

Models of Economic Liberalization

Business, Workers, and Compensation in Latin America, Spain, and Portugal

This book provides the first general theory, grounded in comparative historical analysis, that aims to explain the variation in the models of economic liberalization across Ibero-America (Latin America, Spain, and Portugal) in the last quarter of the twentieth century and the legacies they produced for the current organization of the political economies. Although the macroeconomics of effective market adjustment evolved in a similar way, the patterns of compensation delivered by neoliberal governments, and the type of actors in business and the working class that benefited from them, were remarkably different. Based on the policymaking styles and the compensatory measures employed to make market transitions politically viable, the book distinguishes three alternative models: Statist, Corporatist, and Market. Sebastián Etchemendy argues that the most decisive factors that shape adjustment paths are the type of regime and the economic and organizational power with which business and labor emerged from the inward-oriented model. The analysis stretches from the origins of state, business, and labor industrial actors in the 1930s and 1940s to the politics of compensation under neoliberalism across the Ibero-American world, including extensive fieldwork material on Spain, Argentina, and Chile.

Sebastián Etchemendy is Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science and International Studies, Torcuato Di Tella University, Argentina. He holds a B.A. from the University of Buenos Aires and a Ph.D. in Political Science from the University of California, Berkeley. He has published in the journals Comparative Politics, Comparative Political Studies, Politics and Society, and Desarrollo Económico, as well as in edited volumes on Argentine and Latin American politics. He won the Fulbright Fellowship for graduate studies in the United States and the Social Science Research Council (SSRC) Dissertation Fellowship. His dissertation, on which this book is based, was nominated by the Department of Political Science at Berkeley for the Almond Prize for Best Dissertation at the American Political Science Association. In 2007, he served as Visiting Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science at Stanford University. In 2010 and 2011, he worked as adviser to the Minister of Labor of Argentina.



Advance Praise for Models of Economic Liberalization

"Sebastián Etchemendy's new book, *Models of Economic Liberalization*, lays to rest conventional and overly general explanations of the ways in which market-based economic reforms are undertaken. The approach Etchemendy takes recognizes that structural economic reform is very much an act of political construction, and that the same general goals can be undertaken in very different ways, based on alternative political constituencies. In an analysis that conjointly treats the politics of state-business and state-labor relations in three distinct (and distinctive) pathways to reform – in Spain, Argentina, and Chile – he provides a masterful treatment that focuses on the 'compensations,' the packages of winners and losers created in different trajectories of reform, that were part and parcel of liberalization. The result is a study that gets the politics right but also sets the interest-group groundwork for what will take place after liberalization is complete."

- Marcus Kurtz, The Ohio State University

"Models of Economic Liberalization provides an original theoretical framework for understanding sectoral and cross-national variation in the political compensation of economic actors during economic liberalization. Sebastián Etchemendy shows that the mix of policies by which labor and business groups have been compensated can be explained by differences in political regimes and by variation in the political organization of economic interests during the period of import-substitution industrialization. The innovative research design that contrasts sectoral adjustment across southern Europe and Latin America allows this study to open up a new dialogue with studies of economic reform in advanced industrialized countries, such as the varieties of capitalism perspective."

— Isabela Mares, Columbia University



Models of Economic Liberalization

Business, Workers, and Compensation in Latin America, Spain, and Portugal

SEBASTIÁN ETCHEMENDY

Torcuato Di Tella University, Argentina





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521763127

© Sebastián Etchemendy 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Etchemendy, Sebastián.

Models of economic liberalization: Business, workers, and compensation in Latin America, Spain, and Portugal / Sebastián Etchemendy.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-76312-7 (hardback)

- 1. Latin America Economic policy. 2. Spain Economic policy.
- 3. Portugal Economic policy. 4. Neoliberalism Latin America.
- 5. Neoliberalism Spain. 6. Neoliberalism Portugal. I. Title.

