<i>Conclusion: objects have a stable being (386de)</i>	86
2.5	Before Hermogenes	88
2.5.1	<i>Empedoclean and Thucydidean 'conventionalism'</i>	89
2.5.2	<i>De natura hominis and Democritus</i>	91
3	Naturalism defended (386e–390e)	95
3.1	First argument: the naturalness of actions (386e–387d)	95
3.1.1	<i>The naturalness of actions. Cutting and burning (386e–387b)</i>	95
3.1.2	<i>Speaking (387bc)</i>	100
3.1.3	<i>Naming (387cd)</i>	103
3.2	Second argument: the function of names (387d–388c)	107
3.2.1	<i>Names as instruments (387d–388c)</i>	107
3.2.2	<i>Aristotle on names as instruments</i>	114
3.3	Third argument: enter the namegiver (388c–389a)	115
3.3.1	<i>The use and the making of instruments (388cd)</i>	115
3.3.2	<i>The lawgiver as name-maker (388d–389a)</i>	117
3.3.3	<i>Who is the lawgiver?</i>	121
3.4	Fourth argument: instruments, names and forms (389a–390e)	125
3.4.1	<i>Instruments and forms (389a)</i>	125
3.4.2	<i>Generic and specific forms of tools (389bd)</i>	129
3.4.3	<i>Forms of name (389d–390a)</i>	132
3.4.4	<i>The lawgiver and the dialectician (390bd)</i>	138
3.5	Conclusion (390de)	144
4	Naturalism unfolded (390e–394e)	146
4.1	Searching for a theory (390e–392b)	146
4.2	The theory discovered. Naturalism and synonymy (392b–394e)	152
4.2.1	<i>'Scamandrius' and 'Astyanax' (392bd)</i>	152
4.2.2	<i>'Astyanax' and 'Hector' (392d–393b). The argument previewed</i>	155
4.2.3	<i>A lion begets a lion – and a king a king (393bd)</i>	159
4.2.4	<i>The relative irrelevance of letters and syllables (393de)</i>	163
4.2.5	<i>Synonymical Generation runs wild. The 'power' of names (394ab)</i>	167
4.2.6	<i>'Hector' and 'Astyanax' again (394be)</i>	172
4.3	Conclusion (394e–396c)	178
5	Naturalism illustrated: the etymologies of 'secondary' names (394e–421c)	181
5.1	The arrangement of the etymologies	182
5.1.1	<i>Analysis of 394e–421c</i>	182
5.1.2	<i>The systematic character of the etymologies</i>	189

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76347-9 - The Cratylus of Plato: A Commentary

Francesco Ademollo

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>		ix
5.1.3	<i>Platonic views in the etymologies (396bc, 399bc, 400ab, 403a–404b, 410b)</i>	191
5.2	The etymologies and the argument of the <i>Cratylus</i>	197
5.2.1	<i>Ordinary proper names put aside (397ab)</i>	197
5.2.2	<i>The etymologies as doxography, or the suicide of naturalism (400d–401a)</i>	199
5.2.3	<i>The etymology as doxography (continued): the theory of flux (401d, 402a, 411bc)</i>	201
5.3	More on the theory of flux	210
5.3.1	<i>Locomotion</i>	210
5.3.2	<i>The Penetrating Principle (412–413d)</i>	215
5.3.3	<i>Further evidence about the atomists in the Cratylus (412b, 414a, 420d)</i>	223
5.3.4	<i>Atomism in the Theaetetus</i>	225
5.3.5	<i>The Penetrating Principle again (413e–414a, 417bc, 418a–419b)</i>	227
5.3.6	<i>Flux and relativity?</i>	233
5.4	Meaning in the etymologies	233
5.5	Plato's attitude to the etymologies	237
5.5.1	<i>Seriousness in the etymologies (414c–415a, 439bc)</i>	237
5.5.2	<i>The inspiration of Euthyphro (396c–397a)</i>	241
5.5.3	<i>Humour and detachment in the etymologies (398de, 399a, 406bc)</i>	246
5.5.4	<i>The etymologies' epistemological status</i>	250
6	Naturalism illustrated: the primary names (421c–427e)	257
6.1	From secondary to primary names (421c–422c)	257
6.1.1	<i>The postulation of primary names (421c–422c)</i>	257
6.1.2	<i>Intermezzo: the meaning of ῥῆμα (399ab, 421b, e)</i>	262
6.2	The correctness of primary names (422c–424a)	267
6.2.1	<i>Introduction (422ce)</i>	267
6.2.2	<i>Indication by gestural mimesis (422e–423b)</i>	269
6.2.3	<i>Indication by vocal mimesis (423bc)</i>	271
6.2.4	<i>Vocal imitation of the essence (423c–424a)</i>	274
6.3	The imposition of primary names (424a–425b)	280
6.3.1	<i>The etymologies of primary names: false start (424ab)</i>	280
6.3.2	<i>Division of letters (424bc)</i>	281
6.3.3	<i>Division of beings (424d)</i>	285
6.3.4	<i>Matching letters and beings (424d–425a)</i>	290
6.3.5	<i>Intermezzo: names, verbs and speech (425a)</i>	293
6.3.6	<i>First assessment of Socrates' programme</i>	296
6.3.7	<i>How names are and how they should be (425ab)</i>	298
6.4	The investigation of actual primary names (425b–427d)	302
6.4.1	<i>Disclaimers and preliminaries (425b–426b)</i>	302
6.4.2	<i>Letters and primary names: the examples (426c–427c)</i>	306
6.4.3	<i>Conclusion of Socrates' survey (427cd)</i>	311
6.4.4	<i>An assessment of the mimetic survey</i>	312
6.4.5	<i>The discussion with Hermogenes concluded (427de)</i>	315

