

BECOMING HUMAN

The Upper Palaeolithic era of Europe has left an abundance of evidence for symbolic activities, such as direct representations of animals and other features of the natural world, personal adornments, and elaborate burials, as well as other vestiges that are more abstract and cryptic. These behaviours are also exhibited by populations throughout the world, from the prehistoric period through to the present day. How can we interpret these activities? What do they tell us about the beliefs and priorities of the people who carried them out? How do these behaviours relate to ideologies, cosmology, and understanding of the world? What can they tell us about the emergence of ritual and religious thought? And how do the activities of humans in prehistoric Europe compare with those of their predecessors there and elsewhere?

In this volume, fifteen internationally renowned scholars contribute essays that explore the relationship between symbolism, spirituality, and humanity in the prehistoric societies of Europe and traditional societies elsewhere. The volume is richly illustrated with fifty halftones and twenty-four colour plates.

Colin Renfrew is Emeritus Disney Professor and Senior Fellow of the McDonald Institute for Archaeological Research at Cambridge University. He is the author and editor of many publications, including *Archaeology: Theories, Methods and Practice*, with Paul Bahn, which is one of the standard textbooks on the subject.

Iain Morley is a Research Fellow of Darwin College and Fellow of the McDonald Institute for Archaeological Research at Cambridge University. The author of numerous articles in academic journals and books, he is also coeditor, with Colin Renfrew, of *Image and Imagination: A Global Prehistory of Figurative Representation*.

BECOMING HUMAN: INNOVATION IN PREHISTORIC MATERIAL AND SPIRITUAL CULTURE

Edited by

COLIN RENFREW

*McDonald Institute for Archaeological Research,
Cambridge University*

IAIN MORLEY

*McDonald Institute for Archaeological Research,
Cambridge University*



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521734660

© Cambridge University Press 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Becoming human: innovation in prehistoric material and spiritual culture/[edited by] Colin Renfrew, Iain Morley.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-87654-4 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-73466-0 (pbk.)

1. Religion, Prehistoric. 2. Anthropology of religion. 3. Material culture – Europe. 4. Paleolithic period – Europe. 5. Europe – Antiquities. I. Renfrew, Colin, 1937– II. Morley, Iain, 1975– III. Title

GN799.R4B43 2009

306.0936–dc22 2008020473

ISBN 978-0-521-87654-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-73466-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.

Contents

<i>List of Figures and Plates</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Picture Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Contributors</i>	xiii
<i>Foreword by Mary Ann Meyers</i>	xvii
1 Introduction – Becoming human: changing perspectives on the emergence of human values <i>Colin Renfrew</i>	1
2 The emergence of symbolic thought: the principal steps of hominisation leading towards greater complexity <i>Henry de Lumley</i>	10
SECTION I: AFRICAN ORIGINS, EUROPEAN BEGINNINGS, AND WORLD PREHISTORY	
3 The origins of symbolism, spirituality, and shamans: exploring Middle Stone Age material culture in South Africa <i>Christopher Henshilwood</i>	29
4 Neanderthal symbolic behaviour? <i>Jane M. Renfrew</i>	50
5 Identifying ancient religious thought and iconography: problems of definition, preservation, and interpretation <i>Paul S. C. Taçon</i>	61
6 Situating the creative explosion: universal or local? <i>Colin Renfrew</i>	74
SECTION II: APPROACHES TO ‘ART AND RELIGION’	
7 The roots of art and religion in ancient material culture <i>Merlin Donald</i>	95

8	The archaeology of early religious practices: a plea for a hypothesis-testing approach <i>Francesco d'Errico</i>	104
9	Out of the mind: material culture and the supernatural <i>Steven Mithen</i>	123
10	Of people and pictures: the nexus of Upper Palaeolithic religion, social discrimination, and art <i>David Lewis-Williams</i>	135
11	Ritual and music: parallels and practice, and the Palaeolithic <i>Iain Morley</i>	159
SECTION III: THE EUROPEAN EXPERIENCE		
12	Materiality and meaning-making in the understanding of the Palaeolithic 'arts' <i>Margaret W. Conkey</i>	179
13	Sticking bones into cracks in the Upper Palaeolithic <i>Jean Clottes</i>	195
14	Cognition and climate: why is Upper Palaeolithic cave art almost confined to the Franco-Cantabrian region? <i>Paul Mellars</i>	212
SECTION IV: REFLECTIONS ON THE ORIGINS OF SPIRITUALITY		
15	Interdisciplinary perspectives on human origins and religious awareness <i>J. Wentzel van Huyssteen</i>	235
16	Innovation in material and spiritual culture: exploring conjectured relationships <i>Keith Ward</i>	253
	<i>Index</i>	269