HC125.E898 2011

339-dc22 2010051111

ISBN 978-0-521-76312-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To my parents, for all the books

To my cousin Raúl Adolfo, for that sunny morning



Contents

Acknowledgments		page ix
\mathbf{P}^{A}	ART I. THE INTELLECTUAL TERRAIN	
Ι	Overview: Models of Economic Liberalization in ISI Economies	3
2	From State to Society: Neoliberal Reform and a Theory of Compensation in ISI Economies	24
	ART II. THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF BUSINESS DJUSTMENT	
3	Compensating Business Insiders: The Origins of Statist and Corporatist Models in Spain and Argentina	53
4	Statist and Corporatist Models of Business Adjustment in Spain and Argentina: Sectoral Case Studies	88
5	Exceptions That Prove the Rule: Variation within Countries in Models of Business Adjustment	126
$\mathbf{P}A$	RT III. THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF LABOR ADJUSTMENT	
6	Compensating Labor Insiders: The Origins of Statist and Corporatist Models in Spain and Argentina	153
7	Statist and Corporatist Models of Labor Adjustment in Spain and Argentina: Sectoral Case Studies	189
$\mathbf{P}A$	ART IV. THE MARKET MODEL	
8	Compensating Outsiders: Chile's Market Model in the Comparative Framework	221
PΑ	ART V. COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES IN IBERO-AMERICA	
9	Models of Economic Liberalization in Brazil, Portugal, Peru, and Mexico	257
		vii



viii	Contents
10 Conclusions: Legacies for the Liberalized Economies and	
Varieties of Capitalism in the Developing World	300
Appendix	317
Bibliography	323
Index	351



Acknowledgments

This book was long in the making and started as a dissertation project at the Department of Political Science of the University of California, Berkeley. Therefore, I want to thank in the first place my dissertation chair, Ruth Berins Collier. Ruth simply taught me to think in comparative perspective; my intellectual debt to her is tough to measure. Both Ruth and David Collier trusted a Latin American who had never been in the United States, first to study at Berkeley and then to pursue a dissertation that was atypical because it involved two continents and two types of actors that are generally studied separately. For that support, I will always be grateful. Jonah Levy, also a member of my dissertation committee, has a type of passion for political science that reminds one of what is relevant in our research and in our profession. Finally, Peter Evans always pushed me to think ahead of the obvious and to consider the implications of the social phenomena I was studying.

Fieldwork for this project was an unforgettable experience that took me to three countries, Spain, Argentina, and Chile. With the same black leather jacket, tape recorder, and notebook, I traveled through the oil enclaves of Patagonia and Castilla-La Mancha; shipyards in Asturias; auto assembly plants in Córdoba and Barcelona; steelmills in San Nicolás, Gijón, and the Basque Country; and the business communities and policy circles of Madrid, Santiago de Chile, and Buenos Aires. This extensive field research and the book it eventually shaped could not have been possible without support from a number of individuals and institutions. The Juan March Institute in Madrid supplied me with not only institutional affiliation but also the company of a lively group of students and researchers. I want to thank, in particular, Professor Ignacio Sánchez Cuenca and the excellent librarian, Martha Peach, who made my life there a lot easier. My debt to Alvaro Espina, former Employment and Industry Secretary, is enormous. He opened for me the doors to the Spanish business and government circles. Ludolfo Paramio provided insights on the Spanish political world and contacts in the socialist union. Finally, Gabriel Saro, Robert Fishman, Sergio Santillán, Ruben Vega García, Javier Barrutia, Luis Carlos Croissier, and Mikel Navarro all offered contacts and intellectual engagement. In Chile, Javier



 \mathbf{x}

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-76312-7 - Models of Economic Liberalization: Business, Workers, and Compensation in Latin America, Spain and Portugal Sebastián Etchemendy Frontmatter More information

Acknowledgments

Couso, from Universidad Diego Portales, guided me through the political and business communities. Fabian Repetto kindly provided me with contacts among social policy analysts. Dagmar Raczynski was generous enough to discuss with me the complexities of social policy in authoritarian Chile. In Argentina, the University Torcuato Di Tella was a superb platform for field research. Pablo Gerchunoff's contacts in the business sector were essential in facilitating my interviews. Carlos Tomada kindly provided me with invaluable access to Argentine unionists. Rosalía Cortés, Marta Novick, Daniel Márquez, Antonio Jara, Agustín Salvia, and Rafael Gaviola all helped me in different ways. The fieldwork was partially funded by the Social Science Research Council IDRF grant.

