Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-0-521-76288-5 — Reasonable Disagreement: A Theory of Political Morality Christopher McMahon Index More Information

## Index

accommodation 22–23, 100 accommodationist preferences 114, 115 Adorno, Theodor 152 affirmative action 87 Anglo-American model 147 apology and official repudiation 193 distinguished from official repudiation 193 appraisal of other societies 142 assisted living 72, 96 authority and compliance with the law 100-102, 105 de facto 100 legitimacy of 100, 103, 104, 175 of managers 181 autonomy and cultural change 185, 189 political 118, 125, 149, 175, 180, 182 bargaining 53, 105-106 basic structure 114–116, 125, 127, 171 ideal form of as basis for moral criticism 171 beauty 45 bias 13, 21 Blackburn, Simon 66 blame 161 Boghossian, Paul 136 Boyd, Richard 31 Brandom, Robert 39 Brenner, Robert 127 burdens of judgment 20-21, 25, 81 and perspectives on reasons 25-26 capitalism 112-113

Chang, Ruth 59 Christensen, David 14 Christianity, conversion to 185–186 claims 56–57, 71, 85 codes of honor 190

cognitive limitations, human 76 cognitivism 65-66 cohabitation 110 Cohen, G. A. 88 Cohen, Joshua 114 collective agents 183 and apology 192-193 Collingwood, R. G. 42 communist dictatorship 116 concepts alteration through deliberation 108 and philosophical theories 93-94 as form to motivational matter 109, 136, 142, 154, 163, 167 descriptive 39 evaluative 44, 45 moral 38, 129, 160 normative and evaluative, see concepts, evaluative and concepts, moral normative and evaluative, epistemic access to in the past 163 possession of 38, 81-84 religious 117, 149 similarity of 83-84 stretching of 110 conceptual change 84, 115, 146, 164 and non-argumentative force 111, 116, 136, 139, 146, 151, 155 conceptual-cum-social process 115, 116, 117, 121, 126, 134–135, 151, 171, 178 and struggle 121-122 concession 19-20, 54 higher-order 19 constructivism 27-28, 61-62 conventions 132, 133-134 cooperation 52, 69 and economic structure 156, 178 cosmopolitan 157 in border lands 140 coordination proposals 98

200

cultural deprivation 185

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-0-521-76288-5 — Reasonable Disagreement: A Theory of Political Morality Christopher McMahon Index More Information

> Danto, Arthur 166 deconstruction 153 deliberation, shared 71, 73, 80-81, 95, 106-108, 111, 112, 117, 146 deliberative democracy 2-3 democracy, liberal 147-153, 154-155 Derrida, Jacques 153 despotism 148, 150-151, 155, 179 and the conquest of the Americas 186 as checked by democracy 154 difference principle 90, 91 disagreement 70 about justice or fairness 21-22 about normative and evaluative questions 18 and argument 70-71 as morally required 17, 18 as reason to change one's mind 15 as reason to reconsider 69 as reason to suppose a mistake 15 distinguished from practical conflict 26, 37 religious 68 discrimination 99, 126 as unfair 87 dispositions cooperative 51-52 extrapolative 74, 107, 110 extrapolative, catching of 43 motivational 46, 80 motivational, absence of 63–64 motivational, as matter to conceptual form 109, 142, 154, 167 to make or seek concessions 51, 52-53, 63, 75, 84-85, 108, 179 divine corporation 117, 170 dominance 113, 121, 125, 130, 171, 173-174 and democracy 113 and immigration 138-139 and sexual hierarchy 181 narration of reversal of 174 reversal of 172, 173-174 economic structure 178 empirical fact questions of 10, 13, 125 epistemic peers 13 equality 89 evidence conclusive 13, 14 first-order 15 inconclusiveness of 10–11 expertise and fallibility 13

```
and intuition 11, 12
in social sciences 12
expressivism 65–66
```