List of Figures and Plates

Figures

2.1	Chopper on a trachyte pebble, Hadar, Ethiopia.	<i>page</i> 11
2.2	Rhyolite flake, Hadar, Ethiopia.	12
2.3	Chopper on a quartz pebble, Omo, Ethiopia.	12
2.4	Quartz flake, Omo, Ethiopia.	13
2.5	Basalt handaxe, Afar, Ethiopia.	13
2.6	Quartz handaxe, Caune de l’Arago, France.	14
2.7	Hornblend handaxe (Durandal), Caune de l’Arago, France.	15
2.8	Handaxe, Nadaouiyeh, Syria.	15
2.9	Hearth at Menez Dregan I, France.	16
2.10	Hearth at Terra Amata, France.	17
2.11	Accumulation of human remains, Sima de los Huesos, Atapuerca, Spain.	18
2.12	Individual mortality according to age and sex at Sima de los Huesos, Atapuerca, Spain.	19
2.13	Child’s grave, Qafzeh cave, Israel.	20
2.14	Neanderthal burial, La Ferrassie, France.	21
2.15	Neanderthal burial, La Chapelle-aux-Saints, France.	22
2.16	Statue of a man with lion’s head from Hohle Fels, Germany.	23
2.17	“The Sorcerer”, Mount Bego, France.	24
2.18	“The divine primordial couple”, Mount Bego, France.	25
5.1	Symmetrical handaxe from Sterkfontein, South Africa.	64
6.1	Venus of Willendorf, Austria.	80
6.2	Venus of Brassempouy, France.	81
6.3	Venus of Lespugue, France.	82
6.4	Map of the distribution of Venus figurines c. 23,000 to c.21,000 B.C.	83
6.5	Venus of Dolni Věstonice, Moravia.	84
6.6	Spear thrower from Mas d’Azil, France.	85
6.7	Map of locations of spear-throwers from Palaeolithic Europe.	86

6.8	Venus of Laussel, France.	87
6.9	Clay bison, Tuc d'Audobert, France.	88
6.10	“Female sex” carved in bas-relief, Abri Cellier, France.	89
8.1	Bovid rib with blood vessel lines, Pech de l'Azé, France.	108
8.2	Perforated cave-bear femur, Divje babe II, Slovenia.	109
8.3	Occurrence of “modern” traits in the African, Near Eastern, and European archaeological records.	110
8.4	Nassarius kraussianus shell beads, Blombos cave, South Africa.	111
13.1	Finger tracings superimposed on cave bear scratches, Chauvet cave, France.	197
13.2	Children's footprints in a side gallery of Niaux Cave, France.	198
13.3	Charcoal heaps, Chauvet cave, France.	199
13.4	Stone plaquette and bones inserted in the ground, Enlène, France.	201
13.5	Bone pieces forcibly inserted into cracks, Enlène, France.	203
13.6	Bone pieces forcibly inserted into cracks, Enlène, France.	204
13.7	Reindeer antler inserted into soil in a recess, Fontanet cave, France.	205
13.8	Cave bear humerus inserted halfway into the ground, Chauvet cave, France.	206
13.9	Cave bear humerus inserted halfway into the ground, Chauvet cave, France.	207
13.10	Bone inserted into crack near stencilled hands, Gargas cave, France.	207
14.1	Distribution of Upper Palaeolithic cave art in Europe.	213
14.2	Reconstructed climatic fluctuations in central France over the past sixty thousand years.	215
14.3	Reconstructed distribution of vegetation zones in Europe at the Last Glacial Maximum.	216
14.4	Frequencies of different animals during Palaeolithic occupation of La Ferrassie, France.	218
14.5	Percentages of reindeer remains from Upper Palaeolithic sites in southwestern France (upper diagram) compared with those from preceding Mousterian (Neanderthal) sites.	219
14.6	Characteristic stone and bone tools of the Azilian period in southwest France.	226

Plates

Colour plates follow page xvi

- I Rose coloured handaxe (Excalibur) Sima de los Huesos, Atapuerca Spain.

