

MILL AND PATERNALISM

Many discussions of J. S. Mill's concept of liberty focus too narrowly on *On Liberty* and fail to acknowledge that Mill's treatment of related issues elsewhere may modify its leading doctrines. *Mill and Paternalism* demonstrates how a contextual reading suggests that in *Principles of Political Economy*, and also his writings on Ireland, India and on domestic issues like land reform, Mill proposed a substantially more interventionist account of the state than *On Liberty* seems to imply. This helps to explain his sympathies for socialism after 1848, as well as his Malthusianism and feminism, which, in conjunction with Harriet Taylor's views, are central to his later discussions of the family and marriage. Feminism, indeed, is shown to provide the answer to the problem which most agitated Mill, overpopulation. Thus Gregory Claeys sheds new lights on many of Mill's overarching preoccupations, including the theory of liberty at the heart of *On Liberty*.

GREGORY CLAEYS is Professor of the History of Political Thought at Royal Holloway, University of London. His previous publications include *Imperial Sceptics: British Critics of Empire, 1850–1920* (2010) and *Citizens and Saints: Politics and Anti-Politics in Early British Socialism* (1989). He has also edited *The Cambridge History of Nineteenth Century Political Thought* (2011), with Gareth Stedman Jones, and *The Cambridge Companion to Utopian Literature* (2010).

MILL AND PATERNALISM

GREGORY CLAEYS

Royal Holloway, University of London



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-0-521-76108-6 — Mill and Paternalism
 Gregory Claeys
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521761086

© Gregory Claeys 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2013

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Claeys, Gregory.

Mill and paternalism / Gregory Claeys, Royal Holloway, University of London.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-76108-6

1. Mill, John Stuart, 1806–1873. 2. Paternalism. I. Title.

B1607.C53 2013

192 – dc23 2012032868

ISBN 978-0-521-76108-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

*To the staff of Ward A9 of the Hammersmith Hospital, London,
from surgeon to cleaner, Albanian to Zimbabwean, for
their tender mercies, with heartfelt gratitude.*

*Secondly, to twenty years of students in Royal Holloway's
'Victorian Social and Political Thought' course, who first heard
and probed many of this book's arguments, and
inspired me to push them further.*

And finally, to M.T.L., epitome of feline excellence, RIP.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i>	ix
Introduction: Mill, liberty and paternalism: context, intention and interpretation		I
Mill, liberty and paternalism		I
Negative liberty and ideal character		I
The value, rights and duties of interference: the role of <i>On Liberty</i>		8
Models of authority: Bentham, Malthus, Carlyle, the Saint-Simonians and Comte		16
Evidence of authority: ‘henpecked’ restated		34
Self-dependence: the critique of blind paternalism		42
Conclusion		59
1 Intervention, progress and the state – domestic and foreign		61
Mill and domestic reform		61
The scope of government		61
Taxation and inheritance		70
Poor relief		76
Franchise regulations		79
Education		83
Miscellaneous issues respecting state intervention		88
Foreign intervention: India and Ireland		93
India: ‘parental despotism’		99
Ireland and land reform		108
Conclusion		118
2 Mill, socialism and collective autonomy		123
Owenism and Saint-Simonism: from the mid 1820s to c. 1840		128
From ‘Coleridge’ (1840) to ‘The Claims of Labour’ (1845) 1848		134 139
Land, cooperation and the ‘Chapters on Socialism’, 1852–73		153

	The 'Chapters on Socialism' and the limits of Mill's socialism	162
	Conclusion: red in context?	166
3	Rethinking <i>On Liberty</i> : superstition, expediency and family values	173
	Introduction: the 'strongest case'	173
	Superstition and family values	180
	Mill's Malthusian reputation	205
	Conclusion	209
	Conclusion: the aims of positive paternalism: equal association and radical meritocracy	211
	The argument restated	211
	Mill and paternalism	219
	<i>Bibliography</i>	226
	<i>Index</i>	249

Acknowledgements

I am grateful to the staff of the London Library; the Inter-Library Loan department at Royal Holloway; the British Library; the Cambridge University Library; the Hull History Centre, University of Hull; the International Institute of Social History, Amsterdam; the Library, Somerville College, Oxford; and the Archives, the London School of Economics. At Cambridge University Press I have benefitted from the guidance of Richard Fisher, as ever, and of Liz Friend-Smith. To Michael Levin I owe a special debt for his attentive reading of an earlier draft of the book. For references and miscellaneous advice I would also like to thank Jocelyn Betts, Annabel Brett, Thomas C. Jones, Philip Schofield, Florian Schui, Quentin Skinner, Georgios Varouxakis and Donald Winch.

An earlier version of Chapter 2 appeared as ‘Justice, Independence and Industrial Democracy: the Development of John Stuart Mill’s Views on Socialism’, *Journal of Politics*, 49 (1987), 122–147. Chapter 3 was first presented at the Bicentenary Conference on John Stuart Mill held at University College London in 2006.