### Index

201

fairness and burden of living with perceived moral error 103. 116 as a kind of choiceworthiness 55-56 as a moral universal 143 broad 86, 92, 105, 143 concept of 55 contrasted with unfairness 55 impossibility of an ahistorical principle of 54 narrow 71, 85, 91, 104, 143 sense of 53-54, 55, 75, 80, 91, 96, 134, 137, 143, 159 see also reasonableness as fairness fatalism 149, 151, 152 feminism 170 Fodor, Jerry 38, 43, 83 Foucault, Michel 178 Frankfurt School 151, 152 Frege-Geach problem 66 Geuss, Raymond 152 Gibbard, Allan 66 globalization 155-156 Goodin, Robert 22 good-judgments 44 Goodman, Nelson 4, 36, 50, 118 Gutmann, Amy and Dennis Thompson 22, 23 Habermas, Jürgen 2, 25, 34–35, 77, 111, 152 Harman, Gilbert 131 Hegel, G. W. F. 164 hierarchy 143, 168, 170, 171, 172 and intrasocietal communication 179 and ownership of productive property 180-181 as an ideal 174, 179, 182 characterized 174-175 sexual 181-182 history modern conception of 168 philosophy of 3 Hobbes, Thomas 186, 187 Horgan, Terry and Mark Timmons 43, 66 Hurley, S. L. 32, 82

idolatry 186 indoctrination 148, 151 inference to the best explanation 164 injustice, present and past 183–184

judgment history of 75, 77, 81, 84, 114, 157, 162, 170 power of 44, 49, 107, 109, 126, 135 judgments all-things-considered 50, 58–59, 80–81 as shaping motivation 50 Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-0-521-76288-5 — Reasonable Disagreement: A Theory of Political Morality Christopher McMahon Index More Information

#### 202

judgments (cont.) correctness of 61 of fairness 57, 63 moral, see moral judgments iustice as luck neutralization 88 global 157 political 19 theories of 72 Kant, Immanuel 52 Kelly, Thomas 14 Korsgaard, Christine 41 Kripke, Saul 39 Larmore, Charles 1 literary skill 76 localism 131 and the past 159, 168 distinguished from relativism 133-136 Locke, John 123 lottery 104 Mackie, J. L. 27 many-sidedness 120 Marx, Karl 178 McDowell, John 47, 48 meta-ethics 3 characterized 26 relation to reasonable disagreement of 27 method of majority rule 104, 106, 151 Mill, John Stuart 46, 108, 119, 127 Millikan, Ruth Garrett 41 Moody-Adams, Michelle 131, 172 Moore, G. E. 30 moral appraisal of the past, two approaches to 164, 173-174 moral judgments 27 about possibilities 65 as target setting 32-33, 34, 37 of political morality 33, 57 motivational content of 63 universal validity of 123 moral myopia 30 moral nominalism 4, 27, 35-36, 60, 61, 68, 77, 114, 122, 129 and judgments of alien social systems 142, 144 and timeless moral truths 161, 176 contrasted with debunking theories 178 contrasted with parametric universalism 176 moral normativity as equated with the zone of reasonable disagreement 127 as possessing a history 128, 129, 135, 159-161,

as possessing a history 128, 129, 135, 159–161, 167–168, 171

## Index

European 186-187, 188-189 evolution of 122-123, 127-128, 162-163 evolution of as a non-logical process 172 evolution of as part of the general historical process 128, 165, 167 indigenous 188, 189-190 moral properties, as identical with non-moral properties 31 moral rationalism 29 moral realism and agreement 70 and evolution of moral thinking 122, 160, 173 as unable to provide for inconclusive evidence 28, 29 distinguished from constructivism 27, 61-62 naturalistic 30-32 naturalistic vs. non-naturalistic 28 non-naturalistic 28-30 moral reasons 35 Humean theory of 31 moral thinking, evolution of 122 morally important social values 35, 85-86 motivation cooperative 136 kinds of 47 rational 49, 57, 62–63 mullahs 149 Nagel, Thomas 42, 177 narratives and periodization 166 historical 165-167 minimalist 166 national defense 86 need, concept of 72 nominalism descriptive 43-44 moral, see moral nominalism normativity normative power 177-178 normative questions and ought-questions 31 normative reasons, Humean theory of 31-32 one-sidedness 120 ought-judgments 45 as recording logical facts 34 Harman's two kinds 131-132, 145, 169 parametric universalism 175-177 path dependence 107 patriarchy 181 Patterson, Orlando 124 personal identity 184