List of Figures and Plates

ix

- II Statue of a man with lion's head from
Hohlenstein-Stadel, Germany.
- III Scene from Lascaux shaft, Lascaux cave, France.
- IV Engraved ochre from Blombos Cave, South Africa.
- V Nassarius kraussianus marine shell beads from
Blombos Cave, South Africa.
- VI Therianthrope and Dynamic Figure, Kakadu
National Park, Australia.
- VII Kangaroo-headed being with legs crossed, Kakadu
National Park, Australia.
- VIII The "Eagle Ancestor", Wollemi National Park, Australia.
- IX Early depiction of a Rainbow Serpent, Kakadu
National Park, Australia.
- X Rainbow Serpent and 13 flying foxes, Australia.
- XI Double-headed thylacine, Kakadu National Park,
Australia.
- XII Thylacine with a woven bag, Arnhem Land, Australia.
- XIII Bison on the ceiling of Altamira Cave, Spain.
- XIV Horse, Le Portel Cave, France.
- XV Rhinoceroses, Chauvet cave, France.
- XVI Feline, Apollo 11 Cave, Namibia.
- XVII Hand stencils, Gargas, France.
- XVIII Hand stencils, Argentina.
- XIX Palimpsest of painting and engraving, Lascaux, France.
- XX Monolith at Göbekli Tepe, Turkey.
- XXI Monolith at Göbekli Tepe, Turkey.
- XXII Modified pigments and ochred stone artefacts.
- XXIII Near-contemporary shamanic and ritual artefacts.
- XXIV Recent deposits of small beads and other deposits,
Arroe Rock, Montana, USA.

Picture Acknowledgements

Thanks are given to the following photographers, authors, or institutions who hold copyright to the photographs used in the figures and plates:

Natural History Museum, London: Figure 6.1, Figure 6.3, Figure 6.5;

Jean Vertut and Paul Bahn: Figure 6.2, Figure 6.6, Figure 6.8, Figure 6.9, Figure 6.10;

Pedro A. Saura Ramos: Plate XIII;

Jean Clottes: Plate XIV, Plate XV, Plate XVII;

State Museum, Windhoek, Namibia: Plate XVI;

Paul Bahn: Plate XVIII;

Norbert Aujoulat, Plate XIX;

Klaus Schmidt: Plate XX, Plate XXI;

Erella Hovers: Plate XXII 1–3 (photograph by Gabi Laron);

L. S. Dubin: Plate XXII a, b, c, e, g;

Roger de la Harpe: Plate XXIII d, f;

M.-L. Beffa and L. Delaby: Plate XXIII h (© Publications Scientifiques du Muséum national d'Histoire naturelle, Paris).

Contributors

Colin Renfrew is Emeritus Disney Professor and Senior Fellow of the McDonald Institute for Archaeological Research at Cambridge University. He is the author and editor of many publications, including *Archaeology: Theories, Methods and Practice*, with Paul Bahn, which is one of the standard textbooks on the subject.

Iain Morley is a Research Fellow of Darwin College and Fellow of the McDonald Institute for Archaeological Research at Cambridge University. The author of numerous articles in academic journals and books, he is also coeditor, with Colin Renfrew, of *Image and Imagination: A Global Prehistory of Figurative Representation*.

Jean Clottes, Conservateur Général du Patrimoine, is President of the International Federation of Rock Art Organizations and former Scientific Adviser for prehistoric art to the French Ministry of Culture. He is also the editor of *INORA (International Newsletter on Rock Art)*. He is coauthor, with Jean Courtin and Luc Vanrell, of *Cosquer redécouvert* (2005).

Margaret W. Conkey is Professor of Anthropology and Director of the Archaeological Research Facility at the University of California, Berkeley. She has published extensively on the interpretation of the visual culture and “arts” of Paleolithic Europe, including the coedited volume, with Olga Soffer et al., *Beyond Art: Pleistocene Image and Symbol* (1997).

Francesco d’Errico is a CNRS Director of Research at the Institut de Préhistoire et de Géologie du Quaternaire, University of Bordeaux I,

and Research Professor in the Department of Anthropology at the George Washington University in Washington, DC. He is the author of two monographs and more than 150 journal articles, including “*Nassarius kraussianus* shell beads from Blombos Cave: Evidence for Symbolic Behaviour in the Middle Stone Age” (2005), with Christopher Henshilwood, Marian Vanhaeren, and Karen van Niekerk.

Merlin Donald is Professor Emeritus at Queen’s University, Ontario, and Adjunct Professor of Cognitive Science at Case Western Reserve University. He is the author of many scientific papers and two books, *Origins of the Modern Mind: Three Stages in the Evolution of Cultural Cognition* (1991) and *A Mind So Rare: The Evolution of Human Consciousness* (2001).

Christopher Henshilwood is Research Professor and holds a South African Research Chair in the Origins of Modern Human Behaviour at the Institute for Human Evolution, University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa. He is Professor of African prehistory at the Institute for Archaeology, History, Culture, and Religion at the University of Bergen, Norway. He is the author of many academic articles including, with Curtis W. Marean, the article in *Current Anthropology*, “The Origin of Modern Human Behavior: A Review and Critique of Models and Test Implications” (2003).

David Lewis-Williams is Professor Emeritus at the University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. He was founder and formerly director of the Rock Art Research Institute and is the author of *The Mind in the Cave: Consciousness and the Origins of Art* (2004).