I was fortunate to work in scholarly environments that made the complicated process of turning a dissertation into a book both stimulating and enjoyable. In Buenos Aires, Torcuato Di Tella University has lived up to the challenge of constructing an internationalized research university in the social sciences that is also involved in Argentine and Latin American policy and political debates. I am proud to be part of such an endeavor. In particular, Cary Smulovitz, as Chair of the Department of Political Science, friend, and "institution builder," always showed me with her example that pursuing a complex book project from this side of the world was a worthy task. I cannot forget to mention the willingness of Di Tella librarians to cope effectively with my impossible requests, always in the best mood. The semester I spent as Visiting Assistant Professor at the Department of Political Science at Stanford University was essential for polishing the general manuscript and examining secondary material from the seven countries analyzed in the book. Aside from these two institutions, I received invaluable feedback at talks and seminars I delivered at the Department of Political Science at Northwestern University; the Center for Democracy, Development and the Rule of Law of Stanford University; the Department of Political Science at the University of California at Berkeley; the Department of Political Science of Brown University; the Institute Juan March in Madrid; Universidad Alberto Hurtado in Chile; and Flacso Argentina.

I am lucky in having some friends who are great academics and were willing to read many chapters: Carlos Freytes, Grigore Pop-Eleches, Ken Dubin, and Ken Shadlen. Their suggestions made the book much better. Ben Schneider read parts of the manuscript and helped me to organize my ideas and to conduct myself within the maze of writing a book. Jorge Battaglino, Philip Kitzberger, Markus Kurtz, Jim Mahoney, Isabela Mares, Gerardo Munck, Victoria Murillo, Luis Schiumerini, and Richard Snyder also read different versions or parts of the manuscript and gave me useful comments. At Di Tella, conversations with Juan Carlos Torre, Germán Lodola, Alejandro Bonvecchi, and Carlos Gervasoni were important in clarifying my argument. The excellent reviews from Cambridge University Press and the generous guidance of Lew Bateman helped me improve and reshape central parts of the book. Andrés Schipani and Federico Fuchs offered thoughtful criticism on the labor chapters. Andrés was kind enough to provide valuable insights into the world of the unorganized workers



Acknowledgments xi

in Chile and to assemble data. Germán Lodola graciously shared with me his database on the BNDES credits. Mauricio Morales let me use his electoral database on Chile. Finally, I must thank all the businessmen, union leaders, state officials and, especially, base-level and local union activists who opened their doors to a stranger without hesitation. Most of them were generous enough to talk to me and expect nothing in return.

Other extra-academic and noninstitutional forms of encouragement are obviously crucial in finishing a long project like this one. Jorge Battaglino, Philip Kitzberger, Marcelo Ferrante, Germán Lodola, and Germán Conte are indispensable friends. It is difficult to conceive of my life in Buenos Aires without them and without our conversations over politics and soccer, among other important topics. Marcelo, my sister Mercedes, and my beloved nephew Joaquín helped keep me sane through all these years. Mercedes Chiappe lived with me through crucial parts of this process and was a source of love and support in the final stages of this book in a way I will simply never forget. The book is dedicated to my parents, César Enrique and María Angélica, and to my late cousin Raúl Adolfo. Since I was a child, my father encouraged me toward a life of books and politics. He supplied me with contacts among his fellow Argentine business executives, and he was always ready to listen to and mostly disagree with my political ideas. Without his help and his love, this book would have never happened. I am sure he would have remembered, as I do, when I was eighteen and he put a book by his former professor, Gino Germani, into my hands.

Buenos Aires, June 2011