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76347-9 - The Cratylus of Plato: A Commentary

Francesco Ademollo

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

x

*Contents*

7	Naturalism discussed (427e–433b)	317
7.1	Introduction (427e–429c)	317
7.1.1	<i>Preliminary exchanges (427e–428e)</i>	317
7.1.2	<i>Better and worse names? (428e–429b)</i>	319
7.1.3	<i>Hermogenes' name, again (429bc)</i>	324
7.2	Naturalism and falsehood (429c–431c)	326
7.2.1	<i>Naturalism and the impossibility of false speaking (429cd)</i>	326
7.2.2	<i>Cratylus against false speaking (429d)</i>	332
7.2.3	<i>Cratylus against false speaking, continued</i>	335
7.2.4	<i>Socrates' defence of false speaking (430a–431c)</i>	338
7.2.5	<i>Conclusion</i>	350
7.3	Naturalism and imperfect resemblance (431c–433b)	351
7.3.1	<i>First round (431ce)</i>	351
7.3.2	<i>Second round: Cratylus' argument from spelling (431e–432a)</i>	356
7.3.3	<i>Second round: Socrates' reply and the 'Two Cratyluses' (432ad)</i>	359
7.3.4	<i>Conclusions on fine and bad names (432d–433b)</i>	369
8	Naturalism refuted and conventionalism defended (433b–439b)	383
8.1	Resemblance and convention in names (433b–435d)	383
8.1.1	<i>Preliminaries (433b–434b)</i>	383
8.1.2	<i>The sklerotes argument: conflicting letters in the same name (434bd)</i>	390
8.1.3	<i>The sklerotes argument: understanding, indication, correctness (434e–435b)</i>	395
8.1.4	<i>Convention 'contributes' to correctness (435bc)</i>	405
8.1.5	<i>Conclusions on resemblance and convention in names (435cd)</i>	413
8.1.6	<i>Convention elsewhere in the Platonic corpus</i>	424
8.1.7	<i>The ancient commentators</i>	425
8.2	Names and knowledge (435d–439b)	427
8.2.1	<i>Cratylus' view that names 'teach' (435d–436a)</i>	427
8.2.2	<i>Names might express false beliefs (436a–437d)</i>	431
8.2.3	<i>Names and the namegiver's knowledge (437d–438d)</i>	441
8.2.4	<i>Knowledge 'without names' (438d–439b)</i>	444
9	Flux and forms (439b–440e)	449
9.1	The arguments (439b–440d)	449
9.1.1	<i>The lawgivers in a whirl (439bc)</i>	449
9.1.2	<i>Flux and forms: the arguments previewed</i>	451
9.1.3	<i>Enter the forms, exeunt particulars (439cd)</i>	456
9.1.4	<i>The first argument (439d)</i>	462
9.1.5	<i>The first argument and the Theaetetus</i>	468
9.1.6	<i>The second argument (439e)</i>	473
9.1.7	<i>The third argument (439e–440a)</i>	478
9.1.8	<i>The fourth argument (440ab)</i>	482

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-76347-9 - The Cratylus of Plato: A Commentary

Francesco Ademollo

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>		xi
9.1.9	<i>Flux rejected? (440bc)</i>	483
9.1.10	<i>Conclusion (440cd)</i>	485
9.2	Epilogue (440de)	487
Appendix 1:	The text of 437d10–438b8	489
Appendix 2:	Some interpolations and non-mechanical errors in W and δ	496
<i>References</i>		497
I	<i>General index</i>	509
II	<i>Index of ancient texts</i>	517
III	<i>Index of Greek expressions</i>	533
IV	<i>Index of words discussed in the Cratylus</i>	536