Henry de Lumley is director of the Institut de Paléontologie Humaine in Paris, France. He has organized many large archaeology excavations in the southeast of France, and has published numerous journal articles and monographs, including *La grand histoire des premiers Hommes Européens* (2007).

Paul Mellars is Professor of Prehistory and Human Evolution at the University of Cambridge. He is the author of many academic papers and has authored and edited many books, including *The Neanderthal Legacy: An Archaeological Perspective from Western Europe* (1996).

Contributors

xv

Steven Mithen is Professor of Early Prehistory and Head of the School of Human and Environmental Sciences at the University of Reading. He is the author of *The Singing Neanderthals: The Origins of Music, Language, Mind and Body* (2005).

Jane M. Renfrew is a Fellow and De Brie College Lecturer in Archaeology at Lucy Cavendish College, University of Cambridge. She is the author of *Palaeoethnobotany: The Prehistoric Food Plants of the Near East and Europe* (1973).

Paul S. C. Taçon is Professor of Anthropology and Archaeology in the School of Arts, Griffith University, Queensland. He is coeditor, with Christopher Chippindale, of *The Archaeology of Rock-Art* (1999) and the author of more than 135 academic and popular papers on prehistoric art, body art, material culture, colour, cultural evolution, identity, and contemporary indigenous issues.

J. Wentzel van Huyssteen is Princeton Theological Seminary's James I. McCord Professor of Theology and Science. He teaches courses on the role of worldviews in theological reflection, theology and the problem of rationality, theology and cosmology, and theology and evolution. His lecture series at the University of Edinburgh was published as *Alone in the World? Human Uniqueness in Science and Theology* (2006).

Keith Ward is an Emeritus Student of Christ Church, Oxford, where he was formerly Regius Professor of Divinity. He has also been Professor of Moral Theology at London University; Professor of the History of Religion at London; and Professor of Divinity at Gresham College, London. He was Dean of Trinity Hall, Cambridge, where he is now an Honorary Fellow. He is also a Fellow of the British Academy. He is the author of *The Big Questions in Science and Religion* (2008).

Foreword

Sir John Templeton believed that in their quest to comprehend foundational realities, scientists, philosophers, and theologians have much to learn about and from one another. For a decade now, the Humble Approach Initiative, a program of the John Templeton Foundation, has held symposia with a changing international cast of the most creative scholars from many disciplines who come together to pursue big, difficult, and invariably riveting questions. Some that have long engaged me, as student and teacher, stem from the fact that religious ideas often seem to develop in interaction with material culture. Looking at Palaeolithic art and recognizing that it is unlikely that there is only one meaning to thirty-five thousand years of image making, it is intriguing, nevertheless, to speculate whether these magnificent Ice Age representations of animal forms, rare human figures, and mysterious signs on cave walls may be expressions of religious feelings and notions – and, indeed, may actually shape subsequent emotions and concepts by serving as “tools” for future ritual practice. In light of a rich history of interpretation of these masterpieces – for example, theories that they signal a passage from the work world to the play world in a new era of free time and abundance; suggest totemism; reflect magical practices undertaken to bring about such desired ends as a plentiful hunt, fertility, and the destruction of enemies; or express concepts related to the structure and organization of the living world – what evidence, if any, exists that innovations in material cultures may be related to developments in religious ideas and behaviour? Can we infer anything from early prehistoric images about a possible link between spiritual development and human cultural creations? Is the deep cave filled with engravings and paintings a precursor of the shrine and temple? What was

the artist thinking as he or she drew? What accounts for the appearance of icons in some early prehistoric societies and not in others? Can studies of early cognition provide clues to the roots of spirituality in the underground chambers of the world? Does the content of mobiliary and parietal art, their archaeological contexts, and ethnological comparisons support a shamanic or other religious interpretation of subterranean picture making? Could the material expressions of the first biologically modern humans affect as well as reflect emerging systems of belief? Or are the productive, functional, and symbolic categories of Palaeolithic art makers forever beyond our grasp? Even as experts laboured to control the spread of fungi and bacteria in one world-renowned cave, France's celebrated Lascaux in the southernmost part of the Dordogne, the Périgord Noir, thirteen scientists and theologians met nearby in the village of Les Eyzies, the "capital of prehistory", to explore conjectured relationships between innovations in material and spiritual cultures, in the spring of 2004. One brought from a Middle Stone Age site in South Africa a few tiny perforated shells, dating back seventy-five thousand years, which may have been worn as beads and, if so, indicated symbolic thinking; all brought perspectives that caused their colleagues to look again at old questions in new light. Their conversation, which led to this book, fulfilled its sponsors' hopes that such symposia discussions will not only act as a corrective to parochialism but will also encourage discovery and accelerate its pace.

Mary Ann Meyers
Senior Fellow
John Templeton Foundation