Pettit, Philip 16, 42, 130, 192

philosophers 94-95

philosophical theories of the good polity 93-94, 96 Plantinga, Alvin 38 political association 98 political morality 51, 60, 135 as morality of authority and property 123, 180, 181 future conceptions of 148, 153-154 past conceptions of 161 requirements of as a priori 123, 124, 143 scope of 162 political speech, freedom of 119, 122 post-colonialism 153, 156 post-modernism 163, 165 power 118 pragmatic procedure for changing minds 109-111 and non-argumentative force III principles, general 79 proper functioning 38-39, 40-43, 159, 176 and reconsideration 69 as non-natural attribute 67 construed realistically 40, 129, 159, 178 fallibility of awareness of 41 linguisitic 48, 63 skepticism concerning 115 social dimension of 42-43 property 123, 180 proxies 144-145, 169-170 public good, the 85, 86, 124, 125 Putnam, Hilary 130 quasi-realism 66 Quine, Willard Van Orman 39 Rawls, John 20, 21-22, 81, 90, 94, 112 rationality 42, 177 reality effect 166 reason 157 see also rationality reasonable disagreement about compensation for past wrongs 190-191 about economic questions 10-11 about historical questions 167 about narrow and broad fairness 92 about questions of political morality 33, 63, 77 about relative weight of reasons 81 among experts 9, 10, 148 and burden of living with perceived moral error 103-104 and inconclusive evidence 10 and interpretation of concepts 79 and mutual misunderstanding 83 and the whole moral truth 120 as explained by moral nominalism 77, 81 as grounded in different histories of judgment

#### Index

203

as grounded in employment of different terms 80 as grounded in the possession of different concepts 137-138 as presupposing mutual understanding 137–138, 146, 157 as replacing relativism 141 as requiring a non-realist meta-ethics 32 as revealed by history of a dispute 25-26, 103, 120 as surviving shared deliberation 77-79, 92, 112 assumed to exist 6 between philosophers and non-philosophers 95 difficulty of providing examples of 9 distinguished from "unreasonable" disagreement 37-38 in the moral evaluation of the past 170 marks of 2, 7, 9, 25-26, 68, 92, 98 resolution of 99-100, 103-104, 105 second-order 147, 150, see also concessions, higher-order tasks of an account of 8-9 why problematic 7-9 zone of, see zone of reasonable disagreement reasonable rejection 24 as presupposing understanding 137-138, 146, 157 reasonableness and concession 19-20, 53 and questions of empirical fact 125 as competence 8, 18-19 as fairness 19-20, 23, 53, 147 as a mental capacity 20 on the part of immigrants 139 two senses of 3-4, 18-20, 57 reasoning and weighing claims 20 by analogy 72, 77, 94, 96 in good faith 1 with general principles 79 reasons, relative strength of 58-59, 174 rectification and inheritance of claims 188-190 of inherited injustice 191 natural 184 two forms of 183-184 reenactment 42, 55, 57, 162 reflective equilibrium 94, 96 reflective understanding 151, 171 relativism cultural 131 moral 5, 129-130 of distance 141 relevant similarity 40, 73 in evaluative judgments 46-47

12, 21, 133, 157

# CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-0-521-76288-5 — Reasonable Disagreement: A Theory of Political Morality Christopher McMahon Index More Information

#### 204

reparations 182-184 republicanism 154 Richardson, Henry 22 right, world of 51, 60 Roman Empire 140 Rorty, Richard 76 Rousseau, Jean-Jacques 177 Scanlon, T. M. 4, 24, 45, 51, 53, 175 Schneewind, J. B. 117 serfdom 127 Shafer-Landau, Russ 27, 30, 61 Sharia law 138 Skinner, Quentin 162 slavery 123–125, 133, 135 and autonomy 182 as necessarily unfair 124, 142–143, 161 general acceptance of 125 reparations for 183-184 Smith, Michael 37, 41 social organization 178 social prosperity 87-88, 89 socialism 112-113 Spanish Inquisition 187 state, defined 125, 140 Sturgeon, Nicholas 31 Sunstein, Cass 23 supervenience 28, 67 and multiple realizability 67

#### Index

target setting, see judgments, moral, as target setting taste, cultivation of 48 testimony 163 truth, moral 61-62 equated with zone of reasonable disagreement 120 parts of 120 unreasonableness 23, 126–128, 149, 168, 179 Van Roojen, Mark 64 Waldron, Jeremy 21 Wedgwood, Ralph 82 Wilde, Oscar 80, 137 Williams, Bernard 36, 124, 141, 143, 148, 150, 151, 161, 166, 171 Wittgenstein, Ludwig 38 worlds evaluative 50, 60 moral 58, 60, 62, 63, 118, 157, 158, 160, 163–164 social, of the past 164

Young, Robert 153

zone of reasonable disagreement 37, 94–95, 103, 116, 128, 140, 179 as core of wider disagreement 78 understood counterfactually 93, 95, 98, 128, 134, 137, 148